IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- June 24 -30 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-06-24 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons for June 24 through June 30, 2020.

R0: Minutes for June 24, 2020

1.0 **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday June 17, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**

* 1. **Called to order at 4:03pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
  2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
     1. No Issues noted.
  3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
     1. About 14 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Montemurro, Michael | BlackBerry |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
|  | TGmd | 6/24 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/535r26:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-26-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-12 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

2.  Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.  Comment resolution:

* + 1. **ednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours**

1. Youhan KIM – CIDs 4538, 4296,

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-01-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx>

1. Youhan KIM – CID 4513 –

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0892-01-000m-mcs32-deprecation.docx>

1. Mark Rison CIDs: 4178, 4575 and 4576

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>

1. Matthew FISCHER – CIDs 4416, 4613, 4614 on PV1 security,

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0877-00-000m-cr-pv1-security.docx>

1. CIDs pulled from June Motions

a.      PHY: 4445, 4178, 4137

b.      MAC: 4723, 4155, 4159

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
       1. Question on Presentation that did not get motioned last week on SAE issues. Scheduled for next Motion Telecon July 24th.
    2. No objection to updated Agenda see R27
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. **Review current status**:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Tab Name | | | Number of comments | | | |  | | | | | |
|  | | |  | | | |  | | | | | |
| All SB comments | | | 820 | | | |  | | | | | |
| 201912 Approved | | | 1 | | | |  | | | | | |
| 202001 Approved | | | 221 | | | |  | | | | | |
| 202002 Approved | | | 116 | | | | Note that CID 4140 was approved in Feb 2020 again with the revised resolution. | | | | | |
| 202003 Approved | | | 47 | | | |  | | | | | |
| 202004 Approved | | | 46 | | | |  | | | | | |
| 202005 Approved | | | 95 | | | | Note that some resolved CIDs were approved with resivsed resolutions. | | | | | |
| 202006 Approved | | | 64 | | | |  | | | | | |
|  | | |  | | | |  | | | | | |
| Comment Resolution Status | | | |  |  | |  |  |  |  |
| **Owning Ad-hoc** | **Assigned** | | **Discuss** | **Review** | **Resolution Drafted** | | **Ready for Motion** | **Approved** | **Duplicate** | **Grand Total** |
| EDITOR | 20 | |  |  |  | |  | 584 |  | 604 |
| GEN | 42 | | 9 |  |  | |  |  |  | 51 |
| MAC | 74 | |  | 1 | 6 | | 4 |  |  | 85 |
| EDITOR2 | 2 | |  |  |  | |  |  |  | 2 |
| PHY | 59 | |  |  |  | | 2 |  | 17 | 78 |
| **Grand Total** | **197** | | **9** | **1** | **6** | | **6** | **584** | **17** | **820** |

* + 1. Discussion on the details presented.
    2. The editors will produce a D3.4 will be available in about 3 weeks.
  1. **Review doc 11-20/891r1** - CIDs 4538, 4296 - Youhan KIM (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-01-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx>
     2. CID 4538 (PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission “Background”
        3. Proposed resolution: CID 4538 (PHY): Revised

Note to Commenter:

There are 22 instances of “data part” in REVmd D3.3. These are modified to appropriate terms in the instruction below.

Instruction to Editor:

Change “DATA part” to “DATA field” at D3.3 P2921L42, and P2922L55.

Change “DATA part” to “Data field” at D3.3 P2993L43.

Change “data part” to “Data field” at D3.3 P3083L45, P3083L49, P3101L26, P3101L34, P3124L51, P3124L56, P3464L33, P3464L35, P3475L21, P3475L29, P3484L46, P3484L51, P3492L37, P3494L55, P3494L59, P3512L11, P3512L17, P3551L14, P3551L18.

* + - 1. Discussion on why changing “DATA part” to “DATA field”.
      2. Discussion on the non-change of Data part in two cases but decided that all should change.
      3. Discussion on if it is a real field or not, or at least it could be described as one. There are over 400 instances of “Data field” in the spec already.
      4. Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4296 (PHY)
       1. Review comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Revised.

Note to Commenter:

There are not many places in REVmd using the terms “non-HT/HT/VHT training”. For example, “non-HT training” is used only once in REVmd D3.3. Instruction to Editor below replaces “non-HT/HT/VHT training” with other defined terminologies.

Instruction to Editor:

Implement the proposed text updates for CID 4296 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-02-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx>

* + - 1. Review the proposed changes.
      2. Update to the Resolution: CID 4296 (PHY) Revised; Incorporate the changes as shown for CID 4296 in 11-20/0891r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-03-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx> ), which replaces the cited phrases with other defined terminologies.
      3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Review Doc 11-20/0892r1**– CID 4513 – Youhan KIM (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0892-01-000m-mcs32-deprecation.docx>
     2. CID 4513 (PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Missing place that needs to have a sentence of deprecation also added (D3.3 p3715.6).
        4. Discussion on where the deprecation sentence should be placed and how often.
        5. Proposed resolution: CID 4513 (PHY): Revised

Note to Commenter:

HT MCS 32 is an optional feature and is not widely adopted by WLAN products. Since two WLAN generations (11ac/ax) have already passed since the introduction of the HT MCS 32, the use of HT MCS 32 is anticipated to only decrease even further in the future. Hence, HT MCS 32 is proposed to be deprecated.

