IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| REVmd LB236 EDITOR2 ad-hoc related comment resolutions |
| Date: 2019-02-12 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  | edward.ks.au@huawei.com  |

##### This submission present proposed resolution for CIDs 2326, 2625, 2487, 2528, 2227, 2563, 2293, and 2543. The proposed changes are based on REVmd/D2.1.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

R1 – updated per the discussion on the February 8th teleconference call

R2 – Resolutions for CIDs 2227 and 2563 are updated. Alternative resolution for CID 2528 is uploaded.

R3 – Resolutions for CIDs 2528, 2227, and 2563 are updated. CID 2486 is pulled out and transferred to MAC.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2326 | 10.6.10 | 1762 | 18 | "Table 10-9 (Modulation classes(#64)(11aj)) defines modulation classes for the rules for response frames in 9.7(Aggregate MPDU (A-MPDU))." -- the latter seems like spec xref rot | Fix the second xref in the cited text |

***Discussion:***

The sentence of interest is shown below.



I've reviewed IEEE 802.11-2012 standards and found the following in page 862 (clause 9.7.8) in IEEE 802.11-2012 standards: "In order to determine the rules for response frames given in 9.7, the following modulation classes are defined in Table 9-4". Here clause 9.7 is about the multirate support.

The correct reference should be subclause 10.6 (Multirate support).

***Proposed resolution:***

***Revised***

Fix the reference by replacing 9.7 with 10.6.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2625 | 23.2.2 | 3294 | 24 | Mixture of "is" and "equals" for referring to TXVECTOR for 11ah (e.g. "FORMAT is S1G and(CH\_BANDWIDTH equalsCBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 orCBW16) andPREAMBLE\_TYPE equalsS1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLEand NUM\_STS is larger than1(#1136)") | Change "equals" to "is" throughout Table 23-1 |

