IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- May 6-29 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-05-06 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecons from May 6 to May 29, 2020.

R0: May 6th:

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Wednesday May 6, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order at 4:05pm** ET by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
      1. No Issues noted.
   3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
      1. About 25 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Costa, D.Nelson | Peraso Technologies Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Eitan, Alecsander | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus Wireless |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Hansen, Christopher | Covariant Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Harkins, Daniel | Aruba Networks, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Hervieu, Lili | Cable Technology Laboratories, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Jiang, Jinjing | Apple, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Kasher, Assaf | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Kwon, Young Hoon | NXP Semiconductors |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Montemurro, Michael | BlackBerry |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Stacey, Robert | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
|  | TGmd | 5/6 | YAGHOOBI, HASSAN | Intel Corporation |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: None reported
  1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/535r11:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-11-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
     2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-12 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

2.  Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.  Comment resolution:

2020-05-06 Wednesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours

i. Chris Hansen – CIDs 4071, 4075, 4283, 4480, 4486, 4640

a. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0531-00-000m-dmg-comment-resolutions.docx>

ii. Edward AU – CID 4603

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0696-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4603.docx>

iii. Matthew Fischer – CID 4158, CID 4157

a. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-01-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>

b. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1778-05-000m-india-ch-167-169-173.pptx>

iv. CID 4156

1. Matthew Fischer - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1562-04-000m-all-sta-crs-mcs-negotiation.docx>
2. Po-Kai Huang – <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0678-01-000m-some-thoughts-on-control-response-mcs-negotiation.pptx>

v. Dan Harkins

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0543-01-000m-privacy-for-password-identifiers.docx>

4. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda
       1. Chris HANSEN add doc 11-20/711r1
          1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0711-01-000m-cid-4071-4075-resolutions.docx>
       2. Matthew Fischer
          1. May or may not present 11-19/1778r5 today. Request to wait to decide until later in the call.
          2. Probably will move to later time. But will will not take action today.
       3. CID 4156
          1. There are two submissions for this CID.
       4. Dan Harkins
          1. The document is now r2
    2. No objection to updated Agenda see R12
  1. **Editor Report** – Emily QI (Intel)
     1. We are reviewing D3.3.
     2. Reviewer responses need to be submitted today.
  2. **Review doc 11-20/531r1 –** Chris HANSEN (Covariant Corp)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0531-01-000m-dmg-comment-resolutions.docx>
     2. CID 4283 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Discussion on the language used and the changes.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4283 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:13:09Z): Incorporate the changes marked as "Instruct the Editor to …" for CID 4283 in 11-20/0531r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0531-02-000m-dmg-comment-resolutions.docx>), which makes changes in the direction suggested.
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4480 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:21:31Z)
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4486 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:22:34Z): REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:13:09Z): Incorporate the changes marked as "Instruct the Editor to …" for CID 4486 in 11-20/0531r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0531-02-000m-dmg-comment-resolutions.docx>). These changes clarify that DMG STAs may both transmit and respond to probe requests.
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 4640 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed resolution:
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **Review doc 11-20/711r1** Christopher Hansen (Covariant Corp)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0711-01-000m-cid-4071-4075-resolutions.docx>
     2. CID 4071 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission Discussion
        3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:27:50Z): Incorporate the changes marked as "Instruct the Editor to …" for CID 4071 in 11-20/0711r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0711-02-000m-cid-4071-4075-resolutions.docx>), which makes changes in the direction suggested.
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4071 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accept
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Review doc 11-20/0696r0** Edward AU (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0696-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4603.docx>
     2. CID 4603 (GEN)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review history of the discussion on this CID
        3. Review the previous AdHoc Notes: GEN: 2020-04-29 21:35:32Z - status set to: Submission Required - Note CID 1095 was used to change MultipleBSSIDActivated to MultiBSSIDImplemented, and one was missed on page 998.34.

GEN: 2020-04-28 01:42:15Z - status set to: Review

Proposed Resolution: Revised; At 3903.59, change “Deprecated as the related feature has been removed from the standard." to “Deprecated as dot11MultiBSSIDActivated is not referenced and has been removed from the standard”.

* + - 1. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2020-05-06 20:40:42Z) At 999.32, replace “dot11MultipleBSSIDActivated” with “dot11MultiBSSIDImplemented”.

At 3901.53, replace “Deprecated as the related feature has been removed from the standard.” with “Deprecated as dot11MultiBSSIDActivated has been removed from the standard.”

Reply to the commenter: The Multi BSSID feature is not deprecated.

* + - 1. No objection Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Review doc 11-20/0516r2** – Mathew Fischer (Broadcom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-02-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>
     2. CID 4158 (MAC)
        1. Review Comments.
        2. Proposed Resolution CID 4158: CID 4158 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:46:12Z): Incorporate changes as shown in 11-20/0516r2 that are marked with CID 4158 which generally agree with the commenter’s suggestion.
     3. CID 4160 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4160 (MAC): REJECTED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:44:48Z): The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined.
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4159 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Noted an error there are some “(RE) A…” and some (re) a…” and that there are some need to be addressed in r3.
        3. Explain what was change from R1 and R2.
        4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2020-05-06 20:50:55Z): Incorporate the changes as shown in 11-20/0516r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-03-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>) for CID 4159. These include the MSCS setup in (Re)Association request and response frames, as requested.
        5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **CID 4156**
     1. 15 Minutes for Matthew Fischer and 15 Minute for Po-Kai Huang
     2. **Review doc 11-20/1562** – Matthew Fischer (Broadcom)
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1562-06-000m-all-sta-crs-mcs-negotiation.docx>
        2. CID 4156 (MAC)
           1. Review comment
           2. Review submission discussion.
           3. Noted the changes from R5 to R6.
     3. **Review doc 11-20/678r2** Po-Kai Huang (Intel)
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0678-01-000m-some-thoughts-on-control-response-mcs-negotiation.pptx>
        2. CID 4156 (MAC)
           1. Submission asks the question of which task group, TGmd vs TGbe, should be target Task Group.
           2. Review submission
           3. We may need more analysis before proceeding.
           4. Discussion on the need for making a change and if it should here or in TGbe.
           5. Long discussion on the pro and con for investigating this feature in TGmd vs TGbe and the consequences of either choice.
           6. More work will need to be done before a decision.
           7. Put on a future Telecon Agenda.
  3. **Review doc 11-20/0543r2** – Dan Harkins (HPE)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0543-02-000m-privacy-for-password-identifiers.docx>
     2. CID 4731 (PHY)
        1. Review differences from R1 to R2.
        2. Discussion on the value of the changes proposed.
        3. Discussion on how to best address the comment.
        4. More discussion could be done offline.
        5. We need to respond in a timely manner to all comments.
        6. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2020-05-06 21:55:49Z)
        7. Incorporate the changes in https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0543-02-000m-privacy-for-password-identifiers.doc which address the privacy issues with password identifiers.:
        8. Mark Ready for Motion
        9. If the motion fails, a reject reason will be prepared for consideration in its place.
           1. Reject reason (in case the motion fails). The BRC could not come to consensus on technical changes to the draft that would address the privacy concerns stated by the commenter.
  4. Next Telecon Schedule Review
     1. See R12
  5. Adjourned 5:57pm ET

**References:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-11-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0531-01-000m-dmg-comment-resolutions.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0531-02-000m-dmg-comment-resolutions.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0711-01-000m-cid-4071-4075-resolutions.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0711-02-000m-cid-4071-4075-resolutions.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0696-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4603.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-02-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-03-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1562-06-000m-all-sta-crs-mcs-negotiation.docx>
11. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0678-01-000m-some-thoughts-on-control-response-mcs-negotiation.pptx>
12. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0543-02-000m-privacy-for-password-identifiers.docx>