IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVme - November Electronic Plenary |
| Date: 2021-11-09 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technology, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This file has the Telecon Minutes for REVme during the 2021 November IEEE 802 Electronic Plenary.

R0: Nov 9 -

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon – 2021 November 802 Electronic Plenary – Tuesday 9 Nov 4-6pm ET.**
	1. **Called to order** 16:03am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
	2. **Introductions of Officers.**
		1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		2. Vice Chair – Mark RISON (Samsung)
		3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
	3. **Review Patent Policy, Copyright Policy and 802 Policies**
		1. No response to call for Patent.
	4. **Chair Statement** on goals and status of Task Group.
		1. Target to get the CC35 Comments resolved this session.
		2. Desire to work together to be ready for First WG LB out of this session.
	5. **Review today’s agenda**:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1632-01-000m-revme-agenda-november-2021-session.pptx>
		2. Draft Agenda:

Tuesday Nov 9, 4pm ET

* + 1. Chair’s Welcome, Policy & patent reminder
		2. Approve agenda
		3. 802.11ay Corrigendum PAR Review
		4. Editor Report
		5. Comment Resolution
1. MAC Comments – McCann (Huawei)
2. MAC Comments – Rison (Samsung)
	* 1. Recess
		2. Unanimous Approval for Proposed Agenda – No Objection.
	1. **802.11ay Corrigendum PAR Review** Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1750-01-000m-par-corrigendum-1-correct-802-11ay-assignment-of-protected-announce-support-bit.docx>
		2. Review the changes from last Monday.
		3. No objection – Will motion on Monday Nov 15th for sending to WG.
	2. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0687-04-000m-802-11revme-editor-s-report.pptx>
		2. Reference Documents:
			1. **Draft: P802.11REVme D 0.4 (members’ area)**
				1. [Draft P802.11REVme\_D0.4.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/11/private/Draft_Standards/11me/Draft%20P802.11REVme_D0.4.pdf)
				2. [Draft P802.11REVme\_D0.4 Redline Compared to D0.3.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/11/private/Draft_Standards/11me/Draft%20P802.11REVme_D0.4%20Redline%20Compared%20to%20D0.3.pdf)
			2. **D0.4 Word docs and figures are also available (member’s area) for preparing submissions.**
				1. [REVme\_D0.4-Figure Source.zip](https://www.ieee802.org/11/private/Draft_Standards/11me/Figure%20Source-D0.4.zip)
				2. [REVme\_D0.4.rtf.zip](https://www.ieee802.org/11/private/Draft_Standards/11me/REVme_D0.4.rtf.zip)
			3. **CC35 Comments**
				1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0684-09-000m-revme-wg-cc35-comments.xlsx>
		3. Amendment Roll-in
3. **802.11-2020 – Done, D0.0**
4. **802.11ax-2021 – Done, D0.1**
5. **802.11ay-2021 – by September 2021**
6. **802.11ba-2021 – by November 2021**
	* 1. CC35 Comments – Resolution Status:

* + - 1. 79 CIDs currently ready for Motion
		1. Assignees:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Owning Ad-hoc** | **GEN** | **MAC** | **SEC** | **ED2** | **ED1** | **PHY** | **Grand Total** |
| Brian HART |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |
| Dan Harkins |  | 2 |  |  |  |  | 2 |
| Edward Au | 3 |  |  | 22 |  |  | 25 |
| Graham Smith | 3 |  |  |  |  |  | 3 |
| Jon Rosdahl | 10 |  |  |  |  |  | 10 |
| Mark HAMILTON | 1 | 14 | 1 |  |  | 1 | 17 |
| Mark RISON | 22 | 73 | 18 | 15 | 3 | 5 | 136 |
| Menzo WENTINK |  | 12 |  |  |  |  | 12 |
| Michael Montemurro |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |
| Stephen McCann |  | 16 |  |  |  |  | 16 |
| Youhan KIM |  | 2 |  |  |  |  | 2 |
| **Grand Total** | **39** | **119** | **20** | **37** | **3** | **7** | **225** |

