IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- July 17 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-07-17 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
| Michael Montemurro | Self |  |  | [montemurro.michael@gmail.com](mailto:montemurro.michael@gmail.com) |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGmd REVmd CRC Telecon held July 17, 2020.

There will be a Telecon on July 24 that will contain motions for resolutions prepared between June 19 to July 17.

R0: Initial version of the minutes. Thanks To Michael Montemurro to helping take Minutes!

1.0 **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Friday July 17, 2020 10:00-12:00 ET**

* 1. **Called to order at 10:05am** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
  2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
     1. No Issues noted.
  3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
     1. About 25 attendees reported by WebEx
  4. -please log with IMAT:
     1. About 22 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Ghosh, Chittabrata | Nokia |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Hart, Brian | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Kakani, Naveen | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Kasher, Assaf | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Knodel, Mallory | Center for Democracy and Technology |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Kumar, Manish | Marvell Semiconductor, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Kwon, Young Hoon | NXP Semiconductors |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Lindskog, Erik | SAMSUNG |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | McCann, Stephen | Self |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Montemurro, Michael | Self |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 7/17 | Wentink, Menzo | Qualcomm Incorporated |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/1001r4:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-04-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-15 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

– see https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156. Total of 820 comments; approximately 280 comments remaining. Editors prepared D3.3 incorporating all approved comments to date. Draft 3.3 available on Monday 2020-05-11. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-26-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>.

Editors planning D3.4 (available mid July) to include resolution approved in May and June motions.

3. Comment resolution

1. **2020-07-17 Friday 10 am Eastern 2 hours** 
   1. Emily QI – CID 4050 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947>
   2. Mark RISON – CID 4087, 4756, 4286, 4137, 4629, 4630, 4363, 4229/4266, 4293, 4298/4299 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435>
   3. Assaf KASHER – CID 4463, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0929>
   4. Gaurav PATWARDHAN - non-AP STA TXOP frame bursting, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1076-01-000m-non-ap-sta-txop-frame-bursting.pptx>
   5. Menzo WENTINK – including CIDs 4761, 4725, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-13-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1038-00-000m-edca-and-hcca.docx>

