IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| IEEE 802.11 TGah,  Nov 2015 TGah Session Meeting Minutes | | | | |
| Date: 2015-11-09 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Eugene Baik | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | eugeneb@qca.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

TGah meeting minutes from the IEEE 802.11 Dallas session, Nov 9th – 13th, 2015.

**IEEE 802.11 Task Group ah,**

**Nov 2015 Meeting**

**Hyatt Regency, Dallas, TX USA**

**November 9th-13th, 2015**

**Monday, Nov 9th, 2015, PM2 TGah Session (16:00-17:30)**

1. Meeting called to order at 4:02PM by Chair Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM)
2. Eugene Baik (Qualcomm) volunteers for secretary
3. Review of Agenda (11-15/1229r1)

* Call for volunteer of TGah BRC
* Assignee updates for SB0 comment spreadsheet
* Editorial comment review document 1 by Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm)
* Editorial comment review document 2 by Alfred Asterjadhi
* Call for any additional submissions
  + None
* Move to approve meeting agenda
  + Move by Alfred, Seconded by Eugene
  + Agenda approved unanimously

1. Review of Mandatory IPR and Patent Policy by Yongho Seok

* No one speaks up for call for potentially essential patents

1. Approval of meeting minutes

* September meeting minutes (11-15/1197r0)

1. Current status report of TGah

* Sept. Recirculation Letter Ballot 97% approval
* EC approves start of Sponsor Ballot
* 90.5% Sponsor Ballot approval
* ~550 comments received, to be resolved by TGah
* SB Comment Resolution Rules
  + Any voting member of .11 can vote at TGah meetings
  + TGah motions (regarding e.g. comment resolutions, changes to draft) can be discussed during IEEE F2F and teleconference calls.
  + IP related comments should be discussed in F2F, and not during teleconferences

1. Call for volunteers for resolution of SB0 Comments

* Chair to give time for review of comments spreadsheet, since it became available late last week
* Volunteers for resolving CIDs to email chair Yongho Seok by Thursday AM2
* Remaining comments without volunteers will be assigned during Thursday sessions

1. Editorial Comment Review 1 Document by Alfred Asterjadhi (11-15/1393r0)

* Review of 50 CIDs classified as “Editorial”
* Document resolves 41CIDs, remaining 9 CIDs to be resolved in later contribution
* CIDs from Adrian Stephens (Intel), Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM)
* No comments from TG about document, Yongho suggests they look through document offline before Thursday AM

1. Editorial Comment Review 2 Document by Alfred Asterjadhi (11-15/1394r0)
   * Review of 50 CIDs classified as “Editorial”

* Document resolves 41 CIDs. 1 CID resolution removed from document after it was determined to be Technical.
* No comments from TG about document, Yongho suggests more time for TG to review document offline before Thursday AM. Comments to be sent to TGah email reflector.

1. Session is recessed until Tuesday PM at 5:25pm

**Tuesday, Nov 10th, 2015, PM2 TGah Session (16:00-18:00)**

1. Meeting called to order at 4:01PM by Chair Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM)
2. Eugene Baik (Qualcomm) volunteers for secretary
3. Review of Agenda (11-15/1229r2)

* SB Editor Resolutions Part 3, 11-15/1395r0 Alfred Asterjadhi
* SB Editor Resolutions Part 4, 11-15/1396r0 Alfred Asterjadhi
* Agenda approved unanimously, moved by Alfred, seconded by Eugene

1. Review of IPR policy
   * No one speaks up for essential patent claims
2. SB Editor Resolutions Part 3, Alfred Asterjadhi (11-15/1395r0)
   * Provides resolutions for 46 “Editorial” CIDs
   * CIDs from Adrian Stephens, Robert O’Hara, James Lepp, Dave Halasz, Benjamin Rolfe, others
   * Chair asks members to review document offline and send comments to TGah reflector prior to Thursday AM2
   * Revised version r1 to be motioned on Thursday
3. SB Editor Resolutions Part 3, Alfred Asterjadhi (11-15/1395r0)
   * Provides resolutions for 41 Editorial CIDs
   * CIDs from David Hunter
   * Chair asks members to review document offline and send comments to TGah reflector prior to Thursday AM2
   * Revised version r1 to be motioned on Thursday
4. Reminder to send email to TGah reflector to volunteer for CIDs by Thursday AM2. Remaining unassigned CIDs will be assigned.
5. With no other documents to discuss, session is recessed until Thursday AM2.

