IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVmd Telecon in Feb and Mar 2019 | | | | |
| Date: 2019-02-01 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | [jrosdahl@ieee.org](mailto:jrosdahl@ieee.org) |
| Michael Montemurro | BlackBerry Ltd | 4701 Tahoe Blvd, Mississauga, ON CANADA L4W 0B4 | +1-289-261-4183 | [mmontemurro@blackberry.com](mailto:mmontemurro@blackberry.com) |
| Joseph Levy | InterDigital Communications, Inc. | 2 Huntington Quadrangle  4th floor, South Wing Melville, NY 11747 | +1.631.622.4139 | [jslevy@ieee.org](mailto:jslevy@ieee.org) |

Abstract

802.11md Telecon minutes for February and March 2019 (Feb 1,8,15,22 and March 1)

R0: February 1, 2019

Meeting announcement:

TGmd will hold 5 teleconferences before the March 2019 session: February 1, 8, 15, 22 and March 1 at 10am Eastern (3 hours) for the purpose of Letter Ballot 236 comment resolution and presentations.

We’ll use the [join.me](http://join.me) bridge:  <https://join.me/ieee802.11>, see <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/11/joinme.html> for more detailed instructions.

Teleconferences are subject to applicable policies and procedures, see below.

•       IEEE Code of Ethics

–  <https://www.ieee.org/about/corporate/governance/p7-8.html>

•       IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Affiliation FAQ

–  <https://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>

•       Antitrust and Competition Policy

–  <https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/other/antitrust.pdf>

•       IEEE-SA Patent Policy

–  <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html>

–  <https://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/>

 •       IEEE 802 Working Group Policies &Procedures (29 Jul 2016)

–  <http://www.ieee802.org/PNP/approved/IEEE_802_WG_PandP_v19.pdf>

•       IEEE 802 LMSC Chair's Guidelines (Approved 13 Jul 2018)

–  <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/17/ec-17-0120-27-0PNP-ieee-802-lmsc-chairs-guidelines.pdf>

•       Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings

–  <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

•       IEEE 802.11 WG OM: (Approved 10 Nov 2017)

–   <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-22-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>

1. **802.11md - REVmd – Telecon, Friday 1 February 2019, 10:00- 12:00 ET**
   1. **Call to Order** at 10:05 ET by the TG Chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
   2. Thanks Michael Montemorro for taking the intial minutes.
   3. **Attendance:**
      1. Dorothy STANLEY (HPE)
      2. Emily QI (Intel)
      3. Mark RISON (Samsung)
      4. Michael MONEMURRO (Blackberry)
      5. Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      6. Joseph LEVY (InterDigital)
      7. Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
      8. Sean COFFEY (Realtek)
      9. Erik (Qualcomm)
   4. **Review of Patent Policy**
      1. **Patent Policy:** 
         1. Call for essential patents – No comments.
      2. Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
   5. **Agenda Review – doc 11-19/0246r0**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0246-00-000m-2019-feb-mar-tgmd-teleconference-agendas.docx>
      2. Draft agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

2. Editor report – Emily QI

3. Comment resolution

a. 2019-02-01

i. PHY/Security CIDs – Mike Montemurro

ii. Editorial CIDs requiring discuaaion – Emily

iii. Available MAC CIDs

iv. Additional available CIDs

4. AOB:

1. March agenda posted, see <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0221-00-000m-2019-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx> . Are there any requested agenda items?
2. April Ad-hoc: April 2-3-4 – Location venue – Portland