***Proposed resolution:***

Revised

|  |
| --- |
| * TXVECTOR and RXVECTOR parameters (11ah)
 |
| Parameter | Condition | Value | **TXVECTOR** | **RXVECTOR** |
| FORMAT |  | Determines the format of the PPDU.Enumerated type:S1G indicates S1G PPDU format.S1G\_DUP\_1M indicates S1G 1 MHz Duplicate PPDU formatS1G\_DUP\_2M indicates S1G 2 MHz Duplicate PPDU format | Y | Y |
| PREAMBLE\_TYPE | FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) | Determine the type of preamble of the S1G PPDU.Enumerated type:S1G\_SHORT\_PREAMBLE indicates the short preamble defined in 23.3.8.2.1 (S1G\_SHORT preamble).S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE indicates the long preamble defined in 23.3.8.2.2 (S1G\_LONG preamble). | Y | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_2M | Set to S1G\_SHORT\_PREAMBLE defined in 23.3.8.2.1 (S1G\_SHORT preamble)(#1136). | Y | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| MU\_SU | FORMAT is S1G and PREAMBLE\_TYPE is S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE and CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16)  | Determine whether MU or SU of the S1G PPDUEnumerated type:Set to MU if NUM\_USERS is 2 to 4.Set to SU if NUM\_USERS is 1. | Y | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| NDP\_INDICATION | (#1136) | Determine the type of S1G frame.Set to 1 if this packet is one of NDP CMAC frames as defined in 9.9 (NDP CMAC frames(11ah)).Set to 0 otherwise.(#1136) | Y | Y |
| NDP\_CMAC\_FRAME\_BODY | NDP\_INDICATION is 1 | Set to concatenated bit fields, which describe the NDP CMAC frame body content in one of NDP CMAC frame types defined in Table 9-538 (NDP CMAC frame Type field values(11ah)).(See 9.9 (NDP CMAC frames(11ah))). | Y | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| SMOOTHING | FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and PREAMBLE\_TYPE is S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE and NUM\_STS is larger than 1(#1136) | (#1136)Indicates whether (Ed)frequency domain smoothing is recommended as part of channel estimation.Set to 1 if (Ed)frequency domain smoothing is recommended.Set to 0 otherwise. | Y | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and PREAMBLE\_TYPEis S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE and NUM\_STS is 1(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| Otherwise | (#1136)Indicates whether frequency domain smoothing is recommended as part of channel estimation.Set to 1 if frequency domain smoothing is recommended.Set to 0 otherwise. | Y(#1136) | Y(#1136) |
| AGGREGATION | (#1136) | Indicates whether the PSDU contains an A-MPDU. Enumerated type:AGGREGATED indicates this packet has A-MPDU aggregation.NOT\_AGGREGATED indicates this packet does not have A-MPDU aggregation(#1136). | Y | Y |
| SECTOR\_ID | (#1136)FORMAT is S1G and PREMABLE\_TYPE is S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE | Indicates which sectorized beam of the available sectorized beams are used in the transmission. The length of the parameter is 8 bits. A 1 in bit position n, relative to the LSB, indicates that Sector n is used. This parameter is present only if sectorization is applied. | O | N |
| Otherwise | Not present | N | N |
| N\_TX | (#1136) | Indicates the number of transmit chains(#1136). | Y | N |
| EXPANSION\_MAT | (#1136)FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is MU | Contains a vector in the number of selected subcarriers containing feedback matrices as defined in 23.3.10.2 (Beamforming Feedback Matrix V) based on the channel measured during the training symbols of a previous S1G NDP PPDU. | MU | N |
| (#1136)FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is SU | (#1136)Contains a vector in the number of selected subcarriers containing feedback matrices as defined in 23.3.10.2 (Beamforming Feedback Matrix V) based on the channel measured during the training symbols of a previous S1G NDP PPDU. | O(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| CHAN\_MAT | PSDU\_LENGTH is 0 and NDP\_INDICATION is 0(#1136) | Contains a set of compressed beamforming feedback matrices as defined in 23.3.10.2 (Beamforming Feedback Matrix V) based on the channel measured during the training symbols of the received S1G NDP PPDU. | N | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| DELTA\_SNR | FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) | Contains an array of delta SNR values as defined in 9.4.1.51 (MU Exclusive Beamforming Report field) based on the channel measured during the training symbols of the received S1G NDP PPDU.NOTE—In the RXVECTOR this parameter is present only for S1G NDP PPDUs for MU sounding. | MU | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| RCPI |  | Is a measure of the received RF power averaged over all the receive chains in the Data field of a received PPDU.Refer to 19.3.19.6 (Received channel power indicator (RCPI) measurement) for the definition of RCPI. | N | Y |
| SNR | (#1136) | Contains an array of measures of the received SNR for each spatial stream. SNR indications of 8 bits are supported. SNR shall be the sum of the decibel values of SNR per tone divided by the number of tones represented in each stream as described in 9.4.1.49 (VHT Compressed Beamforming Report field). | N | Y |
| FEC\_CODING | FORMAT is S1G | Indicates which FEC encoding is used.Enumerated type:BCC\_CODING indicates binary convolutional code.LDPC\_CODING indicates low-density parity check code. | MU | Y |
