IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for 2017 December and 2018 January telecons | | | | |
| Date: 2017-12-01 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This file will contain the minutes for the TGmd 3 (2-hour) teleconferences after the 2017 November session before the January 2018 session: Friday December 1, 15 and Jan 5 at 10am Eastern for comment collection comment resolution and presentations.

R0: Dec 1st Telecon

R1:

Color Code

CIDs Ready for Motion

CIDs needing more work

CIDs previously marked ready and have been updated.

Teleconferences are subject to applicable policies and procedures:

•       IEEE Code of Ethics

–       <http://www.ieee.org/about/corporate/governance/p7-8.html>

•       IEEE Standards Association (IEEE-SA) Affiliation FAQ

–   <http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliation.html>

•       Antitrust and Competition Policy

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/resources/antitrust-guidelines.pdf>

•       IEEE-SA Patent Policy

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html>

–       [https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public//mytools/mob/loa.pdf](http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt)

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/faq.pdf>

–       <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>

•       IEEE 802 Working Group Policies &Procedures (29 Jul 2016)

–       <http://www.ieee802.org/PNP/approved/IEEE_802_WG_PandP_v19.pdf>

•       IEEE 802 LMSC Chair's Guidelines (Approved 17 Mar 2017)

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0201-00-00EC-ieee-802-lmsc-chairs-guidelines.pdf> as updated in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/17/ec-17-0016-06-00EC-march-2017-rule-changes.pdf>

•       Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

•       IEEE 802.11 WG OM: (Approved 17 Mar 2017)

–       <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-0629-19-0000-802-11-operations-manual.docx>

1.0 **802.11 TGmd Telecon** – December 1, 2017 10:00-12:00 ET

* 1. **Called to order** by the chair, Dorothy STANLEY (HPE) at 10:05am ET.
  2. **Present** during some portion of the call:
     1. Dorothy STANLEY (chair) (HPE)
     2. Jon Rosdahl (Qualcomm)
     3. Graham SMITH – SR Technologies
     4. Emily QI (Intel Corporation)
     5. Mark RISON (Samsung)
     6. Mike MONTEMURRO – (Blackberry)
     7. Manish KUMAR (Marvel)
     8. Sean COFFEY (Realtek)
     9. Mark HAMILTON (Arris/Ruckes Network)
     10. Artyom Lomayev (Intel)
     11. Nelson Costa (Peraso)
     12. Sungeun Lee (Cypress)
     13. Joseph Levy (InterDigital)
     14. Adrian Stephens (Intel)
  3. **Review Patent Policy** and Participation Policy
     1. Patent policy slide set was reviewed
     2. Call for patents issued. Noone came forward
     3. Participation Slide was reviewed.
  4. **Review and Approve Agenda**:

Proposed Agenda:

1.       Call to order, attendance, and patent policy

a.       Call for potentially essential patents: **If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance:**

                            i.      Either speak up now or

ii.      Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible or

               iii.      Cause an LOA to be submitted

b.      Review Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>

2.       Editor report – Emily QI

a.       Editor report document: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-05-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>

b.      Comments received in the recent comment collection are here: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0914-05-000m-revmd-wg-cc-comments.xls>

