IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Editorial Comment Resolutions Part 1 | | | | |
| Date: 2015-11-09 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGah D5.0:

* 8106, 8105, 8103, 8077, 8076, 8070, 8068, 8063, 8062, 8061
* 8060, 8059, 8058, 8057, 8056, 8055, 8052, 8051, 8050, 8049
* 8047, 8046, 8044, 8042, 8039, 8032, 8030, 8028, 8027, 8026
* 8025, 8024, 8023, 8022, 8021, 8020, 8019, 8018, 8017, 8016
* 8015, 8014, 8013, 8012, 8011, 8010, 8009, 8008, 8007, 8006

Revisions:

- Rev 0: Initial version of the document contains resolutions for all listed CIDs except for:

8105, 8059, 8042, 8025, 8022, 8016, 8014, 8013, 8007

## PARS I

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8106 | Stephens, Adrian | 140.33 | This is not how to organize a "where list" | Read IEEE-SA style guide & conform.  The changes to make here: 1. A where on a line by itself 2. An indented para per variable starting with the name of the variable and then its definition | Revised –  Execute the changes as instructed. Also remove commas, dots at the end of each line containing the variable definitions.  **How it looks like:**  Where  *Plength* is the length (in bits) of a page indicated in the Page Bitmap field  *PBlength* is the length of the page (in octets) indicated in the Page Bitmap field  *PScount* is the value indicated in the Page Slice Count subfield  *PSlength* is the value indicated in the Page Slice Length subfield  ~~where~~ *~~Plength~~* ~~is the length (in bits) of a page indicated in the Page Bitmap field,~~ *~~PBlength~~* ~~is the length of the page (in octets) indicated in the Page Bitmap field,~~ *~~PScount~~* ~~is the value indicated in the Page Slice Count subfield,~~ *~~PSlength~~* ~~is the value indicated in the Page Slice Length subfield.~~ |
| 8105 | Stephens, Adrian | 138.26 | I encourage the 802.11ah editors to read the IEEE-SA style guide on equations and apply it throughout the amendment. | For example here, this would become something like:  "... The RAW duration indicated by the corresponding RAW assignment, D\_RAW, is given, in units of microseconds, by:  D\_RAW = D\_SLOT x N\_RAW  where  D\_SLOT is the RAW slot duration, in microseconds  N\_RAW is the value of the Number of Slots subfield"  In the above, underscore should be interpreted as subscripting.  The essence is: 1. Short variable names, not "self descriptive names" 2. A where list in which each variable on the RHS of the equation is fully defined | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8103 | Stephens, Adrian | 135.12 | This method of describing repeated fields has been replaced in REVmc with an alternative, which should also be applied throughout 802.11ah. One of the advantages of the new method is that it makes the multiplicity explicit. For example, 8.4.2.188 does not say that there is a minimum of one RAW Assignment field. | In Figure 8-577ae replace all the "RAW Assignment" columns with a single column containing a "RAW Assignments" field, of variable length.  At 135.20 insert a new para: "The RAW Assignments field contains one or more RAW Assignment subfields." Then change references to the "RAW Assignment field" to "RAW Assignment subfield".  Please make these changes throughout the amendment to the other Clause 8 structures that use the "old" repeating instances style. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  …one or more RAW Assignment ~~fields~~subfields. Each RAW Assignment ~~field~~ subfield contains…  …  The RAW Assignments field contains one or more RAW Assignment subfields.  …  **Figure 8-577ag—RAW Assignment ~~field~~ subfield** **format**…  …  …the number of ~~sectorized group IDs~~ GrpID subfields in the GrpIDs field following this field.  ~~The~~ Each GrpID ~~field~~ subfield is 6 bits and identifies…  …  The Reachable Addresses field contains one or more Reachable Address subfields …  The Reachable Address fields subfields indicate the MAC addresses that can be reached through the relay STA. The format of the Reachable Address field subfield …  …  The Probe Response Group Bitmap field indicates which Probe Response Option Bitmap ~~field~~subfield is included in the Short Probe Response Option element. If Probe Response Option Bitmap ~~field~~ subfield *i* is included in the Short Probe Response Option element, then *i*-th bit in the Probe Response Group Bitmap field is set to 1.  The Probe Response Option Bitmaps field contains one or more Probe Response Option Bitmap subfields.  ~~One or more Probe Response Option Bitmap fields(#MDR) are optionally included in the Short Probe Response Option(#MDR) element.~~ Each Probe Response Option Bitmap ~~field(#MDR)~~ subfield is one octet and indicates  indicates that the values in the Sectorized Group ID ~~fields~~ subfields  The Sectorized Group IDs field contains one or more Sectorized Group ID subfields.  ~~The~~ Each Sectorized Group ID ~~field(#MDR)~~ subfield is 4 bits and indicates a new sectorized group ID that it is associated with the receiver STAs. A value of 15 in the Sectorized Group ID ~~field~~ subfield is reserved for padding bits. |
