IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| 802.11ba Teleconference Minutes April/May 2019 |
| Date: 29-04-19 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson AB | Mobilvägen 1, 22632 Lund, Sweden | +46-706-216956 | leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com |

Abstract

This document contains minutes from TG 802.11ba teleconference in April/May 2019.

Rev 0: Minutes for TG 802.11ba teleconference on 22nd of April 2019.

Rev 1: Minutes for TG 802.11ba teleconference on 29th of April 2019 added.

Rev 2: Minutes for TG 802.11ba teleconference on 6th of May 2019 added and some typos corrected.

**Teleconference on Monday, April 22 2019, 5:00 – 6:30 pm (ET)**

**Agenda:**

1. Call meeting to order

2. Agenda setting

3. Patent policy (link at the end of the email)

4. Attendance: send email to the chair or secretary (leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com)

5. Presentations:

* 19/643 CR on miscellaneous comments - part 1, Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation) – first 5 CIDs covered
* 19/644 CR on miscellaneous comments - part 2, Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation)
* 19/645 CR on HDR/LDR comments - Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation)

6. Adjourn

Please note that teleconferences are bound by the conditions stipulated by the documentation below.  Please review them and bring up any questions/concerns you may have before proceeding with the teleconference:

IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operations Manual –
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-0002-16-0000-802-11-operations-manual.doc>

1. **Chair Minyoung Park (Intel) calls the meeting to order at 5:02 pm (ET).**
2. Minyoung goes through the proposed agenda and asks it there are any questions or additional items that should be added. No questions asked so the proposed agenda will be used.
3. Minyoung reminds about the IEEE patent policy and directs people to the links provided in the call in case of questions about the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
4. Minyoung reminds about attendance.
5. Presentations:

**11-19/0643r3 “Comment resolutions for miscellaneous comments - part 1”, Minyoung Park (Intel):** This is continuation of what was done at the ad-hoc f2f, addressing CIDs not discussed at the f2f.

CID 2228: Minyoung points out that Annex G does not define specific frame exchanges. No further discussion.

CID 2264: No discussion.

CID 2374: Resolution changed from Rejected to Revised.

CID 2392: No discussion.

CID 2511: No discussion.

CID 2572: Resolution changed from Accepted to Revised.

CID 2614: No discussion.

CID 2615: No discussion.

CID 2616: No discussion.

CID 2617: No discussion.

CID 2644: No discussion.

CID 2645: No discussion.

CID 2653: No discussion.

CID 2778: No discussion.

CID 2798: No discussion.

11-19/0643r4, with the changed made above to the corresponding resolutions in r3, will be ready for motion.

**11-19/0644r1 “Comment resolutions for miscellaneous comments - part 2”, Minyoung Park (Intel):** The CIDs discussed in this contribution are all based on comments from the same person, and are based on that the commenter is not satisfied with the way a block of comments was reject at the January f2f. The comments are on Draft 1.0, although comments in this round are supposed to be on Draft 2.0.

CID 2270: Minyoung points out that the comment fails to identify the issue and thus is an invalid comment. No further discussion.

CID 2271: No discussion.

CID 2272: The reason for rejection slightly updated. The decision Rejected remains.

CID 2279: No discussion.

CID 2280: No discussion.

CID 2281: reason for rejection slightly updated.

CID 2282: No discussion.

CID 2283: No discussion.

Run out of time.

1. **Meeting is adjourned at 6.35 pm (ET).**

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Minyoung Park | Intel |
| 2 | Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson |
| 3 | Li-hsiang Sun | Interdigital |
| 4 | Rui Yang | Interdigital |
| 5 | Alphan Sahin  | Interdigital |
| 6 | Bo Sun | ZTE |
| 7 | Yunsong Yang | Huawei |
| 8 | Steve Shellhammer | Qualcomm |

**Teleconference on Monday, April 29 2019, 11:00pm – 0:30 am (ET)**

**Agenda:**

1. Call meeting to order

2. Agenda setting

3. Patent policy (link at the end of the email)

4. Attendance: send email to the chair or secretary (leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com)

5. Presentations:

* 19/643 CR on miscellaneous comments - part 1, Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation) – first 5 CIDs covered
* 19/644 CR on miscellaneous comments - part 2, Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation)
* 19/645 CR on HDR/LDR comments - Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation)
* 19/570r2 Comment Resolutions for TXVECTOR and RXVECTOR Yonggang Fang (ZTE)

6. Adjourn

Please note that teleconferences are bound by the conditions stipulated by the documentation below.  Please review them and bring up any questions/concerns you may have before proceeding with the teleconference:

IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operations Manual –
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-0002-16-0000-802-11-operations-manual.doc>

