IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Editorial Comment Resolutions Part 4 | | | | |
| Date: 2015-11-10 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGah D5.0.

* 8348, 8349, 8352, 8355, 8356, 8357, 8359, 8360, 8361, 8362
* 8365, 8366, 8367, 8368, 8370, 8371, 8372, 8373, 8374, 8375
* 8376, 8377, 8378, 8379, 8380, 8381, 8382, 8383, 8384, 8385
* 8386, 8387, 8388, 8389, 8390, 8391, 8392, 8393, 8394, 8395
* 8396, 8397, 8398, 8399, 8400, 8401, 8402, 8403, 8404, 8405

Revisions:

- Rev 0: Initial version of the document that contains comment resolutions for the above listed CIDs except for:

8395, 8392, 8385, 8383, 8382, 8380, 8379, 8367

# PARS I

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8348 | Hunter, David | 10.36 | "S1G Relay": this is not the name of a frame, field, etc., so in IEEE 802.11 this term does not use initial caps. | Replace "Relay" with "relay". | Accepted |
| 8349 | Hunter, David | 10.36 | "S1G Relay is a mechanism that allows to increase the coverage area of an AP,": the name of a mechanism does not take initial caps, an article is missing, and "that allows to increase" is broken English. Replace this text. | Replace "S1G Relay is a mechanism that allows to increase the coverage area of an AP," with "The S1G relay is a mechanism for expanding the coverage area of an AP." | Accepted |
| 8352 | Hunter, David | 10.37 | "STA, and its architecture is illustrated in Figure 9-104 (S1G Relay Architecture).": this reference violates two rules: references to figures, tables, etc. need to be about objects that either have already been presented (such as earlier in Clause 4) or will be presented in the same subclause; and the General Description is not a list of pointers to other sections, but is an introduction to the concepts that will be used in the rest of the standard. | Delete ", and its architecture is illustrated in Figure 9-104 (S1G Relay Architecture)". | Accepted |
| 8355 | Hunter, David | 10.43 | "to the next STA which may be the destination STA, or another S1G relay STA.": the comma needs to separate the independent and dependent clauses, not two phrases joined by an "or". | Replace "next STA which may" with "next STA, which may" and replace "STA, or another" with "STA or another". | Accepted |
| 8356 | Hunter, David | 10.52 | "MAC header (PV0 or PV1)": this is the first use of "PV0" and "PV1" in the text, so both need definitions ( such as "protocol version 0 (PV0)" ). However, that is not sufficient for this introductory clause. The meanings of "protocol version 0" and "protocol version 1" need to be described first. | Either provide an introduction to "protocol version" and then define "PV0" and "PV1" or simply delete "(PV0 or PV1)". | Revised –  Note that both PV0 and PV1 are defined subclause 3.2. However, agree with the commenter tht the first occurrence needs to be expanded.  Replace “PV0” with “protocol version 0 (PV0)” and “PV1” with “protocol version 1 (PV1)”. |
| 8357 | Hunter, David | 11.11 | The word "group" in "Use group cipher suite" does not use an initial cap. See IEEE 802.11mc D4.3. | Replace "Group" with "group". | Accepted |
| 8359 | Hunter, David | 11.26 | "A relay AP is an AP which offers": which/that problem. | Replace "which" with "that". | Accepted |
| 8360 | Hunter, David | 11.28 | "based on destination address as described": missing an article and a comma. | Replace "based on destination address as described" with "based on the destination address, as described". | Accepted |
| 8361 | Hunter, David | 13.38 | "For an S1G STA, this parameter is set to": sounds like this process is something done by some other entity to accommodate an S1G STA. However, this action seems to be done by the S1G STA itself. | Replace "For an S1G STA, this parameter" with "In an S1G STA this parameter" | Accepted |
| 8362 | Hunter, David | 13.40 | "to awaken to receive Beacon frame as determined by": missing an article and a comma. | Replace "receive Beacon frame as determined bby" with "receive a Beacon frame, as determined by". On line 46 replace "frame as" with "frame, as". | Accepted |

# PARS II

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8365 | Hunter, David | 20.16 | "primitive shall contain a ResultCode": normative statement inside a definition (and is not part of the meaning of the defined term). In addition, the primitive is \_defined\_ to contain a ResultCode parameter in its invocation -- so "shall contain a ReultCode parameter" doesn't make any sense. | Replace: "the MLME response in the resulting MLMEJOIN.confirm primitive shall contain a ResultCode parameter whose value is not SUCCESS " with: the ResultCode parameter in the MLME's responding invocation of the MLMEJOIN.confirm primitive contains a value that is not SUCCESS." | Revised –  Agree in principle with the comment. Howerer normative statements are consistently used in clause 6. Proposed resolution is to adopt the proposed change suggested by the commenter while maintaining the normative statement.  Replace: "the MLME response in the resulting MLMEJOIN.confirm primitive shall contain a ResultCode parameter whose value is not SUCCESS " with: the ResultCode parameter in the MLME's responding invocation of the MLMEJOIN.confirm primitive shall contain a value that is not SUCCESS." |
| 8366 | Hunter, David | 20.37 | "shall not generate this primitive.": normative requirement in a definition (and is not part of the meaning of the defined term). In addition, STAs don't generate primitives. Since "is false does not" is confusing, reorder this sentence. | Replace: "is true, a STA for which the local MAC variable AuthenticationRequestTransmission is false shall not generate this primitive." with:  "is true and a STA's local MAC variable AuthenticationRequestTransmission is false, then the STA does not invoke this primitive." | Revised –  Agree in principle with the comment. Howerer normative statements are consistently used in clause 6. Proposed resolution is to adopt the proposed change suggested by the commenter while maintaining the normative statement.  Replace: "is true, a STA for which the local MAC variable AuthenticationRequestTransmission is false shall not generate this primitive." with:  "is true and a STA's local MAC variable AuthenticationRequestTransmission is false, then the STA shall not invoke this primitive." |
| 8367 | Hunter, David | 41.45 | "primitive shall contain a ResultCode": normative requirement in a definition (and is not part of the meaning of the defined term). | Replace: "tuple, the MLME response in the resulting MLME-START.confirm primitive shall contain a ResultCode parameter whose value is not SUCCESS." with: ."tuple, the MLME responds by invoking the MLME-START.confirm primitive with a ResultCode parameter whose value is not SUCCESS." | **Not addressed in this R0** |
| 8368 | Hunter, David | 44.30 | "On receipt of this primitive, the SME should operate according to": this is a normative statement that applies to operations but is being stated in a definition (and is not just part of the meaning of a defined term). | On line 30, and on page 45 line 28, page 47 line 61, page 49 line 23, page 50 line 49, page 52 line 23, page 54 lines 11 and 55, page 56 line 63, page 58 line 22, page 60 line 31, page 61 line 27, page 63 line 38, page 65 lines 3 and 47, page 67 line 50, and page 68 line 24 replace "SME should operate" with "SME operates". | Rejected –  Normative statements are consistently being used in REVmc D4.0 in clause 6 as well. |
| 8370 | Hunter, David | 104.23 | "Listen Interval field when it is carried in an S1G PPDU": it is simpler and clearer to use an adjective. | Replace the caption "Listen Interval field when it is carried in an S1G PPDU" with "S1G PPDU Listen Interval field". | Revised –  Proposed resolution is the same as for CID 8076.  Revised –  Replace the following two phrases in this subclause: “Interval field that is carried” and “Interval field when it is carried” with “Interval field carried” |
| 8371 | Hunter, David | 183.39 | "the field defined in S1G Capabilities element": doesn't say which field and is missing an article. | Replace "the field defined in S1G" with "the field with the same name that is defined in the S1G". | Accepted |
| 8372 | Hunter, David | 184.39 | "is set to 1 in ... to confirm storing of the": what is confirmed is storage, not the process of storing. | Replace "storing" with "storage". | Accepted |
| 8373 | Hunter, David | 184.48 | "set to 0 header compression request": typo -- missing words. | Replace "0 header" with "0 in the header" | Accepted |
| 8374 | Hunter, David | 233.53 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are sentences are followed with periods. | Insert periods at the ends of lines 53 and 54. | Accepted |
| 8375 | Hunter, David | 234.61 | The 11ah change to 11mc to add "frames" after "Probe Response": this is a mistake. The 11mc version is both clear and better written. | Remove the 11ah addition of "frames". | Accepted |

