IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVme – Sept 27, 2021 | | | | |
| Date: 2021-09-27 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | 1 – 801 – 492 – 4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11me (REVme) Telecon for Sept 27th:

R0 = Sept 27th Telecon

ACTION ITEM LIST:

1.6.4 ACTION ITEM #1: Michael Montemurro to send announcement of new Telecons to stds-802-11 and stds-802-11-tgm reflectors.

1.10.9.5 ACTION ITEM #2: Editor – Check if the definition of “station vector” needs to be in 3.1 or 3.2.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon Monday August 9th, 2021, at 10-12:00 ET**
   1. Called to order 10:05am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
      1. Introductions of Officers.
         1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
         2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
         3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
         4. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei)
         5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   2. Attendance:
      1. IMAT Reported attendance

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Aboulmagd, Osama | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 2 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 3 | Bhandaru, Nehru | Broadcom Corporation |
| 4 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 5 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
| 6 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 7 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 8 | Henry, Jerome | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 9 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 10 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 11 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 12 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 13 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 14 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
| 15 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 16 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 17 | Wei, Dong | NXP Semiconductors |
| 18 | yi, yongjiang | Spreadtrum Communication USA Inc. |

* + 1. Webex Attendance not in IMAT:
  1. Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.
     1. No issues were noted.
  2. Review agenda:11-21/1572r0:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1572-00-000m-sep-nov-teleconference-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the Sept 27-Nov 1 teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent and copyright policy

a.       Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

1. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c.      Patent, Participation and policy related slides: See slides 4-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0935-01-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2021.pptx>

2.       Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.       Comment resolution and motions

1. **Monday September 27, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern**
   1. Discussion on additional teleconferences

(Open Fridays Oct 15, 22, 29, Nov 5)

* 1. Comment resolution
     1. CID 12 – Chair – Michael MONTEMURRO
     2. Document 11-21/1383 – GEN CIDs - Stephen MCCANN (Huawei)
     3. Document 11-21/1128 – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     4. Document 11-21/829 – Assigned CIDs (including CID 294) -- Mark RISON (Samsung)
     5. Document 11-21/965 – PHY CIDs – Brian Hart (Cisco)

1. **Friday October 1, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern**
   1. Comment resolution

CIDs 594, 116 – Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei)

Document 11-21/xxxx – Wentink (Qualcomm) – TDLS CIDs

Document 11-21/809 – Bhandaru (Broadcom)

Document 11-21/816 – Rison (Samsung)

1. **Monday October 18, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Comment resolution
      1. Document 11-21/1448 – Chen (Intel)
      2. Document 11-21/xxx – Qi (Intel) /Sakoda (Sony)
2. **Monday October 25, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Motions (document 11-21/758r7)
      1. TBA
   2. Comment resolution
      1. <>
3. **Monday November 1, 2021 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Comment resolution
      1. <>

5.       AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. No objection to the agenda – Unanimous Approval
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. Working on implementing the 79 comments approved in Interim.
     2. Once finished with comment implantation, and receipt of 11ba sources, will begin Rollin of TGba.
  2. **New Telecons:** 
     1. Discussion on additional teleconferences (open Fridays Oct 15, 22, 29, Nov 5)
     2. Call times: 10-12 am ET
     3. No objection
     4. ACTION ITEM #1: Michael Montemurro to send announcement of new Telecons to stds-802-11 and stds-802-11-tgm reflectors.
  3. **CID 12** – Chair – Michael MONTEMURRO
     1. CID 12 (PHY)
     2. missed including CID 12 from being marked Ready for Motion (see 11-21/1315r4).
     3. Editorial comments were added to document.
     4. Will mark the Ready for Motion again with the 11-21/1136r1
     5. No objection – Mark CID 12 as Ready for Motion.
  4. **Review doc 11-21/1383r1** – Stephen McCann (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1383-01-000m-proposed-comment-resolution-for-gen-cids.docx>
     2. CID 500 (GEN)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Rejected: The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined.

