IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- May 27-29 2020 |
| Date: 2020-05-27 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons for May 27 and 29, 2020.

R0: May 27, 2020

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday May 27, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**
	1. **Called to order at 4:03pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
	2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
		1. No Issues noted.
	3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
		1. About 10 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co.,  Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Montemurro, Michael | BlackBerry |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 5/27 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
	1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/535r18:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-18-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
		2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-12 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

2.  Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.  Comment resolution:

a) 2020-05-27 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours

i. Edward AU – CID 4505, 4216, 4201, 4217, 4218, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0371-06-000m-resolution-for-cmmg-mac-related-cids-4217-4218-and-4250.docx>, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0823-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4505.docx>

ii. Mark HAMILTON CIDs, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-03-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>

iii. Mark Hamilton – STA meaning convention <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0690-00-000m-sta-meaning-convention.docx>

iv. GEN CIDs – Jon ROSDAHL

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
			1. No comments on proposed agenda
		2. No objection to updated Agenda see R19
	1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
		1. No update since Friday.
		2. Still working on d3.4 – should be ready be end of next month.
	2. **CID 4505, 4216, 4201, 4217, 4218,** Edward AU –
		1. **Review doc 11-20/823r0**
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0823-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4505.docx>
			2. CID 4505 (MAC)
				1. Abstract: This submission presents a resolution for CID 4505. The proposed changes are based on REVmd/D3.3 and prepared based on the changes proposed by Mark Rison from his contribution 20/0435r3.
				2. Review Comment
				3. Review the proposed changes
				4. Question on new paragraph in 9.6.29.3 – is it needed with the other changes?
				5. Reference to table 9-34 – item 62 - Operating Mode Notification there should be a CMMG version also. – there is a CMMG version that is different, and it should be on a separate line.- There is a separate CMMG version of these type things.
				6. Another CID may be correcting the MIB, but not subject of this CID.
				7. Clause 11.41 is not replicated, and that was not probably the intent of TGaj, the response from that group is still pending.
				8. Resolve with the new paragraph in place.
				9. Proposed Resolution: CID 4505 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-27 20:17:31Z): Incorporate the changes shown in 11-20/0823r1 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0823-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4505.docx). This makes changes as proposed, and fixes some individual locations. Action item: Edward AU to follow-up with the 11aj experts about Operating Mode Notification.
				10. Mark Ready for Motion
		2. **Review Doc 11-20/0371r6:**
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0371-06-000m-resolution-for-cmmg-mac-related-cids-4217-4218-and-4250.docx>
			2. CID 4217 and 4218 (EDITOR)
				1. Previously done – Motion #187 – Revisit
				2. Review the submission and proposed updates.
				3. Propose to update the resolution as shown in the R6.
				4. No objection to the updates.
				5. Will remotion with the updated document.
			3. CID 4216 (MAC)
				1. Review comment
				2. Review proposed changes.
				3. Proposed resolution: CID 4216 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2020-05-27 20:39:38Z): Note to the editors: The proposed resolution is part of the resolutions for CIDs 4217 and 4218.
				4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
			4. CID 4201 (MAC)
				1. Review comment
				2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4201 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2020-05-27 20:41:07Z): Note to the editors: The proposed resolution is part of the resolutions for CIDs 4217 and 4218.
				3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	3. **Mark HAMILTON CIDs,**
		1. **Review doc 11-20/338r3**:
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-03-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
		2. CID 4534 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review submission discussion
			3. Discussion on Table 9-106—Optional subelement IDs for Beacon request Subelement ID Name Extensible 0 SSID No(#2584) example.
			4. Proposed resolution: Revised – incorporate the changes for CID 4534 in 11-20/338r3 which resolves the comment in the direction given by the commenter, but in a different location/way.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4567 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review proposed changes.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Revised.

Replace:

If the MAC Address field included in the Frame request was not set to the broadcast address, a Frame Report Entry field where Transmitter Address (TA) matching the MAC address field value shall be included in the Frame report if at least one Data or Management frame was received with this Transmitter Address during the measurement duration.

with:

If the MAC Address field included in the Frame request was not set to the broadcast address, the measuring station shall report, in one or more Frame reports, only those Data or Management frames received during the measurement duration with a TA field matching the MAC Address field of the Frame request, if at least one such frame was received.

