IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes for REVmd CRC- April 21-24 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-04-21 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11md REVmd CRC Adhoc for the week of April 21

This set of Telecons replaces the face to face AdHoc that was cancelled due to COVID-19.

R0: April 21

1. **IEEE 802.11md REVmd CRC Telecon Tuesday April 21, 2020 16:00-18:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order at 4:03pm** by the TG Chair Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Review Patent and Participation Policy**
      1. No Issues noted.
   3. **Attendance:** -please log with IMAT:
      1. About 17 attendees reported by WebEx

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Ecclesine, Peter | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Goodall, David | Morse Micro |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Hervieu, Lili | Cable Technology Laboratories, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Incorporated |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | McCann, Stephen | BlackBerry |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | noh, yujin | Newracom Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Qi, Emily | Intel Corporation |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
|  | TGmd | 4/21 | Stanley, Dorothy | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |

* + 1. Missing from IMAT: Ganesh VENKATESAN (Intel)
  1. **Review Agenda**: 11-20/535r5:

* + 1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-05-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
    2. **The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b.      Patent, Participation slides: See slides 5-12 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>

c. Adhoc meeting reminders:

April 21-23 Cambridge UK – Not in person; teleconference proposal is below.

2.       Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.       Comment resolution

a. 2020-04-21 Tuesday 4-6pm Eastern 2 hours (ad-hoc week)

i. Alfred ASTERJADHI – 11-20/446r0 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0446-00-000m-assorted-comment-resolutions.doc> x

ii. ~~Youhan Kim~~ – Yujin NOH CIDs 4022, 4023 PHY CIDs - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0621-00-000m-resolutions-to-cid4022-and-cid4023.docx>

iii. Matthew FISCHER presentations

a. 11-19/1564: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-01-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx> ,

b. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1562-01-000m-all-sta-crs-mcs-negotiation.docx> ,

c. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1778-04-000m-india-ch-167-169-173.pptx>

d. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-00-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>

* + 1. Youhan noted that Yujin was presenting doc 11-20/0621 – agenda modified.
    2. The order of Matthew FISCHER Documents was changed.
    3. No objection to modified agenda
  1. **Editor Report:** EMILY QI
     1. We had 30 CIDs that were resolved last week.
     2. See doc 11-19/2156r7 for current comment spreadsheet.
     3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-07-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>
  2. **Review doc 11-20/446r0** – Alfred ASTERJADHI (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0446-00-000m-assorted-comment-resolutions.docx>
     2. CID 4441 and 4443 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission discussion and proposed changes
        3. Discussion on the description of how a portion of a TXOP is done.
        4. Discussion on the use of a NAV-setting frame as a sync frame.
        5. Discussion on what the sync function requirements are in this case.
        6. Discussion on what frames can be used as a NAV-setting frame.
        7. Discussion on what normative text may need to be required.
        8. More work needed.
        9. Return on Wednesday April 29 telecon
     3. CID 4269 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review proposed changes
        3. Proposed Resolution: Revised—

Agree in principle that there is no ProbeTimer. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change while noting that NDP Probe Request frames, are sent instead of Probe Request frames under this protocol, and that the timer used in this case is the ActiveScanningTimer.

REVmd editor to make the changes shown in 11-20/0446r0 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0446-00-000m-assorted-comment-resolutions.docx>> under all headings that include CID 4269.

* + - 1. No Objection - Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4166 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review Proposed changes
       3. Discussion on correcting some “that/which” and grammar issues.
       4. Update to r1
       5. Proposed Resolution: Revised—

Agree with the direction of the comment. A STA that does not support SST operation is not expected to receive or send a TWT element that has a nonzero value for the TWT channel field. Hence, proposed resolution is to explicitly specify that this is the case.

REVmd editor to make the changes shown in 11-20/0446r1 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0446-01-000m-assorted-comment-resolutions.docx>> under all headings that include CID 4166.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark ready for Motion
  1. **Review doc 11-20/621r0** Yujin NOH (Newracom)
     + 1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0621-00-000m-resolutions-to-cid4022-and-cid4023.docx>
       2. CID 4022 (PHY)
          1. Review comment.
          2. Review submission background.
          3. Review proposed changes
          4. Proposed resolution: Revised; Incorporate the changes indicated by “Proposed Resolution: CID 4022” in 11-20/621r0 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0621-00-000m-resolutions-to-cid4022-and-cid4023.docx>> Note to commenter that L-SIG and VHT-SIG-A avoids similar issue by not use the variable N\_SR, but rather using “26” in Equations (21-25) and (21-28), respectively. Hence changing N\_SR to 26 in Equation (21-20) is more appropriate. Similar change should also be made for S1G in Equation (23-14).
          5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       3. CID 4023 (PHY)
          1. Review Comment
          2. Review submission background.
          3. Review proposed changes
          4. Proposed resolution: Revised; Incorporate the changes indicated by “Proposed Resolution: CID 4023” in 11-20/621r1 <<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0621-01-000m-resolutions-to-cid4022-and-cid4023.docx>> . Note to commenter that L-SIG and VHT-SIG-A avoids similar issue by not use the variable N\_SR, but rather using “26” in Equations (21-25) and (21-28), respectively. Hence changing N\_SR to 26 in Equation (21-23) is more appropriate
          5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Review doc 11-19/1564r3** - Matthew FISCHER (Broadcom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-03-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx>
     2. CID 4155 (MAC)
        1. Review status of submission
        2. We have reviewed an earlier version of this submission before.
        3. Discussion on corresponding vs associated.
        4. Discussion on where the inserted paragraph should be placed. Should it be placed before or after the NOTE.
        5. Discussion on removing corresponding from new text. (d3.0 1072.60) in section 10.2 – Changed the 2nd instance of corresponding.
        6. Will upload the R4 -
        7. Proposed Resolution: REVISED - Make the changes as shown in 11-19/1564r4 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-04-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx). This clarifies the text for block ack state processing, as requested.
        8. Request to update the date on the file header. – Request to have it reflect the date it was updated.
  3. **Review doc 11-19/1562r4** – Matthew Fischer
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1562-04-000m-all-sta-crs-mcs-negotiation.docx>
     2. Update the date and version of the header.
     3. Note references were to D3.2
     4. CID 4156 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review changes made to submission since last presented.
        3. Discussion on index vs indices
        4. Discussion on the upper/lower case of Index – is it a field or not.
        5. Discussion on the impact of the change on the current devices.
        6. Discussion on the feature definition and if it exists in the standard today.
        7. Discussion on the source of the feature – from 11ah, and possibly extended afterward.
        8. To locate something in the table, you use the index and a difference to find the correct entry.
        9. Discussion on how to calculate the MCS computation.
        10. More discussion is needed will be assigned to a future Telecon
        11. Discussion on if this proposal could be better asserted in 11be rather than 11md. Difference of opinion.
  4. **Review doc 11-20/516r1** Matthew Fischer (Broadcom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-01-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>
     2. CID 4158, 4159 and 4160 (MAC)
        1. Review comments
        2. Review proposed changes for CID 4158.
        3. Proposed resolution for CID 4158 (MAC): Revise - TGmd editor to make changes as shown in 11-20/0516r1 that are marked with CID 4158 which generally agree with the commenter’s suggestion.
        4. No objection – Mark CID 4158 Ready for Motion
        5. If there is any review needed, do prior to May 15.
        6. Review the changes for next CID
        7. Proposed resolution for CID 4159 (MAC): Revise - TGmd editor to make changes as shown in 11-20/0516r1 that are marked with CID 4159 which generally agree with the commenter’s suggestion.
        8. Proposed resolution for CID 4160 (MAC): Reject – the commenter has not provided enough information for the TG to make changes that would satisfy the comment.
        9. Discussion on if the change is backward compatible.
        10. Discussion on what the process of the MSCS procedure does.
        11. Note that the case of (Re)-Association vs (Re)-association. Will take offline to address.
        12. Concern on how the feature was introduced, and discussion on if this change affects the feature or not.
        13. Discussion on how to determine the flow in the initial case vs moving from one AP to another one.
        14. Missing the MLME changes that may be needed.
        15. The tag for the changes should only list CID 4159 as CID 4160 is a rejected CID.
        16. Discussion on if this is a new feature vs optimization.
        17. Concern on number of recirculation ballots left and not enough time to evaluate this change.
     3. Out to time, review again on May 6th.
  5. Next call tomorrow 4-6pm ET
  6. Review agenda for tomorrow.
  7. Adjourned 6:03pm

**References:**

April 21:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0535-05-000m-2020-april-july-teleconference-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0308-00-000m-2020-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-2156-07-000m-revmd-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0446-00-000m-assorted-comment-resolutions.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0446-01-000m-assorted-comment-resolutions.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0621-00-000m-resolutions-to-cid4022-and-cid4023.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0621-01-000m-resolutions-to-cid4022-and-cid4023.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1564-03-000m-originator-block-ack-state.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1562-04-000m-all-sta-crs-mcs-negotiation.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0516-01-000m-cr-mscs-and-cid4158.docx>