| 8077 | Stephens, Adrian | 104.24 | "Listen Interval field when it is carried in an S1G PPDU" - this creates a contradiction with the existing figure. | Show the existing figure and add "when it is not carried in an S1G PPDU". | Revised –  Change the title of Figure 8-69 as follows: “Listen Interval field when it is carried in a non-S1G PPDU.”  **How it looks like:**  ***Change the title of Figure 8-69 as follows:***  **Figure 8-69—Listen Interval field when it is carried in a non-S1G PPDU.** |
| 8076 | Stephens, Adrian | 104.7 | It's a subtle linguistic point, but "The Listen Interval field that is carried in a non-S1G PPDU is illustrated in Figure 8-69 (Listen Interval field)." is grammatically wrong. | It's a subtle linguistic point, but "The Listen Interval field that is carried in a non-S1G PPDU is illustrated in Figure 8-69 (Listen Interval field)." is grammatically wrong. | Revised –  Replace the following two phrases in this subclause: “Interval field that is carried” and “Interval field when it is carried” with “Interval field carried”  **How it looks like:**  The Listen Interval field ~~that is~~ carried in a non-S1G…  …  The Listen Interval ~~field that is~~ field carried…  …  **Figure 8-69a—Listen Interval ~~field when it is~~ field** **carried in an S1G PPDU** |
| 8070 | Stephens, Adrian | 91.24 | "the STA expected to process"  There are use issues with this, 1) passive voice; 2) anthropomorphic language. | Reword to avoid use of passive voice and anthropomorphic verbs (e.g., desired, hoped, expected, long-awaited). | Revised –  Replace “expected to” with “ that could”.  **How it looks like:**  …of the STA ~~expected to~~ that could … |
| 8068 | Stephens, Adrian | 90.14 | "Frame Control field subfield values within S1G Control frames when Subtype subfield is not equal to 3 and not equal to 10" -- Ah we're slipped into "war and peace" mode again. | Define concise terminology for this condition - perhaps defining a named variant of the control frame, and then use it here - i.e. "Frame Control field subfield values within a <new-term> Control frame. | Revised –  Replace “that are not S1G Control frames” with “carried in a non-S1G PPDU” (twice). Replace “S1G Control frames” with “Control frames carried in an S1G PPDU” (twice). Remove “when Subtype subfield is not equal to 3 and not equal to 10” from the title of Figure 8-18a and insert a sentence at the end of the paragraph that precedes it: “The Subtype subfield in the Frame Control field of Control frames carried in S1G PPDUs is not set to 3 or 10.”  **How it looks like:**  The subfields within the Frame Control field of Control frames ~~that are not~~carried in a non-S1G ~~Control frames~~ PPDU are…  …  **Figure 8-18—Frame Control field subfield values within Control frames ~~that are not~~carried in a non-S1G ~~Control frames~~PPDU**  …  The subfields within the Frame Control field of ~~S1G~~ Control frames carried in an S1G PPDU are set as…  …  … The Subtype subfield in the Frame Control field of Control frames carried in S1G PPDUs is not set to 3 or 10.  …  **Figure 8-18a—Frame Control field subfield values within ~~S1G~~ Control frames ~~when Subtype subfield~~****~~is not equal to 3 and not equal to 10~~carried in an S1G PPDU.** |
| 8063 | Stephens, Adrian | 82.5 | Please resist creating new editorial conventions. When in doubt check for a convention in the baseline. "[MHz]" is not a convention used in the baseline. | Change [MHz] to use parentheses here (2 instances) and throughout (a total of 9 instances) | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  Channel center frequency = Channel starting frequency + 0.5[(MHz] ) × ChannelCenterFrequencyIndex  …  Primary channel center frequency = Channel starting frequency + 0.5[(MHz] ) × Primary Channel Number  …   |  | | --- | | Minimum BSS BW [MHz]  Minimum BSS BW (MHz) | | …  Maximum BSS BW [MHz]  Maximum BSS BW (MHz) | |
| 8062 | Stephens, Adrian | 81.22 | "Poll Type value B15 B14" This is unnecessary. In REVmc, we have frequently removed unnecessary "binary encoded "values and replaced them with decimal. | Replace heading with "Value" or "Poll type" or "Poll Type field" (note capitalization). Replace values with decimal equivalents. | Revised –  Replace “Poll Type value B15 B14” with “Poll Type field” and convert its binary values into decimal. |
