IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| “Resolutions on Notes”  |
| Date: 2022-04 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Graham SMITH | SR Technology | Sunrise, FL, USA. | 916 799 9563 | gsmith@srtrl.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Resolution of CIDs 1115, 1116, 1117, 1118, 1122, 1123

**CIDs 1123 and 1117**

NOTE 3 at 26.10.2.3 P4234.34

NOTE 4 at 26.10.2.2. P4233.33

Both NOTES are identical! True different clauses but the note does not seem to be specific to the clause, i.e. SRG OBSS level, or non-SRG OBSS level.

-An AP can get protection equivalent to SR\_DELAYED by transmitting the Trigger frame in a non-HT PPDU or HT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter AGGREGATION set to 0 instead of in a VHT PPDU.

**CIDs 1122 and 1115**

NOTE 1 at 26.10.2.3. P4234.15

NOTE 1 at 26.10.2.2. P4233.11

Both NOTES are identical!

* A STA cannot perform SR over an HE sounding NDP or HE TB feedback NDP (see 26.11.6 (SPATIAL\_REUSE))

**CIDs 1118**

NOTE 5 at 26.10.2.2. P4233.42

-A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_RESTRICTED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only before the end of the PPDU

**CID 1116**

NOTE 3 at 26.10.2.2. P4233.30

—A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_DELAYED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only after the end of the PPDU

**Proposed ACTION**

1. **Delete the duplication note, i.e. the second one**
2. **Make the NOTES into text unless anyone can find normative text.**

**CID 1123**

26.10.2.3 P4234.34

Comment: NOTE 3 looks normative to me

Proposed resolution: Replace “NOTE 3 –“ with “Note that…”

NOTE 3—An AP can get protection equivalent to SR\_DELAYED by transmitting the Trigger frame in a non-HT PPDU or HT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter AGGREGATION set to 0 instead of in a VHT PPDU

**RESOLUTION**

**Revised**

At 26.10.2.3 P4234.34

Delete NOTE 3

(The identical NOTE is on previous page at 26.10.2.2. P4233.33)

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**CID 1122**

26.10.2.3. P4234.15

Comment: NOTE 1 looks normative to me

Proposed resolution: Replace “NOTE 1 – “ with “Note that…”

NOTE 1—A STA cannot perform SR over an HE sounding NDP or HE TB feedback NDP (see 26.11.6 (SPATIAL\_REUSE)).

**RESOLUTION**

**Revised**

26.10.2.3. P4234.15

Delete NOTE 1

(The identical NOTE is on previous page at 26.10.2.2. P4233.11)

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

26.10.2.2. P4233.33

Comment: NOTE 4 looks normative to me

Proposed resolution: Change to “Note that an AP can set…”

NOTE 4 - An AP can get protection equivalent to SR\_DELAYED by transmitting the Trigger frame in a non-HT PPDU or HT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter AGGREGATION set to 0 instead of in a VHT PPDU.

Discussion:

Matt says that the preceding text is theh explanation and that the Note is a clarification.

“The PHY-CCARESET.request primitive shall be issued at the end of the PPDU if the PPDU is an HE SU PPDU or an HE ER SU PPDU and the RXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE indicates SR\_DELAYED.

**1116**

26.10.2.2. P4233.30

Comment: NOTE 3 looks normative to me

Proposed resolution: Change to “Note that a STA sets…”

NOTE 3 - A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_DELAYED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only after the end of the PPDU

Discussion:

Is the wording “An AP can get…” and “a STA sets...” informative?

Matt says the preceeding text is the expolanation and these notes are clarifications.

i.e.

“The PHY-CCARESET.request primitive shall be issued at the end of the PPDU if the PPDU is an HE SU PPDU or an HE ER SU PPDU and the RXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE indicates SR\_DELAYED.

NOTE 3 - A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_DELAYED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only after the end of the PPDU

NOTE 4 - An AP can get protection equivalent to SR\_DELAYED by transmitting the Trigger frame in a non-HT PPDU or HT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter AGGREGATION set to 0 instead of in a VHT PPDU.

Yes I agree that the Notes add clarification, but are they best as notes?

**Resolution for CID 1116 AND 1117:**

OPTION A

REVISED

Delete carriage return at line 28 THEN

Replace

“NOTE 3—A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_DELAYED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only after the end of the PPDU.

NOTE 4—An AP can get protection equivalent to SR\_DELAYED by transmitting the Trigger frame in a non-HT PPDU or HT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter AGGREGATION set to 0 instead of in a VHT PPDU.”

With

“A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_DELAYED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only after the end of the PPDU. An AP can get protection equivalent to SR\_DELAYED by transmitting the Trigger frame in a non-HT PPDU or HT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter AGGREGATION set to 0 instead of in a VHT PPDU.”

OPTION B

REJECTED

The Notes are calrifications of the preceeding text

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**1115**

26.10.2.2. P4233.11

Comment: NOTE 1 looks normative to me

Proposed resolution: Change to “Note that a STA cannot perform…”

NOTE 1—A STA cannot perform SR over an HE sounding NDP or HE TB feedback NDP (see 26.11.6 (SPATIAL\_REUSE)).”

If 26.11.6 does not have anything normative on this, then the reference is not needed.

Discussion:

Matt says the reference is in the Note, i.e. 26.11.6

There is no mention of “HE sounding” in 26.11.6. There is in 26.11.7 but I can’t see the connection in either.

There is mention of HE TB

Closest I can see is maybe P4247.60 or P4248.7.

Personally I am not convinced that this is a clarification of the in the cited clause. I can’t find the same or similar sentence.

I would play it safe.

**Resolution**

REVISED

Replace

“NOTE 1—A STA cannot perform SR over an HE sounding NDP or HE TB feedback NDP (see 26.11.6 (SPATIAL\_REUSE)).”

With

“A STA cannot perform SR over an HE sounding NDP or HE TB feedback NDP.” ~~(see 26.11.6 (SPATIAL\_REUSE))~~

**CID 1118**

26.10.2.2. P4233.42

Comment: NOTE 5 looks normative to me

Proposed resolution: Change to “Note that a STA sets…”

**RESOLUTION**

**Revised**

At 26.10.2.3. P4233.40

Delete the carriage return and “NOTE 5 - ”

Note to Editor:

Text then continues with

“A STA sets the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL\_REUSE to SR\_RESTRICTED in a PPDU if it allows OBSS PD-based spatial reuse operation, but only before the end of the PPDU.