IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| REVmd Telecon Minutes April - May | | | | |
| Date: 2019-04-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
| Michael Montemurro | BlackBerry Ltd | 4701 Tahoe Blvd, Mississauga, ON. CANADA. L4W 0B4 | +1-289-261-4183 | [mmontemurro@blackberry.com](mailto:mmontemurro@blackberry.com) |

Abstract

R0: Minutes for 802.11md (REVmd) Telecon for April 12, 2019

R1: Minutes for 802.11md (REVmd) Telecon for April 26, 2019

# 2019 April, May Teleconference Agendas

TGmd will hold 4 teleconferences before the March 2019 session: March 29, April 12, 26 and May 3 at 10am Eastern (2 hours) for the purpose of Letter Ballot 236 comment resolution and presentations.

We’ll use the [join.me](http://join.me) bridge:  <https://join.me/ieee802.11>, see <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/11/joinme.html> for more detailed instructions.

1. **802.11md - REVmd – Telecon, Friday 12 April 2019, 10:00- 12:00 ET**
   1. **Call to Order** at 10:02 ET by the TG Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Attendance:**
      1. Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
      2. Edward AU (Huawei)
      3. Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Jerome HENRY (Cisco)
      5. Joseph LEVY (Interdigital)
      6. Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/ARRIS)
      7. Mark RISON (Samsung)
      8. Srinivas KANDALA (Samsung)
      9. Michael MONTEMURRO (Blackberry)
      10. Sean COFFEY (Realtek)
      11. Roger MARKS (EthAirNet Associates
      12. Stephen MCCANN (BlackBerry)
      13. Antonio de la Oliva (UC3M, Interdigital)
   3. **Review Patent Policy**
      1. Call for essential patents
      2. No issues noted
   4. **Review Participation slide**:
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
   5. **Review Agenda** -
      1. [https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-05-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-05-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx )
      2. No changes noted.
   6. **Editor Report** -
      1. Emily Qi and Edward Au completed the draft updates to address the MDR comments.
      2. Thanks to the Editors and all who contributed to the review.
      3. In May, the group will vote on a motion to approve uncontroversial MDR comments.
      4. ACTION: Emily to send an email to the reflector announcing the completion of the changes and the motion.
   7. **Comment Resolution –** 
      1. Presentation of document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0286-04-000m-mac-address-policy-anqp-and-beacon-element.docx> - CID 2685 - Roger MARKS (EthAirAssociates)
         1. The extended capability bit indicates that there is a MAC address policy for the LAN.
         2. A STA may request the policy from the AP via ANQP.
         3. The LAPP process is specified in the IEEE 802.1CQ standard.
         4. The mechanism for how an IEEE 802.11 device may request an address is not defined.
         5. A zero-length prefix indicates that the STA can select any MAC address.
         6. Action for Roger to investigate the prefix notation.
         7. IEEE STD 802 hasn’t incorporated IEEE 802C-2017 at this time.
         8. This version dropped a sub-clause that added a new status code. The document needs to be updated to include the change.
         9. The MIB changes are not complete. Roger to work with Emily to complete the MIB changes.
         10. The document needs multiple acronym and editorial clean-up.
         11. The MIB needs additional items to include the policy bitmask and prefix information.
         12. The document will be given agenda time on May 3.
         13. There should be a statement that the policy would apply to the entire ESS.
      2. Presentation of document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0473-01-000m-lb236-comment-resolution-for-phy-cca.docx> - Sean COFFEY (Realtek)
         1. CID 2181 (PHY)
            1. ACCEPTED (PHY: 2019-04-12 14:52:07Z)
            2. Ready for Motion
         2. CID 2184 (PHY)
            1. ACCEPTED (PHY: 2019-04-12 14:54:28Z)
            2. Ready for Motion
         3. CID 2601 (PHY)
            1. How does the STA know whether the frame is a HT or non-HT PPDU?
            2. For ED, the signal is not specific to any IEEE 802.11 PHY.
            3. The clause is needed to differentiate from packet detect.
            4. The clause order make sense and should not be reordered. We should not be making changes in this area.
            5. REJECTED (PHY: 2019-04-12 15:05:56Z) - The comment does not adequately explain why the current text is unclear. The group finds that the current text is clear and that no further explanation is necessary.
            6. Ready for Motion.