Notes:

1. this is a similar comment to REVmd CID 2304 in:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0611-29-000m-revmd-wg-ballot-comments.xls>

and also, REVmd CID 4706 in:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-29-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>

1. In order for this CID to be resolved in another way, research needs to be performed to determine whether the two cited MIB variables be removed or not.
   * + 1. Explanation for the rationale for the rejection given.
       2. Question on if the MIB compiler is successful or not?
          1. A MIB Compilation was done prior to SA Ballot and Publication for TGmd.
       3. Add a note that the MIB was compiled
          1. 3) The MIB was compiled prior to the publication of IEEE 802.11-2020.
       4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     1. CID 576 (GEN)
        1. Reviewed Comment
        2. There are 4 instances of changes.
        3. One in Figure 4-20
        4. D0.3 - One on page p317L62
        5. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Change “ANQP Server” to “advertisement server” at P317.02 and P317.62 Also change the term within Figure 4-20.
        6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     2. CID 580 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review context location. - 5881.28 (D0.3)
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accept
        4. Discussion on other potential issues – out of scope for this CID.
        5. Discussion on keeping part of the EG but decided to just accept.
        6. The later part of the E.G. shows up in several places, so we may want to keep it here in R.2.1 – keep “an IEEE 802.21 Information Server”.
        7. Updated Proposed Resolution: Revised; Change the cited sentence to “(e.g. an IEEE 802.21 Information Server)”.
        8. Some concern on the circular nature of the definition of information server and it being referenced here.
        9. Straw Poll: Do you accept the original or the Revised version of the resolution:
           1. A. Accept; B. Revised; C: Neither
           2. Result – 2, 6, 0 (10 no vote).
        10. Will use the revised version.
        11. No objection to use the Revised version (see minutes: 1.8.4.7.)
        12. No objection - Mark Ready for Motion.
   1. **Review Doc 11-21/1128r1** – Mark RISON
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1128-01-000m-on-frattacks-and-related-matters.docx>
      2. Need to defer, still waiting for more off-line input.
   2. **Review Document 11-21/829r4** – Mark RISON (Samsung)
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>
      2. CID 294 (ED1)
         1. Review comment
         2. Proposed Resolution: CID 294 (ED1): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 11-21/0829r4 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>> for CID 294.
         3. No objection – Mark ready for Motion
      3. CID 171 (SEC)
         1. Review comment history
         2. Review context on page 1093.61 – Table 9-152.
         3. Proposed Resolution: CID 171 (SEC): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 11-21/0829r4 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>> for CID 171.
         4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
      4. CID 454 (MAC)
         1. Review comment
         2. Proposed Resolution: CID 454 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2021-09-27 14:53:52Z): Delete “mesh” at:

2370.11, in “the most recently received mesh beacon from the peer”

2372.3, in “its mesh Beacon frame” and in “a mesh Beacon frame”

2373.26, in “the STA’s most recent mesh Beacon frame”

At 2416.49, change “The Mesh Beacon frame shall not include a QMF Policy element.” to “A mesh STA shall not include a QMF Policy element in a Beacon frame.”

