### IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 11ax D1.0 MAC Comment Resolution for 9.4.2.139 | | | | |
| Date: 2017-03-08 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Frank Hsu | MediaTek Inc. |  |  | frank.hsu@mediatek.com |
| Ming Gan | Huawei |  |  | ming.gan@huawei.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments of TGax Draft 1.0 with the following CIDs:

**3030, 3122, 5326, 5919, 6088, 6347, 6348, 7357, 7381, 8541**

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Minor editorial change.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGax D1.0 Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGax D1.0 Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGax Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGax Editor” are instructions to the TGax editor to modify existing material in the TGax draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGax editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGax Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3122 | Adrian Stephens | 68.51 | 9.4.2.139 | "The NoFragmentation subfield is reserved when transmitted by an HE STA"  When transmitted by an HE STA to an HT or VHT non-HE STA, this statement disallows the HE STA from indicating no use of fragmentation within that BA. | Consider adding "to another HE STA" at the end of the cited text. | Revised  Modify the spec as defined in the proposed modifications in doc 0631r2. |
| 5326 | EVGENY KHOROV | 68.51 | 9.4.2.139 | When data are transmitted between a non-HE STA and an HE STA, the ADDBA Capabilities may be incorrectly processed. | Make No fragmentation field equal 1 for an HE STA if its level of fragmentation = 0 and 0 otherwise | Revised - agree in principle with the comment.  Add text to specify that the No-Fragmentation is reserved when transmitted from an HE STA to another HE STA. |
| 3030 | Abhishek Patil | 68.65 | 9.4.2.139 | Level3 is missing from ADDBA | As in the comment | Revised- agree in principle with the comment.  Add defintion/description of HE Fragmentation Operation subfield being 3 to set up level 3 dynamic fragmentation.  This part is covered in 11-17/0689r2 (CIDs 5928, 3302, 8158, 8544, 7539). |
| 5919 | James Yee | 68.56 | 9.4.2.139 | Level 3 dynamic fragmenation is described in 27.3.3.4, 27.3.4.4 and elsewhere in this draft, but is not mentioned in the description of HE Fragmentation Operation of this section. This inconsistency needs to be corrected. | Add statements for setting the HE Fragmentation Operation field to Level 3 dynamic fragmentation. Or, remove Level 3 dynamic fragmentation from the draft. | Duplicated. Same resolution made as 3030. |
| 6088 | Jian Yu | 68.56 | 9.4.2.139 | Level 3 is missing here | Add level 3 description, may refer to Table 9-262z | Duplicated. Same resolution made as 3030. |
| 7357 | Kwok Shum Au | 68.60 | 9.4.2.139 | There are 4 possible values of the HE Fragmentation Operation subfield. The description from 68.60 to 69.20 summarizes the scenarios when the values are 0, 1, and 2. How about the scenario when the value is 3? | Insert the description for the scenario when the value of the HE Fragmentation Operation subfield is 3 in the ADDBA Request frame and the ADDBA Response frame. | Duplicated. Same resolution made as 3030. |
| 7381 | Laurent Cariou | 68.56 | 9.4.2.139 | Fragmentation level 3 should be included in the HE fragmentation operation of the ADDBA Extension element | Same as comment | Duplicated. Same resolution made as 3030. |
| 8541 | Rojan Chitrakar | 68.30 | 9.4.2.139 | Instead of defining new Action frames (L3 Frag BA Request/Response) for block ack setup for L3 fragmentation, it is more efficient to reuse the HE Fragmentation Operation subfield to indicate L3 fragmentation as well. | Use the value of 3 for the HE Fragmentation Operation subfield in the ADDBA request/response frames to negotiate Block Ack setup under fragmentation level 3. | Duplicated. Same resolution made as 3030. |
| 6347 | John Coffey | 68.56 | 9.4.2.139 | Confusing variation in terms: here we have "HE fragmentation Operation subfield", whereas elsewhere we have "HE Fragnentation Operation subfield". Are these variants all describing the same thing? If so, the same term must be used. | Change "HE fragmentation Operation subfield" to "HE Fragmentation Operation subfield". | Accepted  Modify the spec as defined in the proposed modifications in doc 0631r2. |
| 6348 | John Coffey | 68.57 | 9.4.2.139 | Confusing variation in terms: here we have "HE fragmentation operation subfield", whereas elsewhere we have "HE Fragnentation Operation subfield" (and earlier in the same paragraph we have "HE fragmentation Operation subfield). Are these variants all describing the same thing? If so, the same term must be used. | Change "HE fragmentation operation subfield" to "HE Fragmentation Operation subfield". | Accepted  Modify the spec as defined in the proposed modifications in doc 0631r2. |

**Discussion:**

There are relavant comments in section 27.3(Fragmentation) to the ADDBA Extension element.

Revised text of CIDs, 3030, 5919, 6088, 7357, 7381, and 8541 is covered in 11-17/689r2.

**Propose:**

***TGax editor: Modify 9.4.2.139 as the following:***

***Change the paragraph as follows:***

The No-Fragmentation subfield determines whether a fragmented MSDU can be carried in the MPDU sent under the block ack agreement. When this subfield set to 1 in the ADDBA Request frame, it indicates that the non-HE originator is not fragmenting sent MSDUs. When this subfield set to 1 in the ADDBA Response frame, it indicates that the non-HE recipient is not capable of receiving fragmented MSDUs. The No-Fragmentation subfield is reserved when transmitted by an HE STA to another HE STA.(#3122, 5326)

***Change the paragraph as follows:***

The HE ~~fragmentation~~ Fragmentation(#6347) Operation subfield is reserved when transmitted by a non-HE STA. The HE ~~fragmentation~~ ~~operation~~ Fragmentation Operation (#6348) subfield when transmitted by an HE STA indicates the level of dynamic fragmentation that is supported as a recipient for the TID which is defined in the ADDBA frame as follows:

— When this subfield set to 0 in the ADDBA Request frame indicates that the originator does not intend to send fragmented MSDUs for the TID specified in the Block Ack Parameter Set field of the ADDBA Request frame.

— When this subfield set to 1 in the ADDBA Request frame, it indicates that the originator intends to send fragmented MSDUs under fragmentation level 1 (see 27.3.3.2 (Level 1 dynamic fragmentation)) for the TID specified in the Block Ack Parameter Set field of the ADDBA Request frame.

— When this subfield set to 2 in the ADDBA Request frame, it indicates that the originator intends to send fragmented MSDUs under fragmentation level 2 (see 27.3.3.3 (Level 2 dynamic fragmentation)) for the TID specified in the Block Ack Parameter Set field of the ADDBA Request frame.