IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- July 15 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-07-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGmd REVmd CRC Telecon held during the 2020 July 802 Electronic Plenary.

R0: Initial version of the minutes.

1.0 **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday July 08, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**

* 1. **Called to order at 4:03pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
  2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
     1. No Issues noted.
  3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
     1. About 50 attendees reported by WebEx
        1. Added as Appendix after References:
     2. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  4. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/1001r3:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-03-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-15 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

– see https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156. Total of 820 comments; approximately 280 comments remaining. Editors prepared D3.3 incorporating all approved comments to date. Draft 3.3 available on Monday 2020-05-11. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-26-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>.

Editors planning D3.4 (available mid July) to include resolution approved in May and June motions.

3. Comment resolution

1. **a2020-07-15 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours – July Plenary meeting**
   1. Youhan KIM – CID 4710, 4569
   2. Mark RISON – CIDs 4629, 4630, 4395, 4363, 4137
   3. Mark RISON CIDs 4746, 4394/4395, 4696, 4229/4266, 4625 additional changes related to. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435>

Also see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1081-00-000m-operational-rates-and-mcss-8213-revmd-sb1-cid-4229.docx> re: CIDs 4229, 4266  
Still under development: 4293, 4298/4299, 4694 (also Graham in 11-20-272).

* 1. Michael MONTEMURRO – PHY CIDs – 4671, 4694
  2. Jon ROSDAHL – GEN CIDs

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
       1. No other Agenda Topics.
    2. No objection to updated Agenda see doc 11-20/1001R4
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. Review doc: 11-17/920r27
     2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-27-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>
     3. Review current status:
     4. Thanks to those that helped in the review.
     5. D3.4 is available in the Members Area.
     6. Master Spreadsheet is 11-19/2156r15:
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-15-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>
     7. Motion Tracking Sheet is 11-19/1839r4:
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1839-04-000m-tgmd-motion-tracking.xlsx>
     8. SA1 Comment Group Status:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Owning Ad-hoc** | **Assigned** | **Discuss** | **Resolution Drafted** | **Ready for Motion** | **Approved** | **Duplicate** | **Grand Total** |
| EDITOR | 18 |  |  | 3 | 584 |  | 605 |
| GEN | 42 | 6 |  | 3 |  |  | 51 |
| MAC | 61 |  | 6 | 17 |  |  | 84 |
| EDITOR2 | 2 |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |
| PHY | 47 |  | 2 | 14 |  | 15 | 78 |
| **Grand Total** | **170** | **6** | **8** | **37** | **584** | **15** | **820** |

* + 1. Comment status:
* Resolved: 584
* Ready for Motions: 37
* Remaining: 199
* Submission Required: 144
  1. **Review doc 11-20/1071r2 - CID 4710,** 4569 - Youhan KIM –
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1071-02-000m-d3-0-miscellaneous-cr.docx>
     2. CID 4569 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission discussion
        3. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (PHY: 2020-07-15 20:16:39Z)
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4710 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission discussion
           1. D3.3 has 35 instances of “NDP frame”. 34 of them are related to S1G, while one is related to CMMG (D3.3 P1810L53).
        3. Review of submission history.
        4. Review the specific changes.
        5. Discussion on if the comment is fully addressed in the resolution.
        6. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-15 20:33:19Z) - Implement the proposed text updates under "Proposed Changes: CID 4710" in https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1071-03-000m-d3-0-miscellaneous-cr.docx.

Note to Commenter:

Instruction to Editor below changes the terms “NDP frame” and “non-NDP frame” to appropriate terms. Note that “non-NDP-CMAC frame” does not seem reasonable as it means “non-NDP carrying MAC information PPDU” whose meaning is not clear. Furthermore, there is one instance of “NDP frame” which is used by CMMG for which “NDP CMAC PPDU” is not relevant.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Review Doc 11-20/435r7** - Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
     2. From the Agenda Entry:
        1. Mark RISON CIDs 4746, 4394/4395, 4696, 4229/4266, 4625 additional changes related to. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435>
        2. Also see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1081-00-000m-operational-rates-and-mcss-8213-revmd-sb1-cid-4229.docx> re: CIDs 4229, 4266
     3. CIDs 4394 and 4395 (PHY):
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission Discussion
        3. Discussion on 11.22.7.3 – “BSSID in the current ESS” – what is the best solution for a replacement. No Change was made.
        4. Proposed resolution for both CID 4394 and 4395: REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-15 20:40:27Z) - Incorporate the changes under "Proposed resolution for CID 4394 and 4395:" in document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4137 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Previously prepared for rejection, pulled from motion in February and again in June.
        3. Review proposed changes
        4. The proposal removes the overload of “Reserved” and uses “Fixed” where a set value is defined.
        5. Discussion on where overload of Reserved is actually called out.
        6. Discussion on a submission for counter proposal and see if there is parts of this submission that could be agreeable to the opposition.
        7. Review History of CID.
        8. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON to work with Youhan KIM on a proposed resolution.
        9. Scheduled for discussion on July 22.
        10. Request schedule time for discussion. – Wednesday July 22nd to review.
     5. CID 4746 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission discussion and proposed changes.
        3. Discussion on how to use the existing SAP and get the deauth/disassoc to work.
        4. One proposal would be to remove the proposed paragraphs that would be moved.
        5. Large amount of work is possibly needed. There may need an insufficient detail rejection be prepared for now.
        6. ACTION ITEM: Mark HAMILTON to prepare rejection reason for consideration for motion on July 24th
        7. (Action item Completed) Proposed Resolution: CID 4746 (MAC): REJECTED (MAC: 2020-07-15 21:11:31Z): The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined.
        8. Mark Ready for Motion
     6. CID 4696 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Review proposed changes.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4696 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-07-15 21:12:35Z): Incorporate the text changes in https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx, which make changes in the direction suggested by the commenter.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion
     7. CID 4625 (EDITOR)
        1. Revisit the CID as this was ACCEPTED in motion 160.
        2. While reviewing the implementation, it was noted another change may need to be made to make the resolution for this CID be more complete.
        3. CID 4761 is also about this "dec(A[b:" stuff.
        4. Discussion on the order of bits and the checking of parameters.
        5. On May 27, TGmd asked Mark to talk to Menzo, for his work on CID 4761 to combine these CIDs and work together on a global solution.
        6. Discussion on how to make these CIDs harmonized.
        7. CID 4625 was motioned, and so the Chair indicated a separate motion for other changes could be considered.
        8. Discussion on whether to keep CID 4625 as is and any changes be included in 4761.
        9. A Proposed change in wording: copy from the second NOTE... "The first bit of the output is ... whichever is smaller". The first bit of the output is the value of bit b or bit c, whichever [bit index?] is smaller.
        10. Proposed to schedule 4761 for discussion on Friday, July 24th if time.
  2. **PHY CIDs – 4671, 4694** - Michael MONTEMURRO (Self)
     1. CID 4671 (PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Draft Resolution: Relative to D3.3,

at 2560.45, change

"indicates support for direct hashing to obtain an ECC password

element by setting the SAE hash-to-element bit in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe

Response frames"

to

"advertises support for direct hashing to obtain an ECC password

element by setting SAE hash-to-element in its Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe

Response frames"

at 2731.13, change

"indicates support for direct hashing to obtain the FFC password element by setting the SAE hashto-

PWE bit in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe Response frames"

to

"advertises support for direct hashing to obtain the FFC password element by setting SAE hash-to-

element in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe Response frames"

* + 1. Discussion on if this was resolved previously or not.
    2. Some discussion on if Doc 11-20/351r0 may have been the resolution.
       1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0351-00-000m-sae-sb1-resolutions.docx>
    3. From Minutes April 3, 2020:

2.6.5 CID 4671 (PHY)

2.6.5.1 Review Comment

2.6.5.2 Review context locations.

2.6.5.2.1 D3.0 – p2571 location

2.6.5.2.2 D3.2 p2560.41 –

2.6.5.2.3 "12.4.4.3.3 Direct Generation of the password element with FFC groups(M137) An SAE peer indicates support for direct hashing to obtain the FFC password element by setting the SAE hash-to-PWE bit"

2.6.5.3 The proposed change is similar what is now in d3.2 by CID 4726.

2.6.5.4 Discussion on if current version is in d3.2 is sufficient.

2.6.5.5 Proposed Resolution: CID 4726: "REVISED (PHY: 2020-01-13 22:14:09Z) - Incorporate the changes given in https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2154-02-000m-sae-anti-clogging-token.docx which clarifies anti-clogging token usage with password identifiers."