1. **Chair Minyoung Park (Intel) calls the meeting to order at 11:00 pm (ET).**
2. Minyoung goes through the proposed agenda and asks it there are any questions or additional items that should be added. No questions asked. Minyoung asks if there is any objection to approved the agenda. There is no objection so the proposed agenda will be used.
3. Minyoung reminds about the IEEE patent policy and directs people to the links provided in the call in case of questions about the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
4. Minyoung reminds about attendance.
5. Presentations:

**11-19/0644r2 “Comment resolutions for miscellaneous comments - part 2”, Minyoung Park (Intel):** This is a continuation of the presentation in the last teleconference. The CIDs discussed in this contribution are all based on comments from the same person, and are based on that the commenter is not satisfied with the way a block of comments was reject at the January f2f. The comments are on Draft 1.0, although comments in this round are supposed to be on Draft 2.0.

CID 2284: Question/Comment (Q): Do we have a the bandwidths defined somewhere in the document so that it is possible to refer the commenter to this?

Answer (A): The comment relates to D1.0 and the corresponding figures are changed in D2.1, this is why the comment is rejected.

CID 2285: No discussion.

CID 2286: No discussion.

CID 2287: No discussion.

CID 2288: No discussion.

CID 2289: No discussion.

CID 2291: No discussion.

CID 2292: No discussion.

CID 2293: No discussion.

CID 2295: No discussion.

CID 2296: No discussion.

CID 2297: No discussion.

CID 2298: No discussion.

CID 2299: No discussion.

CID 2300: The resolution is updated to reflect that WUR PPDU has been renamed to WUR Basic PPDU. A new revision of the document (r3) will be needed.

CID 2301: No discussion.

CID 2307: No discussion.

CID 2308: No discussion.

CID 2309: Q: Do you believe the comment has some merit as such?

A: Since I cannot really tell what part of the standard the comment refers to, I don’t know. This is also a reason for rejection.

 CID 2311: Q: I had a similar comment, maybe we can look at these comments jointly.

 A: Yes, we can do this. I will remove it from this document.

 CID 2312: The resolution is slightly updated in that “in D2.1” is added.

CID 2340: No discussion.

CID 2343: Q: Should we try to address his general concerns?

A: Basically, if the text has been modified from D1.0 it is very hard to address anything properly. I have also checked with the WG Chair, and the proposal is to reject in this case since the comment is not made on the correct version of the specification.

CID 2345: No discussion.

CID 2346: No discussion.

CID 2352: Q: Actually, I believe the STA decides.

A: No, it just signals the preferred value. The AP can for instance reject.

CID 2355: No discussion.

CID 2357: The text motivating the rejection is updated. The resolution is still rejected.

CID 2363: No discussion.

CID 2364: No discussion.

CID 2105: No discussion.

Run out of time. We will continue with CID 2366 next time.

1. **Meeting is adjourned at 0:31 am (ET).**

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Minyoung Park | Intel |
| 2 | Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson |
| 3 | Yonggang Fang | ZTE |
| 4 | Xiaofei Wang | Interdigital |
| 5 | Alphan Sahin  | Interdigital |
| 6 | Joseph Levy | Interdigital |
| 7 | Yunsong Yang | Huawei |

**Teleconference on Monday, May 06 2019, 5:00 -7:00 pm (ET)**

**Proposed Agenda:**

1. Call meeting to order

2. Agenda setting

3. Patent policy (link at the end of the email)

4. Attendance: send email to the chair or secretary (leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com)

5. Presentations:

    - 19/644 CR on miscellaneous comments - part 2 (continue from CID 2366, 4 CIDs left), Minyoung Park (Intel Corporation)

    -  11-19-0650-01-00ba-issues-with-resolutions-to-cids-2592-and-2694, Yunsong Yang (Huawei)

     -  11-19-0682-00-00ba-PHY-CR-for-Clause-31.2, Vinod Kristem (Intel)

     -  11-19-0687-00-00ba-PHY-CR-for-Clause-31.2.4, Vinod Kristem (Intel)

     - 11/19-0570r2, Yonggang Fang (ZTE)

6. Adjourn

Please note that teleconferences are bound by the conditions stipulated by the documentation below.  Please review them and bring up any questions/concerns you may have before proceeding with the teleconference:

IEEE Patent Policy - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
Patent FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>
LoA Form - <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/loa.pdf>
Affiliation FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>
Anti-Trust FAQ - <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>
Ethics - <http://www.ieee.org/portal/cms_docs/about/CoE_poster.pdf>
IEEE 802.11 Working Group Operations Manual –
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-0002-16-0000-802-11-operations-manual.doc>

1. **Chair Minyoung Park (Intel) calls the meeting to order at 5:00 pm (ET).**
2. Minyoung goes through the proposed agenda and asks it there are any questions or additional items that should be added. Yonggang asks if he can present directly after Minyoung as he only has some minor updates.