| 8061 | Stephens, Adrian | 78.60 | "non-DMG and non-S1G STA, by an S1G STA and by a DMG STA."  Please, this is unnecessary multiplication of prefixes. Where will it end? | Change cited text to: "DMG, S1G, and other STAs" | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  The More Data field is 1 bit in length and is used differently by a ~~non-DMG~~ DMG, S1G, and ~~non-S1G STA, by an S1G STA~~ other STAs.~~and by a DMG STA.~~ |

## PARS II

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8060 | Stephens, Adrian | 77. 53 | "modify the last value of Subtype for Reserved as follows:" is followed by another editing instruction. | Review all use of "follows:". Where it introduces a table, ensure the table style is set to "anywhere". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  ***Change Table 8-1 by adding a row for the TACK frame and modify the last value of Subtype for Reserved as follows:*** |
| 8059 | Stephens, Adrian | 76. 16 | The caption on this figure now reads like an excerpt of most of "War and Peace". Likewise the caption at line 36 gives "the rise and fall of the Roman empire" a good run for its money.  This makes them hard to read, and increases the likelihood that the reader picks the wrong figure. | Define a term for this condition, introduce that term in this subclase, and consider adding to the 802.11-specific definitions and caption Figure 8-2 "... in <new term> frames".  Alternatively you might want to use something like "Basic variant Frame Control field", and build a table of conditions that establishes the type of variant (see Block Ack for an example).  Likewise for the other variants of the control field. | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8058 | Stephens, Adrian | 75. 27 | The insertions have made a long paragraph into an over-long paragraph. There is no additional charge for whitespace. | Split the para into one or two paras. Perhaps a general para, then a general para per PV0 and PV1. The editors are encouraged to insert whitespace and structure elsewhere in the draft as they do their editing job to avoid "creeping overlongnessification" of baseline text. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  The MAC frame format comprises a set of fields that occur in a fixed order in all frames. Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) depicts the general MAC frame format for protocol version 0 (PV0) MPDUs and Figure 8-727 (PV1 frame format) depicts the general MAC frame format for protocol version 1 (PV1) frames.  The first 2 bits of the first subfield (Protocol Version) of the Frame Control Field and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) are present in all PV0 MPDUs and PV1 MPDUs, including reserved types and subtypes.  For PV0 MPDUs, t~~T~~he first three fields (Frame Control, Duration/ID, and Address 1) and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) constitute the minimal frame format and are present in all these frames, including reserved types and subtypes. The fields Address 2, Address 3, Sequence Control, Address 4, QoS Control, HT Control, and Frame Body are present only in certain frame types and subtypes. Each field is defined in 8.2.4 (Frame fields). For PV1 MPDUs, the fields constituting the minimal frame format are defined in 8.8 (MAC frame format for PV1 frames).  The ~~MAC frame format comprises a set of fields that occur in a fixed order in all frames. Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) depicts the general MAC frame format for protocol version 0 (PV0) MPDUs and Figure 8-727 (PV1 frame format) depicts the general MAC frame format for protocol version 1 (PV1) frames. The first 2 bits of the first subfield (Protocol Version) of the Frame Control Field and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) are present in all PV0 MPDUs and PV1 MPDUs, including reserved types and subtypes. For PV0 MPDUs, tThe first three fields (Frame Control, Duration/ID, and Address 1) and the last field (FCS) in Figure 8-1 (MAC frame format) constitute the minimal frame~~ format ~~and are present in all these frames, including reserved types and subtypes. For PV1 MPDUs, the fields constituting the(#6016)minimal frame format is defined in 8.8 (MAC frame format for PV1 frames). The fields Address 2, Address 3, Sequence Control, Address 4, QoS Control, HT Control, and Frame Body are present only in certain frame types and subtypes. Each field is defined in 8.2.4 (Frame fields). The format~~ of each of the individual subtypes of each PV0 frame type is defined in 8.3 (Format of individual frame types), the format of each PV1 frame type is defined in 8.8 (MAC frame format for PV1 frames), and the format of NDP CMAC frames is defined in 8.9 (NDP CMAC frames). The components of management frame bodies are defined in 8.4 (Management and Extension frame body components). The formats of Action frames bodies (PV0 and PV1) are defined in 8.6 (Action frame format details). |
