IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- July 22-31 2020 |
| Date: 2020-07-22 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGmd REVmd CRC Telecon held July 22 through 31, 2020.

There will be a Telecon on July 24 that will contain motions for resolutions prepared between June 19 to July 17.

R0: Initial version of the minutes for July 22.

1.0 **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Friday July 17, 2020 10:00-12:00 ET**

* 1. **Called to order at 10:05am** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
	2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
		1. No Issues noted.
	3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
		1. About 25 attendees reported by WebEx
	4. -please log with IMAT:
		1. About 13 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Aboulmagd, Osama | Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Harkins, Daniel | Aruba Networks, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Montemurro, Michael | Self |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 7/22 | Wentink, Menzo | Qualcomm Incorporated |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
	1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/1001r5:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-05-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
		2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-15 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

 – see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156> .

Total of 820 comments; approximately 200 comments remaining.

Editors prepared D3.4 incorporating all approved comments to date. Draft 3.4 available on Monday 2020-07-13. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-27-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>.

3. Comment resolution

a) 2020-07-22 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours

1. Emily QI – CID 4050 https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947
2. Menzo WENTINK – including CIDs 4761, 4762, 4315 https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-13-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1038-00-000m-edca-and-hcca.docx>
3. Osama ABOUL-MAGD - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0814-01-000m-proposed-resolutions-to-cids-4145-4146-and-4147.docx>
4. Mark HAMILTON – MAC CIDs, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-12-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx> and <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1114-01-000m-revmd-backoff-procedure-correction.docx>
5. Graham Smith CID 4694 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-10-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx>
6. Mark Rison – CIDs 4565, 4616, 4620, and 4623 for direction, 4137, 4808 (re-visit), 4229/4266, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>.

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
			1. Review all planned on agenda are ready.
		2. No objection to updated Agenda see doc 11-20/1001r5
	1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
		1. No changes from Last Friday
	2. **Review doc 11-20/0947r1** CID 4050 - Emily QI (INTEL)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947-01-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-4050.doc>
		2. CID 4050 (PHY)
			1. Review the updated changes.
			2. Change to Association from ReAssociation.
			3. Need an r2 to be posted.
			4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-22 20:18:56Z) - Incorporate the changes under "Proposed Changes:" in document 11-20/0947r2 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947-02-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-4050.doc>> which clarify SA Query procedures.
			5. Mark Ready for Motion
			6. Prepare for motion on August 7th.
	3. **Review doc 11-20/150r15** - Menzo WENTINK (Qualcomm)
		1. including CIDs 4761, 4762, 4315
		2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-15-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>,
		3. CID 4761
			1. Not ready.
		4. CID 4763 (MAC):
			1. Reassign to Assaf KASHER
		5. CID 4315 (EDITOR2)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review submission discussion –
			3. Review proposed changes; 3 changes.
			4. No discussion
			5. Proposed resolution: CID 4315 (EDTIOR2): Revised; Incorporate the changes in 11-20/0150r15 for CID 4315
			6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		6. CID y, z - Additional Changes described.
			1. Review vestigial edits for “DLS” leftovers.
			2. The Intent to have separate motion for these changes.
			3. Motion to approve: CID (x) and CID (y) - ad hoc proposals. Changes as shown in 11-20/0150r15.
			4.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID **y**Menzo Wentink | There are 4 vestigial occurrences of "DLS" outside the MIB. | Remove these occurences of "DLS". | RevisedTable 10-13 (Settings for the TXVECTOR parameter PARTIAL\_AID for CMMG STAs):1817.14, delete "DLS or" (2x)1818.16 delete "DLS or" (2x) |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID **z**Menzo Wentink | There are 3 vestigial occurrences of "PCO" outside the MIB. | Remove these occurences of "DLS". | RevisedFigure 9-761 (CMMG Operation Information field format):1451.15 delete entries B4 (PCO Active) and B5 (PCO Phase), change "B6" at the Reserved entry to "B4 B6", and change "1" at the Reserved entry to "3".2347.5 delete ", excluding PCO," (in the TDLS section) |

