IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVme - December 6, 13 and 20 | | | | |
| Date: 2021-12-06 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm, Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This file has the Telecon Minutes for REVme for December 6, 13 and 20.

R0: Dec 6th Telcon Minutes – Thanks to Mark HAMILTON for taking the majority of the notes.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon – 2021 December 06 Monday 10-12pm ET.**
   1. **Called to order** 10:04am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
      1. IMAT Reported attendance

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Andersdotter, Amelia | Sky UK Group |
| 2 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 3 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 4 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 5 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 6 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 7 | Kneckt, Jarkko | Apple, Inc. |
| 8 | Liu, Der-Zheng | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 9 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| 10 | Petrick, Albert | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 11 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 12 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 13 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
| 14 | Torab Jahromi, Payam | Facebook |

* 1. **Introductions of Officers.**
     1. TG Chair - Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
     2. Vice Chair – Mark Hamilton (CommScope/Ruckus)
     3. Vice Chair – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     4. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
     5. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei)
     6. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
  2. **Review Patent Policy, Copyright Policy and 802 Policies**
     1. Patent, Participation, and policy related slides: See slides 4-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1642-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-november-2021.pptx>
     2. No response to call for Patents.
  3. **Review and Approve Agenda – 11-21/1885r3**:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1885-03-000m-nov-jan-teleconference-agendas.docx>
     2. Change order to address those present.
     3. No objection to the agenda as presented.
  4. **Editor Report**
     1. WG Letter Ballot has started Dec 1 for 40 days.
  5. **Discuss the future Telecon**
     1. Move Jan 10 to Jan 14
        1. Mark HAMILTON may not be available.
        2. Discussion on if it is feasible.
        3. Discuss if we move to 9-11am ET or 12-2pm ET
        4. Editor needs more time to prepare the comment database.
        5. Move to Jan 14 and keep the time at 10-12pm ET.
  6. **Review doc 11-21/11821r4 - GEN CIDs.**  – Jon Rosdahl (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1821-04-000m-cc35-13-gen-cids.docx>)
     2. CID 497 (GEN):
        1. We talked about a very similar CID (CID 230) in the last meeting.
        2. This proposes a similar rejection.
        3. C: Disagree that a DEFVAL indicates a minimum capability. Deleted the last sentence, that talks about minimum capability.
        4. Proposed Resolution: Rejected. RFC 2578, section 7.9 gives a pretty good description. It pretty clearly says DEFVAL is appropriate for anything that's read-only. And it is optional for anything that is read-write.
        5. Mark Ready for motion, on a separate tab, along with CID 230.
        6. Comment Group = “Gen Motion CID 230 and 497”
     3. CID 372 (GEN):
        1. Reviewed prior discussions on this CID/topic.
        2. C: Can’t be insufficient details – it says to change “transmitter address” to “TA” which is explicit.
        3. C: This seems very related to CID 422, in 11-21/829r9 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-09-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>).
        4. C: CID 422 was withdrawn, however.
        5. C: Subclause 9.3.3.1 (Format of PV0 Management frames) shows that Beacon frames call this field the “Address 2” field.
        6. C: This definition is about the BSSID field. We should not try to change this definition.
        7. C: “transmitter address field” does appear in the Frame report. R: But that is a unique context, and that is the name of the field there.
        8. C: But, the definition does say the MAC header “transmit address field”, and there is no such field. We need to fix this.
        9. Considered clause 11.1.3.8 (Multiple BSSID procedure). This subclause uses the terms derived from transmitted and nontransmitted
        10. C: But the definition does talk about the “TA” field, as part of how the transmitted Beacon is identified. That could be re-written to talk about the transmitted Beacon, instead, but that’s a lot of work to be sure it is correct. Suggest we can just replace the refence to the MAC header’s transmitter address to be the MAC header’s Address 2 field, to make it correct, even if not entirely helpful.
        11. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Change the definition from “The BSSID included in the medium access control (MAC) header transmitter address field of a Beacon frame when the multiple BSSID capability is supported.” To “The BSSID included in the medium access control (MAC) header Address 2 field of a Beacon frame when the multiple BSSID capability is supported.”
        12. Mark Ready for motion. – Comment Group = “Gen Motion - Dec A”
     4. CID 111 (GEN):
        1. C: This is actually the instances of “that intends”.
        2. Reviewed the proposed changes.
        3. Noted that “S-Aps” should be “S-APs”
        4. The change in P1424.8 seems to be adding semantics. Modified the change to just remove the “that intends to join the centralized cluster”.
        5. For the change at P1808.58, use the “prior to” structure above. Otherwise, we just change “intends” to ”prepares”, which has the same original problem. Changed to:
        6. Prior to transmitting an 8 or 16 MHz PPDU, an S1G STA may also invoke a backoff procedure …
        7. Considered the same thing for the next change (P1813.11). But it needs a different structure. Needs more work, come back to this.
        8. P1966.3: More, similar discussion. Considered, “Prior to dynamically allocating… an AP or PCP shall”, or “In order to dynamically allocate…, an AP or PCP shall”, or “To dynamically allocate…, an AP or PCP shall”.
        9. No objection to the “In order to…” direction.
        10. Agreed to: “In order to dynamically allocate an SP within the DTI, an AP or PCP shall commence a GP at a time instant indicated by at least one of the following:”
        11. P1992.24: Also, similar. Suggested: change to, “In order to become a member AP or member PCP after receiving a DMG Beacon frame including cluster information transmitted by an S-AP, a centralized clustering enabled AP or PCP shall successfully perform the following steps in order:”
        12. C: This structure buries the event.
        13. Came up with three options. Will work further off-line.
        14. Chair noted that this comment is an example of one that would be better assigned back to the commenter, to get the specific changes. The Chair will do more to enforce that approach on future ballots.
  7. **Review Document: 11-21/1782r3** ) - Graham SMITH (SR Technologies)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1782-03-000m-annex-g-cids-resolution.docx>
     2. This is trying to wrap up the discussion about removing references to Annex G and “frame exchange sequence”, and to correct uses of “frame exchange” that should have “sequence” added.
     3. It was pointed out that “transmission” of a frame exchange sequence is not needed in many places (and is arguably wrong, since a FES involved both transmission and reception, usually). Changes are added to address these places.
     4. C: This seems to have more changes, that are not really related to the subject (Annex G). The “transmission of” corrections, went too far. Removed the ones not related. Cleaned up changes to remove any use of “transmission of frame exchange sequences” or similar wording.
     5. Didn’t finish review of the rest. Will bring this back on Jan 20.
  8. **Adjourned 12:00 ET**

**References:**

**Dec 6th:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1642-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-november-2021.pptx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1885-03-000m-nov-jan-teleconference-agendas.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1821-04-000m-cc35-13-gen-cids.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-09-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1782-03-000m-annex-g-cids-resolution.docx>