IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolutions for some comments on 11mc/D4.0 (SBmc1) |
| Date: 2015-06-18 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Mark RISON | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre | SJH, CB4 0DS, U.K. | +44 1223 434600 | at samsung (a global commercial entity) I'm the letter emme then dot rison |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for CIDs 6075, 6214, 6215, 6216, 6305, 6306, 6308, 6375, 6376, 6377, 6389, 6390, 6404, 6482, 6496, 6506, 6562, 6563, 6583 on 11mc/D4.0.

r1: changes made before and during BRC meeting on 2015-06-17.

r2: changes made before and during BRC meeting on 2015-06-18. CID 6482 has been left mid-way through major surgery.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6562Mark RISON | The exception for the PM bit in Probe Responses sent in response to unicast Probe Requests in an IBSS makes no sense | Get rid of this special case (in 3.2, 8.2.4.1.7 and 10.2.2.4) |
| CID 6563Mark RISON101529 | Lots of things are ambiguous/unclear in relation to power-saving signalling and mechanisms | I will propose text (not possible to give here) |
| CID 6075Mark Hamilton8.2.4.1.7566.52 | The details of when the PM subfield is valid are still a bit murky. (This is a follow-on comment to changes already made which improved things, but left a bit of work to do.) Also, PM should be discussed as a field/subfield, not a "bit". | A submission will be made by Mark Rison/Mark Hamilton with specific proposed changes. |

Discussion:

[Work in progress!]

*1) IBSS issue 1*

10.2.3.4 [IBSS] STA power state transitions says:

A STA shall set the Power Management subfield in the Frame Control field of frames containing all or part of a BU or individually addressed Probe Request frame that it transmits using the rules in 8.2.4.1.7 (Power Management field).

8.2.4.1.7 says:

In an IBSS, the Power Management field is valid only in frame exchanges as described in 10.2.3.4 (STA power state transitions).

This is circular.

*2) IBSS issue 2*

10.2.3.5 ATIM frame and frame transmission says:

l) A non-DMG STA may transmit individually addressed or group addressed Null Data frames within the ATIM window to indicate the STA’s intent to change power management modes. The STA may transition into PS mode after acknowledgments have been successfully received for all individually addressed Null Data frames or after the STA has transmitted group addressed Null Data frames at least dot11BSSBroadcastNullCount times.

The problem with using individually-addressed frames is that you never really know who’s in the IBSS. It would be far more robust (and simpler and faster too) to just spam out group-addressed frames.

Furthermore, the wording appears to allow the STA to indicate PS mode but not transition to it, and does not address transitioning back to AM.

*3) IBSS issue 3*

10.2.3.4 STA power state transitions says a STA’s PM mode is indicated in frames containing all/part of a BU, and in certain Probe Request frames. 10.2.3.5 ATIM frame and frame transmission, though, says that the STA signals changes to PM mode in (QoS) Null frames. Such frames do not contain all/part of a BU (and are not Probe Request frames, obviously).

*4) IBSS issue 4*

If you’re going to be transmitting ATIMs to announce traffic, then why not use the PM bit in them to indicate your PM mode? This avoids sending both ATIMs and (QoS) Nulls. Unfortunately, like (QoS) Nulls, ATIMs do not contain all/part of a BU.

Note the definition of BU is:

**bufferable unit (BU)**: An MSDU, A-MSDU (HT STAs and DMG STAs only) or bufferable MMPDU that is buffered to operate the power saving protocol.

An ATIM is not a bufferable MMPDU, per Table 10-1.

Proposed changes:

Make the following changes in the indicated subclauses:

**8.2.4.1.7 Power Management field**

In an IBSS, the Power Management field is valid only in certain frame ~~exchange~~s as described in 10.2.3.4 (STA power state transitions). In such ~~exchanges~~frames, a value of 1 indicates that the STA will be in PS mode. A value of 0 indicates that the STA will be in active mode.

**10.2.3.4 STA power state transitions**

A STA may enter PS mode if the value of the ATIM window in use within the IBSS is greater than 0. A STA shall not enter PS mode if the value of the ATIM window in use within the IBSS is equal to 0. ***<paragraph break>***

A STA shall indicate its power management mode in~~set~~ the Power Management subfield ~~in~~of the Frame Control field of frames containing all or part of a BU or individually addressed Probe Request frame, or (QoS) Null or ATIM frames, that it transmits ~~using the rules in 8.2.4.1.7 (Power Management field)~~.

**10.2.3.5 ATIM frame and frame transmission**

To change power management mode, a~~A~~ non-DMG [where are the rules of DMG IBSSen, then?] STA shall transmit ATIM or (QoS) Null frames within the ATIM window. The STA should transmit group addressed ATIM or (QoS) Null frames, and may transmit ~~individually addressed or group addressed~~ ATIM or (QoS) Null ~~Data~~ frames individually addressed to all other STAs in the IBSS ~~within the ATIM window to indicate the STA’s intent to change power management modes~~. The STA ~~may~~shall not transition into or out of PS mode ~~after~~unless it has ~~acknowledgments have been successfully~~ received acknowledgements from all other STAs in the IBSS ~~for all individually addressed Null Data frames~~ or ~~after the STA~~it has transmitted group addressed ATIM or (QoS) Null ~~Data~~ frames at least dot11BSSBroadcastNullCount times.

