IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TGbd D3.0 Comment Resolution related to Annex C MIB | | | | |
| Date: 2022-1-11 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Hiroyuki Motozuka | Panasonic | 600 Saedo-cho, Tsuzuki-ku, Yokohama, Kanagawa, Japan |  | motozuka.hiroyuki@jp.panasonic.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolution to the following CID related to Annex C in Draft P802.11bd D3.0 received during LB259.

1 CID 3047

Revision history:

r0 Initial version

r1 Added amentment text for GROUP dot11DMGComplianceGroup, dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1, dot11CMMGComplianceGroup.

Changed the style for GROUP dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup.

Removed REVme from the references while added 11ax and 11ay to the references.

r2 Incorporated the proposed changes in MDR report (22/0021r5) that is not conflicted with the proposal for CID3047 in this submission.  
Added discussion regarding the conflict.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Resolution** |
| 3047 | C.3 | 138.51 | The values for dot11Compliances are maintained in the ANA database, but dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup is not on the current ANA database(11-11/0270r57), so "dot11Compliances 25" for it (P138L65) is not appropriate. Also, when we follow practice of the other amendments, dot11\*\*\*Compliance should be in dot11Compliences, and dot11\*\*\*ComplianceGroup should be in dot11Groups of ANA Database. | - Add definition for dot11NGVCompliance in Annex C of 11bd;  - Change allocation of {dot11Compliances 25} from dot11NGVComplianceGroup to dot11NGVCompliance;  - Get two allocations {dot11Groups <ANA>} for dot11NGVComplianceGroup(P138L51) and dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup(P138L65). | **Revised**  Change the description for dot11NGVComplianceGroup and dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup so the variables have allocated values in dot11Groups. Add description for “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” and “dot11NGVCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE”.  TGbd Editor: Incorporate the change in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0033-02-00bd-d3-0-comment-resolution-annex-c-mib.docx> for CID 3047.  Note to the TGbd Editor: Please process <ANA> values in the proposed text. |

**Discussion**

1. **Regarding dot11NGVComplianceGroup OBJECT-GROUP**
   1. **This kind of OBJECT-GROUP is described in different section in the baseline.**
      1. **Suggest to change the instruction and remove “Compliance Statements – NGV” header.**
   2. **This kind of OBJECT-GROUP is defined in dot11Groups in the baseline. This was proposed in 11-21/0110r0 (resolution to CID 1451 of LB251), but it seems it was not implemented correctly into D2.0 with some reason.**
      1. **Propose to change “dot11Compliances 25” to “dot11Groups <ANA>”**
      2. **(Added in r2) Variable list in OBJECTS should be revised as in 22/0021r5. In addition to the variables added in 22/0021r5, dot11VirtualCSonOCBSecondaryImplemented should be added. (See CID3022 in 22/0017r1)**
2. **Regarding dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup OBJECT-GROUP**
   1. **The same issue as 1.2 above.**
      1. **Propose to change “dot11Compliances 25” to “dot11Groups <ANA>”**
      2. **(Added in r2) It is proposed to change “dot11Compliances 25” to “dot11Compliances 26” in 11-22/0021r5 (during ongoing MDR), but it should be replaced with “dot11Groups <ANA>” still, with the reason described in 1.2 above.**
3. **GROUP description**
   1. **In the baseline, variable like dot11HEComplianceGroup has description under “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE.”**
      1. **Propose to add description for dot11NGVComplianceGroup and dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup under “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE.”**
      2. **Change description in existing groups that is mutually exclusive to dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup (e.g. dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup, ...)**
4. **MODULE-COMPLIANCE**
   1. **MODULE-COMPLIANCE statement is missing.**
      1. **Propose to add “dot11NGVCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” after Compliance Statement for WUR.**
5. **Note regarding ANA**
   1. **In 11-11/0270r57 ANA Database,** dot11NGVComplianceGroup has allocated value in dot11Compliances
      1. This value should be (re-)allocated to dot11NGVCompliance instead of dot11NGVComplianceGroup.
   2. **No values are allocated for TGbd in dot11Groups.**
      1. **Two values for dot11NGVComplianceGroup and dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup should be newly allocated.**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Allocated | 25 | dot11NGVComplianceGroup |  | [TGbd](#TGbd!A1) |

**Proposed changes to D3.0**

C.3 MIB Detail

*TGbd Editor: Please change P138L37-65 in TGbd Draft D3.0 as follows:*

***Insert the following after “dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1 OBJECT-GROUP”:***

dot11NGVComplianceGroup OBJECT-GROUP

OBJECTS {

dot11NGVActivated,

dot11RadioEnvironmentMeasurementPeriod,

dot11VirtualCSonOCBSecondaryImplemented,

dot11NONNGVRadioEnvironmentSupported,

dot11StationMeasurementPeriod }

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"Attributes that configure the NGV Group for IEEE Std 802.11."