Instruction to Editor:

Add the following sentence at D3.3 P3035L26:

“The use of MCS 32 format is deprecated.”

Change D3.3 P3715L6 as:

“Support for MCS with index 32” to “Support for MCS with index 32. The use of MCS with index 32 is deprecated.”

* + - 1. Discussion on making consistent style of text for the deprecation.
      2. Proceed with the proposed resolution, and Emily will check to ensure consistency on the deprecation sentences.
      3. Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Review doc 11-20/435r4** - CIDs: 4178, 4575 and 4576 - Mark RISON (Samsung)
     1. [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx )
     2. CIDs 4178 (PHY), 4575 (EDITOR), 4576 (EDITOR)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes.
        3. On Friday, we passed a motion on 4179, which addresses the issue in a bit different path.
        4. CID 4177 and 4179 are both similar, and we motioned them.
        5. Add a note to these Resolutions to indicate the similar CIDs being edited.
        6. Discussion on how to resolve the set of CIDs.
     3. Proposed resolution for CIDs 4178 (PHY), 4575 (EDITOR), 4576 (EDITOR): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 11-20/0435r5 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>> resolves the comments in the direction suggested by the commenter.
     4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Review doc 11-877r0 -** CIDs 4416, 4613, 4614 on PV1 security, Matthew FISCHER (Broadcom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0877-00-000m-cr-pv1-security.docx>
     2. CID 4466 (PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Some comments were sent to Matthew to consider in his submission.
        4. More work may need to be done, but we will review the next CID for now.
        5. CID 4466 (PHY): Will be covered along with CID 4613.
     3. CID 4613 (PHY)
        1. Review comment
        2. Discussion on the use or restrictions of PV1 Frames.
        3. Discussion on Alignment of GCMP
        4. More comments were sent to Matthew for consideration with edits suggested.
        5. More discussion on usage rules of PV1
        6. Previously CID 4388 resolution includes: "REVISED (PHY: 2020-03-09 19:53:01Z) - Add the following at 12.5.5.1 (GCMP Overview) P2614.62: “An S1G STA shall use PV0 frames when using GCMP encapsulation.”"
           1. So this proposal will need to take this into account as well.
        7. More chat window information:

See resolution to CID 4612 in 20/0435, which proposes condensing all this waffle to just

The STA MAC Address Identified By A2 subfield shall contain the Address 2 field from the MAC header for PV0 MPDUs and the MAC address identified by the A2 field in the MAC header for PV1 MPDUs.

* + - 1. Discussion on D3.0 p902.54 – that has MAC addresses are described differently.
      2. Question on what is wrong with the current text. The proposed change is trying to clean up the language in the cited location.
      3. Review the change on 12.5.3.3.4 the paragraph has two sentences proposed, and the discussion was leaning to remove the 2nd sentence.
      4. Before we proceed, request to review D3.0 780.45 which has a different format of the sentence.
      5. Discussion on the various wording variations.
      6. CID 4612 is a similar CID and is currently assigned to Mark RISON.
      7. CID 4611 is also similar but on a different page.
      8. One person should take all the resolutions: 4611, 4612, 4613, 4614 and 4466 to harmonize the resolutions.
      9. The Resolution for CID 4611, 4612, 4614 have a resolution prepared by Mark RISON – these resolutions were reviewed before.
      10. See doc 11-20/435r4
          1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
      11. Review proposed resolution for CID 4612.
      12. Discussion on the value of the Note…. suggest removing it.
      13. CID 4611 is same comment with different resolution.
      14. This also has changes proposed for CID 4614 which was covered by the document from Matthew.
      15. Discussion on adding a reference to 9.8.3.2.
      16. With the addition of the cross reference, Matthew would be ok with giving CID 4614 to Mark RISON.
      17. Doc 11-20/435r5 will be posted.
      18. Proposed resolution for CID 4611 (PHY), CID 4612 (PHY), and CID 4614 (PHY): REVISED (PHY: 2020-06-24 21:59:43Z) - Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 4612 in 11-20/435r5 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-05-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>> , which make changes in the direction suggested by the commenter.
      19. Mark CID 4611 (PHY), CID 4612 (PHY), and CID 4614 (PHY) ready for motion.
      20. ACTION ITEM: A check for CID 4466 and 4613 to be aligned with this resolution to be done by Matthew FISCHER.
      21. Review those two CIDs later.
  1. Review future Telecon agendas.
     1. See R27 of agenda
     2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-27-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
  2. Adjourned 6:pm

**References:**

**July 24th:**

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-26-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-01-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-02-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0891-03-000m-d3-0-phy-cr-part-2.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0892-01-000m-mcs32-deprecation.docx>

* + 1. [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx )

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0877-00-000m-cr-pv1-security.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-27-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>