| (#1136)FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_2M or S1G\_DUP\_1M | (#1136)Indicates which FEC encoding is used.Enumerated type:BCC\_CODING indicates binary convolutional code.LDPC\_CODING indicates low-density parity check code. | Y(#1136) | Y(#1136) |
| STBC | (#1136) | Indicates whether or not STBC is used.0 indicates no STBC (*NSTS=NSS* in the Data field).1 indicates STBC is used (*NSTS=2NSS* in the Data field)(#1136)*.* | Y | Y |
| GI\_TYPE | (#1136) | Indicates whether a short guard interval is used in the transmission of the Data field of the PPDU.Enumerated type:LONG\_GI indicates short GI is not used in the Data field of the PPDU.SHORT\_GI indicates short GI is used in the Data field of the PPDU. | Y | Y |
| TXPWR\_LEVEL | (#1136) | The allowed values for the TXPWR\_LEVEL parameter are in the range from 1 to numberOfOctets(dot11TxPowerLevelExtended)/2. This parameter is used to indicate which of the available transmit output power levels defined in dot11TxPowerLevelExtended shall be used for the current transmission(#1136). | Y | N |
| RSSI | (#1136) | The allowed values for the RSSI parameter are in the range 0 to 255 inclusive. This parameter is a measure by the PHY of the power observed at the antenna connectors(#140) used to receive the current PPDU measured during the reception of the LTF field. RSSI is intended to be used in a relative manner, and it is a monotonically increasing function of the received power. | N | Y |
| MCS | FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) | Indicates the modulation and coding scheme used in the transmission of the PPDU.Integer: range 0 to 9 | MU | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_2M | Indicates the modulation and coding scheme used in the transmission of the PPDU.Integer: range 0 to 9 | Y(#1136) | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | (#1136)Indicates the modulation and coding scheme used in the transmission of the PPDU.Integer: range 0 to 10 | Y(#1136) | Y(#1136) |
| REC\_MCS | (#1136)FORMAT is (S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16)) or S1G\_DUP\_2M | Indicates the MCS that the STA’s receiver recommends.Integer: range 0 to 9 | N | O |
| (#1136)Otherwise | (#1136)Indicates the MCS that the STA’s receiver recommends.Integer: range 0 to 10 | N(#1136) | O(#1136) |
| CH\_BANDWIDTH | FORMAT is S1G | Indicates the channel width of the transmitted PPDU:Enumerated type:CBW1 for 1 MHzCBW2 for 2 MHzCBW4 for 4 MHzCBW8 for 8 MHzCBW16 for 16 MHz | Y | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_2M | In TXVECTOR, indicates the channel width of the transmitted (#1129)S1G 2 MHz Duplicate PPDU.In RXVECTOR, indicates the estimated channel width of the (#1129)received S1G 2 MHz Duplicate PPDU.Enumerated type:CBW4 for 4 MHzCBW8 for 8 MHzCBW16 for 16 MHz | Y | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_1M | In TXVECTOR, indicates the channel width of the transmitted (#1129)S1G 1 MHz Duplicate PPDU.In RXVECTOR, indicates the estimated channel width of the (#1129)received S1G 1 MHz Duplicate PPDU.Enumerated type:CBW2 for 2 MHzCBW4 for 4 MHzCBW8 for 8 MHzCBW16 for 16 MHz(#1136) | Y | Y |
| LENGTH | AGGREGATION is AGGREGATED(#1013) | Indicates the packet duration in number of symbols in the PSDU(#1013) | Y | Y |
| AGGREGATION is NOT\_AGGREGATED(#1013) | Indicates the packet duration in number of octets in the PSDU(#1013) | Y | Y |
| APEP\_LENGTH | FORMAT is S1G and AGGREGATION is AGGREGATED(#1013) | If equal to 0, indicates an S1G NDP PPDU for both RXVECTOR and TXVECTOR.If greater than 0 in the TXVECTOR, indicates the number of octets in the A-MPDU pre-EOF padding (see 10.13.2) carried in the PSDU. This parameter is used to determine the number of OFDM symbols in the Data field that do not appear after a subframe with 1 in the EOF subfield. | MU | O |
| FORMAT is (S1G\_DUP\_2M or SIG\_DUP\_1M) and AGGREGATION is AGGREGATED(#1013) | If equal to 0, indicates an S1G NDP PPDU for both RXVECTOR and TXVECTOR. If greater than 0 in the TXVECTOR, indicates the number of octets in the A-MPDU pre-EOF padding (see 10.12.2) carried in the PSDU. This parameter is used to determine the number of OFDM symbols in the Data field that do not appear after a subframe with 1 in the EOF subfield.(#1013)  | Y(#1013) | O(#1013) |
| Otherwise(#1013) | Not present(#1013) | N(#1013) | N(#1013) |
| PSDU\_LENGTH | FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is MU(#1013) | Indicates the value in the RXVECTOR obtained from 23.4.3 (TXTIME and PSDU\_LENGTH calculation)(#1013). | N(#1013) | Y |
| Otherwise(#1013) | If greater than 0 in the TXVECTOR and AGGREGATION is NOT\_AGGREGATED, indicates the number of octets in the PSDU.If greater than 0 in the RXVECTOR, this parameter is the value obtained from 23.4.3 (TXTIME and PSDU\_LENGTH calculation).A value of 0 indicates an S1G NDP PPDU for both RXVECTOR and TXVECTOR(#1013). | Y(#1013) | Y(#1013) |
| USER\_POSITION | (#1136)FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is MU | Index for user in MU transmission. Integer: range 0–3.NOTE—The entries in the USER\_POSITION array are in ascending order. | Y | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| NUM\_STS | FORMAT is S1G | Indicates the number of space-time streams.Integer: range 1–4 per user in the TXVECTOR and 0–4 in the RXVECTOR. NUM\_STS summed over all users is in the range 1 to 4 for MU-MIMO. | MU | Y |
| (#1136)FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_2M or S1G\_DUP\_1M | Indicates the number of space-time streams.Integer: range 1–4 per user in the TXVECTOR and 0–4 in the RXVECTOR.(#1136) | Y | Y |
