IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| **CIDs for: Section 9.3.1.23** **Trigger Frame Format-MU BAR Variant** |
| **Date:** 2016-04-17 |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Raja Banerjea |  | 1700 Technology DriveSan Jose, CA |   | rajab@qca.qualcomm.com |
| George Cherian |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGax D0.1 with the following CIDs :

* 5,108 ,512,566,567,615,665,973,1308,1815,2220,2252,2423,2585,2586.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGax Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGax Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGax Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGax Editor” are instructions to the TGax editor to modify existing material in the TGax draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGax editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGax Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **PP.LL** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 5 | Ahmadreza Hedayat | 22.10 | Figure 9-51d seems to be duplicated. The caption is incorrect. Figure 9-51e seems to be the Trigger type-dependent Per-User Info while the caption says it belongs to the Common Info. | Remove or update the 9-51d. Update the caption of 9-51e. | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |
| 108 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 40.10 | This figure is not really needed since it is the same as the one defined in the previous subclause (redundancy leads to errors). Remove this field and simply specify what the Trigger Dependent Per User Info field contains when the trigger is MU BAR variant. Also in P40L19 the figure reference is wrong. Specify that it is Figure 9-51. | As in comment. | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |
| 512 | Dengyu Qiao | 22.33 | How does BAR Ack Policy subfield in BAR Control subfield set for MU-BAR variant?In current spec, BAR Ack Policy subfield can be set to 1 (Normal Acknowledgement for BAR) or 0 (No Acknowledgement for BAR).MU-BAR is carrying the resource allocation information to solicit BA frame, which implies that there is no need of acknowledgement for MU-BAR variant. | Insert the following sentence:BAR Ack Policy subfield in BAR Control subfield shall set to 1 (No Acknowledgement) for MU-BAR variant.Or BAR Ack Policy subfield in BAR Control subfield is reserved for MU-BAR variant. | Rejected.The BAR Ack Policy is as deifned in the baseline (and currently its settings are under deprecation). No changes are neede in the 11ax amendment |
| 566 | EVGENY KHOROV | 22.27 | The length of the BAR Control subfield is 16 bits | Add this information to figure 9-51e | Revised Accounted for the suggested change. |
| 567 | EVGENY KHOROV | 22.36 | It is not clear from the draft how to fill the BAR information field. (SFD provides more details) | Add more details | Revised Agree in principle that there is ambiguity. Proposed resolution clarifies those ambiguities |
| 615 | Geonjung Ko | 22.35 | If the incorrectly inserted figure 9-51d is replaced with Figure 9-2 in 11-16/0024r1, some subfields such as GCR Group Address in GCR BlockAckReq variant may be redundant. | Exclude redundant subfields in BAR Information subfield in Trigger Dependent Per User field for MU-BAR variant. | Revised. Agree in principle that the figure is incorrect. Since the GCR address is already present in the BAR Information field o fthe GCR BlockAckReq the proposed resolution is to remove from the Type Dependent Common Info field. |
| 665 | Huizhao Wang | 22.11 | MU-BAR's Trigger Dependent Common Info field should be mapped to Per User Info instead: For MU-BAR, it needs to carry several BARs targeted to several STAs. The current mapping is wrong. Instead, for MU-BAR, its Common info field's Tigger Dependent Common Info field can be omitted, or defined for other purpose. And map the current defined MU-BAR Trigger Dependent Common Info field into each STAs' Per User Info fields, and hence map the BAR Control & BAR Information subfields into Per User Info's Trigger Dependent Per User Info subfield. (A technical contribution will be followed later) | Map Figure 9-51d into Per User Info instead, and map Figure 9-51e into Per User Info's Trigger Dependent Per User Info subfield instead. And fix the subclause 9.3.1.23.1 text to describe the new mapping (a technical contribution will be followed later) | Revised --Agree in principle that the current mapping is wrong and therefore the text needs to be modified. Proposed resolution is to specify that the Type depended common info field’s length is 0. The BAR Control information and BAR Information is mapped to Type depended Per User Info subfield. |
| 973 | kaiying Lv | 22.10 | Figure 9-51d is the same as Figure 9-51c--Per User Info field. | Please replace with the correct one. | Revised.The figures have been replaced with the correct figure. |
| 1308 | Mark RISON | 22.18 | "If the Trigger frame is an MU-BAR variant, then the Trigger-dependent Per User Info field is define in Figure 9-14e (Control Information subfield format when Control ID subfield is 2)." -- huh? | Change to "in Figure 9-51e" and then fix that figure too | Revised.Agree with the comment. Prposed resolution resolves the ambiguities pointed out by the comment. . |
| 1815 | Rojan Chitrakar | 22.10 | Figure is wrong. | Provide the correct figure. | Revised.The figures have been replaced with the correct figure. |
| 2220 | Tomoko Adachi | 22.01 | The explanation of the MU-BAR variant needs to be reconsidered.Figure 9-51d is completely the same with Figure 9-51c.The title of Figure 9-51e is completely the same with Figure 9-51d. This should explain the Trigger Dependent Per User Info field. | Correct the explanation of the MU-BAR variant. | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |
| 2252 | Weimin Xing | 22.10 | Figure 9-51d is the same as Figure 9-51c, and the figure for " Trigger Dependent Common Info field for MU-BAR variant" is lost.And figure 9-51e is per user info field for MU-BAR not common info, the title is wrong.And the text in L20, "...is define inFigure 9-14e ..."should be "...is define inFigure 9-51e ..." | change the figure 9-51d as the SFD, change the title of Figure 9-51e to"Trigger Dependent Per User Info field for MU-BAR variant" and In L20, change "Figure 9-14e" to "Figure 9-51e" | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |
| 2423 | Yongho Seok | 22.15 | Figure 9-51d is not the Trigger Dependent Common Info field for MU-BAR variant because the Trigger Dependent Common Info field is not repeated.The caption of Figure 9-51d should be changed to the Per User Info field for MU-BAR variant. | As per comment | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |
| 2585 | Young Hoon Kwon | 22.04 | Wrong figure. Figure 9-51d is Per User Info field. | Modify the text to "If the Trigger frame is an MU-BAR variant, the Trigger Dependent Common Info field is not present.", and delete Figure 9-51d | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |
| 2586 | Young Hoon Kwon | 22.20 | Wrong figure. It should be Figure 9-51e. | Modify the text from "... defined in Figure 9-14e" to "... defined in Figure 9-51e". | Revised. Current text in section 9.3.1.23.1 is removed and text as specified in current document added. |