5. Adjourn

* + 1. No objection to adgenda
    2. Motion to approve Agenda
       1. Move to approve 11-19/246r1 as the teleconference agenda.
       2. Moved: Emily Qi Second: Joe Levy
       3. **Results**: Vote: 5 – Yes; 0 – No; 1 – Abstain – Motion Passes
  1. **Editor’s Report**
     1. Latest comment spreadsheet: 11-18/0611r15
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0611-15-000m-revmd-wg-ballot-comments.xls>
     2. Added a new tab with comments approved in January 2019.
        1. CID 2278 – Originally it was accepted. However, there was a problem with a proposed resolution. The change that was implemented was changing the clause from 10.32 to 11.32. The change in draft 2.1 is the correct change. Therefore, the comment resolution needs to be updated to Revised.
        2. No objection to the Editor’s change.
     3. There will be motion in March to revise the resolution.
     4. The MDR will start on Monday. Thanks for all who reviewed the draft that was submitted.
        1. An agenda item will be added to the March meeting to review
  2. **Review Doc 11-19/247r2** Emily QI (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0247-02-000m-lb236-proposed-resolutions-for-editor-adhoc.doc>
     2. CID 2136:
        1. Recommend that we get feedback from IEEE on definitions that include numbers. IEEE 802.11 is not the only group here.
        2. The issues are: the numbers, the parenthesis, and other characters in the definition.
        3. Emily will investigate with help from editors.
     3. CID 2431:
        1. “retrycounter” is included in the Mesh state machine and should not be changed.
        2. Mark Rison will take an action to add line numbers in the resolution for all specific locations based on the resolution posted in this document and post the update to the reflector.
     4. CID 2473
        1. There’s no real value for the use of sub-field since its used inconsistently throughout the draft.
        2. If we made the change, there’s a chance that we could introduce inconsistencies to the draft.
        3. If a text version of the draft could be produced, then we could possibly use tools to look at whether this could be investigated further.
        4. **ACTION:** Emily to investigate producing an ASCII version of the draft and post in the Members Area of the IEEE 802.11 website.
        5. **ACTION**: Mark R to run tools on ASCII version to verify change.
     5. CID 2488
        1. This comment does not appear to be an Editorial comment.
        2. The Mesh STA changes should not be made because MBSS STA refers to a STA that implements Mesh
        3. Do we really agree that an IBSS STA is a STA that is a member of an IBSS?
        4. A definition of IBSS STA is needed.
        5. All occurrences of IBSS STA refer to a STA operating in an IBSS.
        6. There are 21 instances of “member of an IBSS”
        7. At 241.60, the change would not work.
        8. Leaning to going in the direction of the commenter, but a submission is required.
        9. Assigned to commenter.
     6. CID 2489
        1. The commenter showed all the explicit changes so there is no ambiguity.
        2. Accepted.
        3. Ready for Motion.
     7. CID 2501
        1. This resolution simply adds “cryptographic” to the expansion for the acronym.
        2. The is use “cryptographic” is not necessarily correct for the KDE.
        3. The proposed resolution does not really address the comment.
        4. Adding “cryptographic” to the definition does not seem to be correct.
        5. Revise the comment, removing “cryptographic” from the definition.
        6. Make the two last changes from the proposed resolution
        7. Proposed Resolution: Revised.

Add "The" at the start of the first para of 9.4.2.185.

Change the caption for Table 12-7 to "KDE selectors"At 2619.7 , delete “cryptographic” in the sentence “The additional data may be zero or more element(s) (such as the RSNE) and zero or more key data cryptographic encapsulation(s) (KDEs) (such as GTK(s) or PMKID(s)).

* + - 1. Ready for Motion
    1. CID 2568
       1. Issues with the use of “sometimes” in the proposed resolution.
       2. The resolution will need to be revised for further work on the resolution.
       3. There is agreement on the definition.
       4. Assign to commenter.
  1. **PHY AdHoc CIDs**
     1. Thanks to Joseph Levy for helping with taking minutes
     2. Addressing "low hanging fruit" PHY comments:
     3. Screen shot of CIDs being reviewed:

Machine generated alternative text:
. ICIC . 
2467 
26260 127.4 
251 
26250 12.74 
26250 
"(Kev is seq•me 
29420 18.3.s 
29450 
214 s 
2212 
2439 
2183 
2185 
2101 
2130 
2131 
. Claus 
12 
26320 127.66 
26370 12772 
30320 19.119 
31330 21342 
It is a inside the D Of 
ZAPOL-Key OataKOsJ (e g 
the seems as 
as arr.-thing is added irdgod Changed) 
" which the s 
arMhing is (M imieed it 
ar determine 
The change for zapJL-Key rug 4/4 
comsatibility with deployed deMces Md 
This lisl is an exclusiee list, in any only one 
the ballots apg•gw OCI bung-t CO"d 
"ard shall caps&e of 8. 12. and u using the 
in Clause 17 
'mg tiff* 
shall used unless the BSS 
mly cfERP STAS supM the Shon Slot 
d8hned In the the is 
to 6.6) to 342.37 definitu 
"Insen Gl and apmv prepend a (LONG_GI) and 
aggly as (Transmitted signal)" Il 
"Inser Cl Md apgev Gl (LONG_CI) 
I think it At 2626.9 , 
of 
Change the The 
arg 
Delete which cmtain the to the 
the 
the text at the to "(Kev 
(that 
Rwt 02.0 chM1ge by "On [Q*ion of me. 
the KeyReg*ay fie 
Change ta 'Additionally cantains an OCI at lie end 
line 35. cr.ge the end of the senW 
"Ming at 
to the atra 
"ERF STAS that support the Slot 
"STAS that the Slot 
Change RCPI er.ding Ir. '6.46.6 
Channel Indicatr 
Gl amd applv prepend a 
(LONG_GI) and as in 
Gl 2nd apptv a 