| 8057 | Stephens, Adrian | 75. 20 | This is the first instance, I think, of BDT in the text. It's not in the abbreviations, so it's not obvious what it means. | Add BDT to the abbreviations. | Revised –  Order the abbreviations in alphabetical order.  **How it looks like:**  BDTbidirectional TXOP  …  BDTbidirectional TXOP |
| 8056 | Stephens, Adrian | 74. 11 | For consistency with the baseline, text in figures should be arial. | Change text in Figure 7-5 to arial throughout. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  **Figure 7-5—The channel-list parameter elements to the 1 MHz, 2 MHz, 4 MHz, 8 MHz and 16 MHz channel width** |
| 8055 | Stephens, Adrian | 72. 64 | "generated by a VHT STA, and an S1G STA"  This is arguably correct, but also awkward. | Less surprising: "generated by a VHT or S1G STA"  Make the change globally (4 instances of "and an SIG STA"). | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  …by a VHT or S1G STA, and an S1G STA contains at most…  …  A VHT ~~STA and an~~ or S1G ~~STA~~ STA shall not…  …  A DMG ~~STA and an~~ or S1G ~~STA~~ STA shall not use PSMP.  …  An HT ~~STA and an~~ or S1G ~~STA~~ STA shall not transmit a PPDU… |
| 8052 | Stephens, Adrian | 67. 54 | "MLME-RELAYACTIVATE.indication" -- the name of this primitive does not match others in the same parent. | Change cited text to "MLME-S1GRELAYACTIVATE.indication" | Revised –  Replace "RELAYACTIVATE" with "S1GRELAYACTIVATE" throughout the draft.  **How it looks like:**  MLME-RELAYACTIVATE S1GRELAYACTIVATE.request request primitive  …  **MLME-~~RELAYACTIVATE~~S1GRELAYACTIVATE.indication** |
| 8051 | Stephens, Adrian | 42. 50 | The following MLME primitives support the signaling of AID switch request/response procedure.  It would be nice to have a reference here to that procedures, which allows a reader of the .pdf to click through and find it. | Review the new MLME-SAP primitive "general" subclauses and add references to the related procedures. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  …AID switch request/response procedureprocedure described in 10.48 (Dynamic AID assignment operation).  …  …signaling of a sync control procedureprocedure described in 9.46 (Synchronization (Sync) frame operation).  …  ~~The following MLME primitives support the signaling of a STA information announcement procedure.~~  The following MLME primitives support the signaling of a STA information announcement procedure described in 9.51.5.3 (Implicit Ack procedure) and 10.48 (Dynamic AID assignment operation).  …  …of an EDCA Parameter Set update procedureprocedure described in 9.2.4.2 (HCF contention-based channel access (EDCA)).  …  …of an activity specification procedureprocedure described in 10.51 (Support for energy limited STAs).  …  …of TWT Setup procedureprocedure described in 9.44 (Target wake time (TWT)).  …  …a TWT Teardown procedureprocedure described in 9.44.8 (TWT Teardown).  …  …of a Sectorized Group ID List managementmanagement described in 9.50 (Sectorized beam operation).  …  …of Header Compression procedureprocedure described in 9.55 (Generation of PV1 MPDUs and header compression procedure).  …  …a reachable address update procedureprocedure described in 9.51 (S1G Relay operation).  …  …of control response MCS negotiation procedureprocedure described in 9.7.6.5.4b (Control response MCS negotiation).  …  …of relay activation and deactivation procedureprocedure described in 9.51 (S1G Relay operation). |
| 8050 | Stephens, Adrian | 307. 4 | "sync frame", if this is a reference to the "Sync frame" it should say so, otherwise is is an informal reference to any frame performing a sync function. | If there is only one kind of "sync frame" replace all "sync frame" with "Sync frame". | Rejected –  This is an informal reference to any frame performing a sync function (as mentioned in P307L50 the NDP CTS frame should be used as a sync frame). |
| 8049 | Stephens, Adrian | 341. 4 | "Flow Suspension action frame" -- there is no such thing.  There is a "Flow Control Action frame", which is the class of frames. Or the individual frame name doesn't include "action" in it. | Change all uses of "Flow [Suspension|Resumption] action frame" by removing "action". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  —~~a Flow Suspension action frame~~  —a Flow Suspension frame  …  …the Flow ~~Suspension action~~ Suspension frame listed…  …  Flow ~~Resumption action~~ Resumption frame to cancel…  …  …the TA field of the Flow ~~Resumption action~~ Resumption frame.  …  …receives a Flow ~~Resumption action~~ Resumption frame…  …  …by the TA field of the Flow ~~Resumption action~~ Resumption frame.  …  Flow suspension in response to Flow Suspension Action Suspension frame or NDP ACK frame…  …  Flow resumption upon receiving a Flow Resumption Action Resump-tion frame…  …  …by the TA field of the Flow ~~Suspension action~~ Suspension frame. |