3.    Comment resolution.

**2017-12-01**

a.       ANQP CID: 351

b.      Menzo CIDs: 194, 222, 223

c.       FILS: CID 47

d.     11-17-1810, 1811 - Artyom LOMAYEV

e.      GEN Discuss CIDs: 29, 76, 324

f.       RNR CIDs: 14, 340, 342

4.       AOB, next meeting: Ad-hoc Dec 7-8 Piscataway NJ (details to follow)

5.       Adjourn

* + 1. Agenda approved no objections.
  1. **Editor report** – Emily QI
     1. a.       Editor report document: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-05-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>
        1. This is the version presented at the November Plenary in Orlando
     2. b.      Comments received in the recent comment collection are here: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0914-05-000m-revmd-wg-cc-comments.xls>
     3. **about 48 comments approved in November, and editors are working on them.**
     4. **Request for a correction on implementation of a resolution that was made where a “s” is missing in D0.04.**
        1. **P2922 line 29 – there is a “s” missing before the “(k)” CID 291 was not implemented correctly.**
        2. **CID 291 – (doc 11-17/1243) had it correctly noted.**
        3. **The editor will correct the error and it will be in the next revision.**
     5. **D0.05 will have the correction plus the 48 other resolutions implanted.**
  2. **Comment resolution.** 
     1. **ANQP CID: 351 (MAC)**
        1. Review comment
        2. Marc and Ping have been exchanging email on this topic, but no resolution has been proposed. Ping and Jouni seemed to be the original authors of this element.
        3. Michael will check with Stephen, but as this is an TGai caused issue, Mark Hamilton will push for a proposed resolution from Marc.
        4. Also, there is a question on the formatting of definition coming before or after a table is appropriate – Emily to check on it.
        5. The field does not seem to be used in any location in the standard. It is in the ANQ usage, but otherwise not shown to be used.
        6. ACTION ITEM: Mark Hamilton to post an email to the reflector about this topic.
     2. CIDs: 194, 222, 223 (GEN) – Menzo
        1. Not on the call – move to the AdHoc
        2. Need to check on Status – Dorothy to send email.
     3. FILS: CID 47 (MAC)
        1. We talked about this in July and Adrian had suggested wording, and we were waiting on confirmation for the new wording.
        2. Action ITEM: Mark HAMLITON to send Email on this CID for updating proposed resolution.
     4. Review Doc **11-17/1811r0** - Artyom LOMAYEV
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1811-00-000m-20-11-golay-sequences.docx>
           1. Review submission
           2. Review the context, but it was noted in 802.11-2016, so wanted to make sure there were no other changes that may have effected these locations.
           3. It was noted by Emily that the errors are the same in D0.04.
           4. Discussion on the possible errors.
           5. No objection to adopt the changes
           6. Dorothy to prepare a motion for consideration at the January Interim Session in Irvine.
     5. **Review Doc** **11-17/1810r0** - Artyom LOMAYEV
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1810-00-000m-20-2-3-phyconfig-vector-parameters.docx>
           1. Review Submission
           2. Missing definition of PHYCONFIG VECTOR
           3. Queston on what is being proposed to be added.
           4. A new sub clause being added would need to be instructed differently. There already existis a 20.3.1, so is the intent to add before or after the existing clause.

Suggested wording “insert a new subclause, and renumber the following clauses). This would give the new clause the number to be 20.2.3.

Check the order in 20.1 – make the new 20.3 match the order.

Insert the following as subclause as 20.2.3

The coloring is not material to the instructions.

* + - * 1. Discussion on the indexing method proposed.

Change the “can” to “shall” fixes the concern (in the red text).

* + - * 1. Range 1-11 is correct, but it should only be the odd numbers

Make a cross reference to avoid duplicate definition

* + - * 1. It seems to be a definition for Channel number being defined here, and not in Annex E, so only one place should have the definition.

It would be better to delete “and channel Number” as it is defined a few line later.

* + - * 1. Question on “at least channel 2”?

Channel 2 is the mandatory channel

The “at least” is not necessary in the sentence.

Shall support Channel 2 is the requirement, the other Channels are optional.

Suggest “Shall support Channel 2 and may support other channels as well”.

* + - * 1. The changes will be made offline and then the revision to be posted to the reflector for consideration.
        2. The difference between Channel number and the “Operating Channel” was questioned.

New wording can be created, but will need to be done offline.

* + - * 1. The Channel number is no longer 1-11, it is from 1-6.

Labels on the figure may help

It does seem confusion the overloading of “Channel Number”