::= { dot11Groups <ANA> }

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup OBJECT-GROUP

OBJECTS {

dot11NGVCurrentChannelWidth,

dot11NGVCurrentPrimaryChannel,

dot11NGVCurrentSecondaryChannel,

dot11NGVDCMImplemented,

dot11NGVMidambleRxMaxNSS,

dot11NGVDYN20MAllowed }

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"Attributes that configure the NGV PHY."

::= { dot11Groups <ANA> }

*TGbd Editor: Please add the following at the end of subclause C.3 of TGbd Draft:*

***Change the beginning of “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” in the “Compliance***

***Statements” part of C.3 as follows:***

dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"The compliance statement for SNMPv2 entities that implement the IEEE

802.11 MIB."

MODULE -- this module

MANDATORY-GROUPS {

dot11SMTbase16,

dot11MACbase5,

dot11CountersGroup5,

dot11SmtAuthenticationAlgorithms,

dot11ResourceTypeID,

dot11PhyOperationComplianceGroup2,

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup}

GROUP dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is

dsss.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup,

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is

ofdm.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is

hrdsss.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is erp.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is ht.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is vht.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is

tvht.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType is s1g.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when object dot11PHYType has the

value of HE.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

GROUP dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

“Implementation of this group is required when the object dot11PHYType has”

the value of ngv.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11HTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11EDMGComplianceGroup"

***Change “GROUP dot11EDMGComplianceGroup” in “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” description as follows:***

GROUP dot11EDMGComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when the object dot11PHYType has

the value of EDMG.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

***Change “GROUP dot11DMGComplianceGroup” in “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” description as follows:***

GROUP dot11DMGComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when the object

dot11PHYType is dmg.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyS1GComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHEComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

***Change “GROUP dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1” in “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” description as follows:***

GROUP dot11CDMGComplianceGroup1

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when the object

dot11PHYType has the value of CDMG.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

***Change “GROUP dot11CMMGComplianceGroup” in “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” description as follows:***

GROUP dot11CMMGComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

"Implementation of this group is required when the object

dot11PHYType has the value of CMMG.

This group is mutually exclusive to the following groups:

dot11PhyDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyOFDMComplianceGroup3

dot11PhyHRDSSSComplianceGroup

dot11PhyERPComplianceGroup

dot11PhyHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup

dot11PhyTVHTComplianceGroup

dot11DMGComplianceGroup

dot11CDMGComplianceGroup

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup"

***Insert the following group into “dot11Compliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE” before OPTIONAL-GROUPS list:***

GROUP dot11NGVComplianceGroup

DESCRIPTION

“NGV Compliance Group”

***Insert the following after "Compliance Statements - EBCS":***

-- \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

-- \* Compliance Statements - NGV

-- \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

dot11NGVCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

“This object class provides the objects from IEEE 802.11

MIB required to manage Next Generation V2X functionality.”

MODULE – this module

MANDATORY-GROUPS {

dot11NGVComplianceGroup,

dot11PhyNGVComplianceGroup }

-- OPTIONAL-GROUPS { }

::= { dot11Compliances <ANA> }

**References**

[1] Draft P802.11bd D3.0

[2] 11-11/0270r57 ANA Database

[3] 11-21/0110r0 LB251 Annex C3 comments resolution

[4] 11-20/1887r11 TGbd LB251 comments

[5] IEEE802.11-2020

[6] IEEE802.11ax-2021

[7] IEEE802.11ay-2021

[8] IEEE802.11ba-2021

[9] Draft P802.11bc D2.0

[10] 11-22/0021r5 IEEE P802.11bd/D3.0 Mandatory Draft Review (MDR) Report

[11] 11-22/0017r1 Resolutions to Annex C