         4. The remainder of the document will be scheduled for May 3.
      3. Presentation of document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0608-01-000m-pics-cf-items.ppt> by Edward AU (Huawei)
         1. The comment related to change the identifiers in the PICS to something more relevant.
         2. No objection to removing the remaining numbered items.
         3. Edward to take an action to prepare a document that removes the numbered items. Post the documents to mentor, send a note to the reflector, and we will motion in May.
      4. Presentation of document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0609-01-000m-pics-pc-items.ppt> by Edward Au (Huawei)
         1. PC4 and PC5 should just be removed so the cross-references should be removed.
         2. There cross references were not necessarily correct anyway so they should be removed.
         3. Edward to take an action to prepare a document that removes the numbered items. Post the documents to mentor, send a note to the reflector, and we will motion in May
      5. Presentation of document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0639-00-000m-delayed-block-ack-deletion-cleanup.docx> by Menzo WENTINK (Qualcomm)
         1. CID 2289 (PHY)
         2. The “Reserved” should be the right change for the field name.
         3. There are additional changes required for the Immediate Block ACK.
         4. Srini to prepare a contribution to update the other block ACK field name and the group can most
         5. REVISED (PHY: 2019-04-12 15:38:16Z) - Incorporate the changes given in document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0639-01-000m-delayed-block-ack-deletion-cleanup.docx>
         6. Ready for Motion
      6. Presentation of document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0574-03-000m-resolutions-for-backoff-and-obsolete-comments-d2.docx>
         1. CID 2640
            1. Menzo to review the resolution.
            2. In the past, the majority wanted to keep EIFS.
            3. Add this comment to the agenda on April 26.
         2. CID 2139
            1. For the NoACK case, the CTS frame is missing.
            2. There is no NoACK policy for non-QoS.
            3. REJECTED. Non-QOS frames do not have ACK policy fields and as such for unicast frames no No-ACK is possible. No-ACK policies are not defined for QMF STAs.
   8. **Planning for the next call** (April 26)
      1. Emily QI has withdrawn CIDs 2130 and 2131.
      2. Action Emily to send an email to the Chair indicating that she is withdrawing the comments.
      3. Action Mike to prepare a rejection reason indicating that the commentor has withdrawn the comment and mark the comments ready for motion in May.
   9. **Adjourned at 11:59 am**
2. **802.11md - REVmd – Telecon, Friday 26 April 2019, 10:00- 12:00 ET**
   1. **Call to Order** at 10:02 ET by the TG Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. **Attendance:**
      1. Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
      2. Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      3. Joseph LEVY (Interdigital)
      4. Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/ARRIS)
      5. Mark RISON (Samsung)
      6. Michael MONTEMURRO (Blackberry)
      7. Osama ABOUL-MAGD (Huawei)
      8. Yujin NOH (Newracom)
      9. Peter STEPHENSON (SAMSUNG)
      10. Sean COFFEY (Realtek)
      11. Srinivas KANDALA (Samsung)
      12. Edward AU (Huawei)
   3. **Review Patent Policy**
      1. Call for essential patents
      2. No issues noted
   4. **Review Participation slide**:
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
   5. **Review Agenda** -
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-06-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx>
      2. Discussion for today:
3. CID 2115 – Ganesh VENKATESAN
4. GEN CIDs – Jon ROSDAHL
5. 11-19-261r3 – S1G CIDs - Yujin NOH
6. 11-19-574 – CIDs 2300, 2640, 2388
   * 1. No changes noted, but we may adjust the ordering.
     2. Question on the MEC comments that were not Editorial.
        1. This was discussed during the Face to Face AdHoc and those will be assigned to the reviewer to bring to the TG for discussion.
     3. 11-19/533r7 will be posted after the meeting.
     4. Consider CID 2640 first
   1. **Editor Report (Dorothy gave summary)**
      1. D2.2 out for review
      2. Expect D2.2. next week.
      3. Draft Review CIDs for Mark RISON to be sent,
   2. **CID 2640 (MAC)**
      1. Review history from 2 weeks ago.
      2. Peter STEPHENSON (Samsung) submitted document 11-19/0574r3
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0574-03-000m-resolutions-for-backoff-and-obsolete-comments-d2.docx>
      3. Review email from Peter STEPHENSON (Samsung)
         1. Shared in the Join.me Chat window:

I've realised there's an ambiguity here which might mean the key wording

in 10.3.4.3,

If the medium is determined to be busy at any time during a backoff slot, then the backoff counter shall not be decremented for that slot. The backoff counter is next decremented after the medium has been determined to be idle for the duration of a DIFS or EIFS, as appropriate (see 10.3.2.3 (IFS)), plus aSlotTime.

does not mean what I thought. I think it may mean that EIFS is only applied if the \*new\* idle medium was caused by a condition (i.e. RX of a frame with all failed FCS) that would invoke the EIFS rules.

My previous interpretation was along the lines of &quot;if, when EIFS is in effect, medium busy is detected, then wait for EIFS after the medium goes idle”. But the standard could be interpreted as saying that unless EIFS of idle time had been detected, EIFS no longer applies, so this case does not in fact ever occur. In that case everything is consistent.

* + 1. ACTION ITEM: The chair will send a note to the reflector refering to CID 2640 to get a broader discussion.
    2. Try to have people online for discussion next week.
    3. ACTION ITEM: Mark RISON and Peter STEPHENSON to discuss off-line and send a clarifying email to the reflector. To be discussed on next call.
  1. 11-19-261r3 – S1G CIDs - Yujin NOH (Newracom)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0261-04-000m-resolutions-to-s1g-phy.docx>
     2. CID 2312 and 2314 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review proposed changes in the submission.
        3. Discussion on the form of the words (determined vs determines) … as the usage is not consistent, it will be left for a separate comment.
        4. Change to use “S1G NDP for Sounding” (drop “Format”)
        5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2019-04-26 14:34:36Z) Incorporate the changes given in 11-19/261r5 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0261-05-000m-resolutions-to-s1g-phy.docx> for CID 2312 and CID 2313
        6. Discussion on issue with the S1G bit discrepencies that need to be resolved.
        7. Will exchange email to work out the issue and try to bring back next week.
     3. CID 2270 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission proposed changes
        3. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (PHY: 2019-04-26 14:42:18Z)
        4. No Objection - Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **GEN CIDs** Jon ROSDAHL
     1. CID 2249 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment
        2. We discussed this in the adhoc and there was an action to review the changes.
        3. The cited text is in Clause 19 and we shouldn’t keep changing HT terminology each time we add a new PHY.
        4. There are numerous other instances of “primary 20 MHz channel” which are not being changed. For example, Clause 9.4.1.28.
        5. There are 63 instances in the draft. Anything outside of Clause 19 should be the subject of a different comment.
        6. The changes to resolve the comment appear to be correct. There are no technical changes.
        7. Discussion that there may be other instances "Primary Channel" outside of Clause 19 that also need to be changed -- Mark RISON and Mark Hamilton to review the approximate 63 instances throughout the draft.
        8. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2019-04-26 14:57:42Z)
        9. Mark Ready for motion
     2. CID 2609 (GEN)
        + 1. Review comment
          2. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (GEN: 2019-04-26 14:59:55Z) The Comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisfy the commenter can be determined
          3. Mark Ready for motion
     3. CID 2236 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment
        2. This proposed change was not covered in the MDR. This was discussed in the adhoc and there was no concern.
        3. We should be changing “Forty MHz” to “40 MHz” throughout the specification.
        4. This is an additional name to the draft.
        5. The cases where “Forty” is used is for field names.
        6. We should not be changing field names.
        7. Discussion on whether field names should be changed by TGm.
        8. STRAW POLL: Do you support changing the field name "Forty MHz Intolerance Field" name to "40MHz Intolerance field"?
           1. Result: 1 – Yes; 4– No; 3 – Abstain.
        9. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2019-04-26 15:15:49Z)

Note to Editor the change is at d2.1 204.4 change "forty MHz capable" to "40 MHz capable".

