IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| REVmc BRC Telecon Minutes July-Aug 15 | | | | |
| Date: 2015-08-03 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Dorothy Stanley | HP- Aruba Networks | 1344 Crossman Ave  Sunnyvale, CA 94089 | +1-630-363-1389 | dstanley@arubanetworks.com |
| Jon Rosdahl | CSR Technologies | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1-801-492-4023 | jrosdahl@ieee.org |

Abstract

R0 of this document contains the minutes for the 802.11REVmc BRC Telecon on July 31, 2015 (10-noon ET).

R1 of this document contains the minutes for the 802.11REVmc BRC Telecon on Aug 7, 2015 (10-noon ET).

1. **Minutes for 802.11 TGmc, teleconference on Friday July 31, 2015 –** 
   1. **Called To Order** by Dorothy STANLEY (Aruba), Chair, at 10:05 ET
   2. **Attendance:** Edward AU (Marvell) last 1.5 hours, Dorothy STANLEY (HP- Aruba Networks), Emily QI (Intel), Scott MARIN (Self), Mark RISON (Samsung), Sigurd SCHELSTAETE (Quantenna), Graham SMITH (SR Technologies) last 45 mins.
   3. **Review Patent Policy –** Reviewed patent policy slides. No issues noted. No response to the call.
   4. **Review Agenda:**

1. Call to order, patent policy, and attendance. Review and approve agenda

2.    Editor Report

3.    Motions on 11-15-565 tabs from Waikoloa

4.    Comment resolution:

1. Mark Hamilton CIDs – next time as Mark is not on the call
2. Additional available CIDs – CIDs 5940 and 5866, see document 11-15-908r1
3. 11-15-762 – Mark Rison comments
4. RAC: CIDs 6896, 6897, 6898; 6877 – Next time

5.    AOB

6.    Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion on the agenda: Item 4b added to the agenda. No objection to proceeding with the agenda as amended.
  1. **Editor’s report**
     1. Not a lot of activity since Waikoloa due to travel and holiday. Expect editing of approved comment resolutions to start next week.
  2. **Motions:**
     1. Consideration of Motion MAC-AR tab. Note that the MAC-AQ tab was already motioned in Waikoloa – Motion 138 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0726-07-000m-tgmc-agenda-july-2015.pptx> (slide 11).
        1. Request to further review resolutions for CIDs 5314, 6511, 6183, 6275.
        2. CID 5314 – resolution has extra “ marks in the bullet list items – move forward by including note in motion below.
        3. CID 6511, 6183 – makes changes to 13.5.7. Editorial comment that statement of 256 length in text is duplicative. Consider comments in a separate motion.
        4. CID 6275 – Editorial comment that introduction of “Q” parameter not required, can describe in a simpler way wihout it. Consider in a separate motion.
     2. **Motion #144** *Approve the comment resolutions in   
        The “Motion MAC-AR” tab in* [*https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0565-11-000m-revmc-sb-mac-comments.xls*](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0565-11-000m-revmc-sb-mac-comments.xls) *except for CIDs 6511, 6183, 6275 and incorporate the indicated text changes into the TGmc draft. Note to editor re: CID 5314, editor to remove double quotes in bullets.*
        1. Moved: Emily QI
        2. Seconded: Mark RISON
        3. Discussion – none
        4. **Result: Y: 4 N: 0 A: 0 Motion PASSES**
     3. **Motion #145** *Approve the comment resolutions for CIDs 6511, 6183, 6275 in the “Motion MAC-AR” tab in* [*https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0565-11-000m-revmc-sb-mac-comments.xls*](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0565-11-000m-revmc-sb-mac-comments.xls) *and incorporate the indicated text changes into the TGmc draft.*
        1. Moved: Emily QI
        2. Seconded: none
        3. Discussion – none
        4. **Result: Motion fails for lack of a second**
  3. Review document 11-15/908r1, updated per discussion to r2
     1. CID 940
        1. Sigurd reviewed the comment, his submission containing discussion of the comment and the proposed chages.
        2. Question on PSDU\_LENGTH - does not include padding. Current text has a theoretical bound. Other constraints provide further limits. Goal is to clarify this as the current text caused confusion for implementers of 11ac.
        3. Propose instead to put text in section 6.5.4.2 and/or put in all PHY tables.
        4. Most concerned with 11ac. Can include additional section reference which also provides limits. Reference to clause 8.2.4.7.1 added to the resolution.
        5. Proposed resolution: “Revised” Incorporate the text changes for CID 5940 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0908-02-000m-discussion-of-cid-5940.docx>
     2. CID 5866
        1. Reviewed the comment. Comment is satisfied by the same change as for CID 940.
     3. **Motion #146** *Resolve CIDs 5940 and 5866 as “Revised” with a resolution of “Incorporate the text changes for CID 5940 in* [*https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0908-02-000m-discussion-of-cid-5940.docx*](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0908-02-000m-discussion-of-cid-5940.docx) *.*
        1. Moved: Sigurd SCHELSTRAETE
        2. Seconded: Mark RISON
        3. Result: 5-0-0 Passes
  4. **Review of selected comments in 11-15-0762 – Mark RISON**
     1. CIDs 6375, 6376, 6377, see extensive text changes in 11-15-0762r4 (discussion begins on page 25)
        1. Mark reviewed the proposed changes. This text has had review by Jouni MALINEN.
        2. Step 4f on page 30 – retain in some form perhaps as a note, aids clarity to say explicitly that reception of a valid frame indicates a successful SA Query exchange.
        3. Several open questions remain, please review and send any comments to Mark RISON.
     2. CID 6576, see text changes in 11-15-0762r4 (page 36)
        1. Mark reviewed the comment and the proposed changes.
        2. Please review and send any comments to Mark RISON.
  5. **All Other Business**
     1. Next call is Friday, August 7th 10am Eastern.
     2. Face to face meeting in Cambridge in August, announcement has gone out. Please notify Jon Rosdahl if you plan to attend.
  6. **Adjourned at 11:55 ET.**