| GROUP\_ID | (#1136)FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is MU | Indicates the group ID.Integer: range 1–62 (see Table 23-14 (Fields in the SIG-A field of S1G\_LONG preamble MU PPDU (#1589)(11ah)) in 23.3.8.2.2.1.5). | Y | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| PARTIAL\_AID | (#1136)FORMAT is (S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is SU) or S1G\_DUP\_2M | Provides an abbreviated indication of the intended recipient(s) of the PSDU (see 10.22).Integer: range 0–511 if UPLINK\_INDICATION is 1, and range 0–63 if UPLINK\_INDICATION is 0. | Y | Y |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Not present(#1136) | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| NUM\_USERS | (#1136)FORMAT is S1G and (CH\_BANDWIDTHis CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and MU\_SU is MU | Indicates the number of users with nonzero space-time streams.Integer: range 1 to 4. | Y | N |
| Otherwise(#1136) | Set to 1(#1136) | Y(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| BEAM\_CHANGE | FORMAT is S1G and MU\_SU is SU and (CH\_BANDWIDTH is CBW2 or CBW4 or CBW8 or CBW16) and PREAMBLE\_TYPE is S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE and NUM\_STS is 1. | Set to 1 if the Q matrix is changed from the omnidirectional portion to the beam changeable portion of the long preamble, in at least one of the nonzero (Ed)subcarrier of the omnidirectional portion as described in 23.3.8.2.2.1.5 (SIG-A definition).Set to 0 if the Q matrix is unchanged in all the nonzero sub-carriers of the omnidirectional portion. NOTE—If BEAM\_CHANGE is 0 and PREAMBLE\_TYPE is S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE, the receiver may do channel smoothing. Otherwise, smoothing is not recommended.(#1136)  | Y | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N | N |
| RESPONSE\_INDICATION | (#1136) | Set to 0 if No Response.Set to 1 if NDP Response.Set to 2 if Normal Response.Set to 3 if Long Response. | Y | Y |
| TRAVELING\_PILOTS | (#1136) | Set to 1 if traveling pilots are used in the packet.Set to 0 otherwise. | Y | O |
| TIME\_OF\_DEPARTURE\_REQUESTED |  | Boolean value:True indicates that the MAC entity requests that the PHY entity measures and reports time of departure parameters corresponding to the time when the first PPDU energy is sent by the transmitting port.False indicates that the MAC entity requests that the PHY entity neither measures nor reports time of departure parameters. | O | N |
| RX\_START\_OF\_FRAME\_OFFSET | dot11MgmtOptionTimingMsmtActivated is true | 0 to 232– 1. An estimate of the offset (in 10 ns units) from the point in time at which the start of the preamble corresponding to the incoming frame arrived at the receive antenna port to the point in time at which this primitive is issued to the MAC. | N | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N(#1136) | N(#1136) |
| UPLINK\_INDICATION | NDP\_INDICATION is 0 and FORMAT is S1G and CH\_BANDWIDTH is not CBW1 | Set to 1 if the S1G PPDU is addressed to APSet to 0 otherwise(See 10.22). | Y | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N | N |
| COLOR | UPLINK\_INDICATION is 0 and NDP\_INDICATION is 0 and FORMAT is S1G or S1G\_DUP\_2M and CH\_BANDWIDTH is not CBW1 and MU\_SU is SU. | Set to a value of its choosing within the range 0 to 7 (See 10.22)(#1136) | Y | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N | N |
| SCRAMBLER\_OR\_CRC | (#1136)NDP\_INDICATION is 0 | Indicates the Scrambler Initialization value in the Service field (as defined in 23.3.9.2 (SERVICE field)) prior to descrambling.Bit sequence of 7 bits in length: [B0:B6] of the SERVICE field value prior to descrambling. | N | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G and NDP\_INDICATION is 1 | Indicates the value of the calculated CRC in the SIG field.Bit sequence of 4 bits in length: Either [B26:B29] of the 1 MHz SIG field or [B38:B41] of the ≥ 2 MHz SIG field. | N | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_2M and NDP\_INDICATION is 1 | Indicates the value of the calculated CRC in the SIG field.Bit sequence of 4 bits in length: [B38:B41] of the ≥ 2 MHz SIG field. | N | Y |
| FORMAT is S1G\_DUP\_1M and NDP\_INDICATION is 1 | Indicates the value of the calculated CRC in the SIG field.Bit sequence of 4 bits in length: [B26:B29] of the 1 MHz SIG field. | N | Y |
| Otherwise | Not present | N | N |
| NOTE—In the “TXVECTOR” and “RXVECTOR” columns, the following apply:Y = Present;N = Not present;O = Optionally present(#1136);MU indicates that the parameter is present once for an S1G SU PPDU and present per user for an S1G MU PPDU. Parameters specified to be present per user are conceptually supplied as an array of values indexed by *u*, where *u* takes values 0 to NUM\_USERS-1. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2487 | 10.3.5 | 1734 | 45 | "A STA may also use an RTS/CTS exchange for individually addressedframes when it is necessary to distribute the NAV or when it is necessary to establish protection (see 10.28(Protection mechanisms)). A STA may also use an RTS/CTS exchange for other purposes." is awkward | Change the cited text at the referenced location to "A STA may also use an RTS/CTS exchange for individually addressed frames when it is necessary to distribute the NAV, or when it is necessary to establish protection (see 10.27 (Protection mechanisms)), or for other purposes." |