## PARS III

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 8047 | Stephens, Adrian | 15. 59 | "(S1G) Beacon frame or (Short) Probe Response" -- this kind of text creates endless maintenance headaches - i.e. searching for all "SIG Beacon frames"  There is no need to be this clever. | Replace with "Beacon frame, S1G Beacon frame, Probe Response frame, or Short Probe Response frame"  Likewise expand any "(SIG) and "(Short)" used in this context throughout the document. Also note its "An SIG" at 15.01. | Accepted |
| 8046 | Stephens, Adrian | 14. 26 | The "Type" column is not doing anything useful, and is not consistent with the baseline.  See, for example, REVmc D4.0 p150 lines 40-63. | In the "Type" column replace "As defined in ..." with "S1G Relay Discovery element".  Review all new parameters in your Clause 6 and make matching changes whenever the "Type" field merely repeats what is in the Valid Range field. | Revised –  Excecute the proposed change only when the Type column contains an element. Replace its contents with “As defined in frame format” when the Type column contains the reference to a frame format. |
| 8044 | Stephens, Adrian | 13. 38 | "For an S1G STA, " -- this usage has attracted comment in REVmc. They are being replaced by "In an <x> STA".  The point is that this is not being done by a 3rd party for the STA, but is being done by or in the STA itself. | Please review all uses of "For an [non-]S1G" and replace with an accurate term. | Revised –  As instructed but use PPDU instead of STA when the context is a field of an S1G frame. E.g., Operation mode field. Also dont apply the change when dot11MultiBSSIDActivated is true. Also do not change when it is part of an Except for" expression (check one last time)  **How it looks like:**  The value of the AID is in the range 1-2007 ~~for~~ in a non-S1G STA, and 0-8191 ~~for~~ in an S1G STA.  …  ~~For~~ In a non-S1G STA, t~~T~~he format of the MFB subfield…  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA, the format of the MFB subfield…  …  For an S1G STA:  In an S1G STA:  Set to 0 for 1 MHz  Set to 1 for 2 MHz  Set to 2 for 4 MHz  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA, the value of ListenInterval  …  The Operating Mode field in an S1G PPDU is shown in Figure 8-115a (Operating Mode field when it is carried in an S1G PPDU).  …  For an S1G STA:  In an S1G STA:  Set to 0 for 1 MHz  Set to 1 for 2 MHz  Set to 2 for 4 MHz  …  ~~For~~ In a non-S1G STA:  Set to 0 for *NSS* = 1  …  For an S1G STA:  In an S1G STA:  Set to 0 for *NSS* = 1  Set to 1 for *NSS* = 2  …  For In an S1G STA, the value…  …  For In an S1G STA, the WNM-Sleep interval…  …  ~~For~~ In a non-AP STA:  Set to 0: the non-AP STA…  …  ~~For an AP:~~  In an AP:  Set to 0: the AP does…  …  ~~For~~ In a non-S1G STA, ~~T~~the “CTS\_Time”  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA, the "CTS\_Time" shall  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA, “NAV indicates idle” means  …  ~~For~~ In a non-S1G ~~STAs~~STA, w~~W~~hen …  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA the EIFS  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA, non-STBC S1G Beacon  …  ~~For~~ In a non-S1G STA, if ~~If~~ the…  …  ~~For~~ In an S1G STA, if the BSSBasicS1GMCS\_NSSSet… |
| 8042 | Stephens, Adrian | 11. 26 | "A relay AP is an AP which offers" -- that / which confusion. Which should generally be preceeded by a comma or a preposition. | Incorrect uses need to be replaced with ", which" or "that" as appropriate. The following uses are incorrect:  next STA which may be non-AP STA which is associated (2x)  a channel which is not the primary channel  in a manner which should approximate  AID and which started upon (2x)  allow STAs which don't listen  is an SID which contains (2X) bit fields which describe the NDP CMAC  3-bit value which identifies  BSS AIDs which are present Compressed SSID which is (2x) Duration field which depends  exchange sequences which can lead  S1G-MCS which indicate (2x)  RESPONSE\_INDICATION value which is defined  MAC address which don't have (and expand "don't" to do not) Negotiation Request which is either  Network Option which is defined (2x)  next STA which may be the  OBSS AP which observes (5x) of STAs which are allowed  4 page slices which appear in the DTIM integer which corresponds STA which most recently  STA which has (7x) frame which is (2x) scheduled TWT which is within RAW which may be  beam which covers  An SST STA which selected STA and which was transmitted PRAW which is specified  m which is located channels which are allowed (2x) STAs which are Sectorized  MCS which is (2x)  STAs which respond the AP which sector the AP which sends  non-TIM mode which also wants  element which contains group which contains  element which includes | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8039 | Stephens, Adrian | 10. 23 | "\*Note:" -- this is not how to do this. | Replace with a framemaker footnote. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  \*Note: some NOTE— Some NDP CMAC frames… |
