### IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **REVmd Assorted Comment Resolutions** | | | | |
| Date: 2018-09-09 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Menzo Wentink | Qualcomm | Utrecht, the Netherlands | +31-65-183-6231 | mwentink@qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This document contains proposed resolutions for several REVmd comments (18):

1. 1505, 1267, 1263, 1143, 1142, 1128, 1126, 1124, 1123, 1122
2. 1110, 1090, 1088, 1073, 1432, 1438, 1439, 1583

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause**  **Page**  **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1505 | Mark RISON | 10.3.3 | There are several issues with the [QS]SRC/LRC stuff: sometimes it's per-MPDU (p.1290 in mc/D6.0), sometimes it's per-MSDU/MMPDU (p.1295); sometimes it's Data frames only (p.1290), sometimes Management too (p.1295) | Frankly, I can't work it out.  Tell me whether SRC/LRC is per-MPDU or per-MSDU/MMPDU, and whether it includes Managament frames/MMPDUs, and I'll come up with the changes | Revised - implement changes documented in 11-18-1426-05-000m-cid-1505.docx, which restructures and simplifies this aspect of EDCA. |
| 1267 | Joseph Levy | 11.23.6.5  2143  20 | Calling a S1G 2, 4, 8, or 16 MHz off-channel TDLS direct link a "wide bandwidth off-channel direct link" seems a bit confusing.  I understand the need to allow for an off-channel direct link for S1G STAs, but shouldn't it be called something else.  Also the way the feature is implemented in the section 11.23.6.5 seems very awkward.  It would be better to add a new set of clauses for the "S1G off-channel direct link", which duplicate 11.23.6.5 with the S1G changes.  This would also eliminate the need to keep switching between VHT and S1G requirements. | Remove the (11ah) additions to 11.23.6.5 which added S1G to the wide bandwidth off-channel direct link and add a new section "11.23.6.6 Setting up a S1G off-channel direct link" with the S1G requirements. | Rejected - the wideband aspect is relative to the bandwidth of the base channel, and a wideband direct link is always wider than the base channel. The S1G modifications appear to have been added in a fairly natural way, so there would be no need to restructure the clause. |
| 1263 | Xiaofei Wang | 10.50.2  1921  25 | The reachable address update procedure may create an error in the following situation:  1. STA1 who is originally associated with relay AP1, moves to relay AP2, under the same root AP, without perfroming disassociation with relay AP1  2. relay AP2 performs reachable address update to the root AP based on condition 1) in L23  3. Before the max idle period expiry of STA1 in relay AP1, another STA2 associates with relay AP1  4. relay AP1 sends reachable address update frame containing "current list" STA1 and STA2 to root AP based on condition 1) in L23, overwriting the correct forwarding entry for STA1 in root AP  5. Later traffic to STA1 is forwarded to relay AP1, causing relay AP1 disassociation of STA1, which triggers another reachable address update frame sent to root AP, based on condition 2) in L23. This completely removes STA1 from root AP's "current list" of reachbale addresses | A potential solution may be:  An S1G relay STA shall send a Reachable Address Update frame that contains the modifications of reachable addresses to the AP to which it is associated when one of the following conditions occurs:  1)A new non-AP STA associates with the S1G relay AP of the relay  2)A non-AP STA is disassociated or deauthenticated from the S1G relay AP of the S1G relay  3)A Reachable Address Update frame is received at the S1G relay AP of the S1G relay    For condition 1) and 2), the reachable address update frame only contains the newly associated/disassocated STA addresses    For condition 3), the relay AP ignores/removes an address from the reachable address element with add/remove subfield set to 0,  from the received reachable address update frame, if the current forwarding relay for the address is not the same as the the STA sending the reachable address update frame to the relay AP | Revised - implement changes in <submission>, which clarify that the Reachable Address Update frame represents changes in the set of reachable addresses. |
