IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| PAR Minutes – November 2018 Session | | | | |
| Date: 2018-11-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Michael Montemurro | BlackBerry | 4701 Tahoe Blvd, Mississauga, ON. Canada L4W0B4 | +1 289-261-4183 | [mmontemurro@blackberry.com](mailto:mfischer@broadcom.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the PAR Standing Committee session that was held during the November 2018 IEEE 802.11 Plenary meeting.

# Monday November 12, 16:00-18:00

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

**Michael Montemurro, BlackBerry – Vice-Chair**

Attendance: 5

1. Meeting called to order at 16:11
2. Agenda Review – approved as document 11-18/1707r0
   * Agenda is approved unanimously
3. Minutes Approval from July – document 11/18-1245r0

MOTION: Move to approve doc 11-18/1245r0 < https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/18/11-18-1245-00-0PAR-minutes-july-2018-session.docx > as the minutes for PAR Review SC from July 2018 meetings in San Diego, CA.

Mover: Michael Montemurro

Second: Stephen McCann

Result: Motion passes unanimously.

1. PAR Comments are captured in 11-18/1707r1:

* **802.3ca - Amendment: 25 Gb/s and 50 Gb/s Passive Optical Networks, PAR Modification & Extension,** [**PAR Modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0172-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ca-draft-par-modification-request.pdf)**,** [**PAR Extension**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0174-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ca-draft-par-extension-request.pdf) **and** [**CSD Modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0173-01-00EC-ieee-p802-3ca-draft-modified-csd.pdf)
  + PAR Modification:
    - 4.2: Update the date to reflect the current plan as shown in the PAR Extension.
  + PAR Extension
    - No Comment
  + CSD Modification:
    - No Comment
* **802.3cp - Amendment: Bidirectional 10 Gb/s, 25 Gb/s, and 50 Gb/s Optical Access PHYs ,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0175-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cp-draft-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0176-01-00EC-ieee-p802-3cp-draft-csd.pdf)
  + PAR:
    - 5.6: Add a missing Stakeholder that was listed in the CSD “Municipal and independent operators”
  + CSD:
    - Broad Market Potential: Add to the list of potential user groups to make the stakeholder list consistent. – add “subscribers.”
    - Technical Feasibility: Suggested change

“The basic technologies for 10 Gb/s, 25 Gb/s, and 50 Gb/s transmission over at least 10 km and at least 40 km of single mode fiber are well established”

to

* + - “The basic technologies for 10 Gb/s, 25 Gb/s, and 50 Gb/s capable of transmission over at least 10 km and at least 40 km of single mode fiber are well established”
* **802.3cs – Amendment: Increased-reach Ethernet optical subscriber access (Super-PON) ,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0177-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cs-draft-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0178-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cs-draft-csd.pdf)
  + PAR:
    - 2.1: Add “Amendment:” to the beginning of the title.
    - 5.2.b: Suggested Change “The scope of this project is to amend IEEE Std 802.3 to add physical layer…” to “This project adds physical layer…”
    - 5.6: Add a missing Stakeholder that was listed in the CSD “Municipal and independent operators”
  + CSD:
    - Broad Market Potential: Add to the list of potential user groups to make the stakeholder list consistent. – add “subscribers.”
* **802.1CMde - Amendment: Enhancements for Fronthaul Interface, Synchronization, and Synchronization Standards,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/de-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/de-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + PAR:
    - 2.1 Suggested change
    - “Amendment: Enhancements for Fronthaul Interface, Synchronization, and Syntonization Standards” to
    - “Amendment: Enhancements to Fronthaul profiles to support new Fronthaul, Synchronization, and Syntonization Standards”
    - 5.2.b: the first sentence is broad enough that the second sentence is not needed. Delete “This amendment also addresses errors and omissions in existing content.”
    - 5.2b: Change the first sentence “This amendment defines enhancements to fronthaul profiles in order to address new developments in fronthaul interface standards, and related synchronization and syntonization standards”Question – can 8.1 include an example list of referenced standards
  + CSD:
    - No comment
* **802.1DF - Standard: Time-Sensitive Networking Profile for Service Provider Networks,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/df-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/df-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + PAR:
    - 5.2: Change the first sentence to “This standard defines profiles that provide Time-Sensitive Networking (TSN) quality of service features for non-fronthaul shared service provider networks.
    - 5.5 typo “besteffort” should be “best effort”
  + CSD:
    - 1.2.5 e) replace with “QoS measures that result fromthe application of this standard risk interfering with obligations onnetwork providers to uphold freedom of opinion and freedom of speech”.