***Discussion:***

The sentences of interest in D2.1 are shown below.



The sentences of interest in D1.0 are shown below.



***Proposed resolution:***

Revised

Replace

“A STA may also use an RTS/CTS exchange for individually addressed frames when it is necessary to distribute the NAV or when it is necessary to establish protection (see 10.28 (Protection mechanisms)). A STA may also use an RTS/CTS exchange for other purposes.”

with

“A STA may also use an RTS/CTS exchange for individually addressed frames when it is necessary to distribute the NAV, or when it is necessary to establish protection (see 10.28 (Protection mechanisms)), or for other purposes.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2528 | 12.4.7.4 | 2538 | 8 | " the Password Identifier is an element " -- the Password Identifier what? | Change the cited text at the referenced location to " the Password Identifier field is an element " |

***Discussion:***

The sentence of interest is shown below.



As per 9.4.2.216, password identifier is an element and I cannot find any “Password Identifier field” throughout the draft standards:



Comments from Mark Rison: needs discussion. I think this is talking about fields in the Commit message.

***On the February 8th teleconference call, we come up with the following proposed resolution:***

*Revised*

*In 2539.9, replace “Password Identifier is an element with a well-defined prefix” with “Password Identifier element has a well-defined prefix”.*

*In 874.44, replace “Presence of fields 4 onwards” with “Presence of fields and elements from order 4 onwards”.*

***On February 11, Mark Rison provided the following alternative resolution for the task group to consider:***

Revised

Accept CID 2302, which avoids the incredibly confusing name "Finite field element".

