IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB234 Comment resolution for CIDs 3646, 3647, 3650, 3659, 3664 | | | | |
| Date: 2019-09-06 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Solomon Trainin | Qualcomm |  | 972547885738 | [strainin@qti.qualcomm.com](mailto:strainin@qti.qualcomm.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Resolution for CIDs 3646, 3647, 3650, 3651, 3659, 3664

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3646 | 10.40.6.2.2 | 215 | 2 | "In a Data-only TDD slot, only Data frames shall be allowed." the BlockAckReq frame is used for an explicit Block Ack request that is of the same functionality as the Implicit Block Ack request in the QoS control field of MPDU's. Propose to allow transmission of the BlockAckReq frame in the Data only TDD slot. | Modify the sentence "In a Data-only TDD slot, only Data frames and BlockAckReq frame shall be allowed" |

**Proposal: Accept**

**TGay editor implement as in the Proposed Change.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3647 | 10.3.2.11 | 177 | 7 | "When a STA operating in an SP with TDD channel access transmits, in a TDD slot, a MPDU that has an Ack Policy of Normal Ack, ..." the rule does not cover the case that the BlockAck is initiated by BlockAckReq. | Modify the sentence "When a STA operating in an SP with TDD channel access transmits, in a TDD slot, a MPDU that has an Ack Policy of Normal Ack or the BlockAckReq frame, ..." |

Discussion:

The commented rule is about Ack response and not BlockAck response. The BlockAckReq relevant rules are covered in the subclause 10.26.5.5 Generation and transmission of BlockAck frames by an HT STA or DMG STA, so no need to change the commented text

**Proposal: Reject due to reason summarized in the discussion**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3650 | 10.26.5.7.1 | 199 | 32 | "...and with slot category of the TDD slot set to Basic TDD slot, as indicated in the TDD Slot Schedule element." the rule is applicable for Data-only slot category as well | Modify "...and with slot category of the TDD slot set to Basic TDD slot and Data-only TDD slot, as indicated in the TDD Slot Schedule element." |

Discussion: The rule of AMPDU transmission in the Basic TDD slot is applicable for the Data-only category as well.

**Proposal: Accept**

**TGay editor implement as in the Proposed Change.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3651 | 10.43.6.4.1 | 242 | 12 | "In a beam refinement transaction in a TDD SP allocation, a non-PCP and a non-AP STA ..." there are separate rules for AP and non-AP STAs in paragraph that starts at line 12 and in paragraph at line 18. The Tx/Rx encoding is unified as in Table 22 --Bitmap and Access Type Schedule field encoding - no need for separate rules for AP and non-AP | Provide the unified definition and remove the excessive paragraph |

**Proposal: Revised**

Discussion

Suggest modifying the definition as in the proposed change

**TGay editor**

P242L18

Remove the paragraph that starts with “In a beam refinement transaction …

P242L12

Modify as presented below

In a beam refinement transaction in a TDD SP allocation, a STA that has transmitted a BRP frame with the Initiator field set to 1 and has not received a response in the earliest occurring TDD slot the STA is assigned to, with access permission of the TDD slot set to simplex TX TDD slot, and with slot category of the TDD slot set to Basic TDD slot as indicated in the TDD Slot Schedule element, after the transmission may retransmit the frame, according to the TDD channel access rules (see 10.40.6.2.2).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 3659 | 9.3.1.24.2 | 76 | 9 | On the TDD Beamforming frame structure propose to align common fields on the same bits between group and individual in the figure 11 and figure 12 The ACK Count index shifts the alignment of the following fields | In the Figure 12 --TDD Beamforming Information field format (TDD group BF) move "ACK count index" subfield after "Transmit period" |

**Proposal: Revised**

Discussion

Suggest modifying the frame format as in the proposed change

**TGay editor**

P76L9

In the Figure 12 —TDD Beamforming Information field format (TDD group BF) move the field “Ack Count Index” as presented below

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | TX Sector ID | Count  Index |  | Beamforming Time Unit | Transmit Period | Ack Count Index | Number of Responders | Responder Info | … | Responder Info | Reserved |
| Bits: | 10 | 3 |  | 4 | 8 | 3 | 8 | 32 |  | 32 | 4 |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3664 | 9.7.3 | 173 | 1 | "Except for the EOF subfield, all Block Ack Schedule frame subfields have the same value." There is no EOF subfield in the frame (9.3.1.23 Block Ack Schedule frame format) | Remove the sentence "Except for the EOF subfield, all Block Ack Schedule frame subfields have the same value." |

**Proposal: Accept**

**TGay editor implement as in the Proposed Change.**

**References:**

1. IEEE P802.11ay/D2.0, July 2018