IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| CID 7452 |
| Date: 2016-04-01 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  | edward.ks.au@huawei.com  |

##### This submission discusses on the accepted resolution of CID 7452 that need additional inputs to editors.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

R1 – revised based on feedback from the commenter

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 7452 | 8.3.5.1.4.2 | 559 | 40 | "The RXVECTOR represents a list of parameters that the PHY provides the local MAC entity upon receipt of a valid PHY header or upon receipt of the last PSDU data bit in the received frame." -- can't be sent before the end, by definition. I'm not sure why the values in the PHY-RXSTART.ind can't be used, either | Delete this sentence | REVISED (MAC: 2016-02-25 15:06:47Z): Delete "upon receipt of a valid PHY header or" |

***Discussion:***

In this comment, the author refers to 559.40 and clause 8.3.5.14.2. However, 559.40 is actually in clause 8.3.5.13.2 (PHY-START.indication), rather than 8.3.5.14.2 (PHY-RXEND.indication). To make things worse, the sentence quoted by the commenter exists in both clauses!





I discuss with Adrian who comments that the resolution may be technically wrong:

|  |
| --- |
| Technically the resolution is wrong. I remember a different outcome (but I might just be mentally inventing that).The point is that the RXSTART ind is given at the end of the PHY header.So this change is needed:At 559.42, to delete “or upon receipt of the last PSDU data bit in the received frame”At 560.40, I think the text is correct, because RXEND ind can come at the end of the header (e.g. unsupported rate) or the end of the PSDU.However, at this location “\*valid\* PHY header” is open to challenge, because the reasons for indication an RXEND ind at the end of the PHY header relate also to receiving an invalid PHY header. |

Upon feedback from the commenter, Mark Rison, this CID is for 560.39 in clause .3.5.14.2 (PHY-RXEND.indication). He provides the following comments offline (in response to the aforementioned Adrian’s comment):

|  |
| --- |
| Yes, so my proposed change for CID 7452 was to delete the sentence.As the comment suggested, I think you could go further and delete the RXVECTOR from the RXEND.ind, since it was already provided in the RXSTART.ind.I can't see how the RXVECTOR could differ, nor can I find anything about such a possible difference in the spec. |

Note: the comment for 559.40 is CID 7451, which has already been accepted.

***Proposed resolution:***

Accept the commenter’s proposed change to delete the whole sentence “The RXVECTOR represents a list of parameters that the PHY provides the local MAC entity upon receipt of a valid PHY header or upon receipt of the last PSDU data bit in the received frame.” at 560.39 in clause 8.3.15.4.2.