IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| REVmc BRC Telecon Minutes Aug 28 |
| Date: 2015-08-28 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Mark Hamilton | Ruckus Wireless | 350 W. Java Dr.Sunnyvale, CA | +1-303-818-8472 | mark.hamilton@ruckuswireless.com |
| Adrian Stephens | Intel |  |  | adrian.p.stephens@intel.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

R0 of this document contains the minutes for the 802.11REVmc BRC Telecon on August 28, 2015 (10-noon ET).

1. **Minutes for 802.11 TGmc** REvmc BRC for Friday August 28, 2015 – called to order by Dorothy STANLEY (HP/Aruba) 10:00 am
	1. Introduction of Officers: Chair: Dorothy STANLEY (HP/Aruba); Vice-Chair: Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus Wireless); Vice-Chair/Secretary: Jon ROSDAHL (CSR); Editor: Adrian STEPHENS (Intel); Co-Editors: Edward AU (Marvel) & Emily Qi (Intel)
	2. Attendance: Dorothy Stanley (HP/Aruba), Adrian Stephens (Intel), Edward Au (Marvell), Emily Qi (Intel), Mark Hamilton (Ruckus), Mark Rison (Samsung), Dan Harkins (HP/Aruba), Sigurd Schelstraete (Quantenna), Scott Marin (Self), Stephen McCann (Blackberry)
	3. Review Patent Policies
		1. No Issues identified
	4. **Review agenda**
		1. 1. Proposed Agenda:

1. Call to order, patent policy, attendance

2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution

11-15-1010 – Adrian Stephens

11-15-762 – Mark Rison

Check status of CID 6565 per Cambridge action item in minutes 8.6.7.4

Check status of CIDs 6562, 6563, 6075, see 11-15-0762

Check on status of 6375, 6376, 6377 (11w related), see 11-15-0762

Check on status of CID 5226

Any additional available CIDs

Potential Motion topics:

CIDs 6583, 6031 (in Motion MAC-AU (Aug 28) in 11-15-0565r15

CIDs 6588, 6081, 5062 in Motion MAC-AV in 11-15-0565r15

CIDs 6603, 6456, 6314 in GEN Cambridge F2F-2 tab in 11-15-0665r7

CID 5171 in GEN Aug Conf-14 tab in 11-15-0665r7

4. AOB

Next meeting: in Bangkok. Bangkok motions include:

Motion on CIDs 6482, 6496, 6480 - email reminders sent (aAirPropagationTime related)

Motion on CID 6506 - email reminders sent (CCA-ED "detect" terminology).

Please review beforehand.

5. Adjourn

* + 1. . Suggested we discuss which timeslots in Bangkok make sense, or would be requested, for prepared motions. We’ll do that as part of AOB.
		2. Agenda approved as proposed.
	1. **Editor’s report**
		1. Review period for editing defects ends tonight.
		2. Hope to have Draft 4.2 posted before the Bangkok meeting.
	2. **Comment resolution, document 11-15/1010r4**:
		1. CID 5046 (EDITOR)
			1. Noted that Mark Hamilton and Stephen McCann have action on this CID.
		2. CID 6788 (EDITOR)
			1. Mark Rison has related CIDs.
			2. Proposed resolution: REVISED. Make changes in 11-15/1010r5 under CID 6788. This ensure that “buffered” and “bufferable” are used correctly in the context of the power saving mechanisms.
			3. No objection. Mark ready for motion.
		3. CID 6680 (MAC)
			1. Took resolution from email thread.
			2. There was question if dot11ExcludeUnencrypted applies to only WEP. Concluded it didn’t matter, it was better to have the sentence at 2016.27 apply to all data frames.
			3. Proposed resolution: REVISED. Make the changes under CID 6680 in 11-15/1010r5. These changes reword text to avoid the use of the term “WEP MPDU”.
			4. No objection. Mark ready for motion.
		4. CID 6235 (MAC), 6587 (MAC)
			1. Too many changes/instances (796) to actually detail each. So, question is whether to leave it to Editor’s discretion to make the changes.
			2. Would like to at least tidy up the DMG items, they are confusing.
			3. Why do we need a specific term for each MCS? A: It has different meanings in different contexts.
			4. Propose resolution: REJECTED. The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the changes that will satisy the commenter can be determined.
			5. The commenter did volunteer to work on this. If those changes become available, they group may be willing to reconsider.
			6. No objection. Mark ready for motion.
		5. CID 5038 (EDITOR)
			1. Skip for now.
		6. CID 5310 (EDITOR)
			1. Proposed Resolution: REVISED. Incorporate changes in 11-15/758r7 under CID 6707. These changes make the change proposed by the commenter, in addition to restructuring the description of subelements.
		7. CID 6712 (EDITOR)
			1. While a search-and-replace method has been discovered, there are still way too many strings and locations to reasonably do. Propose to do only the top 30 (by quantity).
			2. Do we attack the top 30, or the top 30 that have only a single character before or after the hyphen as those look particularly odd? Straw Poll:
				1. Top 30: 111111
				2. Top 30 with single character: 1
				3. Don’t care: 11
			3. Will this help with being able to search for terms, since many search engines are confused by end-of-line hyphenation? It might help, but the problem is bigger, so not completely.
			4. Proposed resolution: REVISED. In the following list of terms replace hyphens by non-breaking hyphens. [List has count, then term]:

1349 non-AP

 621 A-MSDU

 492 A-MPDU

 414 non-HT

 280 L-SIG

 187 A-BFT

 176 S-AP

 162 00-0F-AC

 159 U-APSD

 150 CF-End

 137 VHT-SIG-A

 137 CF-Poll

 127 HT-SIG

 123 VHT-SIG-B

 122 Non-HT

 120 HT-greenfield

 112 MA-UNITDATA

 108 MM-SME

 108 HT-mixed

 104 L-LTF

 100 L-STF

 95 HT-immediate

 84 Non-AP

 81 HT-LTF

 73 S-PCP

 72 CF-Pollable

 69 GCR-SP

 66 R1KH-ID

 63 HT-delayed

 62 PS-Poll

Additionally, This comment will also be passed to the IEEE-SA publication editor for consideration.

(Note to editor, non-breaking hyphen is coded as “\+” in the frame-maker find & replace operation. Also, don’t attempt to flag changes.)

* + - 1. No objection. Ready for motion
	1. **Comment resolution on Mark Hamilton’s “Discuss” CIDs** (done from the database, and shared on WebEx) (Thanks to Adrian for the notes)
		1. CID 6291 (MAC)
			1. Discussion: “Reserved for DMG STAs” is unnecessary for CFP operation because CFP operation is not supported by DMG STAs.
			2. REVISED (MAC: 2015-08-28 14:57:58Z): Delete "Reserved for DMG STAs" from Table 8-5 (both locations, including PCF).
			3. No objection. Ready for motion
		2. CID 6430, 6341, 6342 (MAC)
			1. Discussion: no objection to the principle of the comment.
			2. CID 6430:
				1. 1111.46, exclude
				2. 1188.43. Last 3 rows 8.3.3.13 (p641) duplicate the last 3 rows of the Action frame format. So it is safe to remove them.
				3. For the mesh frames, need to remove the Last-2, Last-1, Last row definitions in the action field, which mirror the Action frame format.
			3. **Action:** Mark Hamilton will look in more detail and produce a submission covering these 3 CIDs containing detailed changes, where necessary.
		3. CID 6442 (MAC)
			1. Propose Reject.
				1. There are 175 instances of "immediately" (many of which are used in a completely different sense), and 306 of "immediate" (many of which are clearly not related to this comment). As a result, any globally applied meaning would have to be crafted very carefully so as to not include unintended contexts. (Note, especially, use in clause 10, PHY clauses, Annex S, etc.)
				2. Further, by removing the text from clause 8, and putting an "instructions for interpretation" type of sentence deep with a subclause of clause 9, is going to leave readers of clause 8 hopelessly confused. This change would need to be 1.4, or somewhere similar - which compounds the concern stated above.
				3. Thus, a global statement applied to the meaning of "immediate" or "immediately" seems overly dangerous.
				4. Further, the commenter has not identified specific changes that are needed, to enable individual, localized changes that would resolve the comment.
			2. This comment needs a submission. Assigned to Mark Rison.
				1. **Action:** Mark Rison
		4. CID 6452 (MAC)
			1. Mark Rison indicates this will be part of his later submission.
		5. CID 6496 (MAC)
			1. Mark Rison indicates this will be part of his later submission.
			2. **Action**: All – please review this in: Doc 11-15/752r<latest>
		6. CID 6775 (MAC)
			1. Mark Rison indicates this will be part of his later submission.
		7. CID 6426 (MAC)
			1. Mark Rison indicates this will be part of his later submission.
		8. CID 6490 (MAC)
			1. Mark Rison indicates this will be part of his later submission.
	2. **Comment resolution, document 11-15/762r8**
		1. CIDs 6426 (MAC), 6490 (MAC)
			1. Okay with presented material.
