IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| SB1 REVmd PHY/SEC comment resolutions | | | | |
| Date: 2020-02-06 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Michael Montemurro | BlackBerry | 4701 Tahoe Blvd, Mississauga, ON L4W 0B4 | +1 289-261-4183 | [mmontemurro@blackberry.com](mailto:mmontemurro@blackberry.com) |

Background

This contribution proposes comment resolutions to selected PHY/SEC comments received in the initial SA Ballot for REVmd.

### Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Duplicate of CID** | **Resn Status** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 4476 | 2642.00 | 12.6.20 |  |  | "When a Public Action frame is transmitted for which a Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined, (see 9.6.10 (Protected Dual of Public Action frames) (The Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined to allow robust STA-STA communications of the same information that is conveyed in Action frames that are not robust (see 9.4.1.11 (Action field)). A Public Action field, in the octet immediately after the Category field, differentiates the Protected Dual of Public Action frame formats. The defined Protected Dual of Public Action frames are listed in Table 9-403 (Public Action field values defined for Protected Dual of Public Action frames).)), which variant (i.e., protected or not protected) is used depends on the setting of the "Protected" parameter of the corresponding MLME .request or .confirm primitive." is incomprehensible (huge sentence with further sentences inside parens). I'm not sure what it's trying to say, and I'm not even sure the parens balance | Change to "The Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined to allow robust STA-STA communications of the same information that is conveyed in Action frames that are not robust (see 9.6.10 (Protected Dual of Public Action frames)). A Public Action field, in the octet immediately after the Category field, differentiates the Protected Dual of Public Action frame formats. The defined Protected Dual of Public Action frames are listed in Table 9-403 (Public Action field values defined for Protected Dual of Public Action frames). When a Public Action frame is transmitted for which a Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined (see 9.4.1.11 (Action field)), which variant (i.e., protected or not protected) is used depends on the setting of the "Protected" parameter of the corresponding MLME .request or .confirm primitive." |

### Discussion:

The comment proposes a changing:

“When a Public Action frame is transmitted for which a Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined, (see 9.6.10 (Protected Dual of Public Action frames) (The Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined to allow robust STA-STA communications of the same information that is conveyed in Action frames that are not robust (see 9.4.1.11 (Action field)). A Public Action field, in the octet immediately after the Category field, differentiates the Protected Dual of Public Action frame formats. The defined Protected Dual of Public Action frames are listed in Table 9-403 (Public Action field values defined for Protected Dual of Public Action frames).)), which variant (i.e., protected or not protected) is used depends on the setting of the "Protected" parameter of the corresponding MLME .request or .confirm primitive.”

To

"~~When a Public Action frame is transmitted for which a Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined, (see 9.6.10 (Protected Dual of Public Action frames) (~~The Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined to allow robust STA-STA communications of the same information that is conveyed in Action frames that are not robust (see 9.6.10 (Protected Dual of Public Action frames)). A Public Action field, in the octet immediately after the Category field, differentiates the Protected Dual of Public Action frame formats. The defined Protected Dual of Public Action frames are listed in Table 9-403 (Public Action field values defined for Protected Dual of Public Action frames).~~))~~ When a Public Action frame is transmitted for which a Protected Dual of Public Action frame is defined (see 9.4.1.11 (Action field)), which variant (i.e., protected or not protected) is used depends on the setting of the "Protected" parameter of the corresponding MLME .request or .confirm primitive."

* The change does make the cited text clearer.

### Proposed Resolution:

Accepted.

### Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Duplicate of CID** | **Resn Status** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 4568 | 2646.00 | 12 |  |  | It is not clear that things like "highest MAC address" and "MAX(STA-A-MAC, STA-B-MAC)" and well-defined. There is something about comparison of MAC addresses in 12.7.1.1 but this has unclear scope | Change 2646.11 from "For the purposes of comparison, the MAC address is encoded as 6 octets, taken to represent an unsigned integer." to "For the purposes of comparison in this standard, the MAC address is encoded as 6 octets, taken to represent an unsigned integer." |

### Discussion:

The context is as follows. Change:

“In an infrastructure BSS, the IEEE 802.1X Authenticator MAC address (AA) and the AP’s MAC address are the same, and the Supplicant’s MAC address (SPA) and the STA’s MAC address are equal. For the purposes of comparison, the MAC address is encoded as 6 octets, taken to represent an unsigned integer. The first octet of the MAC address shall be used as the most significant octet. The bit numbering conventions in 9.2.2 (Conventions) shall be used within each octet. This results in a sequence of 48 bits represented such that bit 0 is the first transmitted bit (Individual/Group bit) and bit 47 is the last transmitted bit.”

To”

“In an infrastructure BSS, the IEEE 802.1X Authenticator MAC address (AA) and the AP’s MAC address are the same, and the Supplicant’s MAC address (SPA) and the STA’s MAC address are equal. For the purposes of  
comparison in this standard, the MAC address is encoded as 6 octets, taken to represent an unsigned integer. The first octet of the MAC address shall be used as the most significant octet. The bit numbering conventions in 9.2.2 (Conventions) shall be used within each octet. This results in a sequence of 48 bits represented such that bit 0 is the first transmitted bit (Individual/Group bit) and bit 47 is the last transmitted bit.”

The proposed change looks ok.

### Proposed Resolution:

Accepted.