:

* 1. **Review doc 11-21/1637r4** - MAC CIDs – Stephen MCCAAN (Huawei)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1637-04-000m-proposed-comment-resolutions-for-mac-cids.docx>
		2. All references are against D0.0
		3. CID 524 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on how subelements and elements are ordered.
			3. Proposed resolution: CID 524 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:29:33Z)
			4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 147 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed resolution: CID 147 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:33:20Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		5. CID 148 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 148 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:33:52Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		6. CID 149 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution CID 149 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:34:59Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		7. CID 150 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on if we need DMG STA or not.
			3. Look to make a change to "4.3.26 CDMG STAAn IEEE 802.11 CDMG STA is a DMG STA that supports CDMG operation in the Chinese 60 GHz frequency band and has dot11CDMGOptionImplemented equal to true. In addition to CDMG features, a CDMG STA supports DMG features as described in 4.3.22 (DMG STA)."
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 150 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:36:53Z): Add "or CMMG STA" after "DMG STA".
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		8. CID 159 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 159 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:38:51Z):

At P1802L60, change "has not failed" to "is considered to be a successful transmission".

At P1802L40 change "transmission failure" to "transmission success or failure".

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 136 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 136 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:41:12Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 138 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Discussion on if present vs optionally present.
			3. Suggested wording: “is present if dot11WNM is true and the BSS max idle period is nonzero, or optionally present if dot11S1G is true
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 138 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 21:48:56Z) - Change "is present if dot11WirelessManagementImplemented is true" (the first occurrence in the paragraph) to "is present if dot11WirelessManagementImplemented is true and the BSS max idle period is nonzero,"
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 359 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review context on p774.33.
			3. Discussion on if “natural binary” has a meaning or not.
			4. Straw Poll:

Which do you support?

a) Delete the sentence

b) Delete the word Natural

c) Reject the comment

d) Abstain

* + - * 1. Results: 3-14-12-13 no answer = 64
			1. Suggestion to Delete the word “Natural”.
				1. There was an objection to delete the word, and to reject the CID.
			2. Discussion on if we need the “binary” assertion and if we need “Natural” or not.
			3. Discussion on possible Rejection.
			4. This sentence has existed since 802.11-1997.
			5. ACTION ITEM: Stephen MCCAAN will send details of CID 359 (MAC) to the reflector for more offline discussion.
			6. Will be a separate item on Monday’s Agenda.
			7. CID 359 (MAC): No consensus could be found. Will continue working and try to bring back.
		1. CID 366 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on if the field holds a number or string.
			3. Review context on P1475.62
			4. Discussion on use of the values and if it is “USD” or 840.
			5. Discussion of ISO 4217 description of the 3-octect string.
			6. Discussion in chat window: options are: receiver only needs to understand alphabetic, receiver only needs to understand numeric, receiver needs to understand both
			7. Currency codes are defined by ISO 4217 and can be either numeric (3.g. “840”) or alphabetic (e.g. “USD”). Therefore, the phrase “Alphabetic or numeric” may be more appropriate.
			8. The currency code field is a 3-octet as defined in ISO 4217.
			9. Suggested changes "An ASCII or UTF-8 string is a sequence of ASCII or UTF-8 encoded code points, respectively, without aterminating null."
			10. Proposed Resolution: CID 366 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:18:18Z): Change the cited sentence to: "The Currency Code field is a 3-octet ASCII string representing an ISO 4217 currency alphabetic or numeric code (e.g., "USD")."
			11. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 439 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review context at 2120.55
			3. Review proposed changes.
			4. Discussion on if the full change is needed.
			5. Suggestion to reject the CID as it is clear.
			6. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:22:37Z): Replace "STAs" with "Non-AP STAs that are not in a PBSS" in the cited sentence. Change "In a PBSS, STAs" to "Non-AP STAs in a PBSS" in the second location.
			7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 429 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 429 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:27:00Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 434 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution CID 434 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:27:45Z): At P2294L45, change “multicast group address" to "multicast-group address".