## 9.3.1.23.1 MU-BAR variant

***TGax Editor: Remove the paragraph below: CIDs (5,108,109,512,566…)***

~~If the Trigger frame is an MU-BAR variant, then the Trigger Dependent Common Info field is defined(#1307) in Figure 9-51d (Trigger Dependent Common Info field for MU-BAR variant(#614)).~~

***TGax Editor: Delete Fig 9.51d***

***TGax Editor: Remove the paragraph below:***

~~If the Trigger frame is an MU-BAR variant, then the Trigger Dependent User Info(#1520) field is defined(#1307) in Figure 9-51e (Trigger Dependent User Info field for MU-BAR variant(#2700))(#2698).~~

***TGax Editor: Delete Fig 9.51e***

TGax Editor: Insert the following sentences at the beginning of section 9.3.1.23.1

The Type Dependent Common Info field is not present in the MU BAR variant Trigger frame. The Type Dependent Per User Information field of the MU BAR variant Trigger frame contains the BAR Control and BAR Information field and is shown in Figure xxx.



**FIG-xxx Type Dependent Per User Information field for MU-BAR variant Trigger frame**

***TGax Editor: Change the paragraph below as follows:***

The BAR Information subfield is defined in 9.3.1.8 (BlockAckReq frame format). The Fragment number field is set accordingly to Table 9-x (Mapping for the Fragment Number subfield of the Compressed BlockAck variant) for a compressed BAR variant, or Table 9-y(Mapping for the Fragment Number subfield of the Multi-STA BlockAck variant) for a Mulit-TID BAR variant.