2.6.5.6 More Work needed to harmonize the proposed changes.

* + 1. A new proposed resolution was crafted.
    2. From the chat window:
       1. From Mark RISON: I find ~1415 "set to 1"s in D3.4
       2. from Dan Harkins: It’s called a “bit field”, a field composed of bits. Table 9-321, which describes this field of bits, has a column “Bit”. So there is a bit and it’s bit number 5 according to table 9-321.
       3. From Jouni: option 1 looks incorrect to me now. we do not define those as subfields. i.e., it would need to be "setting the SAE hash-to-element bit to 1"
    3. Discussion on bit fields vs integer fields and if we call out setting bits to one or only integer fields.
    4. Straw poll on 2 options:
       1. element bit in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and ProbeResponse frames"to "advertises support for direct hashing to obtain an ECC passwordelement by setting the SAE hash-to-element bit to 1 in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe Response frames"at 2731.13, change"indicates support for direct hashing to obtain the FFC password element by setting the SAE hashto-PWE bit in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe Response frames"to"advertises support for direct hashing to obtain the FFC password element by setting the SAE hash-to-element bit to 1 in the Extended RSN Capabilities field in all Beacon and Probe Response frames"Option 2:at 2731.13, change"SAE hashto-PWE"to"SAE hash-to-element"Note to Commenter: It’s called a “bit field”, a field composed of bits. Table 9-321, which describes this field of bits, has a column “Bit”. So there is a bit and it’s bit number 5 according to table 9-321.
       2. Straw poll
          1. Option 1 or Option 2
          2. Results: 14 – 14
       3. Proposed to go with minimal change.
       4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-15 21:51:16Z) Relative to D3.3 at 2731.13, change

"SAE hashto-PWE"

to

"SAE hash-to-element"

Note to Commenter: It’s called a “bit field”, a field composed of bits. Table 9-321, which describes this field of bits, has a column “Bit”. So there is a bit and it’s bit number 5 according to table 9-321.

* + - 1. Mark Ready for Motion.
    1. CID 4694 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. This was assigned to Mark RISON before.
       3. From Adhoc Notes:

PHY: 2020-06-30 19:11:18Z -

Reviewed. Mark R to search emails and follow-up with Graham. Related but not the same as CID 4178, 4179 (already been motioned), 4575 and 4576.

Only 4179 has been motioned. CID 4178, 4575, and 4576 is Ready for Motion.

* + - 1. Doc 11-20/272r8 is by Graham and should be considered for the resolution.
         1. https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0272-08-000m-cids-from-mike-to-graham-2.docx
      2. go to Page 15
      3. Presentation has a lot of changes to review and we need to look at the context of the changes.
      4. Ran out of time. – Rescheduled
  1. **Review next Telecon** agenda:
     1. **2020-07-17 Friday 10 am Eastern 2 hours** 
        1. Emily QI – CID 4050 11-20-947
        2. Mark RISON – CID 4087, 4756, 4286
        3. Assaf KASHER – CID 4463, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0929-01-000m-sb1-resolution-to-some-xdmg-cids.docx>
        4. Gaurav PATWARDHAN - non-AP STA TXOP frame bursting
        5. Menzo WENTINK – including CIDs 4725, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0150-13-000m-assorted-crs-revmd-draft-3-0.docx>, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1038-00-000m-edca-and-hcca.docx>
  2. **Adjourned 6:00pm**

**References:**

**July 15:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-03-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0323-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-july-2020.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-27-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-15-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1839-04-000m-tgmd-motion-tracking.xlsx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1071-02-000m-d3-0-miscellaneous-cr.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0351-00-000m-sae-sb1-resolutions.docx>

**IMAT Attendance Report for Wednesday July 15, 2020 -**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |