IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| REVmc BRC April 21 Telecon Minutes | | | | |
| Date: 2016-04-21 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11 REVmc BRC Telecon for 21 April 2016

**The Draft Agenda:**

1. Call to order, attendance, and patent policy2. Editor report 3. Comment resolution - Available CIDs:

1. 11-16-303 Graham Smith
2. 11-16-276 Mark Rison
3. 11-16-0541 Assaf KASHER (Intel)
4. 11-16-545 Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE (Quantenna)

4. AOB: Next Meeting: Cambridge April 25-285. Adjourn

Note that BRC meetings and teleconferences are subject to IEEE policies and procedures, see:– IEEE Patent Policy – Patent FAQ – Letter of Assurance Form– Affiliation FAQ – Anti-Trust FAQ – Ethics– 802 LMSC P&P – 802LMSC OM

Dial in information: Thu, Apr 21, 7:00 am | 1 hr 30 minSan Francisco (Pacific Daylight Time, GMT-07:00)When it’s time, start the meeting from here:https://meetings.webex.com/collabs/meetings/join?uuid=M0Y5DE3X509C6P5MV8YMZ2NY7M-4O2Access InformationWhere: WebEx OnlineMeeting number: 193 871 034Meeting password: This meeting does not require a password.Audio Connection+1-415-655-0001 US TOLLAccess code: 193 871

**802.11** **REVmc BRC Telecon 21 April 2016**

1. **Called to order** by Dorothy at 10:03am ET
2. **Attendance:**

Dorothy STANLEY (HPE), Adrian STEPHENS (Intel), Assaf KASHER (Intel), Emily QI (Intel), Jinjing JIANG (Marvell), Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm), Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus), Mark RISON (Samsung), Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE (Quantenna)

1. **Review Draft Agenda:**

1. Call to order, attendance, and patent policy2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution - Available CIDs:

1. 11-16-303 Graham Smith
2. 11-16-276 Mark Rison
3. 11-16-0541 Assaf KASHER (Intel)
4. 11-16-545 Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE (Quantenna)

4. AOB: Next Meeting: Cambridge April 25-285. AdjournNote that BRC meetings and teleconferences are subject to IEEE policies and procedures, see:– IEEE Patent Policy – Patent FAQ – Letter of Assurance Form– Affiliation FAQ – Anti-Trust FAQ – Ethics– 802 LMSC P&P – 802LMSC OM

Dial in information: Thu, Apr 21, 7:00 am | 1 hr 30 minSan Francisco (Pacific Daylight Time, GMT-07:00)When it’s time, start the meeting from here:https://meetings.webex.com/collabs/meetings/join?uuid=M0Y5DE3X509C6P5MV8YMZ2NY7M-4O2Access InformationWhere: WebEx OnlineMeeting number: 193 871 034Meeting password: This meeting does not require a password.Audio Connection+1-415-655-0001 US TOLLAccess code: 193 871

* 1. Discuss changing the order of presentations
     1. Option 1: Mark R: 30 min, Assaf: 30min, Sigurd: 15 min
     2. Option 2: we could go Assaf 30 min, Sigurd and balance time to Mark RISON
  2. Agreed for Option 2, ensuring that Mark RISON gets at least 30 mins.
  3. **Agenda approved without objection**

1. **Review Patent Policy:**
   1. No issues noted
2. **Editor Report** Adrian Stephens
   1. D5.3 has been prepared and waiting for chair approval, could make available.
   2. Motions and comment resolutions through March are included.
   3. ACTION Item 1: Dorothy to review draft and post to TG.
   4. No items from Emily QI
3. **Review Doc 11-16/0541r0** Assaf KASHER (Intel)
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0541-00-000m-sc-64-qam-response-to-editor-comments.docx>
   2. From discussion: Document D5.3-1083 includes comments by the editor on changes introduced by the execution of the editor instruction on document 11-16-0220-03-000m-clause-20-SC-extended-MCSs as part of the resolution of SB comment 7142.
      1. Many of the editor’s comments are correct and in this document we propose changes to remedy the issues raised by the editor.
   3. Note editorial points “table” should be capitalized and “through” should be “to”
   4. Review the proposed changes and explaination of changes
   5. Discussion on why the “Other Editorial Issues” were made.
   6. Need to have TX be Tx and RX be Rx, typo in “indicate” and some other minor editorial changes noted.
   7. Note that the header is incorrect, and the cited draft is an editorial version and not generally available, so should not be cited. A review will need to be done when the “official” d5.3 is available. Also note several other editorial nits will need to be corrected.
      1. “Alternative” cannot be used as it is like “legacy” and so should not be used (see page 2).
      2. Table 20-20 there is an MCS in PHY SAP that is different from the header MCS, this causes confusion, so need to rename the field – suggest Base MCS field.
      3. The Term MCS needs to be reviewed to ensure proper usage; Integer vs Enumeration.
   8. We will look at again in Cambridge (next week) or in May if not ready then.
      1. Goal is to try to get it included in a 5.4 prior to the May Meeting.
4. **Review doc 11-16/545r0** Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE (Quantenna)
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0545-00-000m-cids-7106-and-7412.docx>
   2. CID 7106 (GEN)
      1. Review comment
      2. Review discussion and Proposed Change
      3. The proposed change hids the “actor”, and as this is a MAC constraint, it should be described in the MAC section.
      4. At least one opinion, the proposed change is not an improvement.
      5. This requirement should be described in the MAC clause
      6. The Primitive is filled in by the entity sending the Primitive.
      7. The effort was to keep the change minimal, but if we change it to be a constraint, then it may work.
      8. We had another proposal that was made in February (see adhoc notes in the comment files).
   3. CID 7412 (GEN)
      1. Review Comment
      2. This was discussed in Macau. Reference CID 7411, which is similar. CID 7411 was approved at that time, with a note that 7412 should be similar, but isn’t exactly the same.
      3. Proposed resolution suggests changes which are similar to CID 7411.
      4. Review proposed changes
      5. Proposed resolution: Revised. At 2505.56, replace “The” with “where the”.

At 2505.59 delete “and the Clause 19 (High Throughput (HT) PHY specification) PHY-TXSTART.request(TXVECTOR) primitive is issued”

Change reference to Table 20-1 to Table 19-1

* + 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. More work on CID 7106 will need to be done, and hopefully ready for next week during the Cambridge meeting

1. Jon ROSDAHL had to drop at this point, and Mark HAMILTON took over taking minutes for the balance of the meeting.
2. Minutes for 802.11 TGmc for Thursday, April 21, 2016 (Starting at ~11:00am)
   1. **Review doc 11-16/0276r4** Mark RISON (Samsung)
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0276-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d5-0-sbmc1.docx>
      2. CID 7396 (MAC)
         1. Coordinating with Mark Hamilton on the ToDS/FromDS settings details, for Mesh Gates. Will bring back.
      3. CID 7419 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Reviewed baseline text on this topic, noting that it actually appears in three places, 10.8, 5.1.1.4, and 9.2.4.5.4.
         3. Question for the group, which option do we prefer?

1) Delete the second paragraph of 9.2.4.5.4 and fix up the text in 5.1.1.4 to be consistent; OR

2) Delete the second paragraph of 9.2.4.5.4 and remove this details from clause 5.

* + - 1. Need to check if can send QoSNoAck mode with fragmentation. Would the second bullet in the 5.1.1.4 proposed text for Option 1 keep the “one or more” QoS Data frame(s)?
      2. General leaning of the group is toward Option 1.
      3. Mark RISON will clean up, and bring back.
    1. CID 7349 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Noted off-line discussion about what the backoff rules should be for Beacon transmission. Discussion continued here. It doesn’t seem clear if there is text saying what the backoff mechanism is for a Beacon, following a TBTT.
       3. Do Beacons just go out at a PIFS?
       4. Still conversation needed to reach consensus on what to do. The default (if no consensus can be reached) would be to make no change.
       5. Mark RISON will consider further and bring back.
    2. CID 7527 (GEN)
       1. Reminded that Jouni had a concern with the proposed change. The concern is whether “PTK key” can or should be plural. This machine can be run more than once, thus calculating and installing more than one key. But, none of the rest of the text describing the state machine states is written with plurals, so it seems to written to consider only each run of the machine.
       2. Agreed we should be consistent. Easiest seems to be to leave singular, as Mark RISON has suggested, and cleanup any lose ends.
       3. Another clean up is to mention IGTK at 120.18. Added that.
       4. Reviewed “TPK Key Lifetime” changes. Is “Key Lifetime” the base noun, qualified with “TPK”? (As opposed to “Liftetime” being modified by the (redundant) “TPK Key”) Agreed to this alternate view, but then “Key” should be lower-case.
       5. Also reviewed “PTK (re)Key request”. Agreed there is no term for the concept here, so Mark’s proposal is okay (and better than what was there).
       6. Mark R will post an “r5” with agreed changes.
       7. Proposed Resolution: Revised; Make changes as shown in 11-16/0276r5 (1.3.1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0276-05-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d5-0-sbmc1.docx> ), for CID 7527. This accomplishes the commenter’s intent, and corrects associated wording.
       8. No objections – Mark ready for Motion
  1. Reminder of meeting in Cambridge next week. Chair has posted agenda document.
     1. Discussed time of meeting slots. Starting at 9:30 am would also be okay, and might help Asia call-ins. Will discuss further during the first slot in Cambridge.
     2. Will change the last slot of each day to go to 6:00 pm to allow the maximum overlap with North America call-ins.
  2. Adjourned at 11:31 am ET

**References:**

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0541-00-000m-sc-64-qam-response-to-editor-comments.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0545-00-000m-cids-7106-and-7412.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0276-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d5-0-sbmc1.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/16/11-16-0276-05-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d5-0-sbmc1.docx>