**Thursday, Nov 12th, 2015, AM2 TGah Session (10:30-12:30)**

1. Meeting called to order at 10:30PM by Chair Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM)
2. Eugene Baik (Qualcomm) volunteers for secretary
3. Review of Agenda (11-15/1229r3)

* IPR review
* Approve meeting minutes from September meeting
* Continue addressing SB comments
  + SB0 editor resolutions part 5, by Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm) (11-15/1397r0)
  + SB0 comment resolution part 1, by Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM) (11-15/1439r0)
  + SB0 resolution of CID8199, CID8286 by Rolf de Vegt (Qualcomm) (11-15/1441r0)
    - Discussion of IP related comments, scheduled for 11:30 for when WG chair Adrian Stephens (Intel) becomes available
* Agenda approved unanimously, moved by Alfred, seconded by Eugene

1. Review of IPR policy
   * No one speaks up for essential patent claims
2. Approval of September meeting minutes (11-15/1197r0)
   * Yongho reviews document
   * Move to approve meeting minutes by Eugene, Seconded by Rolf de Vegt
   * No additional discussion, minutes approved by unanimous consensus
3. SB0 editor resolutions part 5, by Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm) (11-15/1397r0)
   * Resolutions for 60 editorial CIDs of 75 editorial CIDs reviewed in document
   * Minor modifications suggested by Yongho Seok, Adrian Stephens to be reflected in r1 version of document to be uploaded to server after presentation
   * Yongho Seok asks for any comments on document to be sent to TGah reflector before today’s PM2 session where it will be motioned
4. Working group chair (Adrian Stephens) is present now so Yongho Seok suggests changing order of the agenda to cover Rolf’s document first.
   * No objections
5. SB0 resolution of CID8199, CID8286 by Rolf de Vegt (Qualcomm) (11-15/1441r0)
   * Covering now because IP related CIDs must be covered in F2F sessions, with WG chair present
   * CID8199 by Andrew Myles regarding LOA submission under new IEEE SA IPR policy. Rejected by Rolf because commenter does not suggest specific change.
     1. One member asked for discussion/vote to be delayed until 11:30am. Yongho Seok: no vote will be taken in AM2 session, will be done at PM2.
     2. There was a question whether the comment is part of a “No” vote on Sponsor Ballot? Answer from Rolf: No. There were arguments on whether resolution “rejection” is valid, because there were no suggested changes in CID.
     3. One member asks if the resolution of rejection disqualify the commenter to change his vote in future ballot? Adrian Stephens: CID resolution does not affect his ability to change or not change his vote if new information or policy changes happen between now and then. Also CID was not part of MBS “Disapprove” vote.
     4. Adrian Stephens (WG Chair) suggests running straw poll on proposed resolution
     5. Straw poll reads “Do you support the comment resolution for CID 8199 as shown in 11-15/1441r0?” 5Y/1N/5A
   * CID8286 by Matthew Fischer (Broadcom) stating that Qualcomm’s submitted LOA does not provide assurance as required. Suggests alternative technologies to replace Qualcomm patents in draft. Rejected because it lacks specific wording for the changes that are desired.
     1. One question raised if CSR’s LOA binding for Qualcomm patents generated without CSR?
     2. Another question asked if WG could forward this CID to PatCom and ask for their counsel before resolution is decided for this CID.
     3. There is an opinion to resolve this CID right now because of sponsor ballot timeline, if resolution is not satisfactory, can submit concerns again at later time.
     4. A question asked if this TGah sponsor ballot patent issue on PatCom agenda
     5. WG Chair: No it isn’t.
     6. One member commented that Patent issue was important issue and asked when the right time to address this issue is? It is hopeful that removing Qualcomm patents was not necessary. Would have been nice if PatCom provided some clarity to avoid that path.
     7. WG Chair: No guarantee that providing PatCom information will coerce them into a decision in desired timeframe.
     8. One member requested the resolution of this CID delayed until at least January, until PatCom comes to a resolution in maybe December.
     9. A motion was moved to forward this CID to IEEE SA PatCom for discussion in their upcoming meeting.
     10. Motion: Move to forward comment CID 8286 received from TGah initial sponsor ballot to IEEE-SA PatCom for consideration at December 2015 meeting and ask for feedback for resolving that CID.