# PARS III

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8376 | Hunter, David | 235.61 | "using access category AC\_BE by default.": the "by default" is almost lost way at the end of this sentence. Insert it at the front to make it clear that this is the default setting. Also, "that is sensor" is missing an article. | Replace: "An S1G STA that is sensor STA shall" with: "By default an S1G STA that is a sensor STA shall" and replace: "category AC\_BE by default." with: "category AC\_BE." | Revised –  Agree in princliple. Perform the change for both sentences: Remove "by default" from both sentences, and replace "An" with " By default, an" in the beginning of the two sentences. Insert "a" between "is" and "sensor" in the first sentence of hte para. |
| 8377 | Hunter, David | 236.01 | "AC1 subfield if the value of": a longer subordinate clause needs to be separated by a comma. | Replace "subfield if the" with "subfield, if the". | Accepted |
| 8378 | Hunter, David | 236.23 | "A first virtual CS mechanism": confusing and bad English. | Replace "A first virtual CS mechanism shall be provided" with "There are two virtual CS mechansims. The first shall be provided". | Rejected –  The sentence is technically correct. The proposed change would indicate that two virtual CS mechanisms are provided by all MAC entities which is not true (only S1G has this). |
| 8379 | Hunter, David | 236.23 | Even though 11mc contains the term "MAC entity" in some locations, the "entity" part is superfluous. It is not needed here, either. Also, this compound sentence needs to be split up for clarity. | Replace "by all MAC entities, and an additonal second virtual CS mechanism shall be provided by an S1G MAC entity. The first" with "by all MACs. The second virtual CS mechanism is an additional capability that shall be provided by all S1G MACs. {New Paragraph} The first". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8380 | Hunter, David | 236.33 | "For S1G STAs, " and, below, "For non-S1G STAs, ": this writing style is confusing because it emphasizes separate types of STAs when these DCF descriptions should be about the CS mechanisms. Emphasizing the mechanisms simplifies the sentences. | Replace "For S1G STAs, the duration information is" with "Duration information in S1G STAs is". On line 54 replace the first two sentences with: "The CS mechanism combines the NAV state and the STA's transmitter status (and in S1G STAs also the RID state) with physical CS to determine the busy/idle state of the medium.". On lne 60 replace "For S1G STAs, when both NAV and RID counters are 0, the virtual CS indication is that the medium is idle; when either the NAV counter or the RID counter is nonzero the indication is that the medium is busy." with "In S1G STAs, if both NAV and RID counters are 0, the virtual CS indication is that the medium is idle, but if either is nonzero, the indication is that the medium is busy.". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8381 | Hunter, David | 236.33 | "in NDP Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0, and in NDP\_2M PS-Poll Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0.": fields are never equal to 0 -- though they might have values that are 0. | Replace "in NDP Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0, and in NDP\_2M PS-Poll Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0." with "in NDP Ack frames whose Idle Indication field value is 0, and in NDP\_2M PS-Poll Ack frames whose Idle Indication field value is 0." | Accepted |
| 8382 | Hunter, David | 236.60 | The beginning of the paragraph about the CS mechanism (starting on line 54) mentions the combination of the NAV, transmitter status and RID. However, the sentence that begins on line 60, "For S1G STAs, when both NAV and RID counters are 0,..." loses the transmitter status. Is transmitter status omitted from the S1G combined mechanism? If so, then state directly that it is. If not, then include it in this sentence. | Include transmitter status in the sentence that begins on line 60. Or combine the S1G STA statement with the DMG-with-multiple-NAV-timers statement. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8383 | Hunter, David | 237.20 | SIFS application list: adding all of the different frame names to the number already there creates confusing and perhaps incorrect statements. For instance, does the fragment "that is an immediate response to an NDP Paging frame" apply to PPDU, BlockAck frame, NDP BlockAck frame and BAT frame? And does "that is a response to an NDP Paging frame" apply to A-MPDU, (NDP) PS-Poll frame, and uplink trigger frame? | Replace the first sentence with a list whose lead-in clause is: "The SIFS shall be used prior to transmission of each of the following frames:" and follow this with a bulleted list of the frame names, each including the appropriate qualifier for that name ("that is an ..."). | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8384 | Hunter, David | 237.26 | "The SIFS shall be used by an S1G AP to separate": the passive voice is vague. For instance, it hints this functionality is something that may be used by non-S1G APs. | Replace "The SIFS shall be used by an S1G AP to separate" with "An S1G AP shall use SIFS to separate". | Accepted |
| 8385 | Hunter, David | 239.29 | There are qualifiers on top of qualifiers in the paragraph that includes: "In addition to the NAV update rules", "if it is greater than", "information received from", and "except when". These overlapping rules need at least some simplification. | Replace "new NAV value if it is greater than the current NAV value, with the informaton received in the Duration field of frames of type: NDP CTS," with "new NAV value, if it receives information that the NAV is greater than the STA's current NAV value. This information shall be received in the Duration field of the following frames: NDP CTS," | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |

# PARS IV

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8386 | Hunter, David | 239.61 | "For a non-S1G STA, the 'CTS\_Time' " and "For an S1G STA, the 'CTS\_Time' ": both sound as if CTS\_Time is used somehow to identify the STA. Instead these are calculated in the STA, not for it. | Replace "For a non-S1G STA, the" with "In a non-S1G STA the" and replace "For an S1G STA, the" with "In an S1G STA the". | Accepted |
| 8387 | Hunter, David | 239.62 | "NDPTxTime as calculated in 9.3.2.4a.2": actually, 9.3.2.4a.2 doesn't do any calculating, though it does some specifying. | Replace "NDPTxTime as calculated in" with "NDPTxTime, as specified in". | Accepted |
| 8388 | Hunter, David | 240.12 | "based on the values of the RXVECTOR parameters ... and CH\_BANDWIDTH of the received frame as described": the "of the received frame" is lost in the middle of a long sentence. Also, the "as described" starts a subordinate thought, so needs to be separated by a comma. | Replace "of the RXVECTOR parameters" with "of the received frame's RXVECTOR parameters", and replace "CH\_BANDWIDTH of the received frame as described" with "CH\_BANDWIDTH, as described". Likewise, in the sentence below (on line 17), insert a comma after "value" and before "which is defined". And on lines 50 and 51 replace "counter as defined" with "counter, as defined" and replace "update) when the" with "update), when the". | Accepted |
| 8389 | Hunter, David | 240.57 | "A member PPDU is a": this definition comes a bit late, as both "member PPDU" and "nonmember PPDU" are used in the paragraph above this one. | Move the sentence "A member PPDU is a ... the receiving STA." to its own paragraph on line 48. Also move the sentence on page 241 line 5 ("A PPDU that .. Is a nonmember PPDU.") into this new paragraph. | Accepted |
| 8390 | Hunter, David | 240.57 | "is a PPDU received by a STA and which was transmitted by a STA": the "which was" is unnecessary and confusing. | Replace "PPDU received by a STA and which was transmitted by" with "PPDU received by a STA and transmitted by". | Revised –  Same as CID 8020. Replace the sentence with: “A member PPDU is a PPDU transmitted by a STA that is a member of the same BSS of the receiving STA.” |
| 8391 | Hunter, David | 240.65 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are sentences are followed with periods. | Insert periods at the ends of line 64 and page 241 line 2. | Accepted |
| 8392 | Hunter, David | 241.21 | "except when the PPDU either contains a valid nonzero Duration field that uddates the NAV ... or it is intended to the S1G STA in which case": confusing. And what does "intended to the S1G STA" mean? | Replace "updates the NAV as described ... the NAV) or it is intended to the S1G STA in which case the RID" with "updates the NAV, as described ... the NAV), or it is intended to be received by the S1G STA. In both of these cases the RID". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8393 | Hunter, David | 241.27 | "If the PPDU is ... frame the" and "If the PPDU is not ... frame the": subordinate clauses need to be separated by commas. | On both lines 26 and 27 replace "frame the" with "frame, the". | Accepted |
| 8394 | Hunter, David | 241.30 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are not sentences are not followed with punctuation. | Delete the periods a the ends of lines 30, 32 and 35. | Accepted |
| 8395 | Hunter, David | 241.41 | "The RID ... is omitted in the figure because it is 0 ... while the RID is reset for the STA to which the Data was addressed.: huh? One "RID" is the sort of thing that is in a figure; the other "RID" is reset for a STA. This is using one word to mean very different things -- and in the same sentence. | Replace "The RID for STAs that receive but not that of the Data frame is omitted ... in this example) while the RID is reset for the STA to which the Data was addressed." with "For STAs that receive ... but not that of the Data frame, the RID counter is omitted in the figure because it is 0 (i.e, ... in this example). But for the STA to which the Data was addressed, the RID is reset." [Somewhat better, but needs a better description than "is 0" as a contrast to "is reset". Or just show the RID counter in the figure...] | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |

# PARS V

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8396 | Hunter, David | 242.03 | "as described below:" needs to be followed by text that completes this sentence. But what follows is a separate paragraph. | Replace the colon with a period. | Accepted |
| 8397 | Hunter, David | 242.28 | Need to keep headings on their tables. | Lock the table caption and the table heading to the table's cells (found on the next page). | Accepted |
| 8398 | Hunter, David | 243.39 | "is equal to the time in microseconds, required": a single comma separates the subject from is verb. | Replace "time in microseconds, required" with "time, in microseconds, required". | Accepted |
| 8399 | Hunter, David | 244.52 | "NOTE--NDP\_1M CTS frame is": missing an article. | Replace "NDP\_1M" with "The NDP\_1M". Likewise, on page 245 line 5 replace "if link adaptation procedure" with "if the link adaptation procedure". | Accepted |
| 8400 | Hunter, David | 245.10 | "adjusted by subtraction of aSIFSTime": the adjustment is made via the process of subtracting. | Replace "by subtraction of" with "by subtracting the value of". | Accepted |
| 8401 | Hunter, David | 245.18 | "with which the non-AP STA is associated to.": extraneous "to". | Delete "to" from "is associated to." | Accepted |
| 8402 | Hunter, David | 245.32 | "shall not support the Dual CTS Protection procedure as defined in": indicates the process of \_not\_ supporting the procedure is defined in the subclause. Doubt that implication was intended. | Replace "procedure as define in" with "procedure defined in". | Accepted |
| 8403 | Hunter, David | 246.20 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are sentences are followed with periods. | Insert periods at the ends of lines 18, 24, 32, 37, 55, 58 and 59. | Accepted |
| 8404 | Hunter, David | 250.34 | "the value in the Duration field of the NDP CTS frame shall protect the pending transmission plus possibly an (NDP) Ack frame." what does "possibly" mean inside a shall statement? | Replace "protect the pending transmisssion plus possibly and (NDP) Ack frame." with "protect the pending transmission and may protect a resulting (NDP) Ack frame." | Rejected –  It means that not all frames that follow the CTS frame elicit an Ack frame (e.g., Ack policy is BlockAck) as such it is possible to have an Ack following the frame but not a certainty. Also please note that the same terminology is used in REVMc D4.0 P1263L61:  “A duration value in the frame protects the pending transmission, plus possibly an Ack frame.” |
| 8405 | Hunter, David | 251.54 | Need to keep headings on their tables. | Lock the table caption and the table heading to the table's cells (found on the next page). | Accepted |