IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed resolution for editorial CIDs – Part II |
| Date: 2020-10-26 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  | edward.ks.au@gmail.com |

##### This submission present proposed resolution for CIDs 7077, 7079, 7068, 7069, 7074. The proposed changes are based on P802.11ay/D6.0 and P802.11REVmd/D5.0.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

R1 – Updated resolution to CIDs 7077 and 7068

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7077 | 4.3.30 | 26 | 10 | CID 6150's resolution correctly stated that "may" is normative, and should be avoided in clause 4. However, the replacement with "can" implies there is normative text elsewhere that enables the sentence. "Might" would be better in this case, where it is simply a factual possibility. | Change "can" to "might" |

**Discussion:**

****

As per the 802.11 editorial style guide:

The normative verbs are:

shall - equivalent to “is required to”, “has to”, “must”

should – equivalent to “is recommended to”, “is advised to”

may – equivalent to “is allowed to”, “is permitted to”

The non-normative verbs are:

can – equivalent to “is able to” or “is allowed to, as defined elsewhere in this standard”

might – equivalent to “chooses according to unspecified criteria”

In addition, recently, the new IEEE SA Standards Style Manual (https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf) introduces a new normative verb “can”, but it is not introduced to the IEEE 802.11 editorial style guide.

**Proposed resolution for CID 7077:**

Rejected

As per the IEEE 802.11 editorial style guide, “can” is a non-nomative verb and it is equivalent to “is able to” or “is allowed to, as defined elsewhere in this standard”, which fits to the sentence the commenter refers to.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7079 | 9.3.1.23 | 99 | 8 | The word "MAC" in "broadcast MAC address" is redundant; "broadcast address" is what is defined. There are instances of "broadcast MAC address" that should change to "broadcast address".Note: Similar comment was made against baseline and approved and adopted in REVmd Draft 5.0.Notes: (1) Same comment for the "broadcast MAC address" was made against baseline and approved and adopted in REVmd Draft 5.0. (2) Similar comment holds for "individual MAC address" (which should change to "individual address"), but will be submitted for future to REVme. | Change the following instances of "broadcast MAC address" to "broadcast address": P99L8, P172L13, P172L14, P271L27, P272L13, P272L23, P272L19, P350L21.P72L26, P74L5: Change "Any valid individual MAC address or the broadcast MAC address" to "Any valid individual MAC address, or the broadcast address". |

**Discussion:**



In P802.11REVmd D5.0, we have the following comment that is accepted:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 5032 | 9.4.2.20.13 | 1039 | 34 | The word "MAC" in "broadcast MAC address" is redundant; "broadcast address" is what is defined. There are 8 instances of "broadcast MAC address" and 70 instances of "broadcast address". | Change the following 6 instances of "broadcast MAC address" to "broadcast address": P1039L34, P1082L26, P1082L36, P1315L50, P4059L59 and P4060L17.P322L36: Change "Any valid individual or broadcast MAC address" to "Any valid individual address, or the broadcast address" |

**Resolution for CID 7079:**

Accept.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7068 | 5.1.5.1 | 29 | 1 | There are (likely) unintentional difference between Figure 5-1 of 11ay and that of REVmd.- the position of "} (The 'MPDU Decription and Integrity (optional)' and 'Block Ack Buffering and Reordering' processes may be performed in either order(RX))" should be located 1 block lower position. | Change the position of "{" to as same as the Figure 5-1 in REVmd D5.0. |

**Discussion:**

In P802.11REVmd D5.0, the position of the “}” starts from “Block Ack Buffering and Reording”.



In P802.11ay D6.0, the position of the “}” starts from “SYNRA Receiver Filtering”.



**Resolution for CID 7068:**

Revised.

Change the position of “}” of Figure 5-1 to be the same as Figure 5-1 in IEEE P802.11REVmd D5.0.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7069 | 5.1.5.1 | 31 | 1 | There are (likely) unintentional difference between Figure 5-2 of 11ay and that of REVmd.- the position of lower "<- ->" (Same security keys and PN counters) should point to "MPDU Encryption (TX) / Decryption (RX) and Integrity (optional) | As in comment |

Discussion:

In P802.11REVmd D5.0, the positon of the lower “<- ->” starts at the block “MPDU Encryption (TX) / Decryption (RX) and Integrity (optional)”.



In P802.11ay D6.0, the position of the lower “<- ->” starts from “Block Ack Buffering and Reordering”.



Agree with the commenter but the proposed resolution needs to be more precise.

**Resolution for CID 7069:**

Revised.

Change the position of the lower “<- ->” to be the same as Figure 5-2 in P802.11REVmd D5.0.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7074 | 10.42.7 | 293 | 18 | Xref to 20.10.2.2 is not "hot", and as such is not updating correctly. | Update all xrefs to 20.10.x.x to correct REVmd subclause (20.9.x.x, I believe). |

**Discussion:**



In P802.11REVmd D5.0, the subclause is 20.9.2.2 (Beamforming) instead of 20.10.2.2.:



Agree with the commenter but the proposed resolution needs to be more precise.

**Resolution for CID 7074:**

Revised.

For all of the 18 instances of 20.10.2, 20.10.2.2, 20.10.2.2.2, 20.10.2.2.5, and 20.10.2.2.6, replace them with 20.9.2, 20.9.2.2, 20.9.2.2.2, 20.9.2.2.5, and 20.9.2.2.6, respectively.