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
       1. Additional Spec Text Doc to go with 20/1076r1 (Guarav) it is 1104r1.
       2. Request to discuss Specification terminology was denied as the agenda today is full acheduled for Wed 29th July.
    2. No objection to updated Agenda see doc 11-20/1001r5
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. No changes from Wednesday
  2. **Review doc 11-20/0947r0** CID 4050 - Emily QI (INTEL)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947-00-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-4050.doc>
     2. CID 4050 (PHY)
        1. The proposed resolution looks good. The question is what is meant by “immediately following”. The condition should be successfully completed SAE authentication after the start of the association.
        2. This does not cover the FILS Authentication case. I could be covered at a later time.
        3. Not sure what “successful” or “following” is interpreted. “successful” should be deleted.
        4. We need language to say that there is a new SAE authentication.
        5. There is support for the direction, but more offline discussion is required.
        6. Schedule revisiting the CID on the July 22 telecon.
  3. **Review doc 11-20/435r7** – Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. Mark RISON – CID 4087, 4756, 4286, 4137, 4629, 4630, 4363, 4229/4266, 4293, 4298/4299 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435>
     2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
     3. CID 4087 (PHY)
        1. From a high level, the text updates look good.
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4087 (PHY) - REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-17 14:40:45Z) - Incorporate the changes in https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx under "Proposed Changes" for CID 4087 which address the comment in the direction proposed by the commenter.
        3. Ready for motion.
     4. CID 4756 (PHY)
        1. No proposed resolution
        2. As agreed, to earlier, prepare a resolution of “insufficient details” and move the “insufficient details” comments.
     5. CID 4286 (PHY)
        1. The comment is accurate. IEEE 802.1X can be used with PSK so renaming all cases to just IEEE 802.1X without EAP is not correct.
        2. There is an identity exchange with EAP that needs to take place. It is more accurate to use the term EAP authentication.
        3. There are about 100 instances of EAP method. However, they cannot change since there needs to be an identity exchange.
        4. IEEE 802.11 provides a means to exchange EAP messages in frames.
        5. In a section that discusses security assumptions, EAP needs to be explicitly called out.
        6. Some sentences talk about EAP authentication and other talk about 802.1X authentication.
        7. Mark Rison to email Jouni and Mike to prepare a resolution.
        8. Schedule a review of the CID for July 29th.
     6. CID 4137 (PHY)
        1. Scheduled for July 22
     7. CID 4629 (PHY) and CID 4630 (PHY)
        1. No proposed resolution.
        2. Add to insufficient detail comments.
     8. CID 4363 (PHY)
        1. ACTION: Mike to prepare a rejection reason and place on a separate tab in the comment resolution spreadsheet.
     9. CID 4293 (PHY)
        1. ACTION: Mike to include CID 4293 in the insufficient detail group.
     10. CID 4298 (PHY) and CID 4299
         1. ACTION: Mike include these CIDs in the insufficient detail group.
     11. CID 4299 and CID 4266
         1. The definition of operational rate set contains a set of data rates that a STA can receive.
         2. The basic rate is the set of rates that all STAs need to transmit and receive in order to operate on a BSS.
         3. Sean Coffey has posted a document related to these CIDs.
  4. **Review doc 11-20/0929r4** – CID 4463 - Assaf KASHER (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0929-04-000m-sb1-resolution-to-some-xdmg-cids.docx>
  5. CID 4463 (PHY)
     1. The “~” is not required for the entries in the table.
     2. We could simply delete the parenthesis.
     3. There is no objection to the changes themselves – it’s the use of the “~”.
     4. The use of the “~” is correct in this case because it indicates that the number is an approximation.
     5. If we are going to do this, we should go through every number in the standard to determine if a “~” is required.
     6. Any in the timing tables in the PHY clauses use approximations without the “~”
     7. Its obvious why the “~”s are there. These are clearly approximate because they are rounded from repeating decimals.
     8. In the VHT tables, there is a statement that the numbers are rounded.
     9. This table is different from other PHY tables because in this case, the exact duration is environmentally dependent.
     10. One possibility would be to add a note to indicate that the numbers are approximations.
     11. Proposed Resolution: CID 4463 (PHY) - REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-17 15:13:18Z) - Incorporate the changes in document https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0929-02-000m-sb1-resolution-to-some-xdmg-cids.docx under "Discussion" for CID 4463 which make the changes suggested by the commenter and fix other issues with the tables for DMG and CDMG.
     12. Ready for motion.
  6. **Review doc 11-20/1076r1** - non-AP STA TXOP frame bursting - Gaurav PATWARDHAN (HPE),
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1076-01-000m-non-ap-sta-txop-frame-bursting.pptx>
     2. Review document
     3. The devices were configured out of the box.
     4. If the TXOP is set to 0, its not clear that the device can send more than one PPDU.
     5. The TXOP requirements need to be cleaned up.
     6. This presentation is not relevant to TGmd. It discusses implementation behavior, not the standard.
  7. **Review doc 11-20/1104r1** Chittabrata GHOSH (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1104-01-000m-proposed-changes-in-scs-10-23-2-2-and-10-23-2-9.docx>
     2. Review document
     3. No time for discussion or Straw poll, and will be rescheduled for later
     4. The continued discussion will be scheduled for July 29th
  8. **Review doc 11-20/0150r14** CIDs 4761, 4725 - Menzo WENTINK (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-14-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>,
     2. CID 4761 (MAC)
        1. Not Ready
        2. No resolution available for discussion.
        3. Schedule for Wednesday July 22.
     3. CID 4725 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Agree to add "lifetime " as per commenter 's suggestion. But do not agree with the commenter on the proposed deletion in 10.24.2.12.1
        4. The reason why the text should be deleted is because if a packet cannot be transmitted, there is a likelihood that the next packet cannot be transmitted. But do not agree with the commenter on the proposed deletion in 10.24.2.12.1.
        5. Discarding frames is useful to higher layer. For example, TCP communications.
        6. This procedure is always under control of MIB variables, so STA behavior is not
        7. An alternative could be to increase the short retry limit to an exceptionally large number.
        8. ACTION: Menzo to create resolution including modifying the MIB variable to 2^32 - 1
     4. CID 4762 (MAC) and CID 4315 (MAC)
        1. Add to agenda for Wed July 22.
  9. **Review agenda for the next teleconference** on Wed July 22
  10. **Adjourn at 12:02**

**References:**

**July 17:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-04-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0947-00-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-4050.doc>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0929-04-000m-sb1-resolution-to-some-xdmg-cids.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1076-01-000m-non-ap-sta-txop-frame-bursting.pptx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1104-01-000m-proposed-changes-in-scs-10-23-2-2-and-10-23-2-9.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-14-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>