IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 802.11bc Resolution for CIDs | | | | |
| Date: January 18, 2021 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Carol Ansley | Self |  |  | carol@ansley.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for the following 54 comments submitted during LB 252 for 11bc D1.0 clause 9:

**1041**, 1042, 1043, **1068**, 1111, 1146, 1179, 1194, 1195, ~~1213, 1214~~, 1218, 1219, 1235, 1265, 1269, 1380, 1394, 1396, 1427, 1428, 1437, 1438, 1442, 1443, 1444, 1454, 1462, 1463, 1464, 1475, 1478, 1480, 1493, 1509, 1516, 1522, 1551, 1558, 1564, 1572, 1573, 1593, 1595, 1597, 1599, 1600, 1603, 1604, 1607, 1623, 1624, 1625, 1626

Rejected comments are in bold. Revised comments are underlined. Transferred comments are struck through. All other comments are accepted.

Revisions:

* Rev. 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev. 1: Contains changes made after 19 January 2021 teleconference
* Rev. 2: Contains changes made during 26 January 2021 teleconference

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbc Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbc Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbc Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbc Editor” are instructions to the TGbc editor to modify existing material in the TGbc draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbc editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbc Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Commentor | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 1195 | Jonathan Segev | 9 | 24 | 12 | figure number designation needs to follow the order of publication and the placement of the figure. new figures are just consecutive numbers in the section inserted figures in middle of baseline text takes the form 9-11aa for example for a figure inserted after figure 9-11 and with a single prior amendment inserting a single figure ahead of it. | As per comment | Accept. |
| 1235 | Mark Hamilton | 9.3.3.2 | 22 | 18 | Inserted rows should be clear about where the insertion happens. | Replace "into" with "at the end of". Same thing for all the "Insert the ... row(s)" instructions. | Accept. |
| 1194 | Jonathan Segev | 9.3.3.2 | 22 | 1 | In table 9-32 the beacon frame body elements are not part of what ANA maintains | assign a number using the order of publication the the elements ordering. | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to update the numbering used dependent upon the baseline. |
| 1179 | Jonas Sedin | 9.4.2 |  |  | Figures of frames have different font size and horizontal center throughout the document | Fix the font sizes in the figures of frames and the horizon centration. | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to align the font sizes and figure positions per the 802.11 editing practice throughout the draft. |
| 1041 | Albert Petrick | 9.4.2 | 23 | 7 | Clauses 9.4.2 missing text | Add text or remove subclauses | Reject.  Section 9.4.2 has no text in Revmd D5.0 and none is added by this amendment. The section is listed here to preserve Word formatting. |
| 1043 | Albert Petrick | 9.4.2.1 | 23 | 10 | Table 9-94 should be Table 9-92 as referenced in REVmd D5.0. | Change 9-94 to 9-92 | Accept. |
| 1593 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.2.1 | 23 | 10 | two empty rows are in Table 9-94 and should be removed | remove the two empty rows in table Table 9-94 | Accept. |
| 1427 | Minyoung Park | 9.4.2.1 | 23 | 10 | Please remove the empty rows from the table. | As suggested in the comment. | Accept. |
| 1437 | Osama Aboulmagd | 9.4.2.1 | 23 | 10 | Table 9-94 is not correct. It should be Table 9-92 | As in comment. Change Table 9-94 to Table 9-92 | Accept. |
| 1042 | Albert Petrick | 9.4.2.26 | 23 | 12 | Table number is not in REVmd D5.0 it should be Table 9-153 | as commented | Accept. |
| 1551 | Tomoko Adachi | 9.4.2.300 | 24 |  | It seems to be really close to 300 but I am not sure if the subclause numbering for the new elements are correct. Should it start from 9.4.2.296 based on P802.11ba D7.0? Following the precedents, it needs to be cross-checked with the baselines. | Check the baselines and renumber the subclause. | Revised.  Based on the current drafts, 9.4.2.300 will become 9.4.2.296. The sections following it will change from 9.4.2.301 and 9.4.2.302 to 9.4.2.297 and 9,4,2,298, respectively. |