* + - 1. Mark Ready for motion
    1. CID 2271 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. This is a duplicate resolution to CID 2356.
       3. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2019-04-26 15:18:45Z)

Note to Editor - (CID 2356 (GEN) which was ACCEPTED) does the same deletion.

* + - 1. Mark Ready for motion.
    1. CID 2366 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. The group seems to agree with the intent of the change.
       3. We need to understand the essential change in 10.3.2.16
       4. Discussion on the use of the work “force”.
       5. Proposed change: Delete "MAC" in "MAC variable" in 10.48.1 and 6.3.5.2.3 and 11.3.9.2 (6x).

Change 10.3.2.16 to "A STA in which dot11ShortSlotTimeOptionImplemented is true shall force the PHY characteristic aSlotTime to the short slot value upon transmission or reception of Beacon, Probe Response, Association Response, and Reassociation Response frames from the BSS that the STA has joined or started and that have the short slot subfield equal to 1. The STA shall force the PHY characteristic aSlotTime to the long slot value upon transmission or reception of Beacon, Probe Response, Association Response, and Reassociation Response frames from the BSS that the STA has joined or started and that have the short slot subfield equal to 0.

A STA in which dot11ShortSlotTimeOptionImplemented is false shall force the PHY characteristic aSlotTime to the long slot value at all times. A STA in which dot11ShortSlotTimeOptionImplemented is not present, or when the PHY supports only a single slot time value shall use the PHY characteristic aSlotTime obtained from the attached PHY."

* + - 1. Per definition of Pimrary 20 MHz channel: "In an HT or VHT BSS, the primary 20 MHz channel is also the primary channel”;
      2. There are two paragraphs in 10.3.2.16
      3. The PHY characteristics indicate the slot time values. The MAC chooses between the slot times in 10.3.2.16.
      4. Assigned to Mark Hamilton to provide a submission resolving this comment.
      5. This CID will be placed on the agenda for the May 3 teleconference.
    1. CID 2378 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. This issue came up in 11ax and 11ax fixed the draft in-line with this comment.
       3. This seems like language clean-up with no technical change.
       4. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2019-04-26 15:49:36Z)
       5. Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 2470 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. This subject was discussed at the adhoc in the resolution of CID 2469.
       3. There’s usage that includes both field names and specification.
       4. Submission required describing (field/element) name change with sample text, and non-field/element text change, with sample example text in context
  1. **Review of teleconference agenda for Friday May 3**.
     1. **See doc 11**-19/533r7
     2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-07-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx>
  2. **Adjourn at 12:02**

**References:**

Friday 12 April 2019:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-05-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0286-04-000m-mac-address-policy-anqp-and-beacon-element.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0473-01-000m-lb236-comment-resolution-for-phy-cca.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0608-01-000m-pics-cf-items.ppt>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0609-01-000m-pics-pc-items.ppt>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0639-00-000m-delayed-block-ack-deletion-cleanup.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0639-01-000m-delayed-block-ack-deletion-cleanup.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0574-03-000m-resolutions-for-backoff-and-obsolete-comments-d2.docx>

Friday 26 April 2019

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-06-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0574-03-000m-resolutions-for-backoff-and-obsolete-comments-d2.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0261-04-000m-resolutions-to-s1g-phy.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0261-05-000m-resolutions-to-s1g-phy.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0533-07-000m-2019-apr-may-tgmd-teleconference-and-ad-hoc-agendas.docx>