(Edward’s note: For CID 2302 that is an accepted EDITOR comment, Mark proposed to replace “Finite field element (FFE) field” to “FFE field” throughout. Also in Table 9-42 change “A Finite field element field from a finite field” to “An element in a finite field” (cf. 9.4.1.40)).

Accept CID 2532, which points out the field is called Finite Cyclic Group (CID 2533 needs to be REVISED in consequence).

(Edward’s note: For CID 2532 that is a pending PHY comment, Mark proposed to replace “Group field” with “Finite Cyclic Group field” in clause 12.4.7.4.)

Accept CID 2535, which points out "vendor specific additions" is vague.

(Edward’s note: For CID 2535 that is a pending PHY comment, Mark proposed to replace “vendor specific additions” with “Vendor Speicfic elements” in clause 12.4.7.4.)

Then make the following changes:

NOTE—An Anti-clogging ~~t~~Tokens field, a ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier~~s~~ element, and ~~v~~Vendor sSpecific ~~addition~~elements ~~may be optionally~~might be present in a received Commit message. Since the size of the Scalar field and ~~Element~~FFE field are determined by the Finite Cyclic Group field, any ~~a~~Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field present will be of a size determined by the recipient, and the Password Identifier ~~is an~~ element ~~with~~has a well-defined prefix, the Commit message can be unambiguously parsed using the following technique:

a) Compute the following values:

— Base length is the sum of the length of the Finite Cyclic Group field, the length of the Scalar field, and the length of the ~~Element~~FFE field

— Token length is the size of a requested ~~a~~Anti-clogging tToken field

b) If the length of the Commit message equals the base length then there is no Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field, no ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier element, and no ~~v~~Vendor ~~s~~Specific ~~addition~~elements;

c) If the length of the Commit message is greater than the base length but less than the sum of the base length and token length and a Password Identifier element follows the ~~Element~~FFE field, then there is a ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier element and no Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field. If a Password Identifier element does not follow the ~~Element~~FFE field or the length of the Commit message indicates there are additional octets following the Password Identifier element, then there are ~~v~~Vendor ~~s~~Specific ~~addition~~elements.

d) If the length of the Commit message is greater than the sum of the base length and the token length and a Password Identifier element follows the ~~Element~~FFE field, then there is a ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier element and an Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field. If a Password Identifier element does not follow the ~~Element~~FFE field or the length of the Commit message indicates there are additional octets following the Password Identifier element, then there are ~~v~~Vendor ~~s~~Specific ~~addition~~elements.

***Proposed resolution for CID 2528:***

Revised

*In 874.44, replace “Presence of fields 4 onwards” with “Presence of fields and elements from order 4 onwards”.*

*In 2539.9, update the paragraph as follows:*

NOTE—An Anti-clogging ~~t~~Tokens field, a ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier~~s~~ element, and ~~v~~Vendor sSpecific ~~addition~~elements ~~may be optionally~~might be present in a received Commit message. Since the size of the Scalar field and ~~Element~~FFE field are determined by the Finite Cyclic Group field, any ~~a~~Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field present will be of a size determined by the recipient, and the Password Identifier ~~is an~~ element ~~with~~has a well-defined prefix, the Commit message can be unambiguously parsed using the following technique:

a) Compute the following values:

— Base length is the sum of the length of the Finite Cyclic Group field, the length of the Scalar field, and the length of the ~~Element~~FFE field

— Token length is the size of a requested ~~a~~Anti-clogging tToken field

b) If the length of the Commit message equals the base length then there is no Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field, no ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier element, and no ~~v~~Vendor ~~s~~Specific ~~addition~~elements;

c) If the length of the Commit message is greater than the base length but less than the sum of the base length and token length and a Password Identifier element follows the ~~Element~~FFE field, then there is a ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier element and no Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field. If a Password Identifier element does not follow the ~~Element~~FFE field or the length of the Commit message indicates there are additional octets following the Password Identifier element, then there are ~~v~~Vendor ~~s~~Specific ~~addition~~elements.

d) If the length of the Commit message is greater than the sum of the base length and the token length and a Password Identifier element follows the ~~Element~~FFE field, then there is a ~~p~~Password ~~i~~Identifier element and an Anti-clogging ~~t~~Token field. If a Password Identifier element does not follow the ~~Element~~FFE field or the length of the Commit message indicates there are additional octets following the Password Identifier element, then there are ~~v~~Vendor ~~s~~Specific ~~addition~~elements.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2227 | 10.13.4 | 1777 | 20 | An RA is an address, which can be individual or group, but it is not itself "addressed". There are a few uses of "group addressed RA" that should be "group address" RA. | Replace all six occurrences of "group addressed RA" in this subclause with "group address RA" |

***Discussion:***

The sentence of interest is shown below.



Comments from Mark Rison: needs discussion. "group address RA" reads to me like a collision of two nouns. Maybe "RA that is a group address"?

***Proposed resolution:***

Revised

At 1777.20, 1777.22, 1777.26, 1777.29, 1777.35, and 1777.37, replace “a group addressed RA” with “an RA that is a group address”.

At 253.33, 253.47, and 2113.18, replace “a group address RA” with “an RA that is a group address”.

At 255.62, replace “a synthetic group address RA” with “an RA that is a synthetic group address”.

At 255.37, replace “an individually addressed RA” with “an RA that is an individual address”.

At 259.8, replace “An EPD STA, when transmitting an individually addressed RA” with “An EPD STA, when transmitting a MPDU with an RA that is an individual address”.

At 299.56 and 299.59, replace “individually addressed RAs” with “RAs that are individual addresses”.

At 310.2, 310.18, 311.6, 2328.46, 2332.18, and 2379.18, replace “an individually addressed destination address” with “a destination address that is an individual address”.

At 253.47, 1850.23, 1850.26, 1850.50, 1851.43, and 1851.45, replace “data frame” with “Data frame”.

At 790.35, 790.38, 2181.38, and 2182.18, replace “with individually addressed destination AID” with “with a destination AID that is not the broadcast AID”.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2563 | C.3 |  |  | Sometimes UNITS specifiers in the MIB are spelt out ("milliseconds"), sometimes abbreviated ("mW") | Throughout C.3 in UNITS strings change "seconds" to "s", "milliseconds" to "ms", "minutes" to "min", "hour" to "h", "microseconds" to "us" |

***Discussion:***

On the Februry 8th teleconference call, there was a consensus in changing "seconds" to "s", "milliseconds" to "ms", "minutes" to "min", and "hour" to "h" throughout C.3. For “microseconds”, the following straw poll was conducted:

Which option do you prefer:

* Option 1: Keep using the term “microseconds”
* Option 2: Replace “microseconds” with “0.001 ms”
* Option 3: Replace “microseconds” with “1000 ns”
* Option 4: Replace “microseconds” with “us”.

The straw poll result was:

* Option 1: 8
* Option 2: 2
* Option 3: 2
* Option 4: 7
* Abstain: 5

**Update (February 10):**

As per the editorial style guide (09/1034r12),

“The MIB needs to be compilable. The smtools compiler (see reference in C.2) requires 7-bit ASCII, or compilation will be aborted. Note the following:

* Greek or Unicode characters are not allowed. Spell out the units in full.”

**Second update (February 15)**

Straw poll - Which option do you prefer:

* Option 1: At 4161.35, 4161.48, 4161.60, 4162.7, 4162.19, 4162.31, 4162.44, and 4162.56, replace “mW” with “milliwatts”.
* Option 2: Change "seconds" to "s", "milliseconds" to "ms", "minutes" to "min", and "hour" to "h", keep using microseconds, and keep using “mW” as milliwatts throughout C.3.
* Option 3: Reject the comment (with a rejection reason that a mix of abbreviations is fine).