Minyoung asks if there is any objection to update the agenda accordingly. There is no objection and the agenda is updated accordingly.

1. Minyoung reminds about the IEEE patent policy and directs people to the links provided in the call in case of questions about the IEEE 802 and 802.11 Policy and Procedure.
2. Minyoung reminds about attendance.
3. Presentations:

**11-19/0644r3 “Comment resolutions for miscellaneous comments - part 2”, Minyoung Park (Intel):** This is a continuation of the presentation in the last teleconference.

CID 2366: No discussion.

CID 2368: No discussion.

CID 2369: No discussion.

CID 2395: No discussion.

Q: For 2368, I know that in this round we are going to add a lot of text related to privacy and security. Would it be possible to revise the proposed resolution and say that things will be added?

A: I don’t believe this is the right approach, since one can probably argue like this for a lot of comments.

11-19/0644r3 is ready for motion.

**11-19/0570r2, “Comment Resolutions for TXVECTOR and RXVECTOR”, Yonggang Fang (ZTE):**

Some errors were found in r1. Compared to r1, r2 contains three changes

CID 2779 is removed, BASIC is changed to Basic, and the reference in the resolution text is changed to 570r2.

11-19/0570r2 is ready for motion.

**11-19/0650r1, “Issues with resolutions to CIDs 2592 and 2684”, Yunsong Yang (Huawei):**

Based on some offline discussions, the resolution to CIDs 2592 and 2684 have been updated. In addition, a note has been made to the editor with respect to CID 2513, but the resolution as such is the same.

Q: So these resolutions proposes changes to already adopted resolutions?

A: Yes, my proposal is to change the resolutions.

Q: I am thinking procedure-wise, I believe we should indicate this by clearly stating “replace”

A: I agree. Replace is probably a better word to use here.

Yunsong goes through Clause 30.11.

Q: Just make sure that the instruction in the resolution comment is correct and self-contained. It should not be a note, but a clear instruction to the editor.

A: OK, I will work on that.

Q: In 30.11, the term “shall” should not be used as you don’t know how things are done in a real implementation and actually I believe this is not how it is implemented.

A: I agree.

The document will be revised based on the comments and 11-19/0650r2 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/0682r0, “PHY Comment resolution for Clause 31.2” Vinod Kristem (Intel):**

CID 2020: No discussion.

CID 2501: No discussion.

CID 2489:

Q: We don’t want to specify that the IDFT should be used.

A: The proposed text does not require that an IDFT is used, it is just a mathematical description. I believe it is consistent with what was discussed in the ad-hoc meeting.

Minyoung proposes to postpone this CID and have the discussion at the f2f. CID 2489 is deferred.

Since several others of the CIDs are along the same lines, these need to be deferred as well.

CID 2108: Deferred.

CID 2774: Deferred.

CID 2275: Deferred.

CID 2631: Deferred.

CID 2030:

Q: I believe it would be clearer if you expand the text in the way that you just described.

A: The information is already available in one of the tables, but I can also add it here.

Q: These timing related parameters are not really needed for the receiver. They are only interesting if you implement the transmitter using an IDFT.

A: I agree, it goes back to the time when this was the assumption.

CID 2791: No discussion.

Q: Going back to CID 2030, I do not believe the proposed resolution actually resolved my comment.

11-19/0682r1 will be ready for motion.

**11-19/0687r0, “PHY Comment resolution for Clause 31.2.4” Vinod Kristem (Intel):**

CID 2482:

Q: I believe we have had this discussion many times in the past, and I don’t think it is appropriate to use the word “is”.

A: We have only had straw polls, but no motions. We are just following the standard LB procedure. The proposal is to also add a note to address the concern you have.

Q: The comments and the resolutions are all addressing the same issue?

A: Essentially yes.

Q: I believe it is better to discuss this at the f2f, it seems we are getting nowhere in this discussion.

Q: When you talk about “implementation”, I suggest to be more specific so it is clear exactly what is implemented

A: I agree. I will add this.

Run out of time.

1. **Meeting is adjourned at 7:00 pm (ET).**

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Minyoung Park | Intel |
| 2 | Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson |
| 3 | Yonggang Fang | ZTE |
| 4 | Xiaofei Wang | Interdigital |
| 5 | Alphan Sahin  | Interdigital |
| 6 | Rui Yang | Interdigital |
| 7 | Yunsong Yang | Huawei |
| 8 | Junghoon Suh | Huawei |
| 9 | Vinom Kristem | Intel |