IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Editorial Comment Resolutions Part 2 | | | | |
| Date: 2015-11-09 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGah D5.0.

* 8197, 8191, 8188, 8185, 8184, 8180, 8179, 8176, 8175, 8173
* 8172, 8171, 8170, 8168, 8167, 8164, 8163, 8162, 8161, 8159
* 8158, 8157, 8154, 8153, 8152, 8151, 8150, 8149, 8148, 8144
* 8140, 8139, 8138, 8128, 8126, 8125, 8124, 8122, 8120, 8119
* 8118, 8117, 8115, 8114, 8113, 8112, 8111, 8110, 8109, 8107

Revisions:

- Rev 0: Initial version of the document containing resolutions for the CIDs listed above except for:

8180, 8176, 8168, 8164, 8163, 8149, 8128, 8126

Rev 1: Some changes to resolutions for CID 8175, 8111, removed resolutions for 8109 (re-assing to MAC), 8140 (take care in future revision)

## PARS I

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8197 | ZHENG, SHOUKANG | 240.51 | PHY-RX-START should be PHY-RXSTART. | Replace "PHY-RX-START" with "PHY-RXSTART" in both L51P240 and L14P241. | Accepted |
| 8191 | Stephens, Adrian | 370.41 | The second column of this table uses binary coding unnecessarily. It also splits a field into two parts. | Replace with decimal encoding. Either merge the leftmost 2 columns or split the Change Width field into a 1-bit and a 4-bit field. i.e. the structure of the table should match that of the frame format after these changes. | Revised –  Remove “(B0)” and “(B1-B4)” from the first row and replace “field” with “subfield”. Insert “Primary” before the first occurrence of “Channel Width” and “BSS” before the second occurrence of it in the first row. Replace binary values with decimal in the second column.  In the second row, third column of Table 8-248z make the following changes: Replace the first sentence with: ”Bitmap of B0-B4 indicates the primary channel width, and the operating channel widths, 1/2/4/8/16 MHz.”, and replace the second sentence with: “The Primary Channel Width subfield, located in B0 of this field, and the BSS Operating Channel Width subfield, located in B1-B4 of this field, are defined in Table 10-27 (S1G BSS operating channel width).” |
| 8188 | Stephens, Adrian | 363.52 | Lots of instances of "For a non-S1G STA" near here. The point is this is not done for a STA, but by it. | Rewording is trivial: "If a non-S1G TDLS peer STA chooses to start" | Revised –  Perform the proposed change.  In the next paragraph, replace: “For an S1G STA, if a TDLS peer STA” with “If an S1G TDLS peer STA”.  Replace the first paragraph of subclause 10.23.6.4.4 with “Switching from a wideband off-channel direct link to a 20 MHz, 1 MHz, or 2MHz off-channel direct link is established through a TDLS channel switch. A non-S1G STA operating on a wideband off-channel direct link shall accept a requested switch to a 20 MHz direct link. An S1G STA operating on a wideband off-channel direct link shall accept a requested switch to a 1 MHz or 2 MHz direct link.”  Remove the second paragraph of 10.23.6.4.4. |
| 8185 | Stephens, Adrian | 349.48 | "shall additionally select", I don't know how to "shall additionally". | Delete "additionally". | Accepted |
| 8184 | Stephens, Adrian | 345.31 | This para is too constipated. | Break it up a bit. | Revised –  Break it into three paragraphs. |
| 8180 | Stephens, Adrian | 322.14 | Figure 9-98 doesn't follow IEEE-SA style. | Remove the shading in three places.  Ditto remaining figures in this subclause. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8179 | Stephens, Adrian | 319.35 | "and the omni Beacon frame transmission" -- dnt bbrvt nncsrly | omni -> omnidirectional  Make this change globally. | Accepted |
| 8176 | Stephens, Adrian | 315.8 | Figure 9-96 uses colour and shading unnecessarily. The point of the style is that, when printed, this page will probably not show the shading at all, or will show it as a pattern of dots. | Remove the shading and indicate the channelness in some other way such as with horizontal lines. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8175 | Stephens, Adrian | 314.38 | "CTS2SELF" - there is no such term. | Replace with "CTS to self" | Revised  Replace with “CTS-to-self” |
| 8173 | Stephens, Adrian | 295.23 | A 20-line paragraph gives me indigestion just looking at. And you expect me to read that? | Break up the first para into 2 or 3 pieces.  Ditto at 295.58. | Revised –  Break this paragraph into three paragraphs.  Break the paragraph in 295L58 into two paragraphs. |