* + 1. Discussion on CID a

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| CID **a**Menzo Wentink | Deleted features still occur in the MIB, including their acronyms. The only change seems to be that the MIB entry is marked as deprecated. | Find a way to delete deleted features from the MIB entirely.Or at least maybe to delete the contents of the deleted MIB variable without deleting the remaining structure. |

* + - 1. More discussion will need to occur.
		1. CID 4762 (MAC):
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review proposed resolution and changes.
			3. The first three lines are the actual proposed resolution, and the rest of the text to be included in the AdHoc notes of the database.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4762 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-07-22 20:41:51Z): At 1340.56, at the bottom of Table 9-272, add a Note as follows: "NOTE 12—See also 11.39 (VHT BSS operation)."
			5. No Objection - Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 4764 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Context
			3. Proposed resolution: CID 4764 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-07-22 20:42:59Z): At 1185.41, before "and" insert ", 11.39 (VHT BSS operation)".
			4. No Objection - Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4811 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Context
			3. Review Proposed changes
			4. Request to have some more review on the ***Wide Bandwidth Channel subelement*** changes.
			5. ACTION ITEM: Menzo to check with Brian HART.
			6. This is a follow-up on an earlier change, and it is believed that this is left over that was missed.
			7. Discussion on the Channel Switch element and the Channel element should all align at least logically in VHT and other clauses.
			8. Discussion on aligning with the VHT operation.
			9. The proposed changes are specific to the comment, and only change the location cited.
			10. Concern with the possible problem in the element if there is a problem with-in the sub-element.
			11. There was objection to accepting the proposed change without looking at the broader subject.
			12. The changes we make have to align with other changes.
			13. Note: 9.4.2.160 Wide Bandwidth Channel Switch element and figure 9-343 Wide Bandwidth Channel subelement format.
			14. More work will be needed.
			15. Assigned to agenda for July 29th (Wednesday)
	1. **Review doc 11-20/0814r2** Osama ABOUL\_MAGD (Huawei)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0814-02-000m-proposed-resolutions-to-cids-4145-4146-and-4147.docx>
		2. CIDs 4145 and 4147 (both MAC):
			1. Review comments.
			2. Review proposed changes.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Revised; incorporate the changes in r2
			4. Request for more time to review.
			5. Discussion on the definition of UP and the use of 802.1D. Traffic Category (TC) vs User Category.
			6. Discussion on UP associations.
			7. Discussed if a Frame has a TID and if the frame has priority, then it is a TIDS, then we may have an UP for the frames.
			8. Discussion on if a packet has or does not have a Priority. Some Priority is required for every MSDU at this point (inbound for QoS traffic).
			9. There are still contexts for UPs in the context of QoS frames.
			10. These will be rescheduled for next week and we will close on the CIDs next week. We are at the point we need to close on the subject.
			11. The total view of QoS in the standard may need a longer discussion.
		3. CID 4146 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Clarification on TSPEC element is needed.
			3. Review submission discussion.
			4. Note: EDCA TSPEC uses UP not TSID.
			5. For Table 9-12- TID subfield, change should just be UP not MSDU or A-MPDU before the UP.
			6. TID cannot carry both an UP and a TSID. So that is the ambiguity that needs to be resolved.
			7. More work needs to be done.
			8. Add to adgenda for next week.
	2. **Reivew doc 11-20/338r14** - MAC CIDs – CID 4479 and 4480 – Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/Comscope)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-14-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
		2. CID 4479 (MAC)
			1. Review the CID
			2. Similar to CID 4480
			3. This comment is effectively a duplicate of CID 4480, which has already been approved and motioned (Motion #187) as Accepted.
			4. Details for CID 4480 are: Change "The STA is a non-AP STA in an infrastructure BSS" to "The STA is a non-AP STA in a DMG infrastructure BSS"
			5. Proposed Resolution: Revised. Change "The STA is a non-AP STA in an infrastructure BSS" to "The STA is a non-AP STA in a DMG infrastructure BSS".