Also, in 9.4.2.20.8, Replace:

If the MAC Address field is the broadcast address, then all Data or Management frames are counted toward the Frame report generated in response to this Frame request. For other MAC addresses, only frames matching this MAC address as the Transmitter Address are counted toward the Frame report generated in response to this Frame request.

with:

The MAC Address field indicates the TA field to match against Data and Management frames in order to count toward the Frame report generated in response to this Frame request.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 4808 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Revised.

At P1543.10 and P1543.18, replace:

“is optionally present if security is required on the direct link.”

with:

“is present if the transmitting STA has security enabled on its link with the AP”.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
		1. CID 4653 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
			4. This will give us “Optionally present”.
			5. Need to Revisit CID 4652 and change that resolution to: Revised. Change to "optionally present"
			6. CID was resolved with Motion 167 previously.
			7. Action item: Mark H to send resolution for review by Jouni and Dan.
			8. Mark both Ready for Motion (CID 4652 to be revisited).
		2. CID 4325 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. In 11-20/272r6, Graham states that there are 5 instances of “AC parameters”, there are 22 instances of “EDCA parameters”.
			4. Discussion on if the changes are sufficient.
			5. Change “AC parameters chosen” to “The EDAC parameters announce by the AP….”
			6. Proposed resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-05-27 21:31:11Z) - Incorporate the changes for CID 4325 in doc 11-20/338r4 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-04-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>which changes the 5 locations of AC parameters to announced EDCA.
		3. CID 4445 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Proposed resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-05-27 21:27:27Z) - Incorporate the changes for CID 4445 in doc 11-20/338r4 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-04-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx> which resolves the comment in the direction suggested by the commenter.
			4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 4462 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (PHY: 2020-05-27 21:28:42Z) - As described in the definition of bufferable unit (BU), and Figure 5-1’s flow of action for transmitted frames, aggregation into A-MSDUs occurs before the power buffering stage, and thus A-MSDUs are buffered.
			4. No objection – Mark Ready for motion
	1. **STA meaning convention** - Mark Hamilton ()
		1. **Review doc: 11-20/690r0:**
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0690-00-000m-sta-meaning-convention.docx>
		2. Abstract: This submission contains discussion about how we use the phrase “<adjective> STA” in IEEE Std 802.11, partially in response to REVmd CID 4419, but also for general use and avoidance of confusion in the future.
		3. CID 4419 (GEN)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review the submission and changes proposed.
			3. Request to use double quotes instead of single quotes.
			4. D3.2 P151.35 needs a double quote in the text that was moved.
			5. Discuss removal of the “assume” and use “understood as” and remove “references to this standard”.
			6. Some discussion on the use of “instance” vs “instantiation”.
				1. Use instance in this resolution.
			7. Proposed resolution: Revised; Incorporate the recommendation in 11-20/690r1 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0690-01-000m-sta-meaning-convention.docx>>which addresses the comment in a different direction than suggested by the commenter.
			8. Mark Ready for Motion
	2. **GEN CIDs:** Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		1. CID 4783 (GEN)
			1. Note: dot11OpportunisticTransmissionsActivated is a CMMG/CDMG variable.
			2. The proposed resolution includes instructions to deprecate a MIB variable.
			3. A MIB entry cannot be removed. A MIB variable name may be changed if it does not affect existing implementations.
			4. ACTION ITEM: Submission Required. Assign to Edward AU
		2. CID 4787 (GEN)
			1. ACTION ITEM: Jon ROSDAHL to send to Jouni MALINEN and Dan HARKINS for review
			2. The proposed resolution looks straight forward. No technical changes are required. Could this be an Accept?
			3. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2020-05-27 21:53:31Z)
			4. Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4244 (GEN)
			1. This is a straightforward change that adds a conditional on the STA not being a MESH STA.
			2. The resolution to CID 4245 may already address this comment.
			3. If this comment has already been implemented, then we should add a note to the editor.
			4. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2020-05-27 21:57:05Z) Note to the editor: this change is included in the resolution of CID 4245.
			5. Mark Ready for Motion
	3. **Review Next telecon agenda plan.**
	4. **Adjourn 6:02 pm**

**References:**

**May 27:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-18-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0823-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4505.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0371-06-000m-resolution-for-cmmg-mac-related-cids-4217-4218-and-4250.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0338-03-000m-revmd-initial-sa-comments-assigned-to-hamilton.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0690-00-000m-sta-meaning-convention.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0690-01-000m-sta-meaning-convention.docx>