IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CC35 CID 116 | | | | |
| Date: Oct 14 2021 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Nehru Bhandaru | Broadcom | 250 Innovation Drive, San Jose CA | +1 408 391 2159 | [nehru.bhandaru@broadcom.com](mailto:nehru.bhandaru@broadcom.com) |
| Dan Harkins | HPE |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains discussion and a proposed resolution for CID 116 from TGme CC35 on IEEE P802.11-REVme/D0.0. Proposed changes are relative to REV me/D0.3.

**Revision Notes**

R0 – initial version

R1 – incorporate feedback from Dan

R2 – incorporate additional discussion, feedback

**References**

[1] IEEE P802.11-REVme/D0.0, March 2021

[2] IEEE P802.11-REVme/D0.3, September 2021

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause/Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| **166** | 12.4.8.6.5  p2554.00 | SAE: "<verify X>. If not, <do Y>. If so, <do Z>" construction can be ambiguous since it is not always clear what "if so" is referring to (something in "verify X" vs. "do Y"). | Replace "If Sync is not greater than dot11RSNASAESync, the protocol instance shall verify that the finite cyclic group is the same as the previously received SAE Commit message. If not, the frame shall be silently discarded. If so, the protocol instance shall increment Sync, increment Sc, and transmit its SAE Commit message and its SAE Confirm message with the new Sc value." with "If Sync is not greater than dot11RSNASAESync, the protocol instance shall verify that the finite cyclic group is the same as the previously received SAE Commit message. If not, the frame shall be silently discarded. Otherwise, the protocol instance shall increment Sync, increment Sc, and transmit its SAE Commit message and its SAE Confirm message with the new Sc value." | Resolution: Revise  Agree in principle with the commentor. A further simplification and clarification is suggested.  TGm editor: Please make changes as described in [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1648-00-000m- cc35-nb-crs-116.docx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1648-00-000m-%20cc35-nb-crs-116.docx) |

**CID 166 - Discussion**

There was a fair amount of discussion on the reflector and prior conference calls on the way forward with this comment, which I will not repeat here. The proposed change to resolve this comment is captured here with standard change notation that should help review.

The change also addresses a seeming contradiction in the original text canceling the timer for the case where the frame is to be silently discarded

R1 notes

-

[Summarizing Dan’s email and my reply] There was some concern that there would be two t0 timers pending in the success case or a t0 timer pending on a Del event to the parent process. My interpretation is that there is only one timer for the protocol instance and setting the timer does not create another one and that Del event will destroy the protocol instance and thus the timer associated with it (including cancelation).

There is also an implicit assumption that processing/handling of events is serialized.

Will take another stab at this.

R2 Notes

-

Dan noted chunkiness with the text because of the timer is not being canceled when the Com event arrives and suggested alternate text which kept the timer cancelation on Com event. There was still an issue an issue of timer still being canceled (and there would be no retries) when the group mismatches which is not intent of silent discard.

Reworked the text as follows.

**Proposed Changes**

TGaz Editor Change the paragraph at p3066.9 (11me D0.3) as follows

Upon receipt of a Com event, the t0 (retransmission) timer shall be canceled. If the Status is nonzero, the frame shall be silently discarded, the t0 (retransmission) timer set, and the protocol instance shall remain in the Confirmed state. Otherwise, if ~~If~~ Sync is greater than dot11RSNASAESync, the protocol instance shall send the parent process a Del event and transitions back to Nothing state. Otherwise, if the finite cyclic group differs from the finite cyclic group received in the previous SAE Commit message, the t0 (retransmission) timer shall be set and ~~If~~ ~~Sync is not greater than dot11RSNASAESync~~, ~~the~~ ~~protocol instance shall verify that the finite cyclic group is the same as the previously received SAE Commit~~ ~~message. If not,~~ the frame shall be silently discarded. ~~If so~~ Otherwise, the protocol instance shall increment Sync, increment Sc, ~~and~~ transmit its SAE Commit message and its SAE Confirm message with the new Sc value, and ~~. It~~ ~~then shall~~ set the t0 (retransmission) timer.