IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 11-22-0266-00-000m-Telecon Minutes for REVme - February | | | | |
| Date: 2022-02-07 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technology, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Telecon Minutes for TGme (REVme) for February

R0: Minutes for February7, 2022

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Monday, February 07, 2022 at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:02 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
      1. Introductions of Officers.
         1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
         2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
         3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
         4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      2. Absent:
         1. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei)
   2. IMAT Reported attendance

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Andersdotter, Amelia | Sky UK Group |
| 2 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 3 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 4 | Das, Subir | Peraton Labs |
| 5 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
| 6 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 7 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 8 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 9 | Kneckt, Jarkko | Apple, Inc. |
| 10 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 11 | Lumbatis, Kurt | CommScope, Inc. |
| 12 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 13 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 14 | Patil, Abhishek | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 15 | Petrick, Albert | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 16 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
| 17 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 18 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 19 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
| 20 | Torab Jahromi, Payam | Facebook |
| 21 | VIGER, Pascal | Canon Research Centre France |

* 1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. **See slides 4-19 in** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1962-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2022.pptx>
     2. No issues were noted.
  2. **Review agenda**:11-22/211r1:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0211-01-000m-january-march-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent and copyright policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. **Copyright Policy:**

* + 1. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c.**Patent, Participation and policy related slides: See slides 4-19 in** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1962-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2022.pptx>

d.**Agenda Approval**

2.       **Editor report** – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.       **Comment resolution and motions**

1. **Monday January 31, 2022 – 10am – noon Eastern**
   1. Comment resolution
2. **Monday February 7, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern**
   1. Comment resolution
      1. CID 1218 – Hamilton (Rukus/Commscope)
      2. MBSSID CIDs – document 11-22/0116 – Patil (Qualcomm)
      3. Co-hosted BSSID – document 11-22/0082 – Patil (Qualcomm)
3. **Monday February 14, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Comment resolution
      1. CID 1678 – Rison (Samsung)
      2. CID 1622 – Hamilton (Samsung)
      3. ED2 CIDs – 11-22/0175r1 – Au (Huawei)
      4. ED2 CIDs – 11-22/0218r0 – Au (Huawei)
4. **Friday February 25, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Comment resolution (priority to Security-related CIDs)
5. **Monday February 28, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Motions
      1. document 11-22/0056r4 (slides x – y)
   2. Comment resolution

5.       **AOB**

6. **Adjourn**

* + 1. Review Agenda –
       1. Changes to the Agenda:

a. MBSSID CIDs – document 11-22/0116 – Patil (Qualcomm)

b. CIDs in clause 26.2.2 – document 11-22/0274 – Patil (Qualcomm)

c. CID 1006 – document 11-22/0275 – Patil (Qualcomm)

d. CID 2305 – document 11-22/0263 – McCann (Huawei)

