IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| 11ba D3.0 Comment Resolution for Group ID |
| Date: 2019-7-5 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Lei Huang | Panasonic Corporation |  |  | lei.huang@sg.panasonic.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for the following comments from the letter ballot on P802.11ba D3.0:

7 CIDs: 3079, 3093, 3108, 3118, 3142, 3197, 3376

NOTE – Set the Track Changes Viewing Option in the MS Word to “All Markup” to clearly see the proposed text edits.

**Revision History:**

R0: Initial version.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGba D3.0 Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGba D3.0 Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGba Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGba Editor” are instructions to the TGba editor to modify existing material in the TGba draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGba editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGba Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page.Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3376 | 29.5.4 | 108 | It may not be efficient to wake up WUR STAs with WUR Group ID in FL WUR Wake-up frame when the WUR AP needs to wake up all the WUR STAs. It needs to define a WUR Broadcast ID to wake up all WUR STA. | Add a new subclause for the broadcast WUR ID after subclause 29.5.6. | Rejected - D3.0 allows the WUR AP to transmit a broadcast addressed WUR Wake-up frame with Transmitter ID or Nontransmitter ID to wake up all the associated WUR non-AP STA(s). Therefore, it is unnecessary to define a WUR Broadcast ID for such a purpose. |
| 3197 | 29.5.4 | 108.11 | I think this is a consistency problem, or I don't understand something about how this works. 9.10.3.2 says a VL WUR Wake-up frame has a WUR Group ID that identifies the group of WUR non-AP STAs that are addressed by the frame. 29.5.4 says a VL WUR Wake-up frame with a WUR group ID in the ID field is addressed to all the non-AP STAs identified by the WUR IDs in the Frame Body field. So, it is unclear which of these is really "addressing" the set of non-AP STAs. It is also needs to be stated that these two sets of information had better agree, I think. | Correct the inconsistency, and clarify the relationship between the Group ID and the list of of STAs in the WUR IDs of the Frame Body. | Revised - Agreed in principle with the commenter.TGba editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-19/1029r0 under all headings that include CID 3197. |
| 3079 | 29.5.4 | 108.16 | "The WUR AP shall randomly select the starting value of the WUR group ID space from the identifier's space and shall ensure that none of the WUR group IDs coincide with any of the WUR IDs, transmitter ID, and nontransmitter IDs (if any)." AP cannot 'ensure'. | Cited text to read "The WUR AP shall randomly select the starting value of the WUR group ID space from the identifier's space. No WUR group ID shall coincide with any of the WUR IDs, transmitter ID, and nontransmitter IDs (if any)." | Accepted - TGba editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-19/1029r0 under all headings that include CID 3079. |
| 3118 | 29.5.4 | 108.41 | "only if the Action Type field in the most recently received WUR Mode element is set to ┬í┬░Enter WUR Mode Response┬í+/- or ┬í┬░Enter WUR Mode Suspend Response┬í+/- and the WUR Mode Response Status field is set to ┬í┬░Accept┬í+/-" is reduandant. It's already described in 9.4.2.298 WUR Mode element. Remove the text from the indicated sentence | Remove the text from the indicated sentence | Rejected - It is better to keep this text to avoid any inconsistency between 9.4.2.298 and 29.5.4 |
| 3093 | 9.4.2.298 | 66.22 | Calculation of the length/size isn't sufficiently explained 9-321d when the variable length 9-776i is present inside it. | Explain how the size of the WUR Group ID List subfield is calculated using the WUR Group ID Bitmap Size value. | Revised - Agreed in principle with the commenter.TGba editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-19/1029r0 under all headings that include CID 3093. |
| 3108 | 9.4.2.298 | 65.24 | WUR Group ID List Present subfield is used only by WUR AP and reserved in WUR non-AP STAs. | Add the following text at the end of the indicated text: "The WUR Group ID List Present subfield is reserved when the WUR Mode element is transmitted by a WUR non-AP STA." | Accepted - TGba editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-19/1029r0 under all headings that include CID 3108. |
| 3142 | 3.4 | 23.9 | This is a repeat of comment (CID 2183): "The SGID is used in two equations and is defined in the text. There is no need to list this as an abbreviation." This comment was rejected because "There is no rule that forbids definition of abbreviation based on the number of usages in the spec." While this may be true, it is not good practice to provide useless acronyms in 3.4, the general abbreviations and acronyms list. This abbreviation, SGID, is only used in 9.4.2.298 and it is only used to simplify equation "(SGID +n) mod 4096" that used twice. There are no other uses throughout the draft, why the authors feel this limited used abbreviation should be listed in 3.4 is beyond me. Please remove it. Note, this does not mean SGID can not be used in the 9.4.2.298. | Delete: "SGID starting WRU group identifier" | Accepted - Agreed in principle with the commenter.TGba editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-19/1029r0 under all headings that include CID 3142. |

**Discussion:** *None.*

**Propose:** Revised for CID 3197, 3079, 3093, 3108, 3142 per discussion and editing instructions in 11-19/1029r0.

***TGba editor: Change clause 9.10.3.2 on P79L19 as follows***

The ID field of the VL WUR Wake-up frame contains a WUR group ID when the frame is group addressed to one or more WUR non-AP STAs that are identified by the WUR IDs included in the Frame Body field and belong to the group identified by the WUR group ID (see 29.5.4 (WUR Group ID)) (#3197).

***TGba editor: Change clause 29.5.4 on P108L11 as follows***

A VL WUR Wake-up frame with a WUR group ID in the ID field is a group addressed WUR frame that is addressed to all the WUR non-AP STAs that are identified by the WUR IDs included in the Frame Body field and belong to the group identified by the WUR group ID. (#3197)

***TGba editor: Change clause 29.5.4 on P108L16 as follows***

The WUR AP shall randomly select the starting value of the WUR group ID space from the identifier’s space. No WUR group IDs shall coincide with any of the WUR IDs, transmitter ID, and nontransmitter IDs (if any). (#3079)

***TGba editor: Change the Encoding for the WUR Group ID List Subfield in Table 9-321d on P66L21 as follows***

The format is shown in Figure 9-776i (WUR Group ID List subfield format). This subfield is present if the WUR Group ID List Present subfield of the WUR Parameters Control field is set to 1. Otherwise this subfield is not present. The size of this subfield depends on the value of the WUR Group ID Bitmap Size field in this subfield. (#3093)

***TGba editor: Change clause 9.4.2.298 on P65L24 as follows***

The WUR Group ID List Present subfield is set to 1 if the WUR Group ID List subfield is present in the following WUR Parameters field and is set to 0 otherwise. The WUR Group ID List Present subfield is reserved when the WUR Mode element is transmitted by a WUR non-AP STA. (#3108)

***TGba editor: Change clause 3.4 on P23L9 as follows***

 (#3142)

[End of File]