IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment resolutions for clause 4 |
| Date: 2019-06-27 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D2.0 with the following CIDs (12 CIDs):

* 3113, 3136, 3139, 3143, 3147, 3161, 3162, 3163, 3350, 3351,
* 3352, 3353

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Revised version including some editorial suggestions to improve the proposed resolution motivations.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGba Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGba Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGba Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGba Editor” are instructions to the TGba editor to modify existing material in the TGba draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGba editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGba Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3113 | Jeongki Kim | 21.50 | STAs are not associated with BSSID but AP corresponding to the BSSID. Clarify the text. | As in comment | Revised –TGba editor: Please replace “the corresponding nontransmitted basic service” with “an AP corresponding to a nontransmitted basic service”. |
| 3136 | Joseph Levy | 23.01 | The definition of FL WUR as an abbreviation and acronym is inconstant with the way abbreviations and acronyms are used in the 802.11 specification. Abbreviations and acronyms do not contain spaces, they are a set of letters, numbers, or symbols. Also the use of this "acronym" in the specification is not correctly referenced, as an acronym must follow the . | Delete: "FL WUR fixed-length wake-up radio" from 3.4 and throughout the rest of the amendment replace FL with fixed-length, while leaving the properly defined WUR acronym in place. | Revised –Disagree with the comment that there is inconsistency with the way abbrev. and acronyms are used in 802.11 specification. Please refer to “SPP A-MSDU” as an example of an acronym that does contain spaces. Checked REVmd and did not find any occurrence of FL as an acronym so proposed resolution is to simply define an acronym for FL. TGba editor: Please replace “FL WUR fixed-length wake-up radio” with “FL fixed-length”. |
| 3139 | Joseph Levy | 23.12 | The definition of VL WUR as an abbreviation and acronym is inconstant with the way abbreviations and acronyms are used in the 802.11 specification. Abbreviations and acronyms do not contain spaces, they are a set of letters, numbers, or symbols. Also the use of this "acronym" in the specification is not correctly referenced, as an acronym must follow the . | Delete: "VL WUR variable-length wake-up radio" from 3.4 and throughout the rest of the amendment replace VL with variable-length, while leaving the properly defined WUR acronym in place. | Revised –Disagree with the comment that there is inconsistency with the way abbrev. and acronyms are used in 802.11 specification. Please refer to “SPP A-MSDU” as an example of an acronym that does contain spaces. Checked REVmd and did not find any occurrence of VL as an acronym so proposed resolution is to simply define an acronym for VL. TGba editor: Please replace “VL WUR variable-length wake-up radio” with “VL variable-length”. |
| 3143 | Joseph Levy | 23.01 | Abbreviations and acronyms should not contain spaces. Therefore, FL WUR, VL WUR, WUR ID are not valid abbreviations or acronyms. Please correct, in 3.4 and where they are used throughout the draft. | Remove spaces from the abbreviations and acronyms. | Revised –Disagree with the comment that there is inconsistency with the way abbrev. and acronyms are used in 802.11 specification. Please refer to “SPP A-MSDU” as an example of an acronym that does contain spaces. Checked REVmd and did not find any occurrence of FL and VL as an acronym so proposed resolution is to simply define an acronym for FL and VL. Same for ID.TGba editor: Please replace “VL WUR variable-length wake-up radio” with “VL variable-length”.TGba editor: Please replace “FL WUR fixed-length wake-up radio” with “FL fixed-length”.TGba editor: Please replace “WUR ID wake-up radio identifier” with “ID identifier”. |
| 3147 | Joseph Levy | 23.15 | This is a resubmission of CID 2186 - The rejection states "We note that HE PPDU also has a space in it, but the spec accepts the fact without adding dash." - it should be noted that HE is an abbreviation (which is not in the current 802.11 baseline specification, it is only in 802.11ax) and PPDU is an abbreviation, but HE PPDU is not an abbreviation nor an acronym. Therefore the original comment "WUR ID is not a proper acronym or abbreviation as it has a space in it. Either "rename" it WUR-ID so it is proper abbreviation or delete the abbreviation." | Change the text to read: "WUR-ID wakeup radio identifier"Also fix all the locations where "WUR ID" is used in the text to be "WUR-ID" | Revised –Disagree with the comment that there is inconsistency with the way abbrev. and acronyms are used in 802.11 specification. Please refer to “SPP A-MSDU” as an example of an acronym that does contain spaces. Checked REVmd and did not find any occurrence ID as an acronym so proposed resolution is to simply define an acronym for ID.TGba editor: Please replace “WUR ID wake-up radio identifier” with “ID identifier”. |
| 3161 | Lei Huang | 21.32 | There is no definition on WUR BSS. | remove "for a wake-up radio (WUR) basic service set (BSS)" from the sentence | Rejected –WUR BSS can be obtained as the sum of the WUR acronym and the BSS acronym. |
| 3162 | Lei Huang | 23.01 | What does "fixed-length wake-up radio" mean? | change "FL WUR" to "FL WUR frame" | Received –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is to simply define FL because the proposed change is not correct (please see other comments in the same subclause). TGba editor: Please replace “FL WUR fixed-length wake-up radio” with “FL fixed-length”. |
| 3163 | Lei Huang | 23.12 | What does "variable-length wake-up radio" mean? | change "VL WUR" to "VL WUR frame" | Received –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is to simply define VL because the proposed change is not correct (please see other comments in the same subclause). TGba editor: Please replace “VL WUR variable-length wake-up radio” with “VL variable-length”. |
| 3350 | Xiaofei Wang | 21.34 | It is not clear which AP "the WUR access point" is since no AP has been mentioned earlier in the definitiion. | change "the WUR access point" to "a WUR acccess point" | Revised –Agree in principle. TGba editor: Please replace “the WUR access point” with “a WUR access point”. |
| 3351 | Xiaofei Wang | 21.51 | It is not clear which BSSID is "the corresponding nontransmitted basic service set identifier". Also, what is the "corresponding"? It is not clear how it is corresponding. | change "the" to "a" and remove the word "corresponding" | Revised –Agree in principle. Revision inline with the proposal of CID 3113 as well which clarifies what corresponding means.TGba editor: Please replace “the corresponding nontransmitted basic service” with “an AP corresponding to a nontransmitted basic service”. |
| 3352 | Xiaofei Wang | 23.01 | what is "FL WUR", is the wake-up radio of fixed length? This is not correct. | This abbreviation causes confusion and misunderstanding, please revise and remove | Revised –Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to simply define an acronym for FL. TGba editor: Please replace “FL WUR fixed-length wake-up radio” with “FL fixed-length”. |
| 3353 | Xiaofei Wang | 23.12 | What is "VL WUR:, is the wake up radio of variable length? This is not correct. | This abbreviation causes confusion and misunderstanding, please revise and remove | Revised –Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to simply define an acronym for VL. TGba editor: Please replace “VL WUR variable-length wake-up radio” with “VL variable-length”. |

**Discussion: *None.***