IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- July 8-10 2020 |
| Date: 2020-07-08 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons for July 8 through July 10, 2020.

R0: Minutes for July 08, 2020

1.0 **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday July 0817, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**

* 1. **Called to order at 4:03pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
	2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
		1. No Issues noted.
	3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
		1. About 12 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Kakani, Naveen | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Montemurro, Michael | Self |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 7/8 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
	1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/1001r1:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-01-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
		2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-15 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

 – see https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156. Total of 820 comments; approximately 280 comments remaining. Editors prepared D3.3 incorporating all approved comments to date. Draft 3.3 available on Monday 2020-05-11. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-26-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>.

Editors planning D3.4 (available mid July) to include resolution approved in May and June motions.

3. Comment resolution

**a) 2020-07-08 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours**

i. Mark HAMILTON – MAC CIDs,

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-12-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>

1. Osama ABOUL-MAGD - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0814-01-000m-proposed-resolutions-to-cids-4145-4146-and-4147.docx>
2. Mark Rison CIDs 4277, 4423, 4178/4575/4576, 4717/4718, 4746, 4394/4395, 4696, 4229/4266.

Still under development: 4293, 4298/4299, 4694 (also Graham in 11-20-272).

iv. Matthew Fischer 11-20-516r17 - CID 4156

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
			1. Osama wishes to delay – move to July 22nd
			2. Mark RISON – CID 4625 additional related changes
			3. Matthew FISCHER was not on the call but should be. R17 is now posted.
			4. No other Agenda Topics.
		2. No objection to updated Agenda see doc 11-20/1001R2
	1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
		1. **Review current status**:
			1. Currently under review for D3.4 and hope to post by Monday.
			2. Reviewers of changes are expected to have results by Friday.
		2. THANKS to the Editors for all the efforts of the Editors work and to the reviewers to ensure the changes being made.
	2. **Review Doc 11-20/338r12** – MAC CIDs - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-12-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
		2. CID 4768 (MAC)
			1. Review comment.
			2. Review submission discussion and proposed changes.
			3. The new name for “WSM element” changing to “Tuple of WSM Type and WSM Information”. Need to include fields -- change “WSM element” to “Tuple of WSM Type field and WSM Information field”.
			4. Proposed Resolution: Revised. At the cited location (P680.44 and P680.28): Change "ContactVerificationSignal" to "Map ID" in the parameter list and parameter table. Replace “Contact Verification Signal element” with “Integer”. In the Valid Range column, replace with “0 – 255”. In the parameter table's Description column, replace the text with, "Map ID is set to the Map ID field of the recently transmitted WSM, which is being verified."

At P681.17 and P681.34: Change "ContactVerificationSignal" to "Map ID" in the parameter list and parameter table. Replace “Contact Verification Signal element” with “Integer”. In the Valid Range column, replace with “0 – 255”. In the parameter table's Description column, replace the text with, "Map ID field is the Map ID field of the received Contact Verification Signal frame, and identifies the WSM that is being verified."

At P683.26 (MLME-GDDENABLEMENT.confirm) change “WSM element” to “Tuple of WSM Type field and WSM Information field”. Same thing at P685.23 (MLME-GDDENABLEMENT.response).

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 4771 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion and proposed changes.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Revised. After the first sentence of the NOTE at P187.37, delete the rest of the NOTE.
			4. Discussion on if the parts of the NOTE to be deleted may need to be explicitly stated elsewhere or not.
			5. Discussion on not having it in the NOTE in clause 3 where it is obscure, and if it should be moved, to where.
			6. Updated Proposed Resolution: Reject; The comment has not identified an error in the text. The contents of the NOTE are information to the reader.
			7. Clause 9.2 is not a good fit for the text, so we do not have a simple relocation that can be done.
			8. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 4380 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion and proposed changes.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Revised; Change “Neighbor List elements” to “Neighbor Report elements” at P457.18 (2x) and at P458.17 (2x).

At P2315.49, insert “of” (to become “list \_of\_ Neighbor Report elements”).

At P1526.33, P455.5 and P455.63, change “neighbor list” to “list of neighbor reports”

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. The next 3 CIDs (4813, 4812, 4784) in the document are noted as Insufficient detail and will be rejected in a motion at the next motion point.
		2. Propose to add to agenda on July 22ne to review the bulk of the remaining CIDs in the document.
	1. **Review doc 11-20/435r6** Mark RISON (Samsung)
		1. See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-06-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
		2. Mark Rison selected CIDs 4277, 4423, 4178/4575/4576, 4717/4718, 4746, 4394/4395, 4696, 4229/4266.
		3. Still under development: 4293, 4298/4299, 4694 (also Graham in 11-20-272).
		4. CID 4277 (PHY)
			1. Review comment’
			2. The difference between NDP\_1M BlockAck and NDP\_2M BlockAck was discussed.
			3. Discussion on why the extra description for NDP\_1M BlockAck was not included in NDP\_2M BlockAck.
			4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-07-08 21:03:18Z) - Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 4277 in 11-20/435r7 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>>, which address the comment in the direction proposed by the commenter.
			5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		5. CID 4423 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. From the Minutes of June 30:

4.5.13 CID 4423 (PHY)

4.5.13.1 Waiting for alternate proposal or reject for insufficient details.

4.5.13.2 Review Minutes for May 13:

1.6.11 CID 4423 (PHY)

1.6.11.1 Review Comment

1.6.11.2 Duration time vs time duration; there are about 31 instances.

1.6.11.3 Need to examine them one by one as there are cases where the change may not make sense.

1.6.11.4 Discussion on how the changes could be made and the value of the different variations.

1.6.11.5 Need submission – Assigned to Mark RISON

4.5.13.3 From minutes on June 10:

1.7.3 CID 4423 (PHY)

1.7.3.1 Review Comment

1.7.3.2 In some of these cases, the field names have been changed. We have tried to avoid changing field names.

1.7.3.3 In 9.4.2.100, the text is not consistent with the field names.

1.7.3.4 “Recovery Time Duration” is a field name. This looks to be an S1G field name.

