### IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment resolution for CIDs on Clause 31.2.8 | | | | |
| Date: 2019-04-24 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Vinod Kristem | Intel Corporation | 2200 Mission College Blvd, Santa Clara, CA 950542200 |  | vinod.kristem@intel.com |
| Minyoung Park | Intel Corporation |  |  |  |
| Po-Kai Huang | Intel Corporation |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGba Draft D2.0 with the following CIDs: 2108, 2274, 2275, 2489, and 2631.

Revision History:

Rev 0: Initial Draft

Note: All the cross-reference is with respect to TGba Draft 2.1

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 2489 | 98.64 | 31.2.8 | can is not a normative word to use in the draft. | Change "can be" to "is". | Revised.  Agree in principle. This is a “descriptive” sentence and the usage of “is” is proper and it is consistent with REVmd draft (IEEE Std 802.11-2016), which uses “is” to describe the baseband signal in Equation (19-4) and again in Equation (21-13).  The corresponding sentence has been changed to “….the baseband signal is described by Equation (31-3).”  TGba Editor to make changes as shown in 802.11-19/0861r1 with CID #2489. |
| 2108 | 98.62 | 32.2.9.2 | We decided that OOK waveform is generated by the OFDM transmitter in 17/373r2 and the MC-OOK On symbol is generated by contiguous 13 subcarriers in 17/0964r4. In the corresponding sentence, "can" should be changed to "shall". | See comment. | Revised.  This is a “descriptive” sentence and the usage of “is” is proper and it is consistent with REVmd draft (IEEE Std 802.11-2016), which uses “is” to describe the baseband signal in Equation (19-4) and again in Equation (21-13).  The corresponding sentence has been changed to “….the baseband signal is described by Equation (31-3).”  TGba Editor to make changes as shown in 802.11-19/0861r1 with CID #2108. |
| 2274 | 78.64 | 32.2.7 | "the baseband signal can be obtained by taking the Inverse Discrete Fourier Transform (IDFT)" is an incomplete sentence. | "Picking up on comments made in the previous letter ballot on D1.0, the TG did not properbly address the issue raised in the comment, nor does the TG provide an indication that the text commented on has been deleted and hence the comment does not apply. (Note, page and line and sublause number refer to D1.0). In fact, as stated in the TGba minutes (11-19/226r0), the intend of the task group was to ""Move to resolve CIDs that have no approved resolution as rejected with a reason read ""TGba is unable to reach consensus on a resolution"" in the interest of releasing draft 2.0"". Also, the statement """"TGba is unable to reach consensus on a resolution"" was added to the motion text there was one person speaking against the motion."" was only added to the motion after objection to the original motion trying to reject comments in bulk with the reason of releasing a new LB.  The TG is asked to give the original comment due consideration and debade the proposed comment resolution as included in 11-18/1794r10. The referenced document includes an actionable comment resolution." | Revised.  Agree with the comment in principle. The corresponding sentence has been changed to “….the baseband signal is described by Equation (31-3).”  TGba Editor to make changes as shown in 802.11-19/0861r1 with CID #2274. |
| 2275 | 78.63 | 32.2.7 | The text reads: "For the WUR Sync ON symbols and WUR Data MC-OOK ON symbols (SymLDROn and SymHDROn), the baseband signal can be obtained". This text ought to be normative. As described in 11-09/1034 the usage of the verb "can" is non-normative and its use should be considered carefully. If this text is not normative, then the spec would be incomplete. The normative text in Section 32.2.9.2, page 84, line 11, states that "The encoded binary data shall be modulated using MC-OOK", but MC-OOK is undefined in the current version of this draft. | "Picking up on comments made in the previous letter ballot on D1.0, the TG did not properbly address the issue raised in the comment, nor does the TG provide an indication that the text commented on has been deleted and hence the comment does not apply. (Note, page and line and sublause number refer to D1.0). In fact, as stated in the TGba minutes (11-19/226r0), the intend of the task group was to ""Move to resolve CIDs that have no approved resolution as rejected with a reason read ""TGba is unable to reach consensus on a resolution"" in the interest of releasing draft 2.0"". Also, the statement """"TGba is unable to reach consensus on a resolution"" was added to the motion text there was one person speaking against the motion."" was only added to the motion after objection to the original motion trying to reject comments in bulk with the reason of releasing a new LB.  The TG is asked to give the original comment due consideration and debade the proposed comment resolution as included in 11-18/1794r10. The referenced document includes an actionable comment resolution." | Revised.  Agree with the comment in principle. This is a “descriptive” sentence and the usage of “is” is proper and it is consistent with REVmd draft (IEEE Std 802.11-2016), which uses “is” to describe the baseband signal in Equation (19-4) and again in Equation (21-13).  The corresponding sentence has been changed to “….the baseband signal is described by Equation (31-3).”  TGba Editor to make changes as shown in 802.11-19/0861r1 with CID #2275. |
| 2631 | 98.64 | 31.2.8 | "can" is non-normative. Change "can be" to "may be" | As shown in the comment. | Revised.  This is a “descriptive” sentence and the usage of “is” is proper and it is consistent with REVmd draft (IEEE Std 802.11-2016), which uses “is” to describe the baseband signal in Equation (19-4) and again in Equation (21-13).  The corresponding sentence has been changed to “….the baseband signal is described by Equation (31-3).”  TGba Editor to make changes as shown in 802.11-19/0861r1 with CID #2631. |

***TGba editor: Change the following paragraphs in 31.2.8 Mathematical description of signals: (Track change on) (#2108, 2274, 2275, 2489, 2631)***

…………………………………….(several lines of text)…………………………………………..

For the WUR-Sync On symbols and WUR-Data MC-OOK On symbols (SymLDROn and SymHDROn), the baseband signal is described by Equation (31-3). The actual implementation may use other methods to generate the On and Off symbols.





…………………………………….(several lines of text)…………………………………………..