IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolution for some GEN comments in SB1 |
| Date: 2016-02-22 |
| Author: |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | 303 Terry Fox Drive, Suite 400, Ottawa, Ontario K2K 3J1 |  | edward.ks.au@huawei.com  |

##### This submission presents proposed resolution to CID 7109, 7110, 7356, 7440, 7386, 7422, 7135, 7404, 7405, and 7408. Changes indicated by instructions.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – initial version

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7109 | C.3 | 2919 | 7 | This MIB variable (dot11EstimatedServiceParametersOptionImplemented) is not cited from any group or compliance statement, and therefore there are no conformance requirements on it. | Cite it from an appropriate group or conformance statement. |

***Discussion:***

dot11EstimatedServiceParametersOptionImplemented belongs to Dot11StationConfigEntry:



The commenter points out correctly that this MIB variable is neither cited from an appropriate group nor conformance statement.

A suggestion is to include this MIB variable in dot11SMTbase13 object group:



***Resolution:***

**Revised**

### TGmc Editor: Add “dot11EstimatedServiceParamtetrsOptionImplemented” in line 3361.11.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7110 | C.3 | 2971 | 30 | This variable (dot11LciCivicInNeighborReport) and the follow 3 are not cited in any group or compliance statement. This means there is no requirement ever to implement them. | Add them to an appropriate group or compliance statement. |

***Discussion:***

The 4 MIB variables the commenter refer to are:

* dot11LciCivicInNeighborReport;
* dot11RMFineTimingMsmtRangeRepImplemented;
* dot11RMFineTimingMsmtRangeRepActivated; and
* dot11FineTimingMsmtInitActivated.

These 4 variables are actually already added in the following group, dot11FineTimingMeasurement:



***Resolution:***

**Reject**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7356 | C.3 | 3073 | 51 | It says "2(13 + Maximum A-MPDU" | Add "\*\*" after "2" |

***Discussion:***

Refering to line 3073.51,



In 9.4.2.56.3, we have



***Resolution:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: Change “2(13 + Maximum A-MPDU” to “2 \*\* (13 + Maximum A-MPDU”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7440 | G.3 | 3403 | 45 | Doesn't "( [RTS CTS] non-cf-ack-piggybacked-qos-poll-sequence )" need a | at the end? Otherwise it is effectively prepended to cf-ack-piggybacked-qos-poll-sequence on the next line | Add a | at the end |

***Discussion:***

Refering to line 3403.45,



***Resolution:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: Add a “|” at the end of the line in lne 3403.45.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7386 | 15.2.2.7 | 2208 | 4 | "The number of available antennas shall be determined from the MIB table parameters aSuprtRxAntennas and aSuprtTxAntennas." -- - there are no such things, whatever "MIB table parameters" might mean | Delete the cited sentence |

***Discussion:***

Refering to line 2208.04,

**

The commenter points out correctly that there are neither aSuprtRxAntennas nor aSuprtTxAntennas throughout the draft specification.

As a related note, these two variables are also appeared in Table 16-5:



***Resolution:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: Delete “The number of available antennas shall be determinted from the MIB table parameters aSuprtRxAntennas and aSuprtTxAntennas.” in line 2208.04. Further delete “The number of available antennas is determinted from the MIB table parameters, aSuprtRxAntennas and aSuprtTxAntennas.” in line 2248.06.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7422 | 21.3.17.4.3 | 2583 | 51 | It says "The relative constellation RMS error, calculated by first averaging over subcarriers, frequency segments, OFDM PPDUs, and spatial streams" but this is the VHT PHY | Change "OFDM" to "VHT" |

***Discussion:***

Refering to line 2583.51,



The commenter points out correctly that it should be “VHT PPDUs” rather than “OFDM PPDUs” here.

As a related note, in clause 21.2.5.2, there is also an appearance of “OFDM PPDU” that should be replaced by “VHT PPDU”:



***Resolution:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: Change “OFDM PPDUs” to “VHT PPDUs” in line 2583.52. Further, change “OFDM PPDU” with “VHT PPDU” in line 2504.60.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7135 | 21.2.5.2 | 2504 | 31 | I believe the inequality is the wrong way round. | change "less than" to "greater than" in the inequality on this line.Make matching change at 2506.13And change the text at 2330.43 to match. |
| 7404 | 21.2.5.2 | 2504 | 30 | You need to use 20U if the prim is above the sec | Change < to > |
| 7405 | 21.2.5.3 | 2506 | 13 | You need to use 20U if the prim is above the sec | Change < to > |
| 7408 | 19.2.5 | 2330 | 43 | You need to use 20U if the prim is above the sec | Change "SECONDARY\_CHANNEL\_ABOVE" to "SECONDARY\_CHANNEL\_BELOW" |

***Discussion:***

Refering to line 2504.30,



and line 2506.13,



It can be observed that the logic is not correct because, as both commenters point out, one need to use the upper 20 MHz portion of a 40 MHz channel if the channel frequency of primary channel is above that of the secondary channel.

Referring to line 2330.43,



the same logic applies here that CH\_OFFSET shall only be CH\_OFF\_20U if the channel frequency of the secondary channel is below that of the primary channel.

***Resolution for CID 7135:***

**Revised**

### TGmc Editor: In lines 2504.30 and 2506.13, change “<” to “>”. In line 2330.43, change “SECONDARY\_CHANNEL\_ABOVE” to “SECONDARY\_CHANNEL\_BELOW”.

***Resolution for CID 7404:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: In line 2504.30, change “<” to “>”.

***Resolution for CID 7405:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: In line 2506.13, change “<” to “>”.

***Resolution for CID 7408:***

**Accept**

### TGmc Editor: In line 2330.43, change “SECONDARY\_CHANNEL\_ABOVE” to “SECONDARY\_CHANNEL\_BELOW”.

###