## PARS II

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8172 | Turner, Michelle | 0.0 | This draft meets all editorial requirements. |  | Rejected –  The comment is invalid. |
| 8171 | Stephens, Adrian | 278.23 | "a much longer period of time", is akin to saying "Daz washes whiter". Comparisons need something to be compared to. | Indicate what this is longer than. | Revised –  It is not necessary to indicate with respect to what. Proposed change is to remove “ much longer”.  Remove “much longer”. |
| 8170 | Stephens, Adrian | 277.63 | "8 microseconds" -- style error | Change to "8 <mu>s". Correct all 12 instances of regex "[0-9] microseconds" | Accepted |
| 8168 | Stephens, Adrian | 270.6 | "dec()" the case to decimal operator is a red herring. Base 10 doesn't come into it anyway. | If you feel compelled to have an operator use "val()" describes as the "value" operator. But note other locations don't need this operator, e.g. at 271.42.  Likewise for all dec() operators in the standard. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8167 | Stephens, Adrian | 269.5 | "subfields of the S1G Capabilities element is equal to 1" -- grammar | "is" -> "are". Likewise the other sibling bullets. | Revised –  Actually it is the other way around.  Replace “subfields” with “subfield” in each of the bullets. |
| 8164 | Stephens, Adrian | 486.43 | The indentation, and therefore the logical structure, of this list is unclear. | Create a table for the multichannel sample rate item and reference it from the list. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8163 | Stephens, Adrian | 477.25 | This equation is pretty far away from IEEE-SA equation style. | Conform to IEEE-SA equation style. Specifically create short terms to replace the "sermon in a variable name" variables. Add a where statement, with a separate para defining each short term. The [MHz] units indication is not used in IEEE-SA style. Instead, you could define a name for the 0.5 MHz term, (e.g. F\_S), and define it in the where list "F\_S has the value 0.5 MHz and is the frequency separation between adjacent channels" | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8162 | Stephens, Adrian | 463.21 | I'm not sure how the spacing of this equation has become excessive. I suspect it indicates that the equation is not in native framemaker format. | Ensure all equations are in native framemaker format, and the default "medium size" font, size and spacing has been applied. | Accepted |
| 8161 | Stephens, Adrian | 462.37 | More gratuitous font size changes. | Please review all equations and ensure that medium equation size has been used, except in NOTEs, where it should be small. | Accepted |
| 8159 | Stephens, Adrian | 458.55 | Figure 24-16 is missing the "Bits:" row, according to WG style. | Add missing row. | Accepted |

## PARS III

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8158 | Stephens, Adrian | 457.55 | Gratuitous change of font | Restore the default font for the rhs of the equals sign. | Accepted |
| 8157 | Stephens, Adrian | 446.36 | "Note-1: " - wrong format | replace with "NOTE 1<em-dash>" | Revised –  As instructed (also for note 2). |
| 8154 | Stephens, Adrian | 436.30 | A bit of work is necessary on Figure 24-7. | There is no need for left turned text. Make all text normal orientation and resize widths to accomodate. There should be a space in the "B19B22" heading - generally the range bit labelling should line up pretty close to the left and right cell margins. The "Bits:" row is missing from the bottom of the table. Likewise Figure 24-8. | Revised –  Restructure Figure 24-7 and Figure 24-8 as instructed in the proposed change. |
| 8153 | Stephens, Adrian | 433.16 | The symbol for "minus" is not a hyphen, but an "en-dash". Not sure what the hyphens by themselves are saying. | Replace hyphens as minus with an en dash. Replace hyphens in otherwise blank cells with something unambiguous, e.g. "N/A" and add a table bottom row (straddled) with "NOTE-- N/A = not applicable".  Likewise at 442.14. | Revised –  As instructed for Table 24-9, 24-12, And Table 24-13. |
| 8152 | Stephens, Adrian | 431.44 | Some of these equations use "large" equation fonts, and others "medium". Medium is consistent with the surrounding text and should be used consistently. | Change equation size to medium at lines 24, 29, 44. Also at 434.58, .59; 435.2, .4. | Accepted |
| 8151 | Stephens, Adrian | 427.23 | This figure contains some style issues. | Please make the following changes: Font to Arial throughout. Blue arrows to black. Shading behind the rounded rectangles to be removed. | Accepted |
| 8150 | Stephens, Adrian | 404.38 | "NOTE 1--In" -- you only need to number notes if there is more than one of them. | Delete " 1" here. | Accepted |
| 8149 | Stephens, Adrian | 322.6 | "following the omniportion of the S1G\_LONG format" -- techies and secret societies love to create new terms, and hate to tell others what they mean. This is a new word, the term has not be defined, so you are following in these best traditions. Of course that doesn't help anybody who has not been through multiple years of 802.11ah understand what it is trying to say. | Given that the editor is undoubtedly paid by the word, I would encourage the word to be replaced by a self-defining phrase, such as "omnidirectional portion". Alternatively, create a definition for this term (not my preference).  Likewise "omnipreamble". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8148 | Stephens, Adrian | 387.15 | "S1G 2 MHz Duplicated PPDU" -- The amendment seems to be in two minds about whether to use "duplicated" (58 instances) or "duplicate" (177 instances). The baseline is very clear that it should be "duplicate". | Review all uses of "Duplicated", and when it refers to the format of the PPDU, change to "duplicate". | Accepted |
| 8144 | Stephens, Adrian | 587.24 | The notes that have got unstuck from the table shouldn't be here. | Move the notes to a merged last row of the table they refer to. | Accepted |