| 8032 | Stephens, Adrian | 4. 56 | "but requires to transmit" - not English | change to "transmits" | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  … but requires to transmit transmits at least one PS-Poll … |
| 8030 | Stephens, Adrian | 4. 44 | "An EL STA is a ..." Definitions are a noun phrase, not a sentence. | Change this to read "A ..." Review all definitions and turn any whole sentences into noun phrases. | Accepted |
| 8028 | Seok, Yongho | 243. 39 | "is equal to the time in microseconds, required": a single comma separates the subject from is verb. | Replace "time in microseconds, required" with "time, in microseconds, required". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  … is equal to the ~~time~~ time, in microseconds, … |
| 8027 | Seok, Yongho | 242. 28 | Need to keep headings on their tables. | Lock the table caption and the table heading to the table's cells (found on the next page). | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  **Table 9-1b—NormalTXTime duration based on RXVECTOR's parameters** |
| 8026 | Seok, Yongho | 242. 3 | "as described below:" needs to be followed by text that completes this sentence. But what follows is a separate sentence. | Replace the colon with a period. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  An S1G STA updates the value of the RID counter by setting it as described below~~:~~ . |

## PARS IV

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 8025 | Seok, Yongho | 241. 41 | "The RID ... is omitted in the figure because it is 0 ... while the RID is reset for the STA to which the Data was addressed.: huh? One "RID" is the sort of thing that is in a figure; the other "RID" is reset for a STA. This is using one word to mean very different things -- and in the same sentence. | Replace "The RID for STAs that receive but not that of the Data frame is omitted ... in this example) while the RID is reset for the STA to which the Data was addressed." with "For STAs that receive ... but not that of the Data frame, the RID counter is omitted in the figure because it is 0 (i.e, ... in this example). But for the STA to which the Data was addressed, the RID is reset." [Somewhat better, but needs a better description than "is 0" as a contrast to "is reset". Or just show the RID counter in the figure...] | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8024 | Seok, Yongho | 241. 30 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are not sentences are not followed with punctuation. | Delete the periods a the ends of lines 30, 32 and 35. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  —The RXTIME defined in Equation 24-65 for S1G\_SHORT/S1G\_1M formats~~,~~  —The RXTIME defined in Equation 24-66 if the PPDU has S1G\_LONG format and is an SU PPDU~~,~~  —The RXTIME defined in Equation 24-66 minus (*TDSTF* + *NLTF DDLTF* + *TSIG-B*) if the PPDU has S1G\_LONG format and is an MU PPDU~~.~~ |
| 8023 | Seok, Yongho | 241. 27 | "If the PPDU is ... frame the" and "If the PPDU is not ... frame the": subordinate clauses need to be separated by commas. | On both lines 26 and 27 replace "frame the" with "frame, the". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  If the PPDU is an NDP CMAC ~~frame~~ frame, the PSDU\_RXTIME is equal to 0. If the PPDU is not an NDP CMAC ~~frame~~ frame, the PSDU\_RXTIME is calculated based on multiple RXVECTOR parameters and is equal to: |
| 8022 | Seok, Yongho | 241. 21 | "except when the PPDU either contains a valid nonzero Duration field that uddates the NAV ... or it is intended to the S1G STA in which case": confusing. And what does "intended to the S1G STA" mean? | Replace "updates the NAV as described ... the NAV) or it is intended to the S1G STA in which case the RID" with "updates the NAV, as described ... the NAV), or it is intended to be received by the S1G STA, In both of these cases the RID". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8021 | Seok, Yongho | 240. 65 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are sentences are followed with periods. | Insert periods at the ends of line 64 and page 241 line 2. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  —UPLINK\_INDICATION is 1 and the PARTIAL\_AID indicates that the PPDU is addressed to the AP with which the non-AP STA is associated.  —UPLINK\_INDICATION is 0 and the COLOR indicates that the PPDU is generated by the AP with which the STA is associated. |