| 1143 | Robert Stacey | 9.9.1  1550  35 | There are 8 NDP CMAC control frames and 2 NDP CMAC management frames. Surely there is a general frame format -- an architecture -- behind this menagerie. | Define a general MAC frame format for CMAC frames. It looks like there might be two basic types: a 24-bit frame and a 36-bit frame (distinguished by the PPDU fomat that carrier them). Define a general MAC frame format for each -- this may just be a Frame Tpe field and Frame Body field. Define the Frame body for each of the individual frames (no need to show the Frame Type field for each since this is common to all) | Revised -  In Table 9-502 (NDP CMAC frame Type field values), delete all occurrences of "(control frame)" and "(management frame)".  In Table 9-502 (NDP CMAC frame Type field values), merge the two entries for Value 0 into a single Entry Value 0 with Meaning "NDP CTS or NDP CF-End" and See subclause "9.9.2.1 (NDP CTS), 9.9.2.2 (NDP CF-End)".  Merge 9.9.2 (NDP control frame details) and 9.9.3 (NDP management frame details) into a single clause 9.9.2 named "NDP CMAC frame details". |
| 1142 | Robert Stacey | 9.9  1550  10 | The (spec) architecture around NDP CMAC frames is misguided. NDP CMAC frames are another (MAC) frame format like the PV0 and PV1 formats. PV0 and PV1 frames go into an A-MPDU which becomes the PSDU  that is transferred to the PHY using the PHY SAP defined in Clause 8. Similarly,  NDP CMAC frames SHOULD become the PSDU that is trnasferred to the PHY using the PHY SAP. | Focus 9.9 on the frame formats. Remove references to figures and PPDU formats in Clause 23. Add a general statement: "NDP CMAC frames are carried in the S1G NDP PPDU". Remove the NDP\_CMAC\_FRAME\_BODY parameter from the TX/RXVECTOR. Add a description to 23.3.18 and 23.3.19 to descibe the mapping of the PSDU to and from the SIG field. | Rejected - PV1 frames do not go into an A-MPDU because they use a different protocol value. But PV1 frames can carry a payload of significant size. NDP CMAC frames are different in the sense that they can not carry a payload of any significant size, hence their being limited to control type frames. The NDP aspect is material to this limitation, because there are specific requirements on the transmission of an NDP. |
| 1128 | Robert Stacey | 9.8.1  1538  4 | Subclause 9.2.1 describes both PV0 and PV1 frames. 9.8.1 just repeats this for PV1 frames. | Remove 9.8.1 (including its content) | Rejected - 9.2.1 does not describe PV1 frames but refers to 9.8 for their definition. |
| 1126 | Robert Stacey | 9.4.1.48.2  889  54 | S1G band is not defined. Given the statement at P215L39 and the lack of global harminzation, it should probably be plural. | Define "S1G bands" as "Frequency bands below 1 GHz excluding the TV white space bands" or maybe "Frequency bands for which an S1G operating class is defined in Annex E." Replace "S1G band" with "S1G bands" throughout. | Revised - the S1G band may indeed have a different definition in different jurisdictions, but within a given S1G band the descriptions are correct. |
| 1124 | Robert Stacey | 11.2.3.2  1969  52 | This seems to redefine "non-TIM STA". See P173L36. | Remove either this statement or the one at P173L36. | Rejected - the definition at 173.36 is a shorthand definition of a non-TIM STA. 11.2.3.2 provides the normative behavior. |
| 1123 | Robert Stacey | 11.2.3.2  1969  13 | It looks like paragraphs at L13, L19 and L32 describe a negotiation that establishes the type of PS mode used by the S1G non-AP STA. The sentence at L13 is thus inaccurate and the overall description could be better. Clarify if the procedure applies to both association and reassociation (some (Re) are missing). Define behavior for all possible cases: define what happens if the non-AP STA sends 0 and receives 1, and sends 1 and receives 0. | Change the sentence at L13 to read "An S1G non-AP STA determines the type of PS mode it uses (TIM mode or non-TIM mode) through the (Re)Association Request/(Re)Association Response frame exchange with the AP. The S1G non-AP STA may request operation in non-TIM mode by setting the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Request frame to 1. If the AP sets the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Response frame to 1 then the STA shall operate in the non-TIM mode following association. If the S1G non-AP STA sets the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Request frame to 0 or the S1G AP sets the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Caapbilities element in the (Re)Association Response frame to 0, then the S1G non-AP STA shall operatin in the TIM mode following association. The S1G non-AP STA shall use the negotiated PS mode until either a new mode is negotiated through the PS mode switch (see ), a termporary PS mode switch has occured (see ) or the STA is disassociated. An S1G non-AP STA in non-TIM mode sets dot11NonTImModeActivated to true and sets it to false otherwise." And remove most of the other text. | Revised - agree with the comment. Make changes as shown in <this document> under CID 1123, which clean up this section based on the suggestions in the comment. |
| 1122 | Robert Stacey | 11.2.3.2  1969  7 | It is not clear what "during the whole operation time" means in this context. | Remove here and at L11 | Accepted. |
| 1110 | Robert Stacey | 10.35.5.1  1785  48 | There are a number of problems here. Prodiving the reader with editing instructions is inappropriate and uneccessary. Placing this in a subclause titled "VHT sounding protocol" makes it hard for the S1G STA implementor to find it.  Referencing a subclause from within the subclause creates an infinite loop causing the reader's brain to explode (a reader that carried out the instruction would replace "with "VHT" is replaced with "S1G"" with "with "S1G" is replaced with "S1G"" is replaced with "with "S1G" is replaced with "S1G""... bang). | Add a new subclause "10.35.6a S1G sounding protocol" with the statements: "The VHT sounding protocol defined in 10.35.5 applies to an S1G STA with the following exceptions: [bullet] The STA transmitting the steering matrix is called the S1G beamformer but otherwise performs the role of the VHT beamformer [bullet] The STA for which reception is optimized is called the S1G beamformee but otherwise performs with role of the VHT beamformee [bullet] The MIB objects dot11S1GSUBeamformerOptionImplemented, dot11S1GMUBeamformerOptionImplemented, ... apply instead of  dot11VHTSUBeamformerOptionImplemented, dot11VHTMUBeamformerOptionImplemented, ..., respectively. [bullet] The SU Beamformer Capable, MU Beamformer Capable, ... fields of the S1G Capabilties element apply instead of the SU Beamformer Capable, MU Beamformer Capable, ... fields of the VHT Capabilities element. [bullet] An S1G NDP is used instead of a VHT NDP" Also, move the statements at P1786L25 and L30 into this new subclause. | Revised - the approach taken for S1G is similar to the approach taken for TVHT: "See 21.1.3.1 (General) with “TVHT” replacing “VHT”.".  However, the S1G replacement instruction in the cited location is indeed recursive. In addition, clause 10.32 (Link adaptation) has a slightly different set of replacement instructions, with a notable difference that it introduces an S1G NDP Announcement frame. But an S1G NDP Annoucement frame is not defined, there is only the VHT NDP Announcement frame with slightly different contents when transmitted in an S1G PPDU.  A pragmatic way to resolve at least the technical issues is by excluding the S1G replacement instruction from the text affected by the instruction, and to revert all uses of S1G NDP Announcement frame to VHT NDP Announcement frame. As an alternative, it is possible to introduce S1G names for the VHT NDP Announcement frame, VHT MIMO Control field and the VHT Compressed Beamforming Report field. The latter approach is taken in this comment resolution.  Change as shown in <this document> under CID 1110. |
| 1090 | Robert Stacey | 9.8.3.1  1538  43 | There is a problem with the grammar here, but more significantly, the exception is not well described. | "The general form of the Frame Control field of the PV1 MAC header for all PV1 frames except the PV1 Probe Request frame, PV1 Resrouce Allocation frame, and PV1 Control frames is defined in Figure 9-881. The Frame Control fields for the PV1 Probe Response frame, Reseource Allocation frame and PV1 Control frames are defined in 9.8.5.3, 9.8.5.4, and 9.8.4 respectively." | Revised - agree with the comment. Make changes as shown in <this document> under CID 1090. |
| 1088 | Robert Stacey | 9.8.1  1538  12 | What is an IEEE 32-bit CRC? Is it different from a 32-bit CRC based on ITU-T V.42 [B54] (P725L31)? We either need a reference for IEEE 32-bit CRC or we need to align the two definitions here. | Either align the definitions or provide a reference for IEEE 32-bit CRC. |  |
| 1073 | Robert Stacey | 10.47  1901  37 | The statement "an S1G STA shall set dot11PageSlicingImplemented to true if it supports page slicing" is not a testable requirement since it is not clear what "supports page slicing" entails. Also "S1G STA with dot11PageSlicingImplemented equal to true" (as used in this subclause) is a cumbersome STA descriptor. | Define something called a "page slicing S1G STA" as an S1G STA that declares a certain capability. It is more direct to define the STA type as one that sets its capability element a certain way rather than as one that sets a MIB object a certain way since the MIB is not required and rarely implemented. A statement such as "a page slicing S1G STA is an S1G STA that sets the Page Slicing Support field to 1 in the S1G Capabilities elements it transmits." would do the trick. The MIB object setting can be one of the requirements on such a beast: "A page slicing S1G STA shall set dot11PageSlicingImplemented to true." And, now that we know how to identify the beast (take a wireless sniffer and look for S1G Capability elements with the Page Slicing Support field set to 1) we can apply testable requirements to the breast, e.g., "A page slicing S1G STA shall process all received TIM elements..." (P1902L30). | Rejected - there are many aspects of a STA that are governed by MIB variables, and having different STA names for each MIB variable will not be feasible. Agree that the MIB construct is indeed an artificial detour and it would be easier to simply refer to a STA that supports feature x without the extra overhead of defining an associated MIB variable. |
| 1432 | Mark Rison |  | A PS-Poll can be sent as a non-HT duplicate, so the reason given for rejection of CID 7382 on 802.11mc is invalid | Delete the note referred to in CID 7382 on 802.11REVmc | "GEN: 2018-10-15 16:12:19Z - Assigned to Telecon November 2nd  GEN: 2018-07-30 17:54:40Z - status set to: Discuss  CID 7382 resolution: REJECTED (MAC: 2016-02-22 14:42:30Z): The cited NOTE does not contradict the cited text. The NOTE refers to the immediate data response which cannot be a duplicate, whereas the cited text refers to duplicate frame. (11-15-0532-65-000m-revmc-sponsor-ballot-comments)" |
| 1438 | Mark Rison | 3.2  161  21 | The definition of "base channel" is not clear. For example, in an 80 MHz BSS, with a STA that only supports 40 MHz but has sent an Notify Channel Width or Operating Mode Notification specifying 20 MHz, the "base channel" from that STA's perspective might be a 20, 40 or 80 MHz channel, depending on the intent | Change the definition at the referenced location to "Channel (including its current width) on which the tunneled direct-link setup (TDLS) peer station (STA) is associated with an access point (AP)."  In 11.21.1 after "The channel on which the AP operates is referred to as the base channel." add "However, when the STA is elsewhere in this specification referred to as switching back to the base channel, the STA may operate on a narrower channel." | Revised - the base channel is always a 20 MHz channel. This is specified in 11.21.1 (General), but indeed not very explicit from the definition of the base channel in 3.2.  Therefore, at 161.24, add "The base channel is the channel on which the AP transmits beacons." |
| 1439 | Mark Rison | 3.2  161  22 | The definition of "base channel" is not clear. The "base channel" varies when the STA's operating bandwidth changes (through Notify Channel Width or Operating Mode Notification) which leaves an issue with any existing TDLS link where one or the other device does not support "TDLS Wider Bandwidth" | In 11.21.1 after "The channel on which the AP operates is referred to as the base channel. " add "However, the base channel needs to take account of STAs that do not support the TDLS wider bandwidth mechanism." | Revised - the base channel is always a 20 MHz channel. This is specified in 11.21.1 (General), but indeed not very explicit from the definition of the base channel in 3.2.  Therefore, at 161.24, add "The base channel is the channel on which the AP transmits beacons." |
| 1583 | Mark Hamilton | 21.2.2  2901  50 | The USER\_POSITION array in Table 21-1 is very confusing. This is a "MU" entry, so there is one per user in an MU PPDU, indexed by 'u' (per the NOTE at the end). But, then what are these? And, the table row says they are specificied in ascending order. Of what, the values? So, this has to be 0,1,2,3 in order, always? What's the point, then? Something doesn't make sense. | Clarify how USER\_POSITION is different (or relates to) "u" which is already the index for a given user into array values that are "MU" in this table. |  |

Changes with reference to REVmd draft 1.0.

**CID 1090**

Replace the first paragraph at 1539.43

The general format of the Frame Control field of the PV1 MAC header is shown in Figure 9-881 (Frame Control field(11ah)) except for the most significant octet of the Frame Control field of PV1 Probe Response frames (defined in 9.8.5.3 (PV1 Probe Response frame format)), Resource Allocation frames (defined in 9.8.5.4 (Resource Allocation frame format)), and PV1 Control frames (defined in 9.8.4 (PV1 Control frames)).

with

The Frame Control field of the PV1 MAC header for PV1 frames except the PV1 Probe Request frame, PV1 Resource Allocation frame, and PV1 Control frames, is defined in Figure 9-881 (Frame Control field).

The Frame Control fields for the PV1 Probe Response frame, PV1 Resource Allocation frame and PV1 Control frames are defined in 9.8.5.3 (PV1 Probe Response frame format), 9.8.5.4 (Resource Allocation frame format), and 9.8.4 (PV1 Control frames), respectively.

**CID 1110**

At 1785.45 change as shown

For an S1G STA, the S1G sounding protocol is specified in 10.35.5 (VHT sounding protocol) with “VHT” replaced by “S1G”, except in this sentence.

At 784.1 change as shown

If the VHT NDP Announcement frame is transmitted in an S1G PPDU, the frame is referred to as S1G NDP Announcement frame, and the format of the STA Info field is shown in Figure 9-56 (STA Info field in an S1G STA).

At 889.54 change as shown

In an S1G PPDU, the VHT Compressed Beamforming Report field is referred to as S1G Compressed Beamforming Report field, and:

At 1517.42 add

When carried in an S1G PPDU, a VHT Compressed Beamforming frame is referred to as an S1G Compressed Beamforming frame, and a VHT MIMO Control field is referred to as an S1G MIMO Control field.

At 1517.42 add

When carried in an S1G PPDU, a VHT NDP Announcement frame is referred to as an S1G NDP Announcement frame.

**CID 1123**

At 1969.13 modify as shown

An S1G AP that sets the STA Type Support in transmitted S1G Capabilities elements to 0 or 1 shall set dot11NonTIMModeActivated to true and the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element to 1.

An S1G AP that sets the STA Type Support in transmitted S1G Capabilities elements to 2 may set dot11NonTIMModeActivated to false and the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element to 0.

An S1G AP that sets the STA Type Support in transmitted S1G Capabilities elements to 2 may set dot11NonTIMModeActivated to true and the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element to 1.

An S1G AP shall not set the Non-TIM Support field to 1 in response to a received Non-TIM Support field equal to 0.

An S1G AP that includes an AID Response element in a (Re)Association Response frame shall set the AID/Group AID field to the AID assigned to the (re)associating STA, the AID Switch Count field to 0, and the AID Response Interval field to the value of the Listen Interval field.

NOTE—The S1G AP can specify a listen interval that is different from the listen interval requested by the S1G non-AP STA in the (Re)Association Request frame if the AP can not buffer the S1G STA’s BUs for the requested listen interval.

An S1G non-AP STA determines the type of PS mode it uses (TIM mode or non-TIM mode) through the (Re)Association Request/(Re)Association Response frame exchange with the S1G AP.

An S1G non-AP STA requests operation in non-TIM mode by setting the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Request frame to 1.

An S1G non-AP STA requests operation in TIM mode by setting the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Request frame to 0.

If an S1G AP sets the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Response frame to 1, then the S1G non-AP STA shall set dot11NonTIMModeActivated to true and operate in non-TIM mode following association, and is referred to as a non-TIM STA.

If an S1G AP sets the Non-TIM Support field in the S1G Capabilities element in the (Re)Association Response frame to 0, then the S1G non-AP STA shall set dot11NonTIMModeActivated to false and operate in TIM mode following association, and is referred to as a TIM STA.

An S1G non-AP STA shall operate in the negotiated PS mode during association unless a PS mode switch is negotiated as described in 10.20 (S1G dynamic AID assignment operation) or a temporary PS mode switch has occurred as described in 10.44.2 (Rescheduling of awake/doze cycle). The STA shall update the value of the ListenInterval parameter it uses in invocations of primitives with the value of the AID Response Interval field in the AID Response element of the (Re)Association Response frame.

A TIM STA listens to selected Beacon frames (based upon the ListenInterval parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.request or MLME-REASSOCIATE.request primitive) and sends PS-Poll frames to the AP if the TIM element in the most recent Beacon frame indicates an individually addressed BU is buffered for that STA.

A non-TIM STA shall transmit at least one PS-Poll or trigger frame that is individually addressed to the associated AP every listen interval and may not listen to selected S1G Beacon frames (based upon the ListenInterval parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.request or MLME-REASSOCIATE.request primitive) unless it follows the TWT or NDP Paging procedure.

A non-TIM STA may send (NDP) PS-Poll frames to an S1G AP regardless of whether individually addressed buffered BUs have been indicated by the S1G AP.