IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| SB0 Comment Resolution Part4 | | | | |
| Date: 2015-12-17 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yongho Seok | NEWRACOM |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions of comments received from TGah 1st Sponsor Ballot (TGah Draft 5.0).

* CIDs: 8221, 8223, 8225, 8226, 8227, 8228, 8229, 8230, 8231, 8232 (10 CIDs)

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 8221 | 3 | 3.2 | "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW1)." is not part of the definition of the term, rather is a property of a S1G PPDU, making it either extra information or a requirement, neither of which is allowed in a definition. | remove text following "(S1G) PPDU" | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8223 | 3 | 3.2 | "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW1)." is not part of the definition of the term, rather is a property of a S1G PPDU, making it either extra information or a requirement, neither of which is allowed in a definition. | remove text following "(S1G) PPDU" | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8225 | 3 | 3.2 | The text "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW1)" and "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW2)" describes normative characteristics of the thing being referred to by the defined term, and should not be part of the definition (but should be defined in a normative clause). | Remove text indicated in comment. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8226 | 3 | 3.2 | "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW2)." is a requirement contained in clause 24 (somewhere?) and should not be part of the definition. | Remove "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW2)." | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8227 | 3 | 3.2 | (TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW1), "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW2)" and "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW4)" are requirements that are stated in Clause 24. Definitions in clause 3 shall NOT contain requirements or other information. | Remove text indicated in comment. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8228 | 3 | 3.2 | "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW4)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW4)" and "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW4)" are requirements of the PPDU referred to by the term, and definitions in clause 3 shall NOT contain requirements according to the IEEE-SA style manual. | Remove text indicated in comment. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8229 | 3 | 3.2 | (TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW1), "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW2)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW4)" and "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW8)" are, again, not appropriate in the definition as they state normative characteristics of the PPDU(s) referenced by the term. Requirements do not belong in clause 3. | Remove text indicated in comment. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8230 | 4 | 3.2 | There are normative requirements in the definition: "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW8)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW8)" "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW8)" | Remove requirements from definition of the term. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8231 | 4 | 3.2 | "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW1)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW2)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW4)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW8)" and "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW16)" are requirements and do not belong in the definitions. Such specific requirements of PPDU field values should be in the normative clause defining PPDUs for this PHY. | Remove all the PPDU definitions from this clause and add a sub-clause in clause 24 that includes the specific field settings that define specific PPDUs. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |
| 8232 | 4 | 3.2 | "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW16)", "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW16)" and "(TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH equal to CBW16)" are not appropriate in clause 3. | Remove requirements from definition of the term. | Rejected-  The BRC believes that “TXVECTOR parameter X equal to Y” phrase in a definion is an informative language. The same phrase has been used in Clause 3 of IEEE 802.11 base specification. |