* + 1. CID 2457 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. at 2625.9 - proposed adding the word concatenated, - modified resolution to be: Change "contained in" to "concatenated and contained in" –
       3. No objection, Mark ready for motion.
    2. CID 2452 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. proposing to change "which may contain the following" to "the following abbreviations are used", proposal was made to change to "where" –
       3. there was no objection, revised comment resolution –
       4. Mark Ready for motion.
    3. CID 2451 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. - some discussion
       3. - agreed this was related to CID 2452
       4. - hence proposed to use the same resolution.
       5. Proposed Resolution: Revised (PHY: 2019-02-01 15:35:17Z) – At 2625.10, change “which may contain the following” to “where”. Note to the editor; This is the same resolution as for CID 2452.
       6. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    4. CID 2445 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. - no agreement on how to proceed
       3. - submission required.
       4. Action Item: Jouni MALINEN and Mark RISON to work offline
    5. CID 2212 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. - 2632.9 – Note that we put 1322 to address KRACK attacks
       3. Discusion on if all effects were understood at the time.
       4. Mark RISON (Samsung) Posted to the Chat Window the following information:
          1. "Mathy of KRACK fame thinks that a careful inspection of the 802.11 standard reveals that the authenticator may accept any replay counter that was used in the 4-way handshake, not only the latest one [Subclause 12.7.6.5]: “On reception of message 4, the Authenticator verifies that the Key Replay Counter field value is one that it used on this 4-way handshake”
          2. In practice, he found that several APs indeed accept an older replay counter. More precisely, some APs accept replay counters that were used in a message to the client, but were not yet used in a reply from the client. These Aps will accept the older unencrypted message 4, which has the replay counter r+1. As a result, these AP will install the PTK, and will start sending encrypted unicast data frames to the client.
          3. Mathy suggests that something like the following would make it clearer: “On reception of message 4, the Authenticator verifies that the Key Replay Counter field value is one that it used on this 4-way handshake and is strictly larger than that in any other EAPOL-Key frame received thus far during this session.”
       5. After more discussion, the commenter does not remember what motivated the comment, and is ok with the current text.
       6. Proposed Resolution: Reject: The requirement of the request bit being 0 rules out comparison against the other counter.
       7. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    6. CID 2439 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. - proposing to add text
       3. Proposed Resolution: Revised: At the cited location, change:

"OCI KDE when Dot11RSNAOperatingChannelValidationActivated on the Authenticator".

 to

"When Dot11RSNAOperatingChannelValidationActivated is true on the Authenticator, OCI KDE".

* + - 1. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    1. CID 2671 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. - fixing the reference based on document updates for B27
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       4. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
       5. Also move foot note from B28 to B27 as B27 is not first IETF RFC.  -
       6. Proposed Resoution: Revised – in addition to the proposed change move foot note from B28 to B27 as B27 is not first IETF RFC
    2. CID 2183 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review location 2942.35 -
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accept –
       4. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion
    3. CID 2185 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Revised: Change "ERP STAs" to "STAs”
       3. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    4. CID 2101 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accept -
       3. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    5. CID 2130 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. After discussion, No agreement reached.
       3. - there is a desire to get PHY experts to review this comment,
       4. Action Item: Emily to craft e-mail text and send to WG reflector for discussion.
    6. CID 2131 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. This is Same issue as 2130, but in different location, hence to be include in above e-mail for reflector discussion.
    7. CID 2121 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted - Note to commenter - in the specification currently has k >= 64.
       3. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    8. CID 2365 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted - Note to the editor the changes are on Page 4128 4 and 16.
       3. There were no objections – Mark Ready for motion.
    9. CID 2122 (PHY)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Action item Mark RISON - with check what was encoded in the ASIIC in the table and propose a resolution.
    10. Time 11:36ET - End of Joe’s notes
  1. **Return to Review doc 11-19/247r2** Emily QI (Intel):
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0247-02-000m-lb236-proposed-resolutions-for-editor-adhoc.doc>
     2. CID 2136 (Editor)
        1. Review comment
        2. Editor has reviewed section 3.2, and did not see any other obvious errors, so resolution is addressing only the comment specifically.
        3. Other ordering errors will need more discussion and investigation.
        4. Proposed Resoution: Revised. Move the defintion of "generic advertisement service" from 181.49 to 181.18
        5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **AOB:**
     1. **TGmd Adhoc Location - April 2-4, 2019**
        1. In January, the TG approved an Adhoc meeting for April 2-4 but did not specify a venue.
        2. Received confirmation that Intel can host the meeting in Portland.
        3. A future adhoc meeting can be hosted by Samsung in Cambridge.
        4. Request for Objections to confirming the location of the Adhoc meeting in Portland in April 2019 –
        5. None Given.
  3. **Next Meeting plans**
     1. Any additional agenda items for the 8 February teleconference?
     2. None given.
  4. **Adjourn at 11:55am ET**

**References:**

**February 1, 2019:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0246-00-000m-2019-feb-mar-tgmd-teleconference-agendas.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0221-00-000m-2019-march-tgmd-agenda.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-0611-15-000m-revmd-wg-ballot-comments.xls>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0247-02-000m-lb236-proposed-resolutions-for-editor-adhoc.doc>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/19/11-19-0247-02-000m-lb236-proposed-resolutions-for-editor-adhoc.doc>