Moved by: Matthew Fischer; Seconded by: Sean Coffey

Discussions:

* + - 1. One question asked what kind of response is expected from PatCom
      2. Response from one member: if Qualcomm’s LOA is legally valid
      3. There was a question for WG Chair to clarify that: WG has already received feedback from PatCom, and their response was that there was no missing LOA
      4. WG Chair: Response was non-substantive/not definitive on whether Qualcomm LOA was effective or not. WG made decision to go forward based on interpretation of PatCom response
      5. One comment heard that this was not WG’s job as engineers to decide whether any given technology is satisfied by LOA
      6. One member commented that it’s WG task to determine whether LOA exists.
      7. One question to clarify if LOA by CSR enough to cover Qualcomm’s patents? If answer is yes, then that is enough to go forward.
      8. One response was heard that this is going too far, now the debates became whether a letter from lawyers from a company was enough to go forward. Gotten to point of targeting a specific company, not a specific issue.
      9. One member commented he wanted to see more detail/clarification regarding this issue, since it has to be addressed at some point in sponsor ballot stage.
      10. Another member mentioned that there are other venues to do that, like PatCom or standards board, not in WG

Vote on motion: 5Y/3N/3A, Motion passes.

* + 1. Back to CID:
       1. One member requested to accept the resolution to this CID, since it is a suggestion, but does not suggest a change to draft
       2. One clarification: in comment resolution, CIDs are only accepted if it is to affect a change on draft text.
       3. WG Chair: CIDs deal with specific changes to draft, not changes in process
    2. Straw poll: Do you support the comment resolution for CID 8286 as shown in 11-15/1441r0?
       1. 5Y/2N/4A. Straw poll passes.

1. SB0 comment resolution part 1, by Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM) (11-15/1439r0)
   * Resolutions for 6 CIDs
   * Revisions suggested during session will be reflected in r1 of document
   * Document will be motioned in PM2 session, please review offline ahead of time.
2. All pending items on agenda have been covered, TGah is recessed until PM2.

**Thursday, Nov 12th, 2015, PM2 TGah Session (4:00-6:00)**

1. Meeting called to order at 4:02PM by Chair Yongho Seok (NEWRACOM)
2. Eugene Baik (Qualcomm) volunteers for secretary
3. Review of Agenda (11-15/1229r5)
   * Motion of 7 presented CID resolution documents from earlier sessions
   * Conference call agenda
   * Move to approve agenda by Eugene Baik (Qualcomm), seconded by Bin Tian (Qualcomm)
   * Agenda approved by unanimous consensus
4. Review of IPR policy
   * No one speaks up for essential patent claims
5. Motion of CID resolution submissions:
   * Move to adopt CID resolutions in 11-15/1393r0 by Alfred Asterjadhi, seconded by Matt Fischer (Broadcom)
     1. No additional discussion, motion passes by unanimous consensus
   * Move to adopt CID resolutions in 11-15/1394r1 by Alfred Asterjadhi, seconded by Eugene Baik (Qualcomm)
     1. No additional discussion, motion passes by unanimous consensus
   * Move to adopt CID resolutions in 11-15/1395r1 by Alfred Asterjadhi, seconded by Matt Fischer (Broadcom)
     1. No additional discussion, motion passes by unanimous consensus
   * Move to adopt CID resolutions in 11-15/1396r1 by Alfred Asterjadhi, seconded by Bin Tian (Qualcomm)
     1. No additional discussion, motion passes by unanimous consensus
   * Move to adopt CID resolutions in 11-15/1397r1 by Alfred Asterjadhi, seconded by Matt Fischer (Broadcom)
     1. No additional discussion, motion passes by unanimous consensus
   * Move to adopt CID resolutions in 11-15/1439r1 by Eugene Baik (Qualcomm), seconded by Bin Tian (Qualcomm)
     1. No additional discussion, motion passes by unanimous consensus
6. Rolf presents new CID resolution document in place of document presented in AM2, 11-15/1455r0
   * CID 8199 regarding LOA/IP policy by Andrew Myles. WG Adrian Stephens present.
   * The commenter agreed to the resolution with the modification from earlier resolution
   * Move to adopt the comment resolution of CID 8199 in 11-15/1455r0 by Rolf De Vegt (Qualcomm), seconded by Bin Tian (Qualcomm)
     1. 9Y/0N/4A. Motion passes.
7. Move to instruct Editor to generate D5.1 of the draft based on motions passed in TGah at the November F2F, by Eugene Baik, seconded by Bin Tian.
   * No additional discussions
   * 10Y/0N/3A. Motion passes.
8. Future Teleconference scheduling
   * Motion to cancel prescheduled weekly conferences and to reschedule weekly conference calls to Nov 24th-March 8th, on Tuesdays 8PM ET, for 2.5 hours.
     1. Moved by Alfred Asterjadhi, seconded by Bin Tian
     2. 6Y/0N/1A, Motion passes.
9. Timeline review (11-11/0285r13)
   * Initial Recirculation Sponsor Ballot target is revised to January 2016, from March 2016.
   * EC Approval, Revcom Approval targets July 2016.
10. All pending agenda items completed, session is adjourned with no objections.