* + - * 1. Schedule to review on January 5th.
    1. **GEN Discuss CIDs**: 29, 76, 324
       1. CID 29 (GEN)
          1. Review comment
          2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2017-12-01 16:11:11Z) - Change cited sentence to "This type of IEEE 802.11 LAN is often formed without preplanning."
          3. Discussion on if the the sentence was accurate.
          4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       2. CID 76 (GEN)
          1. Review comment
          2. Discussion on “space-time stream” having a definition of STS abbreviation. – field names had NUM\_STS. Or equations with Nsts.
          3. Question on “Beamformee STS Capability” usage. Discussion on if the name of a subfield could include an abbreviation “STS” without being in the acronym list.
          4. We may want to just add “STS” to the abbreviation list or in the definition of “space-time stream”.
          5. p2984 line 58 – this could be fixed by just adding the abbreviation.
          6. Proposed resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2017-12-01 16:27:13Z) page 155 d0.4 L54 - Change “space-time streams: Streams of” to "space-time stream (STS): Stream of”

and add "STS space-time stream" to subclause 3.4, if appropriate per our conventions.More discussion on the use of space-time stream vs space-time streams (plural) and what the abbreviation would be “STS” vs “STSs”

* + - * 1. Need to revisit if needed, but for now mark as ready for motion.
      1. CID 324 (GEN)
         1. Find comment – p3565 (d0.4) line 10
         2. Review comment
         3. Rather than say “accept MSDUs” say “indicate at the MAC Service…”
         4. This is in dot11ExcludeUnecrypted – so this is only in WEP text, and as it is marked Obsolete, we are not making any changes to related text.
         5. We find that WEP is marked Obsolete in 12 and in 5.12 it is marked deprecated.
         6. The Pre-RSNA are obsolete is one point.
         7. The comment is to make a change to a MIB variable that is only used in WEP.
         8. Straw-Poll:

Should we make the change to a section that deals with WEP?

Results Yes -3 No-5 Abstain-3

No consensus to make the change

* + - * 1. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (GEN: 2017-12-01 16:44:25Z) WEP has been deprecated and the task group has determined that they are not making any changes to clauses associated with obsolete/deprecated features. Mark ready for Motion
    1. RNR CIDs: 14, 340, 341
       1. We have had a comple presentations, but we need to review 11-17/666 and 11-17/667 and form an opinion on what we should do.
       2. Action Item: Mark Hamilton to follow up with Roger Marks.
  1. **AOB**
     1. none
  2. **Next meeting:** Ad-hoc Dec 7-8 Piscataway NJ
     1. We will use Join.me to allow remote participation
     2. Mtg is 9-5pm ET each day
     3. Proposed Agenda:

1.       Ad-hoc Thursday Dec 7, 2017 9am – 11:30am

a.       Obsolete comments: CIDs 57, 58, 61, 70 in 11-17-1137 – text prepared, pending review – Menzo Wentink

                                                 i.      CID 57    BlockAckReq

                                                ii.      CID 58    Basic BlockAck variant

                                                iii.      CID 61    Non-HT block ack

                                                 iv.      CID 70    HT-delayed block ack

b.       Obsolete comments: CIDs 59 and 62 in 11-17-1518 – text prepared, pending review – Menzo Wentink

                i.      CID 59    DLS

               ii.      CID 58    STSL

c.        Obsolete comments: **CID 72 in 11-17-1261 – text prepared – Annex G**

d.       Graham SMITH – CID 282 in 11-17-987

e.       Mark Rison CIDs

 2.       Thursday 1pm – 3pm

 a.       Matthew Fischer: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1192-08-000m-cr-esp.docx>

b.       Update: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1738-00-000m-setting-ccf0-for-20-40mhz-bss-bw.docx>

c.        Mark Hamilton CIDs

 3.       Thursday 3:30pm – 5pm

a.       GEN CIDs

 4.       Friday Dec 8, 2017 9-11:30am – Security CIDs and topics

a.       CID 95

b.       Review of M. Vanhoef paper suggestions, see <http://www.ieee802.org/11/email/stds-802-11-tgm/msg01235.html>

c.        Additional security CIDs

 5.       Friday 1-3pm

a.       CID 5 – Chris HANSEN

b.       Additional CIDs

* + - 1. Review of agenda was done – note email sent out had item 5 as Thursday rather than Friday.
  1. **Adjourn at 11:58 ET**

**References:**

December 1:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0920-05-000m-802-11revmd-editor-s-report.ppt>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-0914-05-000m-revmd-wg-cc-comments.xls>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1811-00-000m-20-11-golay-sequences.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/17/11-17-1810-00-000m-20-2-3-phyconfig-vector-parameters.docx>