| 1265 | Mark RISON | 9.4.2.300.1 | 24 | 14 | "The format of E-BCS Parameters element is shown in Figure 9-bc1 (E-BCS Parameters element format). " should be before the figure | As it says in the comment | Accept. |
| 1623 | Yasuhiko Inoue | 9.4.2.300.1 | 24 | 10 | Not sure what the left side box means. | Remove the left side rectangular. | Accept. |
| 1428 | Minyoung Park | 9.4.2.300.1 | 24 | 10 | Wrong format. Please remove the empty box above the "Octets:" | As suggested in the comment. Please check other figures and make the same correction. | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to correct the figure outlines per the 802.11 editing practice throughout the draft. |
| 1438 | Osama Aboulmagd | 9.4.2.300.1 | 24 |  | Figure 9-bc1 needs to redrawn and delete the empty box at the beginning of the figure. Other Figures also have the same error. | As in comment. | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to correct the figure outlines per the 802.11 editing practice throughout the draft. |
| 1269 | Mark RISON | 9.4.2.300.2 | 24 | 21 | If it's optional then its length should be shown as "0 or 2" | As it says in the comment | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to correct the figure description per the 802.11 editing practice, i.e. move “(optional)” to the cell above. |
| 1595 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.2.300.2 | 24 | 21 | an extra empty cell is in figure 9-bc2 | remove the empty cell from Figure 9-bc2 | Accept. |
| 1597 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.2.300.2 | 25 | 1 | empty cell in figure 9-bc3 | remove empty cell | Accept. |
| 1624 | Yasuhiko Inoue | 9.4.2.300.2 | 24 | 22 | Not sure what the left side box means. | Remove the left side rectangular. | Accept. |
| 1625 | Yasuhiko Inoue | 9.4.2.300.2 | 25 | 2 | Not sure what the left side box means. | Remove the left side rectangular. | Accept. |
| 1478 | Stephen McCann | 9.4.2.300.2 | 24 | 21 | Octet should be plural within Figure 9-bc2 | Change "Octet" to "Octets" in Figure 9-bc2 | Accept. |
| 1599 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.2.300.3 | 26 | 1 | empty cell in figure 9-bc4 | remove empty cell | Accept. |
| 1600 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.2.300.3 | 26 | 5 | empty cell in figure 9-bc5 | remove empty cell | Accept. |
| 1626 | Yasuhiko Inoue | 9.4.2.300.3 | 26 | 5 | Not sure what the left side box means. | Remove the left side rectangular. | Accept. |
| 1442 | Paul Unterhuber | 9.4.2.300.3 | 26 |  | The format of Figure 9-bc4 is not aligned with other figures | Format of figure should be aligned to Figure 9 bc-3 or and previous | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to correct the figure outlines per the 802.11 editing practice. |
| 1480 | Stephen McCann | 9.4.2.300.3 | 26 | 5 | The font size in Figure 9-bc5 differs from that in Figure 9-bc6. | Change the font size in Figure 9-bc5 to match the font size in the other figures. Other figures have the same issue. | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to correct the figure font sizes per the 802.11 editing practice throughout the draft. |
| 1213 | Kazuto Yano | 9.4.2.301 | 27 | 1 | The notation of Request Time "To" Termination subfield is different between Figures 9-bc7 and 9-bc8. ("To" begins with capital in Figure 9-bc8, but does not in Figure 9-bc7). | Please make consistent the notation of the subfield. |  |
| 1214 | Kazuto Yano | 9.4.2.302 | 28 | 5 | Figure 9-bc11 include "Time to Termination Present". On the other hand, it is represented as "Time To Termination Present" (i.e., "To" begins with capital) in the main text. | Please make consistent the notation of the subfield. |  |
| 1068 | Antonio DeLaOlivaDelgado | 9.4.2.302 | 28 | 21 | is broadcast--> is broadcasted | As per the comment | Reject.  Broadcast is correct for present tense or past tense. |
| 1558 | Tomoko Adachi | 9.4.2.302 | 28 | 4 | Figure 9-bc11 is eBCS Response Info Control subfield, not eBCS Request Info Control subfield. | Correct the figure title. | Revised.  Title in the parentheses will be corrected. |
| 1443 | Paul Unterhuber | 9.4.2.302 | 28 |  | The header "Bits" Figure 9-bc11 is in a different line as the values | Align the word "Bits" with the number of bits | Accept. |
