IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- May 20-22 2020 |
| Date: 2020-05-20 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons for May 20 and 22, 2020

R0: May 20th, 2020

**1.0** **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday May 20, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**

* 1. **Called to order at 4:05pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
	2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
		1. No Issues noted.
	3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
		1. About 13 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Kwon, Young Hoon | NXP Semiconductors |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Montemurro, Michael | BlackBerry |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 5/20 | Venkatesan, Ganesh | Intel Corporation |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
	1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/535r16:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-16-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
		2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-12 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

2.  Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.  Comment resolution:

1. **2020-05-20 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours**
	1. Ganesh VENKATESAN – CID 4224, <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0758-00-000m-resolution-to-cid-4224.docx>
	2. CIDS 4155, 4159 – confirm resolutions in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-05-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx> and <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0927-59-000m-revmd-mac-comments.xls>
	3. Michael MONTEMURRO - CID 4301 – Confirm resolution, see <http://www.ieee802.org/11/email/stds-802-11-tgm/msg01878.html>
	4. Mark RISON – including CIDs 4512 (starting on page 41 of the document), 4516, 4353, 4413, 4501, 4247, 4531 (page 35), 4612 (page 32), 4087 (page 29), 4625 (page 27), 4205 (page 13), 4451 (page 5), <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
	5. Mark RISON - CIDs – see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0639-04-000m-selected-rison-discussion-cids.xlsx>

4.       AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
			1. No comments on proposed agenda
		2. No objection to updated Agenda see R17
	1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
		1. About 95 Comments approved last Friday.
		2. Starting to implement the resolutions into the draft.
		3. Expect D3.4 after motions in June and will include May 15 through the June Motions meeting. – Expect First week of July.
		4. June 19 is the expected Comment Motion plan.
			1. We will need to determine if Insufficient Detail Comments may be addressed on the 19th of June or not.
	2. **Review doc 11-20/0758r0 CID 4224** - Ganesh VENKATESAN (Intel)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0758-00-000m-resolution-to-cid-4224.docx>
		2. CID 4224 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission discussion.
			3. Two options to consider. (Accept or Revise)
			4. Discussion on the choice of option a) or b).
				1. The use of “sample” vs “samples”
				2. Agree to use plural form.
				3. The nominal usage is singular in the PHY clause, so maybe we should be consistent and use the singular form or change to plural in other usages.
				4. There are 25 instances or so in total.
				5. The Editor can change the “sample/s” to “samples/s”
				6. After looking at the IEEE 260.1-2004, we could not find an example of the plural usage.
				7. Final answer is singular usage.
			5. P4590.12-21 is for D3.2
			6. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-05-20 20:37:02Z) - Change in Annex-P as shown in the paragraph at P4590L12-21 in D3.2.

"The minimum sampling rate is MULTICHANNEL\_SAMPLING\_RATE sample/s respectively."

to

"The minimum sampling rate is MULTICHANNEL\_SAMPLING\_RATE expressed in sample/s."

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **CIDS 4155, 4159 – confirm resolutions in 11-19/1564r5 and 11-17/0927r59**
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-05-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx> and
		2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0927-59-000m-revmd-mac-comments.xls>
		3. CID 4155 (MAC)
			1. R7 is now posted to Mentor. – 11-19/1564r7:
			2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-07-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx>
			3. Review Changes since R5:
			4. R6: 10.25.6.8:

Changed to standard word usage “between SSN and blah”

Merged middle and last bullets

Update doc references

* + - 1. R7: 10.25.6.8:

Changed SSN to SSN – 1, because “between” includes SSN and in this case, we do not want to include SSN

Update doc references

* + - 1. Review specific changes made.
			2. Discussion on the grammar usage – insert “the” for “the status…”, drop the first “and”.
			3. Discussion on the loss of HT immediate BlockAckReq Frame.
			4. 10.25.6 is HT immediate is covered, so not need to put in the text specifically in all the places.
			5. The problem that's being solved is that the text is ambiguous. The confusion is not about HT Immediate BlockACK. A change here does not address the problem which occurs in multiple sub-clauses.
			6. Discussion on more suggested disagreements of possible changes.
			7. Concern on “failed reception” discussed. Look to change to “lack of reception of”
			8. Discussion on “acknowledge” vs “not acknowledged” description.
			9. ACTION ITEM: Mark Hamilton to post an r8 of the 11-19/1564r8 with the changes made during the discussion.
		1. CID 4159 (MAC)
			1. Will defer until Friday for discussion.
	1. **Review CID 4301 resolution**: Michael MONTEMURRO (Blackberry)
		1. CID 4301 – Confirm resolution in email, see <http://www.ieee802.org/11/email/stds-802-11-tgm/msg01878.html>
			1. --- This message came from the IEEE 802.11 Task Group M Technical Reflector ---