			2. Proposed resolution: REVISED. Make the changes the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6426 and 6490 in 11-15/762r8, which clarify the duplicate filtering rules as they pertain to BA operation.
			3. No objection. Mark ready for motion.
		2. CIDs 6676 (GEN), 6677 (GEN)
			1. No immediate comments, but would like some time to review off-line, with additional experts. Mark R will start an email thread, and keep reflector aware of progress.
		3. CID 6364 (MAC), 6365 (MAC), 6366 (MAC)
			1. Clearly, proposed changes conflict. So, need to choose one.
			2. Proposal is to accept 6364 change, and reject the other two referencing 6364.
			3. Discussion that nobody seems to have a problem understanding or implementing this, so we could reject all three as not needed. On the other hand, it could be made clear.
			4. Straw Poll:
				1. A. Accept 6364: 111
				2. B. Reject 6364: 11
				3. C. Abstain: 11
			5. Proposed resolution, CID 6364: ACCEPTED.
			6. Proposed resolution, CID 6365: REJECTED. This is not the correct order. See CID 6364.
			7. Proposed resolution, CID 6366: REJECTED. It is clearer and more consistent to show the assignments to KCK and KEK separately. See CID 6364.
			8. No objection to the above. Mark all three ready for motion.
		4. CIDs 6562, 6563, 6075
			1. Updated per discussion in Cambridge F2F.
			2. Need to flip the sense of the first sentence in 10.2.3.5 bullet (1), to usual form “In order to do <x> a STA shall do <y>”
			3. Clarify that the MIB attribute is not referenced in the standard.
			4. Mark will rework and bring back.
	3. **MOTION – Motion 152**
		1. Suggested wording is to approve the resolutions to:
* CIDs 6583, 6031 (in Motion MAC-AU (Aug 28) in 11-15-0565r15
* CIDs 6588, 6081, 5062 in Motion MAC-AV in 11-15-0565r15
* CIDs 6603, 6456, 6314 in GEN Cambridge F2F-2 tab in 11-15-0665r7
* CID 5171 in GEN Aug Conf-14 tab in 11-15-0665r7
	+ 1. Removed CID 6583 on request
		2. Removed CID 6456, as it conflicts with CID 6455 and needs the document reference fixed up. We’ll fix it up and bring it back for motion.
		3. Resulting motion:
		4. Approve the resolutions to:
* CIDs 6031 (in Motion MAC-AU (Aug 28) in 11-15-0565r15
* CIDs 6588, 6081, 5062 in Motion MAC-AV in 11-15-0565r15
* CIDs 6603, 6314 in GEN Cambridge F2F-2 tab in 11-15-0665r7
* CID 5171 in GEN Aug Conf-14 tab in 11-15-0665r7
	+ 1. Moved: Adrian Stephens, Seconded: Stephen McCann
		2. No discussion.
			1. Y: 1111111
			2. N:
			3. A: 1
		3. Motion PASSES
	1. **AOB:**
		1. Next meeting is in Bangkok F2F
		2. Note that there are motions planned for Bangkok. Please review and be prepared.
		3. Proposed agenda is in 11-15/0980r0
			1. Added Monday PM1 for Stephen McCann’s CIDs
			2. Added Monday PM1 for Adrian’s updated 11-15/1010
			3. Added Monday PM2 for Mark Rison/Mark Hamilton CIDs
	2. **Adjourned at 12:00 pm**

References:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-1010-04-000m-revmc-sb0-stephens-resolutions-part-2.doc>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0762-08-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d4-0-sbmc1.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0565-15-000m-revmc-sb-mac-comments.xls>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0665-07-000m-revmc-sb-gen-adhoc-comments.xlsx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0758-07-000m-sb0-stephens-resolutions-part-1.doc>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0980-00-000m-tgmc-agenda-september-2015.pptx>