IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| PAR Minutes – November 2019 Session | | | | |
| Date: 2019-11-14 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Michael Montemurro | BlackBerry | 4701 Tahoe Blvd, Mississauga, ON. Canada L4W0B4 | +1 289-261-4183 | [mmontemurro@blackberry.com](mailto:mfischer@broadcom.com) |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the PAR Standing Committee session that was held during the November 2019 IEEE 802.11 Plenary meeting.

# Monday November 11, 16:00-18:00

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

**Michael Montemurro, BlackBerry – Vice-Chair**

Attendance: 5

* Meeting called to order at 16:02
* Agenda Review – approved as document 11-19/1761r0
  + Moved: Michael Montemurro, 2nd: Joseph Levy
  + Agenda is approved unanimously
* Minutes Approval from July 2019 – document 11-19/1272r0

MOTION: Move to approve previous meeting minutes: doc 11-19/1272r0 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-1272-00-0PAR-minutes-july-2019-session.docx> as the minutes for PAR Review SC from July 2019 meetings in Vienna, Austria.

Mover: Joseph Levy

Second: Michael Montemurro

Result: Passes Unanimously

* PAR and CSD comments are captured in 11-19/1007r1
* **802.15.7a - Amendment - Defining High Data Rate Optical Camera Communications (OCC),** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/19/15-19-0296-02-0vat-par-for-high-rate-occ-task-group.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/19/15-19-0297-02-0vat-csd-for-high-rate-occ-task-group.docx)
  + PAR and CSD have been withdrawn.
* **802.3cx - Amendment - Improved Precision Time Protocol (PTP) timestamping accuracy,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0160-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cx-draft-par-response.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0161-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cx-draft-csd-response.pdf)
  + Regarding the PAR:
    - 8.1 – Change “5.2B” to “5.2.b”
  + Regarding the CSD:
    - IEEE 802.1AS are a profile of IEEE 1588. They define the reference point and processing for a timestamp. This project defines the PHY processing and delay calculation for variance in the IEEE 802.3 PHY.
    - No comments.
* **802f Amendment : YANG Data Model for EtherTypes,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/802f-draft-PAR-0919-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/802f-draft-CSD-0919-v01.pdf)
  + Regarding the PAR:
    - 5.5 – Need to expand first use of acronym “RFC”. We Recognize that “YANG” is not spelled out for reasonable reasons.
    - 6.1.b – Add a reference to “Registration Authority URN tutorial”
    - 6.1.b – Expand IEEE Std 802d in section 8.1.
    - 6.1.b – Expand MAC acronym
    - 7.1 – Change “IEEE module once completed” to “IEEE YANG module once completed”
    - 7.1 – Change “and deprecate the EtherTypes Modules they have written” to “and deprecate other EtherTypes Modules they have written”
  + Regarding the CSD:
    - No comments
* **802.1AEdk Amendment: MAC Privacy protection,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/dk-security-mac-privacy-PAR-0919-v02.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/dk-security-mac-privacy-CSD-0919-v00.pdf)
  + Regarding the PAR:
    - 4.3 – The Completion date is within 6 months of the Initial Sponsor Ballot
    - 6.3 – Expand the first use of the acronym “RAC”.
    - 8.1 – The note for section 7.3 is not required.
  + Regarding the CSD:
    - No comments
* **802.1CS Standard - Link-local Registration Protocol,** [**PAR modification**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/cs-PAR-modification-draft-0919-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0215-00-ACSD-802-1cs.pdf)
  + Regarding the PAR Modification:
    - 5.2 – change “unresponsive.Provision” to “unresponsive. Provision”
    - 8.1 – Add “5.2” before the explanatory text.
  + Regarding the CSD Modification:
    - No comments
* **802.3ct -Amendment - 100 Gb/s Operation over DWDM systems,**[**PAR modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0149-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ct-draft-par-response.pdf) **and** [**CSD modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0147-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ct-draft-csd.pdf)
  + Regarding the PAR Modification:
    - 8.1 – Add “5.2” before the explanatory text.
  + Regarding the CSD Modification:
    - No comments
* **802.3cw - Amendment - 400 Gb/s Operation over DWDM systems,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0150-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cw-draft-par-response.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0148-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cw-draft-csd.pdf)
  + Regarding the PAR:
    - No comments.
  + Regarding the CSD:
    - No comments
* **802.16t - Amendment - Fixed and Mobile Wireless Access in Narrowband Channels,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.24/dcn/19/24-19-0029-04-0000-licensed-narrowband-amendment-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.24/dcn/19/24-19-0030-00-0000-licensed-narrowband-amendment-csd.docx)
  + Regarding the PAR:
    - 3.1 – WG 802.16 is listed as the WG and WG Chair doing the work. This is not our understanding. We understand that 802.24 is authoring the PAR, and 802.15 WG may be assigned to the work. While this may sound like nice way to try to get around the normal method of amending a document, strictly speaking, if there is a true need to make this amendment, then 802.16 should have enough interest in making the amendment to come out of hibernation. Otherwise there is not enough interest to do the work to start with.
    - 5.2.a. The changes to the scope does not seem meaningful and should not be made.
    - 5.4 – Why add a purpose clause? What is the rationale to add the purpose to an existing specification?
  + Regarding the CSD:
    - No comments
* Recess until Thursday AM2

# Thursday November 14, 10:30-12:30

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

**Michael Montemurro, BlackBerry – Vice-Chair**

Attendance: 4

1. Meeting called to order at 10:49
2. Agenda Review – approved as document 11-19/1761r1
3. Continue with the approved PAR SC agenda
4. Summary of responses received and are summarized in 11-19/1761r2

* **802f Amendment : YANG Data Model for EtherTypes,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/802f-draft-PAR-0919-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/802f-draft-CSD-0919-v01.pdf)
  + No comments on the responses.
* **802.1AEdk Amendment: MAC Privacy protection,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/dk-security-mac-privacy-PAR-0919-v02.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/dk-security-mac-privacy-CSD-0919-v00.pdf)
  + No comments on the responses.
* **802.1CS Standard - Link-local Registration Protocol,** [**PAR modification**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2019/cs-PAR-modification-draft-0919-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0215-00-ACSD-802-1cs.pdf)
  + No comments on the responses.
* **802.3ct -Amendment - 100 Gb/s Operation over DWDM systems,**[**PAR modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0149-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ct-draft-par-response.pdf) **and** [**CSD modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0147-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ct-draft-csd.pdf)
  + No comments on the responses.
* **802.3cx - Amendment - Improved Precision Time Protocol (PTP) timestamping accuracy,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0160-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cx-draft-par-response.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0161-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cx-draft-csd-response.pdf)
  + No comments on the responses.
* **802.3cw - Amendment - 400 Gb/s Operation over DWDM systems,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0150-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cw-draft-par-response.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0148-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cw-draft-csd.pdf)
  + No comments on the responses.
* **802.16t - Amendment - Fixed and Mobile Wireless Access in Narrowband Channels,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.24/dcn/19/24-19-0029-04-0000-licensed-narrowband-amendment-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.24/dcn/19/24-19-0030-00-0000-licensed-narrowband-amendment-csd.docx)
  + Comment responses updated as 24-19/35r0
  + PAR document updated as 24-19/29r0
  + CSD document updated as 24-19/30r0
  + IEEE 802.15 is the home group in the PAR.
  + The Purpose clause was already there. There was an tool issue.
  + The Scope is unchanged.
  + The document was first approved in this meeting. The update to the scope of the PAR was changed and its unclear what group approved the change (24 or 15) and when the change was approved.
  + Discussion on the process for submitting a PAR.
  + The rules state that a PAR needs to be sponsored by an 802WG.
  + There should have been a motion to accept the PAR prior to submitting the PAR and CSD to the EC for approval.
  + The PAR was developed on Oct 1.
  + Regarding the CSD The changes to the PAR scope should have been approved by a motion as well.
  + The response from 802.11 to 802.16t:

1. PAR submitted for review was not from a Sponsoring WG. 802.24 is a TAG, but did not formally approve the PAR to submit to 802 for review.

2. Changes to the PAR Scope (5.2) were made based on a comment from an individual after the last 802.24 telecon, but before posting to 802 for review.

3. The current updated PAR was approved in 802.24 by the 6:30 deadline, but question on if 802.15 should have approved by the Wednesday deadline. (It is expected that 802.15 will approve during their closing plenary on Thursday).

4. Question is, if permissible for non-WG to submit PAR for consideration.

* The responses to the 802.1 and 802.3 PARs were reviewed and comments submitted with responsese that were agreeable to the PAR Review SC.
* The 802.24 chair submitted a PAR 802.16t and our concerns are noted..

1. Approval of PAR Review SC report

MOTION:

**Move to accept 11-19/1761r2 as the report from PAR Review SC for the November 2019 plenary.**

**Moved: Michael Montemurro**

**2nd: Sebastian Max**

**Results: 3 – Yes; 0 – No; 0 – Abstain. Motion Passes.**

1. Adjourn at 11.25.