Hi all,

From the chat window for the call today, Mark R posted the following proposed resolution. When I added it to the database, I was confused by the editing instructions:

I received the following:

"In D3.2 Add "When MAX-ACCESS is read-only, the MIB attribute value may be updated by the PLME and read from the MIB attribute by management entities. When MAX-ACCESS is read-write, the MIB attribute may be read and written by management entities but shall not be updated by the PLME. at 2868.34, 2896.35 [also fix the font size at 2896.30], 2954.20, 2966.62, 3124.21, 3478.60"

My proposed resolution for the database will be:

REVISED. Relative to draft 3.2, add the following paragraph at 2868.34, 2896.35 [also fix the font size at 2896.30], 2954.20, 2966.62, 3124.21, and 3478.60:

"When MAX-ACCESS is read-only, the MIB attribute value may be updated by the PLME and read from the MIB attribute by management entities. When MAX-ACCESS is read-write, the MIB attribute may be read and written by management entities but shall not be updated by the PLME."

Is that an acceptable resolution?

Thanks,

Mike

* + - 1. Review comment and the email suggestions.
			2. Proposed resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-05-20 21:19:33Z) - Relative to draft 3.2, add the following paragraph at 2868.34, 2896.35 [also fix the font size at 2896.30], 2954.20, 2966.62, 3124.21, and 3478.60:

"When MAX-ACCESS is read-only, the MIB attribute value may be updated by the PLME and read from the MIB attribute by management entities. When MAX-ACCESS is read-write, the MIB attribute may be read and written by management entities but shall not be updated by the PLME."

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **Review doc 11-20/435r3** Mark RISON (Samsung)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>
		2. CID 4512 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the proposed changes.
			3. Discussion on when “unsigned” has to be included in ranges.
			4. Proposed resolution: CID 4512 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-20 21:28:49Z): Incorporate changes as shown in 11-20/0435r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx) for CID 4512, which accomplishes changes in the direction suggested.
			5. Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4353 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review context of 9.3.3.1 and discussion on the “Otherwise” usage and the use of Optionally or “can be”.
			3. More work needed – Mark RISON and Mark HAMILTON are to work offline.
		4. 4413 (MAC) and 4703 (PHY)
			1. Review Comments
			2. Proposal was described in terms of 11ax but needed to be described in a standalone method.
			3. The proposed changes in 435r4
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4413 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-20 21:40:32Z): Incorporate the changes shown under "Discussion" for CIDs 4413 and 4703 in 11-20/0435r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx), which address the issue raised by the commenter.
			5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-05-20 21:42:22Z) - Incorporate the changes shown under "Discussion" for CIDs 4413 and 4703 in 11-20/0435r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx), which address the issue raised by the commenter.
			6. Mark Both CIDs Ready for Motion.
		5. CID 4501 (Editor)
			1. Review comment
			2. Discussion on the use of ACM flag.
			3. Discussion on why the ACM flag is set.
			4. Propose a change to the sentence.
			5. Review 10.23.4.2.1 for an example of a change being proposed.
			6. Proposed resolution: Revised; Incorporate the changes shown under "Discussion" for CID 4501 in 11-20/0435r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx), which address the issue raised by the commenter.
			7. No Objection – Mark ready for Motion
		6. CID 4247 (GEN)
			1. Review comment
			2. Review MIB attribute issue.
			3. The question is ho may MIB attributes that are capability that has defaults.
			4. The MIB Variables that end in “Activated” are suspect and need review.
			5. More work needed – Mark RISON and Mark HAMILTON to work offline.
		7. CID 4531 (MAC)
			1. Review comment
			2. More review may need to be done.
			3. No technical change is expected.
			4. Proposed resolution:
			5. No Objection – Mark ready for Motion
		8. We will start next time with CID 4612 (page 32), 4087 (page 29), 4625 (page 27), 4205 (page 13), 4451 (page 5
	2. **Review of next telecon Agenda**
	3. **Adjourn 6:03pm ET**.

**References:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-16-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0758-00-000m-resolution-to-cid-4224.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-05-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0927-59-000m-revmd-mac-comments.xls>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-07-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx>
7. <https://video.search.yahoo.com/search/video?fr=mcafee&p=monty+python+argument+contradiction#id=1&vid=50957425f4add57fb30465e98f9a6a05&action=click>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0435-03-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11md-d3-0-sb1.docx>