IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment resolution for HCF | | | | |
| Date: 2017-07-10 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Suhwook Kim | LG Electronics | LG Electronics Seocho R&D campus, Seoul Korea |  | [suhwook.kim@lge.com](mailto:suhwook.kim@lge.com) |
| Jeongki Kim | LG Electronics |  |  |  |
| Kiseon Ryu | LG Electronics |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGax D1.0 with the following CIDs (~~4~~3):

* ~~5374,~~ 6034, 5861, 5853

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGax Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGax Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGax Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGax Editor” are instructions to the TGax editor to modify existing material in the TGax draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGax editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGax Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| ~~5374~~ | ~~129.13~~ | ~~10.22.2~~ | ~~It is not clear, what shall be done with LRC, SRC, CW[AC], etc, when a frame was transmitted several times with EDCA and then with UL OFDMA~~ | ~~Clarify~~ | ~~Rejected.~~  ~~What be done with LRC, SRC, CW is described in subclause 10.22.2.11 (Retransmit procedures) and 10.22.2.2 (EDCA backoff procedure) of P802.11ax D1.3~~ |
| 6034 | 133.64 | 10.22.2.8 | Please clarify can any number of buffer status reports and all required bandwidth query reports be triggered in a TXOP with TXOPLimit value 0.  In general it could be a good principle to allow transmission of any number of Trigger frames soliciting a specific response type transmission in an AC with TXOPLimit set to 0. | Please add clarification are Trigger frames to solicit buffer status reports and bandwidth query allowed in a TXOP with TXOPLimit set to value 0. | Rejected.  As described in subclause 10.22.2.8, a QoS Null frame can be caused to be transmitted with TXOP limit value 0. It means that a STA can response with any number of buffer status reports or all required bandwidth query report. |
| 5861 | 133.31 | 10.22.2.8 | In 11ax, if the AP configures EDCA TXOP parameter by itself and it obtains a TXOP duration for DL/UL MU transmission, but without any restriction, the legacy STAs associated in the BSS and the OBSS (non-)AP STAs may suffer from starvation because of the excessive long TXOP duration. Especially in dense environment, the fairness problem of OBSS STAs can be critical when the TXOP duration is determined by only the AP without any restriction. Therefore the MU TXOP Limit should be defined. The MU TXOP Limit should be defined. Since the multi-TID aggregation should be permitted within not exceeded the MU TXOP Limit. E.g., the multi-TID aggregation should be permitted within not exceeded the MU TXOP limit. In addition, if the AP is a TXOP holder and it performs multi-TID aggregation and/or MU transmission, in this case the TXOP holder should not be exceeded the MU TXOP limit. | Define the MU TXOP Limit. | Rejected.  Starvation of legacy OBSS AP/STA may not be serious because MU TXOP isn’t relatively much longer than SU TXOP. Also all MU transmission in 11ax has TXOP limit and TXOP limit can be manageable by an HE AP. |
| 5853 | 152.20 | 27.2.3 | Basically, the HE STA enters the doze state outside trigger-enabled TWT SPs. In this case, HEMUEDCATimer doesn't need to countdown. | Add below sentence in P152P20 for clarification of HEMUEDCATimer. "The HEMUEDCATimer[AC] should not countdown outside trigger-enabled TWT SPs." | Rejected.  The purpose of HEMUEDCATimer[AC] is to ensure a STA doesn’t get a execesably access to the medium and it doesn’t matter if the STA is in doze, it must wait for that amount of time. |