| 8020 | Seok, Yongho | 240. 57 | "is a PPDU received by a STA and which was transmitted by a STA": the "which was" is unnecessary and confusing. | Replace "PPDU received by a STA and which was transmitted by" with "PPDU received by a STA and transmitted by". | Revised –  Replace the sentence with: “A member PPDU is a PPDU transmitted by a STA that is a member of the same BSS of the receiving STA.”  **How it looks like:**  A member PPDU is a PPDU transmitted by a STA that is a member of the same BSS of the receiving STA. A PPDU that is not a member PPDU is a nonmember PPDU. |
| 8019 | Seok, Yongho | 240. 57 | "A member PPDU is a": this definition comes a bit late, as both "member PPDU" and "nonmember PPDU" are used in the paragraph above this one. | Move the sentence "A member PPDU is a ... the receiving STA." to its own paragraph on line 48. Also move the sentence on page 241 line 5 ("A PPDU that .. Is a nonmember PPDU.") into this new paragraph. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  A member PPDU is a PPDU transmitted by a STA that is a member of the same BSS of the receiving STA. A PPDU that is not a member PPDU is a nonmember PPDU.  …  A member PPDU is a PPDU received by a STA and which was transmitted by a STA that is a member of the same BSS as the receiving STA.  …  A PPDU that is not a member PPDU is a nonmember PPDU. |
| 8018 | Seok, Yongho | 240. 12 | "based on the values of the RXVECTOR parameters ... and CH\_BANDWIDTH of the received frame as described": the "of the received frame" is lost in the middle of a long sentence. Also, the "as described" starts a subordinate thought, so needs to be separated by a comma. | Replace "of the RXVECTOR parameters" with "of the received frame's RXVECTOR parameters", and replace "CH\_BANDWIDTH of the received frame as described" with "CH\_BANDWIDTH, as described". Likewise, in the sentence below (on line 17), insert a comma after "value" and before "which is defined". And on lines 50 and 51 replace "counter as defined" with "counter, as defined" and replace "update) when the" with "update), when the". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  … update its RID counter based on the values of the received frame’s RXVECTOR parameters FORMAT, …  UPLINK\_INDICATION, and ~~CH\_BANDWITH of the received frame~~ CH\_BANDWITH, as described in this subclause.  …, PREAMBLE\_TYPE and the RESPONSE\_INDICATION ~~value~~ value, which is defined per type of NDP CMAC frame in Table 9-1a (RESPONSE\_INDICATION value for NDP CMAC frames). |
| 8017 | Seok, Yongho | 239. 62 | "NDPTxTime as calculated in 9.3.2.4a.2": actually, 9.3.2.4a.2 doesn't do any calculating, though it does some specifying. | Replace "NDPTxTime as calculated in" with "NDPTxTime, as specified in". | Revised –  Replace the phrase with “NDPTxTime, which is specified".  **How it looks like:**  … CTS frame that is equal to ~~NDPTxTime as calculated~~ NDPTxTime, which is specified in 9.3.2.4a.2 (RID update). |
| 8016 | Seok, Yongho | 239. 29 | There are qualifiers on top of qualifiers in the paragraph that includes: "In addition to the NAV update rules", "if it is greater than", "information received from", and "except when". These overlapping rules need at least some simplification. | Replace "new NAV value if it is greater than the current NAV value, with the informaton received in the Duration field of frames of type: NDP CTS,"  with "new NAV value, if it receives information that the NAV is greater than the STA's current NAV value. This information shall be received in the Duration field of the following frames: NDP CTS," | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |

## PARS V

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 8015 | Seok, Yongho | 236. 33 | "in NDP Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0, and in NDP\_2M PS-Poll Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0.": fields are never equal to 0 -- though they might have values that are 0. | Replace "in NDP Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0, and in NDP\_2M PS-Poll Ack frames with Idle Indication field equal to 0." with "in NDP Ack frames whose Idle Indication field value is 0, and in NDP\_2M PS-Poll Ack frames whose Idle Indication field value is 0." | Accepted |