## PARS IV

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8140 | Stephens, Adrian | 213.28 | "STAs that encounter an element ID they do not recognize in the frame body of a received PV1 Management frame ignore that element and continue to parse the remainder of the PV1 Management frame body (if any) for additional elements with recognizable element IDs." -- this is not a description of frame format. | Move cited text into clause 9. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8139 | Stephens, Adrian | 199.11 | "TWT Information field" -- for consistency the "information" items do not include field/element in these tables. | Remove the first "field" in this cell.  Review the "Action field format" tables in the draft and remove unnecessary "field" or "element". | Accepted |
| 8138 | Stephens, Adrian | 198.38 | "The Category field is set to the value for S1G, specified in Table 8-46 (Category values). The S1G Action field is set to the value for Header Compression, specified in Table 8-406b (S1G Action field values)."  This duplicates normative specification elsewhere, and can be safely removed.  Also, the description of the Dialog Token might be done once in 8.6.25.1. | Remove at least the cited text. Remove similar text in 8.6.25-8.6.28. | Revised –  Proposed resolution is to use the same terminology that is used in REVmc D4.0.  Replace the cited text with: “The Category field is defined in 8.4.1.11 (Action field).  The S1G Action field is defined in 8.6.25.1 (S1G Action field).”  Perform similar changes throughout 8.6. |
| 8128 | Stephens, Adrian | 175.24 | These tables are unnecessarily bulky. | Change "Meaning" column to "Item requested" and "Definition" to "Reference". Insert the type of item requested in the "Item requested" and a reference to the subclasue defining the item in the "Reference" column. Do the same with the remaining tables in this subclause. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8126 | Stephens, Adrian | 173.31 | "The Information Not Available field is set to 1 if the relay cannot provide the requested information in the fixed fields of S1GRelay Discovery element."  This is a section on frame formats, not what the relay can or cannot do. | Replace with something like: "The Information Not Available field is set to 1 if the information is not provided in the fixed fields."  As this creates an exception to statements such as "When UL Mean Data Rate field is included in an S1GRelay Discovery element in a Probe Request frame, it indicates the UL mean data rate of the direct link between the non-AP STA and AP in the unit of 100 kbps.", edit each of these statements to indicate something along the lines of "When the Information Not Available field is set to 0, and when the UNL Mean Data Rate field is included in an SIGRelay ...".  Do this throughout this subclause. Or find a more intelligent way to specify the exclusions to avoid contradiction. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8125 | Stephens, Adrian | 172.5 | "The UL Mean Data Rate field is 1 octet. " -- unnecessary and ungrammatical.  There is no need to state this. The figures are normative.  Likewise at line 41: "The Delay Bound Requirement/Channel Utilization field is 0 or 1 octet and is an optional field." - the figure indicates both the size and the optionality. | Remove cited text, and similar occurrences throughout this subclause. | Accepted |
| 8124 | Stephens, Adrian | 173.11 | "Relay Discovery Info field" -- this is a poor choice of name. The field is not providing information, but controlling the interpretation of the rest of the frame. | Rename globally to "Relay Discovery Control field". | Accepted |
| 8122 | Stephens, Adrian | 165.46 | "Maximum Transmission Width (Bit 1 Bit 0)" -- unless these bits are separate fields, the value should be specified in decimal. | Remove the (Bit 1 Bit 0) and turn the values below into decimal.  Review all tables and ensure that enumerated integer values are shown as integers - excepting tables that are quoted from the baseline. | Accepted |
| 8120 | Stephens, Adrian | 164.26 | The xref for 9.7.11a.3 doesn't appear to be "live". This means it will get out of date as numbering changes (a valid concern), and there is no pdf hotlink (a less valid concern). | Review the draft for non-hot links. This can be done in the frame-maker sources using regular expressions such as:  [0-9]+\.[0-9]+[a-z]\*.\ Table [0-9]+- Figure [0-9]+- Equation [0-9]+-  These will match the "dead" or manual references, but not the live ones.  An alternative strategy is to modify the xref formats to remove the parenthetical text (in a scratch working copy). Create a pdf. Create txt from it. Search in the txt for regular expressions (e.g. using Antconc) such as \.[0-9]+ \( | Accepted  Note: This is a best effort exercise for the editor. |
| 8119 | Stephens, Adrian | 158.13 | The characters "us" do not stand for microseconds. | Use <greek-mu>s in this cell.  Search for "<number> us". There are 41 of which one "4 user" is a false positive. Globally replace the remainder. | Accepted |