The straw poll result was:

* Option 1: 1
* Option 2: 1
* Option 3: 10
* Abstain: 1

***Proposed resolution:***

Rejected

The task group considered many options as shown below but there is no consensus in making the changes. A concern, for example, was changing the abbreviation from “hour” to “h” in this context would introduce confusion to the readers.

On February 8, the following 4 options were considered.

* Option 1: Keep using the term “microseconds”
* Option 2: Replace “microseconds” with “0.001 ms”
* Option 3: Replace “microseconds” with “1000 ns”
* Option 4: Replace “microseconds” with “us”.

On February 15, the following 3 options were considered.

* Option 1: At 4161.35, 4161.48, 4161.60, 4162.7, 4162.19, 4162.31, 4162.44, and 4162.56, replace “mW” with “milliwatts”.
* Option 2: Change "seconds" to "s", "milliseconds" to "ms", "minutes" to "min", and "hour" to "h", keep using microseconds, and keep using “mW” as milliwatts throughout C.3.
* Option 3: Reject the comment (with a rejection reason that a mix of abbreviations is fine).

The straw poll result was:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2293 | 11.35.1 | 2459 | 51 | Clause 10.40 was removed by 11-17/1238r2. Two locations that referenced 10.40 now have garbage(?) text. In D1.0, these are at P2267.4, P2264.35, and P3398.18. | Replace the parenthetical text (which used to be a reference to 10.40) with a reference to 10.46.1. Similarly, at P3721.18, replace with a reference to 10.46. |

***Discussion:***

The sentences of interest in D2.1 are shown below.

At 2460.49:



At 2463.16:



At 3724.18:



***Proposed resolution:***

Revised

At 2460.49, replace “A source REDS, a destination REDS, and an RDS can establish the types of relay operation as specified in (An example of the fast link adaptation procedure is shown in Link adaptation using the CMMG link measurement(#64)..).” with “A source REDS, a destination REDS, and an RDS can establish the types of relay operation as specified in 10.46.1.”.

At 2463.16, replace “NOTE–As described in (An example of the fast link adaptation procedure is shown in Link adaptation using the CMMG link measurement(#64)..),” with “NOTE–As described in 10.46.3.2.3,”.

At 3724.18, replace “(An example of the fast link adaptation procedure is shown in Link adaptation using the CMMG link measurement(#64)..)” with “10.46”.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 2543 | 11.22.14 | 2361 | 43 | ARP as defined in RFC 826 defines requests and replies, all lowercase (ARP Probes as defined in RFC 5227 do get an uppercase P though) | At the referenced location change " When the IPv4 address being resolved in theARP request packet (IETF RFC 826) is used by a non-AP STA currently associated to the BSS, the proxyARP service shall respond on behalf of the STA to an ARP request (IETF RFC 925) or an ARP Probe (IETFRFC 5227).When an AP receives an ARP Request from one associated STA" to " When the IPv4 address being resolved in anARP request (IETF RFC 826) or probed in an ARP Probe (IETFRFC 5227) is used by a non-AP STA currently associated to the BSS, the proxyARP service shall respond on behalf of the STA.When an AP receives an ARP request from an associated STA" |

***Discussion:***

The sentences of interest are shown below.



***Proposed resolution:***

Revised

At the referenced location change

“When the IPv4 address being resolved in the ARP request packet (IETF RFC 826) is used by a non-AP STA currently associated to the BSS, the proxy ARP service shall respond on behalf of the STA to an ARP request (IETF RFC 925) or an ARP Probe (IETF RFC 5227).

When an AP receives an ARP Request from one associated STA” to

“When the IPv4 address being resolved in an ARP request (IETF RFC 826) or probed in an ARP Probe (IETF RFC 5227) is used by a non-AP STA currently associated to the BSS, the proxy ARP service shall respond on behalf of the STA.

When an AP receives an ARP request from an associated STA”

Delete “IETF RFC 925, Multi-LAN Address Resolution, J. Postel, Oct. 1984.” from clause 2 (Normative references).