| 8014 | Seok, Yongho | 236. 33 | "For S1G STAs, " and, below, "For non-S1G STAs, ": this writing style is confusing because it emphasizes separate types of STAs when these DCF descriptions should be about the CS mechanisms. Emphasizing the mechanisms simplifies the sentences. | Replace "For S1G STAs, the duration information is" with "Duration information in S1G STAs is".  On line 54 replace the first two sentences with: "The CS mechanism combines the NAV state and the STA's transmitter status (and in S1G STAs also the RID state) with physical CS to determine the busy/idle state of the medium.".  On lne 60 replace "For S1G STAs, when both NAV and RID counters are 0, the virtual CS indication is that the medium is idle; when either the NAV counter or the RID counter is nonzero the indication is that the medium is busy." with "In S1G STAs, if both NAV and RID counters are 0, the virtual CS indication is that the medium is idle, but if either is nonzero, the indication is that the medium is busy.". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8013 | Seok, Yongho | 236. 23 | Even though 11mc has "MAC entity" in some locations, the "entity" part is superfluous. The compound sentence needs to be split up for clarity. | Replace "by all MAC entities, and an additonal second virtual CS mechanism shall be provided by an S1G MAC entity. The first" with "by all MACs. The second virtual CS mechanism is an additional capability that shall be provided by all S1G MACs. {New Paragraph} The first". | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8012 | Seok, Yongho | 236. 23 | "A first virtual CS mechanism": confusing and bad English. | Replace "A first virtual CS mechanism shall be provided" with "There are two virtual CS mechansims. The first shall be provided". | Rejected –  The sentence is technically correct. The proposed change would indicate that two virtual CS mechanisms are provided by all MAC entities which is not true (only S1G has this). |
| 8011 | Seok, Yongho | 236.1 | "AC1 subfield if the value of": a longer subordinate clause needs to be separated by a comma. | Replace "subfield if the" with "subfield, if the". | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  …indicated in the PS-Poll ACI ~~subfield~~ subfield, if the value of the element's STA Type subfield includes the STA's type (see 10.50.7 (S1G BSS type and STA type)). |
| 8010 | Seok, Yongho | 235.61 | "using access category AC\_BE by default.": the "by default is almost lost way at the end of this sentence. Insert it at the front to make it clear that this is the default setting. Also, "that is sensor" is missing an article. | Replace "An S1G STA that is sensor STA shall" with "By default an S1G STA that is a sensor STA shall" and repalce "category AC\_BE by default." with "category AC\_BE." | Revised –  Agree in princliple. Perform the change for both sentences: Remove "by default" from both sentences, and replace "An" with " By default, an" in the beginning of the two sentences. Insert "a" between "is" and "sensor" in the first sentence of hte para.  **How it looks like:**  ~~An~~ By default, an S1G STA that is a non-sensor STA shall transmit PS-Poll frames, PS-Poll+BDT frames and NDP PS-Poll frames using access category ~~AC\_VO by~~ AC\_VO. By default~~. An~~ , an S1G STA that is a sensor STA shall transmit PS-Poll frames, PS-Poll+BDT frames and NDP PS-Poll frames using access category ~~AC\_BE by default~~AC\_BE. |
| 8009 | Seok, Yongho | 233.53 | Per the IEEE Style Manual, items in a list that are sentences are followed with periods. | Insert periods at the ends of lines 53 and 54. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  —The RAW is optionally present.  —The TWT is optionally present. |
| 8008 | Seok, Yongho | 10.31 | "An S1G STA is also a QoS STA, but does not support HCCA. An S1G STA is a non-mesh STA.": clearer to put into one sentence. | Replace "An S1G STA is also a QoS STA, but does not support HCCA. An S1G STA is a non-mesh STA." with "An S1G STA is not a mesh STA, but is a QoS STA (though it does not support HCCA)." | Revised –  Replace the two sentences with "An S1G STA is a non-mesh STA and a QoS STA that does not support HCCA."  **How it looks like:**  An S1G STA is also a QoS STA, but does not support HCCA. An S1G STA is a non-mesh STA  An S1G STA is a non-mesh STA and a QoS STA that does not support HCCA. |
| 8007 | Seok, Yongho | 10.26 | "enable either reducing the energy consumption of an STA or increasing the achievable range between an S1G AP and an S1G non-AP STA.": reducing and increasing are not the sorts of things that can be enabled -- though reduction and increase can. Wouldn't it be more accurate to say "usable" rather than "achievable"? And, since the first half is just about a STA, why not make the rest about an AP and a non-AP STA (note that no claims are being made about every AP and STA, just some of them)? | "enable either reducing the energy consumption of a STA"or increasing the achievable range between an S1G AP and an S1G non-AP STA." with " work to either reduce a STA's energy consumption or increase the usable range between an AP and a non-AP STA. " | **NOT ADDRESSED in R0.** |
| 8006 | Seok, Yongho | 4.50 | "A non-sensor STA may not": normative term used in a definition. | Replace "may" with "might". Also delete the extraneous "as" on line 51. | Accepted  **How it looks like:**  A non-sensor STA may might not have the power and traffic volume limitation as expected expected for a sensor STA. |