At P3996L27 and P4010L62, change “Multicast Group address indicates the MAC address of the multicast group" to "Indicates the multicast-group address of the multicast group”.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 374 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 374 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:29:11Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 572 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
				1. Proposed Resolution: CID 572 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:31:45Z)
				2. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 591 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 591 (MAC): REJECTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:32:28Z): The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined.
			3. Move to insufficient details tab to keep rejections of this type separate from the others.
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **Review doc 11-21/0829r7** - MAC Comments – Mark RISON (Samsung)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>
		2. CID 114 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the proposed resolution.
			3. Discussion on why “one or more” is appropriate.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 114 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:36:06Z): In the referenced subclause, replace:

“The transmission process is started by the MAC’s receipt of an MA-UNITDATA.request primitive containing an MSDU and the associated parameters. This might cause one or more Data frames containing the MSDU to be transmitted following A-MSDU aggregation, fragmentation, and security encapsulation, as appropriate.

The MAC generates the MA-UNITDATA.indication primitive in response to one or more received Data frames containing an MSDU following validation, address filtering, decryption, decapsulation, defragmentation, and A-MSDU deaggregation, as appropriate”

with:

“The transmission process is started by the MAC’s receipt of one or more MA-UNITDATA.request primitives, each containing an MSDU and its associated parameters. This might cause one or more Data frames, containing the MSDU(s), to be transmitted.

The reception process is started by the MAC’s receipt of one or more Data frames containing one or more MSDUs. This might cause one or more MA-UNITDATA.indication primitives, each containing an MSDU and its associated parameters, to be issued.”

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 170 and 172 (MAC)
			1. Review Comments
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 170 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:41:36Z)
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 172 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:41:51Z): Make the change proposed by the commenter and additionally in 11.2.7.2.2 and 11.2.7.3.2 change "that contain a BU or are QoS Null frame" to "that are acknowledged by the AP".
			5. No Objection – Mark both CIDs Ready for Motion
		2. CID 231 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Review how the 11ay changes were duplicative of changes made by 11ax.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 231 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:47:32Z): In D0.4 Subclause 11.2.6 after “while the EDMG STA enables its multiple receive chains only when the frame it receives indicates that the following transmission requires the activation of multiple receive chains” append “ (see 10.39.12.4 (MIMO channel access)”, and change:

“The (11ay)HT STA may switch back to the single receive chain mode immediately after the end of the frame exchange sequence.(11ax)(11ay) The EDMG STA switches to the multiple receive chain mode when it receives a frame addressed to it and the frame indicates the following transmission requires multiple receive chains (see 10.39.12.4 (MIMO channel access)); the EDMG STA switches back immediately when the frame exchange sequence ends.”

to:

“The STA may switch back to the single receive chain mode immediately after the end of the frame exchange sequence.”.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion
		1. CID 263 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 263 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:48:50Z): Change the cited NOTE to “NOTE 2—AC\_VO might be selected prior to completion of the (re)association procedure, to assist timely discovery of and joining a BSS.”
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 270 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Review proposed changes
			4. Discussion on change for 10.25.8.4.
			5. This is in the context is all A-MSDU, so we should not change to MSDU.
			6. Proposed Resolution: CID 270 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-11-09 22:58:09Z): Incorporate the changes as shown in 11-21/829r7 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>> for CID 270, which make the proposed changes except saying "A-MSDU" in 10.25.8.4, instead of "MSDU".
			7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
	1. **Recess at 6:01pm ET.**

**References:**

November 9:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1632-01-000m-revme-agenda-november-2021-session.pptx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1750-01-000m-par-corrigendum-1-correct-802-11ay-assignment-of-protected-announce-support-bit.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0687-04-000m-802-11revme-editor-s-report.pptx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1637-04-000m-proposed-comment-resolutions-for-mac-cids.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>