1. **REVmc BRC called to order at 10am by Dorothy STANLEY, Chair** 
   1. **Review Patent Policy**
      1. No issues noted
   2. **Attendance**: Dorothy STANLEY (HP-Aruba Networks); Emily Qi (Intel); Adrian STEPHENS (Intel); Mark RISON (SAMSUNG); Scott MARIN (Self); Jon ROSDAHL (CSR); Sean COFFEY (Realtek) (audio only)
   3. **Review Agenda:**

1. Call to order, patent policy, and attendance

2. Editor report

3. Comment resolution

1. Mark Hamilton MAC CIDs
2. 11-15-762 CIDs – Mark Rison
3. RAC: CIDs 6896, 6897, 6898; 6877
4. Additional available CIDs

4. AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Change to add doc 11-15/999r0 to comment resolution section
    2. Agenda approved without objection
  1. **Editor Report**
     1. Review Panel formed to review changes
     2. Progress was noted
  2. **Comment Resolution:**
  3. **Review document 11-15/999r0 – Dorothy STANLEY**
     1. Proposed resolutions to CIDs 5167, 5168, 5169, 5170, 5165. Also 5997 and 5998.
     2. CID 5167 and 5169 (MAC)
        1. Discuss proposed change
        2. Question on 1076.62 change – is it encoded or formatting ?
        3. Discussion on the changes – determined that the changes proposed were not correct as the RFC is indicating formats not encoding
        4. Proposed resolution: Revised incorporate the text changes in 11-15/999r1 for CID 5167 and 5169.
        5. No objection – mark ready for motion
     3. CID 5168 (MAC)
        1. Review the comment
        2. Discussion on the format of the naming
        3. Discussion on which RFC is being referenced
        4. P808 – defines the subelement format
        5. ANQP element is defined in clause 8.4.5.14 – no change needed here
        6. The encoding is specified in table 8-122, but the RFC is different from the commenter’s suggestion.
        7. Need to check on which RFC is to be used for the encoding
     4. CID 5170 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Iniital Proposed Resolution: Accept
        3. Small nit – the editor can change “R” to “r”
        4. Discussion on what should be the proper caption.
        5. Change Resolution: Revised: caption for Figure 8-209 to “Format of Location Configuration Information report
        6. No objection – mark ready for motion
     5. CID 5165
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed resolution: Revised Change the referenced subclause to, "10.25.3.1.2 (STA procedures to transmit a GAS Query)"
        3. No objection Mark ready for motion
     6. CIDs 5997 (MAC) and 5998 (GEN)
        1. Review comment
        2. Question on existing implementation
        3. Unsure on what the diference would be between the different RFCs noted.
        4. More investigation to be done.
        5. Note that RFC 5424 replaces RFC 3164
        6. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        7. No objection to this resolution – mark ready for motion
  4. **Review document 11-15/762r4 –Mark RISON**
     1. CID 6576 (MAC)
        1. Review comment and proposed changes
        2. Discussion on the context of the change on page 1930.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Revised, Incoprporate the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6576 in 11-15/762r4 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0762-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d4-0-sbmc1.docx>), which account for extended Key IDs.
        4. No objection – mark ready for motion
     2. CID 6716 (Editor)
        1. Review comment
        2. Use of Chinese Character in the document