* + - 1. Any Extra time to go through review/discuss MAC comments.
    1. Add PHY Discuss/Review to next week’s agenda.
    2. Approve modified agenda without objection
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. Hope to have 1.1 ready for next week.
  2. **Review document 11-22/0116r1 - MBSSID CIDs** – Abhi PATIL (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0116-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-related-to-multiple-bssid-set.docx>
     2. CID 1003 (MAC)
        1. Review updated changes in the submission.
        2. Discuss the number of BSSIDs that can be referenced.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 1003 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:12:49Z): Delete the NOTE at 1355.21: "NOTE 1—1 ≤ n ≤ 8 since the BSSID Index field in 9.4.2.73 (Multiple BSSID-Index element) indicates the number of BSSIDs in a multiple BSSID set."
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 1004 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review updated proposed changes in the submission.
        3. Update on page 2 to clarify sentence – see R2.
        4. Correct BSS -> BSSID
        5. Corrected TGme Editor instructions on bottom of page 2.
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 1004 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:23:54Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0116r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0116-02-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-related-to-multiple-bssid-set.docx>) indicated with "[1004]".
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **Review document 11-22/0274r0** - **CIDs in clause 26.2.2** - Abhi PATIL (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-00-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>
     2. CID 1023 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Discuss the value of having the redline available for editor reference.
        3. Concern on not removing the identified conflict.
        4. Modification made to “The BSS color is…” Tag with “(1023)”
        5. Proposed Resolution: CID 1023 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:29:40Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0274r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>) indicated with "[1023]".
        6. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 1021 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 1021 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:35:46Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0274r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>) indicated with "[1021]", which aligns these locations by removing the extra text in the first bullet of the next paragraph.
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 1022 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review discussion and context of the comment and cited text.
        3. Minor change – R1 will be posted to mentor.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 1022 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:40:58Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0274r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>) indicated with "[1022]", which makes the requested change and also adds a NOTE that an AP or STA starting an IBSS or mesh doesn't select color 0. Note to EDITOR, the Proposed Change overlaps the changes for CID 1023, as shown in 11-22/0274r1.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Review doc 11-22/275r0 - CID 1006** – Abhi PATIL (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0275-00-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cid-1006.docx>
     2. CID 1006 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Indicating an element is “last” is a problem for future element additions.
        3. An R1 will be posted to mentor
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 1006 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:45:11Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0275r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0275-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cid-1006.docx>), which performs the requested deletion and fixes typos in the first paragraph of the subclause.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  5. **Return to (Document: 11-22/0274r1) –** Abhi PATIL (Qualcomm)
     1. CID 1022 (MAC)
        1. Question on if the change was needed to indicate COLOR is 0.
        2. Concern that symmetry is not there.
        3. Update to resolution: CID 1022 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2022-02-07 15:40:58Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0274r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>) indicated with "[1022]", which adds a NOTE that an AP or STA starting a BSS doesn't select color 0. Note to the commenter, for an intra-BSS classification, the BSS color must match the current BSS, and hence can never be zero (without the need for stating so).
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  6. **Review doc 11-22/263r0** – Stephen MCCANN (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0263-00-000m-proposed-comment-resolution-for-cid-2305.docx>
     2. CID 2305 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment
        2. New R1 will be posted to mentor.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 2305 (ED1): Incorporate the changes in 11-22/0263r1.
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  7. **General update to the group:**
     1. Abhi's updated documents: doc 11-22/0116r2, 11-22/0274r1 and 11-22/0275r1 are posted to mentor.
  8. **MAC AdHoc Comments** – Review – Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
     1. CID 1461 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed resolution: Accept
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     2. CID 1359 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Question on why not leave 11ay cross reference.
        3. All NDP CMAC PPDU reference have been removed in general.
        4. The PHY clauses have the definitions.
        5. Discussion on just removing it.
        6. STRAW POLL: Should we Accept or Revise (add a Note) for CID 1359?
        7. Results: Accept: 6 Revise: 2 Abstain: 5
        8. Proposed Resolution: Accept
        9. Mark Ready for Motion – separate motion to be run.
     3. CID 1625 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed resolution: Revised; Add the comma as suggested and delete the comma following the “by S1G relays”.
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     4. CID 1652 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. The sentence has too many negatives, would it be something to update in the future with more positive language if possible.
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 1892 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     6. CID 1874 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted; Note to Editor: This change is adding A-MSDU to the lists (3 times).
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  9. **MAC AdHoc CIDS: Discuss** – Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
     1. CID 2207 (MAC)
        1. CID was deferred in the past.
        2. Review comment
        3. There are about 63 instances similar statements.
        4. Assign to Osama AboulMagd and mark Submission Required.
     2. CID 1479 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Discussion on how to limit the size of the Beacon, and if 1536 is the right answer, or some other number, of if no statement is necessary.
        3. Discussion on what is allowed vs what should be constrained.
        4. Discussion on the power savings that one longer beacon can be better in some cases.
        5. STRAW POLL: Do you agree with resolving CID 1479 by:

a) Adding the proposed note.

b) adding a modified note.

c) rejecting the comment.

d) abstain

* + - 1. Results of Straw Poll: 2-3-5-7
      2. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON to start a discussion on the 802.11 reflector about the size of Beacon frames.
    1. CID 1532 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No objection – Mark Ready for motion
    2. CID 1692 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. Discussion on value of changing the name.
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       4. No objection – Mark Ready for motion
    3. CID 1780 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. Similar to 1781 (MAC) but with different proposed change.
       3. Easier to “accept” CID 1781.
       4. Removing “REFUSED” has about 28 instances that would need to be checked.
       5. Mark this Submission Required – Assign to Mark RISON.
       6. No objection to the direction to follow 1780, and 1781 would be a revised as well.
  1. **AOB**
     1. none
  2. **Adjourn 11:56am ET**

**References:**

February 7:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1962-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2022.pptx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0211-01-000m-january-march-teleconference-agenda.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0116-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-related-to-multiple-bssid-set.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0116-02-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-related-to-multiple-bssid-set.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-00-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0274-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cids-in-clause-26-2-2.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0275-00-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cid-1006.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0275-01-000m-lb258-resolution-for-cid-1006.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0263-00-000m-proposed-comment-resolution-for-cid-2305.docx>