| 1394 | Michael Grigat | 9.4.5.1 | 29 | 10 | "Add the following three new clauses after 9.4.5.29" would expect that next subclause is 9.4.5.30 and not 9.4.5.100 as written in the draft | Check numbering of new clauses | Revised.  Based on latest baseline, section 9.4.5.100 will become 9.4.5.30. Sections 9.4.5.101 and 9.4.5.102 will become 9.4.5.31 and 9.4.5.32 respectively. |
| 1493 | Stephen McCann | 9.4.5.1 | 29 | 8 | In Table 9-331 the references in the right hand column are incorrect | Update the subclause references in the right hand column to 9.4.5.100 etc. | Revised.  Based on the latest baseline, 9.4.5.bc, 9.4.5.bc1, and 9.4.5.bc2 will become 9.4.5.30, 9.4.5.31, and 9.4.5.32 respectively. |
| 1509 | Stephen McCann | 9.4.5.1 | 29 | 9 | Tables 9-331, 9-bc3 and 9-bc4 appear to have different formats and differing fonts. | Harmonise the font and format of these three tables and possibly others within the draft. | Revised.  The TGbc editor is instructed to correct the figure font sizes per the 802.11 editing practice throughout the draft. |
| 1516 | Stephen McCann | 9.4.5.101 | 33 | 16 | The current baseline draft 802.11REVmd D5.0 uses the term unregister. | Change "de-register" to "unregister" | Accept. |
| 1564 | Tomoko Adachi | 9.4.5.102 | 34 | 10 | A closing parenthesis missing. | Add a closing parenthesis before the period. | Accept. |
| 1454 | Stephan Sand | 9.4.5.102 | 34 | 10 | A closing parenthesis is missing in the reference to Figure 9-bc22. | Insert ")" after "format" | Accept. |
| 1444 | Paul Unterhuber | 9.4.5.102 | 34 |  | A header for the proposed values in Figure 9-bc22 is missing | Add "Octets" to indicate the size | Revised.  The TGbc editor will add “Octets:”. |
| 1603 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.5101 | 33 | 15 | "Service" is missing from "Enhanced Broadcast" in the title | add "Service" after "Enhanced Broadcast" | Revised.  The TGbc editor will add “Services” after “Enhanced Broadcast”. The TGbc editor will also search for instances of “Enhanced Broadcast” without “Services” and add “Services” as appropriate. |
| 1604 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.4.5102 | 34 | 17 | "Service" is missing from "Enhanced Broadcast" in the title | add "Service" after "Enhanced Broadcast" | Revised.  The TGbc editor will add “Services” after “Enhanced Broadcast”. The TGbc editor will also search for instances of “Enhanced Broadcast” without “Services” and add “Services” as appropriate. |
| 1111 | Fumihide Goto | 9.42.300.2 | 24 | 21 | "Octet:" should be "Octets:" | as comment | Accept. |
| 1146 | Hitoshi Morioka | 9.6.50.1 | 47 | 9 | Reference error. | Fix error. | Accept. |
| 1218 | Kazuto Yano | 9.6.50.2 | 47 | 9 | There is a reference error for a Table. | Please fix the reference error. | Accept. |
| 1380 | Mark RISON | 9.6.50.2 | 47 | 10 | Do not duplicate information | Change "The eBCS Action field is set to 0 as defined in Table 9-bc12 - eBCS Action field values. " to "The eBCS Action field is set as defined in Table 9-bc12 - eBCS Action field values to indicate eBCS Request. " | Accept. |
| 1572 | Tomoko Adachi | 9.6.50.2 | 47 | 9 | Reference error. | Replace with "9.4.1.11 (Action field)". | Accept. |
| 1462 | Stephan Sand | 9.6.50.2 | 47 | 5 | Section 9.6.50.2 defines the eBCS Requesst Frame format. However, line 4/5 on page 47 reads "The Action field of an eBCS Response frame". | Replace "Response" with "Request" | Accept. |
| 1463 | Stephan Sand | 9.6.50.2 | 47 | 9 | Reference error for a Table. Replace the reference error with "9.4.1.11 (Action field)" | As in comment | Accept. |
| 1475 | Stephen McCann | 9.6.50.2 | 47 | 9 | The "Error!" reference needs to be resolved. | Remove all these errors with the correct references. | Accept. |
| 1219 | Kazuto Yano | 9.6.50.3 | 48 | 2 | There is a reference error for a Table. | Please fix the reference error. | Accept. |
| 1396 | Michael Grigat | 9.6.50.3 | 48 | 2 | Error message for referenced table | add table number | Accept. |
| 1573 | Tomoko Adachi | 9.6.50.3 | 48 | 2 | Reference error. | Replace with "9.4.1.11 (Action field)". | Accept. |
| 1464 | Stephan Sand | 9.6.50.3 | 48 | 2 | Reference error for a Table. Replace the reference error with "9.4.1.11 (Action field)" | As in comment | Accept. |
| 1607 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.6.7.100 | 37 | 6 | empty cell in Figure 9-bc26 | remove empty cell | Accept. |
| 1522 | Stephen McCann | 9.6.7.100 | 36 | 6 | Figure 9-bc26 is poorly formatted | There is an extra box above "Octets" on the left hand side of the figure which should be removed. | Accept. |