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 162 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2021-09-27 14:55:41Z):Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 162 in 11-21/0829r4 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>> which explicitly show the locations where the additional text suggested by the commenter is inserted.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 469 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2021-09-27 15:03:49Z) In 6.3.3.3.2 Semantics of the service primitive copy the Reduced Neighbor Report row from the BSSDescriptionFromFD table to the end of the BSSDescription table, changing “FILS Discovery” to “Beacon or Probe Response”.
       3. Check with Editor if there were changes made from 11ax or not
          1. Answer: not.
       4. No Objection – Mark ready for motion
    3. CID 422 (GEN)
       1. Review comment
       2. Question on if RA/TA are fields or values.
       3. Discussion on proposed changes, but question as to if this is the right direction or not.
       4. The DA Field (9.2.4.3.5) – may be mislabelled and should be value rather than field.
       5. Calling it DA address is redundant, and calling it a DA
       6. Changing for example changing “RA and DA values/fields are not equal” to “RA and DA are not equal”
       7. Reducing the suffix qualifier may be a better direction.
       8. Also need to determine how to refer to the SSID.
       9. More work will need to be done.
    4. CID 469 (GEN)
       1. The latest draft did add some items to the ESS description set with the roll-in of 11ax and 11ay.
       2. Need to identify exactly where to add to the table.
       3. Not sure that it matters, but question on if it is added to end of Table as described to end of D0.0
       4. Add “The Change to be added to end of Table as described in D0.0” in the database for this CID.
    5. CID 350 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review proposed changes
       3. Question on if the definition of service identifies is defined in 802.1AC or not. –
       4. Definition for “station vector” needs to be defined in 3.1.
       5. ACTION ITEM #2: Editor – Check if the definition of “station vector” needs to be in 3.1 or 3.2.
       6. The Bulleted option seems to be easiest to read.
       7. The current format seems to be option 1 – more flat text.
       8. Editor indicated that Option 1 is more inline with what we have now.
       9. Proposed resolution: CID 350 (GEN): Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 350 in <this document>, taking the first of the options separated by “OR”, which clarify the relationship between the so-called station vector and sets of service\_access\_point\_identifiers, clarify the optionality/nullness of MA-UNITDATA parameters and make various editorial improvements.
       10. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    6. CID 546 (GEN)
       1. Review comment
       2. Proposed change has one error.
       3. Proposed Resolution: Change “shall be capable of” to “shall support” and “Shall be capable of” to “Shall support” in the locations shown in the table shown under “Discussion” for CID 546 in in 11-21/0829r4 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>>.

At 2169.20 delete “supporting” (leaving, after the changes above, “A STA that supports FMS shall support a delivery interval of 1 for any stream.”).

Note to the commenter: this is the proposed changes (modulo case-sensitivity), with one page number typo fixed

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Review Document 11-21/965**r7 – Hart (Cisco) – PHY CIDs
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0965-07-000m-cc35-phy-cids-19-18-14-15-527.docx>
     2. CID 16 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Agreed with the general direction proposed
        3. Minor corrections to avoid "signal extension" terminology
        4. The NOTE is confusing, with our change to make "frame" only a MAC concept.
        5. The term "interframe" is still a PHY concept, but "frame" is becoming not a PHY concept. We need to be clear.
        6. Need to keep the \*if terms.
        7. Fix line number change above Fig 10-5.
        8. Updated the NOTE to explain the PHY Frame vs PPDU usage changes.
        9. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2021-09-27 15:44:55Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-21/965r8 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0965-08-000m-cc35-phy-cids-19-18-14-15-527.docx>>, for CID 16, which makes changes in the direction suggested by the commenter but avoids usage of signal extension.
        10. No objection - Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Review doc 11-21/1569r0** - EVM Issues – CID 13 – Brian HART (Cisco)
     1. Document not posted yet – Chair authorized him to proceed in deference to the limited time left.
        1. Post telecon: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1569-00-000m-evm-issues.pptx>
     2. CID 13 (PHY)
        1. Review submission
        2. Note that a similar/related submission was posted to 11be (11-21/618r3)  
           <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0618-03-00be-evm-and-sfo-sto.pptx>
        3. Slide 9 – summary on direction/discussion history that may be considered.
        4. Changes proposed are documented in 11-21/1570r0
           1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1570-00-000m-cid13.docx>
        5. More work will be needed here.
  3. **Adjourned 12:00 ET**

**References:**

Sept 27:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1572-00-000m-sep-nov-teleconference-agendas.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0935-01-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2021.pptx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1383-01-000m-proposed-comment-resolution-for-gen-cids.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0611-29-000m-revmd-wg-ballot-comments.xls>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-29-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1128-01-000m-on-frattacks-and-related-matters.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0829-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d0-0-cc35.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0965-07-000m-cc35-phy-cids-19-18-14-15-527.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0965-08-000m-cc35-phy-cids-19-18-14-15-527.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1569-00-000m-evm-issues.pptx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0618-03-00be-evm-and-sfo-sto.pptx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1570-00-000m-cid13.docx>