IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment resolutions for element ID CIDs 1100, 1102, 1104 |
| Date: 2018-08-23 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Mark Hamilton | Ruckus/ARRIS | 350 W. Java Dr.Sunnyvale, CA | +1-303-818-8472 | mark.hamilton@arris.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Resolutions to LB232 comments on element IDs and element identification: CIDs 1100, 1102, 1104

## Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1100 | Robert Stacey | 904.07 | 9.4.2.1 | The Element ID Extension field is not optional; it is present if the Element ID is a certain value. Having both a text description of the element format and a figure is redundent and unnecessary. | Repalce the first sentence with "Elements have a common format defined in Figure 9-136". Delete "See Figure 9-136 (Element format). The presence of the Element ID Extension field is determined by the Element ID field." Add a statement "The Element ID Extension field is present if the Element ID field is 255." Replace "Reserved for elements using the Element ID Extension field" in Table 9-87 with "Reserved" (2x). |
| 1102 | Robert Stacey | 904.09 | 9.4.2.1 | Incorrect plural | Element ID Extension fields -> Element ID Extension field |
| 1104 | Robert Stacey | 915.48 | 9.4.2.1 | Aren't these just "Reserved"? We need a statement that Element ID 255 means a format with the Element ID Extension field present (I have another comment on this). And then we just need to state "Reserved" here | As commented |

## Proposed resolution for 1100

REVISED – Reorganize 9.4.2.1 following the instructions in <this doc>. These changes:

* Correct the error where the Element ID Extension field is described as optional
* Remove redundancy and clarify the format description

## Proposed resolution for 1102

REVISED – Incorporate the changes in <this doc>, which rewords this subclause, including the change proposed by the commenter.

## Proposed resolution for 1104

REVISED – Incorporate the changes in <this doc>, which moves this row to a new table, and in the process also includes the change proposed by the commenter.

## Editing instructions

9.4.2.1 General

*Change the first paragraph as follows:*

Elements have a common format shown in Figure 9-136.

***Replace the text following Figure 9-136 with:***

An element is identified by the Element ID field and, if present, the Element ID Extension field.

The set of valid element identifications are defined in Table 9-87 (Element IDs), and tables referenced therein.

If an Element ID value has an entry in Table 9-87 of “Used with Element ID Extensions” per a referenced table, then the Element ID Extension field is always present in specific element identification with that Element ID value, otherwise the Element ID Extension is not present.

The Length field indicates the number of octets in the element excluding the Element ID and Length fields.

The Information field carries information specific to the element.

***In Table 9-87, remove all rows with Element ID value of 255, remove the column “Element ID Extention”, and add a new row as shown below:***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Used with Element ID Extensions per Table 9-XX | 255 |  |  |

***Add a new Table 9-XX “Element identification with Element ID value of 255”, and text following:***

**Table 9-XX – Element identification with Element ID value of 255**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable(11ai)** |
| Reserved | 255 | 0 |  |  |
| Association Delay Info (see 9.4.2.174 (Association Delay Info element(11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 1 |  | No |
| FILS Request Parameters (see 9.4.2.176 (FILS Request Parameters element(11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 2 |  | No |
| FILS Key Confirmation (see 9.4.2.177 (FILS Key Confirmation element(11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 3 |  | Yes |
| FILS Session (see 9.4.2.178 (FILS Session element(11ai))) (11ai) | 255 | 4 |  | No |
| FILS HLP Container (see 9.4.2.182 (FILS HLP Container element(11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 5 |  | Yes |
| FILS IP Address Assignment (see 9.4.2.183 (FILS IP Address Assignment element(11ai))) (11ai) | 255 | 6 |  | No |
| Key Delivery (see 9.4.2.184 (Key Delivery element (11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 7 |  | Yes |
| FILS Wrapped Data (see 9.4.2.186 (FILS Wrapped Data element(11ai))) (Ed)(11ai) | 255 | 8 |  | Yes |
| FTM Synchronization Information (see 9.4.2.171 (FTM Synchronization Information element))(#165) | 255 | 9 | Yes | No(11ai) |
| Extended Request (see 9.4.2.10 (Extended Request element))(#165) | 255 | 10 |  | No(11ai) |
| Estimated Service Parameters (see 9.4.2.172 (Estimated service parameters element)) | 255 | 11 | Yes | No(11ai) |
| FILS Public Key (see 9.4.2.179 (FILS Public Key element(11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 12 |  | Yes |
| FILS Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element(11ai)))(11ai) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| Future Channel Guidance (see 9.4.2.173 (Future Channel Guidance element))(#165) | 255 | 14 |  | No(11ai) |
| Reserved | 255 | 15-32 |  |  |
| Password identifier (see 9.4.2.215 (Password identifier element(M41))) (M41) | 255 | 33 | No | No |
| Max Channel Switch Time (see 9.4.2.216 (Max Channel Switch Time element(M40)))(M40) | 255 | 34 |  |  |
| Reserved | 255 | 35-43 |  |  |
| Vendor Specific Request Element (see 9.4.2.217 (Vendor Specific Request element(#5)))(#5) | 255(#5) | 44(#5) | No(#5) | No(#5) |
| Reserved | 255 | (11ai)45-255(M40) |  |  |
| ***Editor’s Note: Need to confirm the “Element ID Extension” for the Vendor Specific Request element***NOTE— See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements.(#283) |

(#283)A “Yes” in the Extensible column of an element listed in Table 9-XX indicates that the Length of the element might be extended in future revisions or amendments of this standard. See 10.28.8 (Extensible element parsing). When the Extensible column of an element is set to “Subelements,” then the element might be extended in future revisions or amendments of this standard by defining additional subelements. See 10.28.9 (Extensible subelement parsing).

The element is not extensible otherwise (i.e., if not marked as “Yes” or “Subelements”).

A “Yes” in the Fragmentable column listed in Table 9-XX indicates that the element may be fragmented (see 10.28.11 (Element fragmentation(11ai))). The element is not fragmented otherwise.(11ai)