IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment resolution on CIDs 20644 and 20645 |
| Date: 2019-09-17 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  | edward.ks.au@gmail.com |

This submission present a resolution for CIDs 20644 and 20645. The proposed changes are based on P802.11ax D4.3.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

R1 – Updated the proposed resolution based on the discussion on Tuesday PM2 in the September 2019 interim.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 20645 | C.3 | 710 | 6 | "dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsTable" and its children is a disaster. 1) I think it's basically a big set of capability fields, per 411.23, but this is not clear. 2) "The PPE thresholds mappings are logically WRITE-ONLY. Attempts to read the entries in this table return unsuccessful status and values of null or 0." makes no sense. 3) "The default value for all PPET8 fields is NONE." makes no sense. 4) "RU Index of 0 is 996 tones" is wrong. 5) There is nothing that says you need both dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET8 and dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET16 to be specified for any given set of table indices. 6) "An index that determines a constellation value" can't be a TruthValue. 7) "6 is reserved" is not needed; just define the type as a MIB enumeration. 8) "PPE Thresholds mapping Table" should be "PPE Thresholds Mapping Table" | As it says in the comment | Revised.Agree in principle. Please refer to the changes as shown in 19/1661r2. |
| 20644 | C.3 | 710 | 19 | "The default value for all PPET8 fields is NONE." -- this should be a DEFVAL | As it says in the comment | Revised.Agree in principle. Please refer to the changes as shown in 19/1661r2. |

Discussion:

At 744.43/D4.3:



**Response to: CID 20645/ 1) I think it's basically a big set of capability fields, per 411.23, but this is not clear.**

**Response to: CID 20645/ 5) There is nothing that says you need both dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET8 and dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET16 to be specified for any given set of table indices.**

Agree. It is a conceptual table for PPE thresholds mappings, which determines the nominal packet padding value as a function of the two PPE thresholds, PPET8 and PPET16, for an HE PPDU of a particular RU allocation size and NSTS value.

**Response to: CID 20645/ 2) "The PPE thresholds mappings are logically WRITE-ONLY. Attempts to read the entries in this table return unsuccessful status and values of null or 0." makes no sense.**

Agree.

**Response to: CID 20645/ 3) "The default value for all PPET8 fields is NONE" makes no sense.**

Agree. The default value should be 7 that is corresponding to NONE. Further, the default value for all PPET8 fields should be descripted in dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET8 rather than dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsTable.

**Response to: CID 20645/ 4) "RU Index of 0 is 996 tones" is wrong.**

At 745.32/D4.3:

****

As per Table 9-321e, RU allocation index of 0 is 242 tones.



**Response to: CID 20645/ 6) "An index that determines a constellation value" can't be a TruthValue.**

At 745.43 and 745.58/D4.3:



Agree. The “TruthValue” should be replaced by the following enumberation “INTEGER{ BPSK(0), QPSK(1), 16-QAM(2), 64-QAM(3), 256-QAM(4), 1024-QAM(5), NONE(7)}”.

**Response to: CID 20645/ 7) "6 is reserved" is not needed; just define the type as a MIB enumeration.**

Disagree. The enumeration follows Table 9-321d as shown below.



Response to: 8) "PPE Thresholds mapping Table" should be "PPE Thresholds Mapping Table".

At 746.5/D4.3:



Agree in principle. “PPE Thresholds mapping Table” should be “PPE thresholds mappings table”.

**Response to: CID 20644 "The default value for all PPET8 fields is NONE." -- this should be a DEFVAL.**

Agree and the default value should be appeared in dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET8 rather than dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsTable.

**Proposed resolution for CIDs 20644 and 20645**

**Revised.**

At 744.43/D4.3:

dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsTable OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF Dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsEntry

 MAX-ACCESS not-accessible

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "A conceptual table for PPE thresholds mappings, which determines the nominal packet padding value as a function of the two PPE thresholds, PPET8 and PPET16, for an HE PPDU of a particular RU allocation size and NSTS value. The MIB supports the

 ability to share separate PPE thresholds for each NSTS/RU pair. The thresholds mappings table

 ~~Thresholds Mappings Table~~ contains one entry for each NSTS/RU pair

 and contains two fields for each entry: PPET8 and PPET16. ~~The PPE~~

 ~~thresholds mappings are logically WRITE-ONLY. Attempts to read the~~

 ~~entries in this table return unsuccessful status and values of null or 0.~~

 ~~The default value for all PPET8 fields is NONE.~~"

 REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.11-<year>, 26.12 (HE PPDU post-FEC padding and packet

 extension)"

::= { dot11smt 43}

At 745.32/D4.3:

dot11PPEThresholdsMappingRUIndex OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX Integer

 MAX-ACCESS read-create

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "The index of the RU value portion of the NSS/RU pair for which the values

 from this thresholds ~~Thresholds~~ mapping entry are to be used. The index values

 map to an RU as follows: RU Index of 0 is 242 ~~996~~ tones, 1 is 448 tones,

 2 is 996 tones, 3 is 2x996 tones."

::= { dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsEntry 3 }

At 745.43/D4.3:

dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET8 OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX ~~TruthValue~~ INTEGER{ BPSK(0), QPSK(1), 16-QAM(2), 64-QAM(3), 256-QAM(4), 1024-QAM(5), NONE(7)}

 MAX-ACCESS read-create

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "An index that determines a constellation value at or above which a

 nominal packet padding(#20882) value of at least

 8 microseconds is required for the given NSS/RU pair

 corresponding to the row of the entry. ~~The index values are mapped~~

 ~~as follows: 0 is BPSK, 1 is QPSK, 2 is 16-QAM, 3 is 64-QAM,~~

 ~~4 is 256-QAM, 5 is 1024-QAM, 6 is reserved, 7 is the special~~

 ~~value of NONE.~~"

 DEFVAL { 7 }

::= { dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsEntry 4 }

dot11PPEThresholdsMappingPPET16 OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX ~~TruthValue~~ INTEGER{ BPSK(0), QPSK(1), 16-QAM(2), 64-QAM(3), 256-QAM(4), 1024-QAM(5), NONE(7)}

 MAX-ACCESS read-create

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "An index that determines a constellation value at or above which a

 nominal packet padding(#20882) value of 16 microseconds

 is required for the given NSS/RU pair corresponding to the row of the

 entry. ~~The index values are mapped as follows: 0 is BPSK, 1 is QPSK,~~

 ~~2 is 16-QAM, 3 is 64-QAM, 4 is 256-QAM, 5 is 1024-QAM, 6 is reserved,~~

 ~~7 is the special value of NONE~~."

::= { dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsEntry 5 }

dot11PPEThresholdsMappingStatus OBJECT-TYPE

 SYNTAX RowStatus

 MAX-ACCESS read-create

 STATUS current

 DESCRIPTION

 "The status column used for creating, modifying, and deleting instances

 of the columnar objects in the PPE thresholds mappings table ~~Thresholds mapping Table~~."

 DEFVAL { active }

::= { dot11PPEThresholdsMappingsEntry 6 }