IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Resolutions to Miscellaneous MAC Comments | | | | |
| Date: 2018-11-08 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Osama Aboul-Magd | Huawei Technologies |  |  | [osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com](mailto:osama.aboulmagd@huawei.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document includes resolutions to CIDs 15565, ~~15933~~, ~~15939~~, 16175, 16224, 16360, ~~16487~~, and 17009.

CID 16082.

CIDs are assigned by the Editor to the MAC ad hoc

R0: initial draft

R1: added an option fot the resolution of CID 15565. Need to discuss the two options and choose one of them.

Added resolution to CID 16082

R2: changed resolution to CID 15565 based on input from Mark Rison and Alfred.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Resolution** |  |  |  | **Resolution** |
| 15565 | 645.59 | C.3 | Change "when" to "after which" | As in comment. | Revised.  The text is updated to make it more clear taking into account the commenter proposed resolution.  TGax Editor to make the changes in 11-18/1876r0 under the heading CID 15565 |  |  |  |  |
| ~~15933~~ | ~~37.24~~ | ~~3.2~~ | ~~This definition is getting into normative details of \_how\_, beyond just the \_what\_.~~ | ~~Stop the defintion of "broadcast resource unit" before (without) describing how it is identified.~~ | ~~Transfer to Abhishek~~ |  |  |  |  |
| ~~15939~~ | ~~243.26~~ | ~~11.24.2.8~~ | ~~Parse problemThe first sentence of 11.24.2.8 does not parse properly.~~ | ~~Change to "... to inform its associated AP that a BSS color is in use by the non-AP HE STA."~~ | ~~Transfer to Yongho~~ |  |  |  |  |
| 16175 |  |  | "dynamic fragmentation" is poorly named | Rename it to "variable-length fragmentation" | Rejected  The word “dynamic” better describes the intended function. |  |  |  |  |
| 16224 |  |  | Multi-STA BlockAcks are very badly named, as they are also used in single-STA contexts | Change "Multi-STA BlockAck" to "Extended BlockAck" throughout | Rejected  multi-user includes one or more users. Therefore the term “single user” is a subset of multi-users. |  |  |  |  |
| 16360 | 364.47 | 27.15.2 | "An HE STA may transmit an HE SU PPDU to a peer HE STA." -- really? I'd never have guessed | Express this in such a way that it seems less of a statement of the bleeding obvious! | Revised.  The CID is resolved by CID 15915 in draft D3.2 |  |  |  |  |
| ~~16487~~ | ~~333.00~~ | ~~27.8.1~~ | ~~Table 27-9 is missing HE and the Columns are referring to VHT.~~ | ~~Make the following change: Edit Table 27-9: 1. Delete the last two columns as the intent is to signal the Nss for 160MHz and not the center frequency 2. Change the header of the column starting with "VHT NSS Support" to "NSS Support"~~ | ~~Transfer to Jarkko~~ |  |  |  |  |
| 17009 | 253.13 | 27.1 | "Frame exchanges are still considered as initiated by the STA as defined in Clause 11, and Clause 12 even if the initiating frame of the frame exchange is sent in response to a Trigger frame as defined in the subclauses below."  The intention of this sentence is not clear enough. | Clarify, or remove this sentence. | Revised  Proposed new text is added in order to make the sentence clearer.  TGax Editor to make the changes in 11-18/1876r0 under the heading CID 17009. |  |  |  |  |
| 16082 |  |  | All the D2.0 comments "resolved" as "[REJECTED] Due to lack of submission or consensus" or similar (about 300 of them!) were not in fact resolved, including many where no submission was needed as the proposed change was simple and unambiguous, and no attempt was in fact made to find consensus (they were not even discussed) | Resolve all D2.0 comments that were not resolved | Rejected  Draft D2.0 was published on October 5th 2017. Since then the draft has gone through a number of sub-revisions and one majr revision with many changes added to almost all the Clauses.  Comments that were submitted back then are either not applicable now or have been resolved to the satisfaction of the commenters. Commenters are always welcome to re-submit their comments in subsequent letter ballots in case resolutions to their comments are not satisfactory. |  |  |  |  |

**CID 15565**

The text that this CID referes to is:

dot11ObssNbRuToleranceTime OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX Unsigned32 (300..3600)

UNITS "seconds"

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"This attribute indicates the time in seconds when the last Beacon frame carrying a Narrow Band Tolerance indication from an OBSS AP is received. The default value of this variable is 30 mins and the maximum is 1 hr."

DEFVAL { 1800 }

::= { dot11HEStationConfigEntry 23}

Ediotr’s note from 11-18/1123r9:

Technical issue - passing to ad-hoc for resolution. I woud assume it indicates the amout of time that can pass since the since a non-AP STA received a Beacon frame carrying the "Narrow Band Tolerance indication" (whatever that is) before it does something. It doesn't say that

In addition to the change proposed by the commenter the sentence is further changed to make it more clear.

**TGax Editor: *Change the paragraph below in this subclause as follows (#CID 15565):***

dot11ObssNbRuToleranceTime OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX Unsigned32 (300..3600)

UNITS "seconds"

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"This attribute indicates the minimum time that needs to pass since the reception of the last Beacon frame from an OBSS AP that did not indicate tolerance to narrow bandwidth RU in OFDMA before the STA can transmit a Trigger frame or TRS Control subfield allocating a 26-tone RU, or transmit an HE TB PPDU in a 26-tone RU.

The default value of this variable is 30 mins and the maximum is 1 hr."

DEFVAL { 1800 }

::= { dot11HEStationConfigEntry 23}

**CID 17009**

The CID refers to:

* Introduction

An HE STA supports the MAC and MLME functions defined in Clause 27 in addition to the MAC functions defined in Clause 10, the MLME functions defined in Clause 11, and the security functions defined in Clause 12 except when the functions in Clause 27 supersede the functions in Clause 10 or Clause 11. Frame exchanges are still considered as initiated by the STA as defined in Clause 11, and Clause 12 even if the initiating frame of the frame exchange is sent in response to a Trigger frame as defined in the subclauses below.

**TGax Editor: *Change the paragraph below in this subclause as follows (#CID 17009):***

An HE STA supports the MAC and MLME functions defined in Clause 27 in addition to the MAC functions defined in Clause 10, the MLME functions defined in Clause 11, and the security functions defined in Clause 12 except when the functions in Clause 27 supersede the functions in Clause 10 or Clause 11. A successfully acknowledged frame transmitted by a non-AP STA in response to a Basic Trigger is a successful frame exchange initiated by the STA as referred to in Clause 11 and Clause 12.

**References:**