Note to commenter, this is per the resolution to CID 4480, which noted that the DMG case is not covered by a).

Note to Editor: This the same resolution as to CID 4480, which has already been implemented.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for motion
		1. CID 4677 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. This comment is effectively resolved by the resolution to CID 4432.
			3. Proposed resolution: Revised.

(Note, this is the same resolution as the resolution for CID 4432.)

In D3.1:

At the end of the first para of 11.46.2.1 FILS Discovery frame transmission add “The Address 1 field of the FILS Discovery frame shall) be set to the broadcast address.”.

At the end of the second para (“In a non-DMG and non-S1G BSS, …”) of 11.1.3.1 General (in 11.1.3 Maintaining synchronization) add “The Address 1 field of the Beacon or Timing Advertisement frame shall be set to the broadcast address.”.

At the end of the third para (“In a DMG infrastructure BSS, …”) of 11.1.3.1 General (in 11.1.3 Maintaining synchronization) add “The Address 1 field of the Timing Advertisement frame shall be set to the broadcast address.”.

At the end of second para of 14.13.3.1 Beacon generation in MBSSs add “The Address 1 field of the Beacon frame shall be set to the broadcast address.”.

At the end of 11.8.8.1 General (in 11.8.8 Selecting and advertising a new channel) add a para “The Address 1 field of a Channel Switch Announcement frame shall be set to the broadcast address.”

At the end of 11.9.1 General (in 11.9 Extended channel switching (ECS)) add a para “The Address 1 field of an Extended Channel Switch Announcement frame shall be set to the broadcast address.”

At 2302.47 and 2302.49 change “multiple Beacons, Measurement Pilots, or Probe Response frames” to “multiple Beacon, Measurement Pilot, or Probe Response frames”.

At 2318.56, 2320.52/53(2x)/60/61/63, 2321.1/3/5/13/19/43 change “Measurement Pilots” to “Measurement Pilot frames”. At 327.16 change “measurement pilots” to “Measurement Pilot frames”.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for motion
	1. **Review doc 11-20/1114r1** Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/Comscope)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1114-01-000m-revmd-backoff-procedure-correction.docx>
		2. Abstract: Discusses a glitch in REVmc, and proposed a correction, for REVmd consideration.
		3. Review the submission background section.
		4. Review the Proposed changes
		5. Discussion on the use of punctuation and having the Editors make it consistent.
		6. Discussion on the change of Timers to Counters and if it is correctly in place here.
		7. An Upload of revision will be done, and a separate motion will be created.
	2. **Review doc 11-20/272r10** - CID 4694 - Graham Smith (SR Technologies).
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-10-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx>
		2. CID 4694 (PHY)
			1. Review history of proposal
			2. Review the submission and proposed changes.
			3. Discussion on some minor changes that need to be made.
			4. Running out of time, so need to reschedule for review on future call.
	3. **Out of Time:**
		1. We will add to the end of Friday’s agenda the items we did not make today.
	4. **Review Timeline**
		1. To make Oct 13 Deadline for RevCom submission deadline.
		2. Aug 7th will be final Motion for all CIDs for this SA Ballot.
		3. Proposed Monday August 3 and Tuesday August 4 at 3-5pm ET to be able to complete in time.
		4. Discussion on the times
		5. No strong objection.
	5. **Adjourn at 18:01 (6:01 pm) ET**

**References:**

**July 22:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-05-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-27-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947-01-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-4050.doc>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947-02-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-4050.doc>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-15-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0814-02-000m-proposed-resolutions-to-cids-4145-4146-and-4147.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-14-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1114-01-000m-revmd-backoff-procedure-correction.docx>
11. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-10-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx>