IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed resolutions for CIDs related to the date of publication of the references in MIB |
| Date: 2020-04-22 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies |  |  | edward.ks.au@gmail.com |

##### This submission present proposed resolution for CIDs 4005, 4006, 4007, 4008, 4009, 4010, 4011, 4012, 4183, 4184, 4185, and 4186. The proposed changes are based on REVmd/D3.2.

Note:

CIDs 4005, 4006, 4007, 4008, 4009, 4010, 4011, and 4012 are GEN comments.

CIDs 4183, 4184, 4185, and 4186 are EDITOR2 comments that were approved by the TGmd CRC in the January interim meeting. In this submission, the proposed resolutions of these 4 CIDs are revisited and revised to make sure that the proposed resolutions of all of these 12 comments are consistent.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comments | Proposed Change |
| 4005 | C.3 | 4175 | 47 | dot11EDCATable refers to IEEE Std 802.11-2012 | Replace "IEEE Std 802.11-2012, 10.2.3.2 (HCF contention based channel access(EDCA))" with "IEEE Std 802.11-2020, 10.2.3.2 (HCF contention based channel access(EDCA))" |
| 4006 | C.3 | 4178 | 15 | dot11QAPEDCATable refers to IEEE Std 802.11-2012 | Replace "IEEE Std 802.11-2012, 10.2.3.2 (HCF contention based channel access(EDCA))" with "IEEE Std 802.11-2020, 10.2.3.2 (HCF contention based channel access(EDCA))" |
| 4007 | C.3 | 4179 | 61 | ot11QAPEDCATableTXOPLimit refers to 802.11-2016 | Replace "REFERENCE IEEE Std 802.11-2016, 9.4.2.28 (EDCA Parameter Set element)" with "REFERENCE IEEE Std 802.11-2020, 9.4.2.28 (EDCA Parameter Set element)" |
| 4008 | C.3 | 4192 | 49 | dot11BSSLoadAvailableAdmissionCapacity refers to 802.11-2016 | Replace " REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, 9.4.2.27 (BSS Load element) "" with " REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.11-2020, 9.4.2.27 (BSS Load element) "" |
| 4009 | C.3 | 4195 | 51 | dot11TempType refers to 802.11-2016 | Replace "The use of dot11TempType is deprecated because no associated behavior is described in IEEE Std 802.11-2016" with "The use of dot11TempType is deprecated because no associated behavior is described in IEEE Std 802.11-2020" |
| 4010 | C.3 | 4212 | 43 | dot11HoppingPatternTable refers to 802.11-2016 | Replace 802.11-2016 with 802.11-2020 |
| 4011 | C.3 | 4212 | 62 | dot11HoppingPatternEntry refers to 802.11-2016 | Replace 802.11-2016 with 802.11-2020 |
| 4012 | C.3 | 3811 | 59 | Within C.3 there are several occurrences of references to 802.11-2012 or 802.11-2016. These references need to be updated | In clause C.3, replace 802.11-2012 or 802.11-2016 with 802.11-2020 resp. 802.11-2021 when this draft standard will be published. |
| 4183 | C.3 | 3929 | 9 | "REFERENCE "9.4.2.20 (Measurement Request element)"" is missing the document | Change the reference to be to "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, 9.4.2.20 (Measurement Request element)" (which I trust will get changed to -2020 on publication)NOTE: This resolution (Accepted) was approved in the January 2020 interim. |
| 4184 | C.3 | 3951 | 30 | "REFERENCE "9.4.2.21.5 (Channel Load report)"" is missing the document | Change the reference to be to "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, 9.4.2.21.5 (Channel Load report)" (which I trust will get changed to -2020 on publication)NOTE: This resolution (Accepted) was approved in the January 2020 interim. |
| 4185 | C.3 |  |  | REFERENCEs to Annex E are missing the document | Change all REFERENCES to "Annex E" to be to "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, Annex E" (which I trust will get changed to -2020 on publication)NOTE: The following (Revised) resolution was approved in the January 2020 interim:Change "REFERENCE "Annex E"" to "REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, Annex E"" at the following locations in Draft 3.0: 3931.16, 3950.56, 3954.5, 3959.39, 3964.10, 4003.36, and 4009.6.All a new line "REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, Annex E" at the following locations in Draft 3.0: 3923.20, 3923.29, 4038.19, 4038.33, 4061.11, 4061.25, 4074.48, 4074.60, 4077.2, and 4077.15.All a new line "REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.11-2016, 9.4.2.53 (Supported Operating Classes element), Annex E" at the following location in Draft 3.0: 4070.30. |
| 4186 | C.3 |  |  | REFERENCEs to just "IEEE Std 802.11," are missing the year | Change all REFERENCES that start "IEEE Std 802.11," or "IEEE Std 802.11 " to start "IEEE Std 802.11-2016," (which I trust will get changed to -2020 on publication)NOTE: The following (Revised) resolution was approved in the January 2020 interim:Change "IEEE Std 802.11" with "IEEE Std 802.11-2016" at the following locations in Draft 3.0: 3934.63, 3940.41, and 3941.20. Change "IEEE Std 802.11" with "IEEE Std 802.11-2016," at the following locations in Draft 3.0: 3977.16, 3977.35, 3977.55, 3978.9, and 3978.28.Change "IEEE Std 802.11 - " with "IEEE Std 802.11-2016," at the following location in Draft 3.0: 4010.36.Change "IEEE Std 802.11-2012" with "IEEE Std 802.11-2016" at the following locations in Draft 3.0: 4175.47 and 4178.15. Change "IEEE Std 802.11-2020" with "IEEE Std 802.11-2016" at the following locations in Draft 3.0: 3954.44, 3961.30, and 3966.20. |

**Discussion:**

There are 45 MIB variables that cite a particular subclause (or subclauses) of the latest version of the IEEE 802.11 standards as a normative reference, whereas the remaining MIB variables (much more than 45) do not. For example:



The exact locations of these 45 instances in D3.2 are listed as follows:

1. 3820.10
2. 3820.37
3. 3820.65
4. 3859.43-3859.44
5. 3861.8
6. 3862.6
7. 3862.19
8. 3864.32
9. 3921.18
10. 3921.29
11. 3927.9
12. 3929.17
13. 3938.41-3938.43
14. 3939.20-3939.22
15. 3948.57
16. 3949.32
17. 3952.5
18. 3952.44
19. 3957.38
20. 3959.29
21. 3962.8
22. 3964.18
23. 3975.12-3975.13
24. 3975.31-3975.32
25. 3975.51-3975.52
26. 3976.5-3976.6
27. 3976.24-3976.25
28. 4001.30
29. 4006.64-4006.65
30. 4008.30-4008.31
31. 4036.12
32. 4036.27
33. 4059.5
34. 4059.19
35. 4068.24-4068.25
36. 4072.45
37. 4072.59
38. 4075.1
39. 4075.15
40. 4173.50-4173.52
41. 4175.47
42. 4176.39-4176.41
43. 4178.20-4178.21
44. 4190.66
45. 4191.9

The proposed resolution is to remove the entire description on the reference in these locations.

There are also 9 MIB modules that talks about an object (or objects) of an OBJECT-GROUP is deprecated in the latest version of the IEEE 802.11 standards, and therefore the OBJECT-GROUP is superseded by a new group. For example:



The exact locations of these 9 instances in D3.2 are listed as follows:

1. 3895.32
2. 4152.37
3. 4152.53
4. 4194.11
5. 4211.9
6. 4211.22
7. 4211.44
8. 4211.56
9. 4320.18

The proposed resolution is to remove the reference of IEEE 802.11 Std-2016 and replace it with, e.g., “deprecated as the related feature has been removed from the standards”.

**Proposed resolution:**

REVISED

Delete the following lines on the description of reference in Draft 3.2:

1. 3820.10
2. 3820.37
3. 3820.65
4. 3859.43-3859.44
5. 3861.8
6. 3862.6
7. 3862.19
8. 3864.32
9. 3921.18
10. 3921.29
11. 3927.9
12. 3929.17
13. 3938.41-3938.43
14. 3939.20-3939.22
15. 3948.57
16. 3949.32
17. 3952.5
18. 3952.44
19. 3957.38
20. 3959.29
21. 3962.8
22. 3964.18
23. 3975.12-3975.13
24. 3975.31-3975.32
25. 3975.51-3975.52
26. 3976.5-3976.6
27. 3976.24-3976.25
28. 4001.30
29. 4006.64-4006.65
30. 4008.30-4008.31
31. 4036.12
32. 4036.27
33. 4059.5
34. 4059.19
35. 4068.24-4068.25
36. 4072.45
37. 4072.59
38. 4075.1
39. 4075.15
40. 4173.50-4173.52
41. 4175.47
42. 4176.39-4176.41
43. 4178.20-4178.21
44. 4190.66
45. 4191.9

At 3895.32,

Change “Deprecated as no longer used by IEEE Std 802.11-2016” with “Deprecated as the related feature has been removed from the standards.”.

At 4152.37,

Change “Deprecated as no longer used by IEEE Std 802.11-2016” with “Deprecated as the related feature has been removed from the standards.”.

At 4152.53,

Change “Deprecated as no longer used by IEEE Std 802.11-2016” with “Deprecated as the related feature has been removed from the standards.”.

At 4194.11,

Change “The use of dot11TempType is deprecated because no associated behavior is described in IEEE Std 802.11-2016, and this entity may be removed in a later revision of the standard.” with “The use of dot11TempType is deprecated because the associated behavior has been removed from the standards, and this entity may be removed in a later revision of the standard.”.

At 4211.9,

Change “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in IEEE Std 802.11-2016.” to “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in the standards.”.

At 4211.22,

Change “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in IEEE Std 802.11-2016.” to “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in the standards.”.

At 4211.44,

Change “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in IEEE Std 802.11-2016.” to “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in the standards.”.

At 4211.56,

Change “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in IEEE Std 802.11-2016.” to “This attribute is deprecated because the frequency hopping PHY is no longer present in the standards.”.

At 4320.18,

Change “Superseded by dot11HTMACAdditions2 as contains an object no longer used by IEEE Std 802.11-2016.” to “Superseded by dot11HTMACAdditions2 as dot11HTMACAddition contains an object no longer used by the standards.”.