        3. Need to verify the Chinese references
        4. The current table has the “Google Translate” to get the English, but we may want to use the literal Chinese.
        5. Concern that the Unicode is not consistent and the Chinese characters may not publish correctly with the font.
        6. The official language is US English, so we need to determine the correct translation rather than the transliteration.
        7. Need to find the correct English reference is, and use that instead.
        8. Action item: Emily to contact a Beijing collegue to find an official English translation
     3. CID 6820 (Editor)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Discussion on rules for capitalization and if this is a professional Editor issue.
        3. The propsed change was to capitalize “gaussian” and “legendre”
        4. Proposed Resolution: Revised – Change “boolean” to “Boolean” on p. 1692 (3x), p. 1695, p. 1696 (5x), p. 1697 (2x), p. 2016, p. 2646.

This comment will be forwarded to the IEEE-SA publications editor for consideration during publication

Change “gaussian” to “Gaussian” at 12.9, 12.10.

Change “boolean” to “Boolean” on p. 1692 (3x), p. 1695, p. 1696 (5x), p. 1697 (2x), p. 2016, p. 2646.

Change “legendre” to “Legendre” at 55.13, 1881.25.

* + - 1. The Boolean change will be done by the Technical editor and the Gaussian and Legendre will be done by the publication editor if required.
      2. Mark ready for motion.
    1. CID 5062 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. In reviewing the proposal, it was noted that the format of the changes is different from what we normally use (tracked changes).
       3. Question if the new code produces the same output as the old code.
          1. The old code does not compile, so a definitive proof cannot be done.
       4. A track changes version needs to be shown, and the formula will need to be verified to ensure that this reference implementation produces the same output.
       5. Do we really need a reference implementation? We could just remove it.
       6. More investigation will be done.
    2. CID 6496 (MAC)
       1. Review comment
       2. Discussion on when the aAirPropagationTime value is zero
          1. There was another CID 6482 that is similar
          2. R5 will be posted and Mark to ask for more discussion on these CIDs
    3. CID 6583 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Conern when “reserved” vs “ignored” has some change in possible behavior
       3. There is some more changes to be checked.
       4. Clause 11 will need to have a similar sentence for what “reserved” is for.
  1. Future plan
     1. Next telecom Friday August 14th
     2. Review RSVP list for F2F -
        1. 5-6 on the list currently
        2. Action item: Jon to send another RSVP request and report to Dorothy.
  2. Adjourned at 12:00 ET

**References:**

July 31:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0532-11-000m-revmc-sponsor-ballot-comments.xls>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0565-11-000m-revmc-sb-mac-comments.xls>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0908-02-000m-discussion-of-cid-5940.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0762-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d4-0-sbmc1.docx>

Aug 7:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0999-01-000m-sb-cid-resolutions-5167-and-more.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/15/11-15-0762-04-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11mc-d4-0-sbmc1.docx>