## PARS V

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8118 | Stephens, Adrian | 156.1 | This is a long table. The table header does not repeat. | Move the table header row to a "real" table header row so it repeats. | Rejected –  The table header does repeat (refer to its repetitions in P157L1, 158L1 etc. |
| 8117 | Stephens, Adrian | 154.17 | "S1G Capabilities Info field" -- abbreviating things is generally bad, because people will not apply the abbreviation consistently. If there is no incentive to abbreviate, do not do so. | Rename this field "S1G Capabilities Information field" globally. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  ~~S1G Capabilities Info~~  S1G Capabilities Information …  …  S1G Capabilities ~~Info~~ Information … |
| 8115 | Stephens, Adrian | 152.25 | "The least significant bit of the field corresponds to 256 microseconds." -- this is not how to specify units  Note also that values are represented using the units symbols. So "in microseconds" and "in units of 1234 <mu>s" are both correct. | Delete cited sentence and change first sentence of para to read: "The Nominal Minimum Wake Duration field indicates the minimum amount of time, in units of 256 <mu>s, that" | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  The Nominal Minimum Wake Duration field ~~contains~~ indicates the minimum amount of time, in units of ~~time~~ 256 s, that the TWT requesting STA expects that it needs to be awake in order to complete the frame exchanges associated with the TWT flow identifier for the period of TWT wake interval, where TWT wake interval is the average time that the TWT requesting STA expects to elapse between successive TWT SPs~~. The least significant bit of the field corresponds to 256 microseconds~~. |
| 8114 | Stephens, Adrian | 151.7 | "The value in the Zero Offset Present subfield indicates". Avoid unnecessary decoration. According to the conventions in subclause 1.4 of REVmc D4.2+, "value of" and "contents of" is not necessary when refering to a field - i.e., it is implicit. | Replace cited text with "The Zero Offset Present subfield indicates". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  ~~The value in the~~ The Zero Offset Present subfield… |
| 8113 | Stephens, Adrian | 151.4 | "A value of 0x00" -- why the sudden, and unnecessary, switch to hex? | "The value zero" or "The value 0" | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  ~~A~~ The value ~~of 0x00~~ zero in … |
| 8112 | Stephens, Adrian | 149.44 | The "\*" is not the way to signal a table footer note. | Here Replace \* with "See NOTE." At line 61, replace "\*" with "NOTE<em-dash>" | Accepted –  **How it looks like:**  TWT responding STA accepts the TWT request with the TWT ~~parameters\*~~ parameters (See NOTE) indicated in the TWT element transmitted by the responding STA  …  ~~\*~~NOTE --TWT Parameters are: TWT, Nominal Minimum Wake Duration, TWT Wake Interval and TWT Channel subfield values indicated in the element. |
| 8111 | Stephens, Adrian | 148.62 | too many words | Use an "otherwise" to express the converse. | Revised –  Replace “ A STA that transmits a TWT element with the TWT Request subfield equal to 0 is a TWT responding STA.” with “Otherwise, it is a TWT responding STA.”  **How it looks like:**  A STA that transmits a TWT element with the TWT Request subfield equal to 1 is a TWT requesting STA. ~~A STA that transmits a TWT element with the TWT Request subfield equal to 0 is a TWT responding STA.~~  Otherwise, it is a TWT responding STA. |
| 8110 | Stephens, Adrian | 145.14 | The leftmost legend is "Bit:", which is wrong. | Change to "Bits:". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  Bits: |
| 8109 | Stephens, Adrian | 143.56 | TGmb and TGmc have moved away from "multicast" to "group", as this is closer to what is in the format of the MAC address field.  As 802.11ah has introduced the "multicast AID" terminology, it should follow the spirit of the usage in its baseline. | Change "Multicast AID" to "Group AID" throughout. | To be re-assigned to MAC. |
| 8107 | Stephens, Adrian | 141.7 | TGmc has changed single operand "floor()" and "ceil()" to use the equivalent glyphs throughout. See 1.5 in REVmc D4.0 | Change all single-operand floor and ceiling functions to the glyph form throughout. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  ~~PSnumber = floor(SBSTA/ PSlength)~~  PSnumber = SBSTA/ PSlength |