1.7.3.5 Energy limited operation is not widely implemented at this time.

1.7.3.6 For this feature, there is an EL timer. It would be better to change “Recovery Time Duration” to “Recovery Timer”.

1.7.3.7 Need to fix “Max Awake Duration” as well.

1.7.3.8 In Table 9-85, the proposed change in Time Slot Protection Request definition does not make sense.

1.7.3.9 ACTION ITEM: CID 4423 (PHY) MORE WORK NEEDED – People are encouraged to review the changes in the uploaded document.

4.5.13.4 Schedule for Telecon, Wednesday July 8th

* + - 1. Review the field names that were noted not to change.
			2. Review the changes considering the minutes that were read out.
			3. No objection to the proposed changes.
			4. Proposed resolution: Revised;

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 4423 in https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx, which address the comment in the direction proposed by the commenter.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 4178 (PHY), CID 4575 (EDITOR), CID 4576 (EDITOR):
			1. These were reviewed and marked ready for motion last Friday.
			2. The CID 4694 (PHY) is similar and was pending an update.
			3. Reviewed. Mark R to search emails and follow-up with Graham. Related but not the same as CID 4178, 4179 (already been motioned), 4575 and 4576.
			4. Need to have Graham’s Review of CID 4694 before marking ready for motion.
		2. CID 4717 (MAC) and 4718 (MAC)
			1. Review comments
			2. Review submission discussion and proposed changes.
			3. Review CID 4439 and 4438 –
				1. Question on HT-Delayed BlockAck -
				2. 11-20/625r2 from Graham with some changes.
				3. Revisit on July 10th is the scheduled time.
			4. A submission is being prepared to delete HT-Delayed BlockAck
			5. Request to embed the new Viso figure in R7.
			6. Extra instructions for some edits after embedded need to be made. Reviewed with Editor to ensure they knew what to adjust.
			7. Reviewed the proposed changes that will include a figure in R7.
			8. Proposed resolution 4717 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-07-08 21:38:00Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-20/0435r7 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-06-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx> ), which adds a figure similar to the request.
			9. Proposed resolution 4718 (MAC); reject (reject reason to be posted to reflector for review and added to MAC Adhoc comment file).
			10. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. Review doc 11-20-516r17 - CID 4156 - Matthew Fischer (Broadcom)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-17-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>
		2. CID 4158 (MAC), CID 4159 (MAC), 4160 (MAC)
			1. Review changes to R17
			2. CID 4158 (EDITOR) - revisit, already approved
				1. It was already incorporated in D3.4
				2. update CID 4158 (EDITOR), to be: REVISED Incorporate changes as shown in 11-20/0516r17 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-17-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx) that are marked with CID 4158 which generally agree with the commenter’s suggestion.
			3. Discussion on field being reserved or having a value where it differs with which frame it is in, seems a bad direction to take.
			4. From an email exchange- posted to the WebEx Chat Window:

from [V] Matthew Fischer Broadcom to everyone:

For MSCS in (re)assoc, essentially, you're" at the start saying the non-AP STA always sets it to "Add", and the AP doesn't check it. In that case,

I would suggest you say it is reserved for (re)assoc, so that in the

future it can be extended to some new/variant request if necessary.

Where possible, I believe that it is good practice to keep each defined entity as completely self describing.

I.e. I believe that it leads to simpler and less error-prone designs to have the elements within a field be known completely from the information found within that element.

So to have the interpretation of a field within an element depend on information outside of the element violates that principle.

OK, but we have a number of things where the interpretation depends

on the container/context, and as I said this allows the field to be

reserved for future use (OCE R3 or whatever).

We have a mix, without a hard rule.

I suggest that, based on experience, the self-describing structure is always better.

* + - 1. Discussion on if the document is sufficient or not.
			2. Discussion on checks on the reception of a frame.
			3. CID 4160 (EDITOR) was rejected and motion 187.
			4. CID 4158 (EDITOR) needed a reconsideration with the EDITOR motions.
			5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2020-07-08 21:50:02Z): Incorporate the changes as shown in 11-20/0516r17 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-17-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx) for CID 4159. These include the MSCS setup in (Re)Association request and response frames, as requested.
			6. Will have a separate motion for CID 4159 (MAC)
			7. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. Review next telecon –
		1. Motion on Friday for CID 4695
		2. See 11-20.1011r2 for agenda.
	2. Adjourned 6:02pm ET.

**References:**

**July 08:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-01-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-26-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-12-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-06-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-07-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-1001-02-000m-2020-july-august-agendas.docx>