1. Recess at 18:02 until Tueday at 10:30.

# Tuesday November 13, 10:30-12:30

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

**Michael Montemurro, BlackBerry – Vice-Chair**

Attendance: 4

1. Meeting called to order at 10:38
2. Agenda Review – approved as document 11-18/1707r1
3. PAR Comments are captured in 11-18/1707r1:

* **802.1DF - Standard: Time-Sensitive Networking Profile for Service Provider Networks,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/df-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/df-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + Reviewed comments from previous session. No further comments.
* **802.1DG - Standard: Time-Sensitive Networking Profile for Automotive In-Vehicle Ethernet Communications,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/dg-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/dg-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + PAR:
    - 8.1a: List of the cited standards should be included here.
    - 5.2: TSN is identified, but not “security standards”. Would it make sense to identify which security standards are applicable here?
    - 5.4: change “guidance” to “profiles”
    - 5.5: change “guidelines” to “standardization”
  + CSD:
    - No Comment
* **802.19 -Recommended Practice -  Coexistence Methods for Sub-1 GHz Frequency Bands,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/18/19-18-0073-03-S1GH-s1gh-draft-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/18/19-18-0072-02-S1GH-draft-csd-for-s1gh.docx)
  + PAR:
    - 1.1:Change to 802.19.3 (or appropriate
    - 2.1: Suggest shorten title prefix to be similar to 802.19.2 - “Recommended Practice for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks - Part 19: Coexistence Methods for Sub-1 GHz Frequency Bands”
    - 4.2: suggest starting sponsor ballot later after the WG has more stabilized recommended practice to shorten the Sponsor Ballot time. – suggest revisiting the dates selected in 4.2 and 4.3.
    - 5.2: delete the second sentence as it does not seem applicable to a recommended practice as all systems have to follow regulatory rules when deployed.
    - 5.5: Change to:

“Many millions of devices based on IEEE Std 802.15.4 are currently operating in Sub-1 GHz frequency bands, and the field is expanding rapidly. Critical applications, such as grid modernization (smart grid) and internet of things (IoT) are using the low to moderate data rate capabilities of IEEE Std 802.15.4. IEEE Std 802.11ah-2016 may operate in the same Sub-1 GHz frequency bands and provides higher data rate capabilities than IEEE Std 802.15.4. In consideration of the current usage, as well as anticipation of yet unforeseen usage models enabled by emerging technology, and to fully realize the opportunity for successful deployment of products sharing the spectrum, strategies and tactics to achieve good coexistence performance are critical.

This recommended practice enables the family of IEEE 802(R) wireless standards, specifically IEEE Std 802.15.4 and IEEE Std 802.11ah-2016, to most effectively operate in license exempt Sub-1 GHz frequency bands, by providing best practices and coexistence methods. This recommended practice uses existing features of the referenced standards and provides guidance to implementers and users of IEEE 802(R) wireless standards.”

* + - 5.6: Proposed replacement: “Silicon vendors, equipment manufacturerers, and utility network operators, with applications including smart grid, smart city, Internet of things (IoT), home automation, medical and environmental monitoring”
    - 8.1: Include a list of Cited standards (i.e. 5.2 has two cited standards).
  + CSD:
    - 1.2.1a: Change “802.11ah” to “IEEE Std. 802.11ah-2016”
    - 1.2.1b: Change “802.11” to “802.11ah-2016”
    - 1.2.3: Change “802.11” to “802.11ah-2016”
    - 1.2.4a: Change 3 instances of “802.11” to “802.11ah-2016”
* **802.22 - Standard - Revision Project,** [**PAR Extension**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.22/dcn/18/22-18-0041-00-0000-802-22-revision-par-extension.pdf)
  + Item 1: Revised text for Question #2: Since 2014, the 802.22 Working Group has had significant reduction in participation. Some of the individuals that made major contributions no longer participate in the WG. As a result, the rate of progress of this standard has slowed down. P802.22 Revision Project is currently in Working Group Letter Ballot 3. Around 65 comments need to be addressed and resolved for the draft to reach >90% Approval Ratio.
  + Item 2: Question – Why are you striving for “>90% approval” when threshold is only75% ? If you have achieved 75% you can move on.
* **802.22.3 - Standard - Spectrum Characterization and Occupancy Sensing,** [**PAR Extension**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.22/dcn/18/22-18-0040-00-0000-802-22-3-par-extension-request.pdf)
  + Item 2: “this round” does not have any meeting. Change “this round” to “in the fifth letter ballot”.
* Review PAR Review responses. No issues identified.
* **802.3 Industry Connections: New Ethernet Applications,** [**ICAID**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0179-00-00EC-ieee-802-3-new-ethernet-applications-icaid.pdf) **and** [**Background**](http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/ngrates/public/18_09/IC15-005_NEA_2018_Status%20Report_Nov18_draft_NEA.pdf)
  + ICAID:
    - No Comment
  + Background:
    - No Comment

1. Recess at 12:30 until Thursday at 10:30

# Thursday November 15, 10:30-12:30

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

**Michael Montemurro, BlackBerry – Vice-Chair**

Attendance: 3

1. Meeting called to order at 10:38
2. Agenda Review – approved as document 11-18/1707r1
3. Summary of responses received and are summarized in 11-18/1707r2

* **802.1CMde - Amendment: Enhancements for Fronthaul Interface, Synchronization, and Synchronization Standards,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/de-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/de-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments.
* **802.1DG - Standard: Time-Sensitive Networking Profile for Automotive In-Vehicle Ethernet Communications,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/dg-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/dg-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.1DF - Standard: Time-Sensitive Networking Profile for Service Provider Networks,** [**PAR**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/df-draft-PAR-0918-v01.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/df-draft-CSD-0918-v01.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.3ca - Amendment: 25 Gb/s and 50 Gb/s Passive Optical Networks, PAR Modification & Extension,** [**PAR Modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0172-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ca-draft-par-modification-request.pdf)**,** [**PAR Extension**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0174-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3ca-draft-par-extension-request.pdf) **and** [**CSD Modification**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0173-01-00EC-ieee-p802-3ca-draft-modified-csd.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.3cp - Amendment: Bidirectional 10 Gb/s, 25 Gb/s, and 50 Gb/s Optical Access PHYs ,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0175-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cp-draft-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0176-01-00EC-ieee-p802-3cp-draft-csd.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.3cs – Amendment: Increased-reach Ethernet optical subscriber access (Super-PON) ,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0177-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cs-draft-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/18/ec-18-0178-00-00EC-ieee-p802-3cs-draft-csd.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.19 -Recommended Practice -  Coexistence Methods for Sub-1 GHz Frequency Bands,** [**PAR**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/18/19-18-0073-03-S1GH-s1gh-draft-par.pdf) **and** [**CSD**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/18/19-18-0072-02-S1GH-draft-csd-for-s1gh.docx)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.22 - Standard - Revision Project,** [**PAR Extension**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.22/dcn/18/22-18-0041-00-0000-802-22-revision-par-extension.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* **802.22.3 - Standard - Spectrum Characterization and Occupancy Sensing,** [**PAR Extension**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.22/dcn/18/22-18-0040-00-0000-802-22-3-par-extension-request.pdf)
  + Reviewed Responses – No further comments
* Approval of PAR Review SC report

1. Agenda Review – approved as document 11-18/1707r1

MOTION:

**Move to accept 11-18/1707r2 as the report from PAR Review SC for the November 2018 plenary.**

**Moved: Andrew Myles**

**2nd: Michael Montemurro**

**Results: Unanimous**

1. Adjourn at 11:29.