**C.3 MIB Detail**

dot11BSSBroadcastNullCount OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX Unsigned32 (~~1~~0..64)

*[…]*

This attribute specifies the number of group addressed ATIM or (QoS) Null ~~Data~~ frames an IBSS STA ~~may~~ transmits before it changes power management mode. The value 0 indicates the STA uses individually addressed ATIM or (QoS) Null frames to change power management mode."

Proposed resolution:

[Work in progress!]

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6390Mark RISON | As regards the listen interval (CID 3363), there are three formulations, which generally seem to follow the following rules:- ListenInterval: the parameter in the MLME-(RE)ASSOCIATE.request, which the non-AP STA sets- Listen Interval: the field in the (Re)Association Request, which the AP gets- listen interval: the general notion (mostly used by security handshake timeout descriptions)However, the wording is not always consistent. | I will propose text (not possible to give here) |

Discussion:

As the commenter says, one should distinguish the MLME SAP parameter from the MMPDU field from the general notion.

Proposed changes:

Make the following changes:

* 177.12 and 190.50 to "listen interval ~~value~~"
* 651.27 to "The value of this ~~parameter~~field is the ListenInterval parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.request or MLME‑REASSOCIATE.request primitive" [note deletion of the space in “Listen Interval”, not hyphen]
* 651.42 to "An AP uses the ~~L~~listen ~~I~~interval ~~information~~ in determining the lifetime of frames that it buffers for a STA.".
* 657.37 to "Association denied because the ~~L~~listen ~~I~~interval is too large"
* 1549.4 to "A STA operating in PS mode that is not in WNM-sleep mode shall periodically listen for Beacon frames, as determined by the ~~STA’s~~ ListenInterval parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.request or MLME‑REASSOCIATE.request primitive and the ReceiveDTIMs parameter ~~in~~of the MLME‑POWERMGT.request primitive"
* 1557.53 to "The AP may base the aging function on the ~~L~~listen ~~I~~interval ~~specifi~~indicated by the STA in ~~the~~its (Re)Association Request frame"
* 1559.20 to "The STA shall wake up early enough to be able to receive the first Beacon frame scheduled for transmission at the time corresponding to the last TBTT for which the STA was awake plus the time interval indicated by the ListenInterval parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.request or MLME‑REASSOCIATE.request primitive."
* 1561.10 to "Any AP aging function shall not cause the buffered BU to be discarded after any period that is shorter than ~~the Listen Interval of~~ that indicated by the STA for which BUs are buffered, in the Listen Interval field of its (Re)Association Request frame."

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6390 in <this document>, which distinguish the MLME SAP parameter from the MMPDU field from the general notion.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6404Mark RISON8.2.5.2591.37 | The first para of 8.2.5.2 is full of horrors | I will propose text (not possible to give here) |

Discussion:

591.37 says “Within a frame (excluding [what does this mean? How is a class of duration settings present within a frame anyway?] Data frames containing QoS CF-Poll [is this the same thing as “QoS (+)CF-Poll frame”? And why would such a frame be “transmitted under EDCA” rather than HCCA?], PSMP frames [but including the frames polled by the PSMP? And isn't PSMP a non-EDCA exchange (cf. 8.2.5.6, 594.40)? This contradicts the sentence “PSMP frames always use multiple protection.” below, anyway], and frames that have the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1 [this contradicts the sentence “Frames that have the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1 always use multiple protection” below] [There’s no Duration in a PS-Poll; doesn’t this potentially “initiate a TXOP” too?]) transmitted under EDCA by a STA that initiates a TXOP, there are two classes of duration settings”.

Proposed changes:

Change from 591.37 as follows

~~Within a frame (excluding Data frames containing QoS CF-Poll, PSMP frames, and frames that have the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1)~~ In transmi~~tted~~ssions under EDCA by a STA that initiates a TXOP, there are two classes of duration settings: single protection and multiple protection. In single protection, the value of the Duration/ID field of the frame can set a NAV value at receiving STAs that protects up to the end of any following Data, Management, or response frame plus any additional overhead frames as described below. In multiple protection, the value of the Duration/ID field of the frame can set a NAV that protects up to the estimated end of a sequence of multiple frames. ~~Frames that have the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1 always use multiple protection. PSMP frames always use multiple protection.~~***<paragraph break>***

The STA selects between single and multiple protection when it transmits the first frame of a TXOP. All subsequent frames transmitted by the STA in the same TXOP use the same class of duration settings. A STA always uses multiple protection in a TXOP that includes:

* Frames that have the RDG/More PPDU subfield equal to 1
* PSMP frames
* VHT NDP Announcement frames ~~and~~or Beamforming Report Poll frames ~~always use multiple protection settings.~~

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6404 in <this document>.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6389Mark RISON10.421847.31 | The requirement for an AP to notify (re)associating STAs that it is operating with reduced max NSS is not clearly expressed. Part of the problem is that the text talks of "changes in" max NSS, but from the perspective of a (re)associating STA (except special case of reassociating to the same AP) this is meaningless.[The OMN element appears in Beacons, Probe Responses, (Re)Association Requests/Responses, TDLS Setup Responses, TDLS Setup Confirms, Mesh Peering Opens, Mesh Peering Confirms, and of course OMN frames.] | I will propose text (not possible to give here) |

Discussion:

As it says in the comment. OMN applies to both sides of a link, so the wording should be general enough to reflect this.

Proposed changes:

Make the following changes at 1847.39:

A STA that is operating mode notification capable and that transmits a Beacon or group addressed Probe Response frame or that transmits a~~n~~ Probe Response, Association Request, Association Response, Reassociation Request, Reassociation Response, TDLS Setup Response, TDLS Setup Confirm, Mesh Peering Open, or Mesh Peering Confirm frame to a STA that is operating mode notification capable should ~~notify the recipient STA of a change in its operating mode~~ signal that the maximum number of spatial streams it is able to receive is less than that indicated in the HT Capabilities element in the frame and, if present, the VHT Capabilities element in the frame by including the Operating Mode Notification element in the frame.

A first STA that is operating mode notification capable should notify a second STA that is operating mode notification capable of a change in its operating mode by transmitting an Operating Mode Notification frame to the second STA if the first STA has established any of the following with a second STA:

— An association ~~with an AP~~ in an infrastructure BSS

— A TDLS link

— A DLS link

— A Mesh Peer relationship

NOTE 1—Notify Channel Width frames and elements are used to signal STA operating channel width changes to and from STAs that are not operating mode notification capable.

Make the following changes at 1849.4:

An AP shall not include the Operating Mode Notification element in Beacon, Probe Response, Association Response, and Reassociation Response frames when ~~not changing~~ the maximum number of spatial streams the AP is able to receive is the same as that indicated in the HT Capabilities element and, if present, the VHT Capabilities element.

A STA shall not transmit in an individually addressed frame an Operating Mode field with the value of the Rx NSS subfield indicating a number of spatial streams not supported by the recipient STA. ***<paragraph break>***

***<smaller font>***NOTE 2—The number of spatial streams supported by the recipient HT STA is reported in the ~~Supported Rates element, Extended Supported Rates element,~~ Supported MCS Set field in the HT Capabilities element~~, or~~ and the Supported VHT-MCS and NSS Set field in any VHT Capabilities element transmitted ~~in Management frames~~ by the ~~recipient~~ STA.

A STA shall not transmit in an individually addressed frame an Operating Mode field with the value of the Channel Width subfield indicating a bandwidth not supported by the recipient STA~~, as~~. ***<paragraph break>***

***<smaller font>***NOTE 3—The bandwidth supported by the recipient HT STA is reported in the Supported Channel Width Set subfield in the HT Capability Information field in the HT Capabilities element ~~or the~~ and the Supported Channel Width Set subfield of the VHT Capabilities Info field of any VHT Capabilities element ~~in Management frames~~ transmitted by the STA.

A STA that is operating mode notification capable shall not transmit a PPDU to a STA that uses a bandwidth that is greater than the channel width indicated in the most recently received Operating Mode Notification element or Operating Mode Notification frame from that STA. A STA that is operating mode notification capable shall not transmit a PPDU to a STA that uses a greater number of spatial streams than indicated in the most recently received Operating Mode Notification element or Operating Mode Notification frame ~~received~~ from that STA.

Increment by 2 the number of NOTEs 2 onwards.

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6389 in <this document>.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6214Mark RISON | There are references to "physical carrier sense", "virtual carrier sense" and "physical CS" and "virtual CS" but the terms are never defined | Define the terms. Arguably, virtual CS is defined at 1247.61 (though why it is "referred to as the NAV" is unclear -- or maybe virtual CS also includes considering the medium busy for the duration indicated in a received PPDU header?), but physical CS is not well-defined. 1247.57 says each PHY provides the details, but the term is only used at 2280.45 and merely reflects back to the PHY. Something needs to tie "physical CS" with the zoo of CS/CCA/energy detect/ED/blahblahblahPHYwibblings terminology used in each PHY |
| CID 6215Mark RISON | Use "CS" rather than "carrier sense" except when defined etc. | Use "CS" rather than "carrier sense" at 74.14, 833.8, 1239.15, 1664.39, 1664.40, 3187.59 (2x), 860.43, 864.52, 1378.5, 1679.57, 2184.52, 2437.59 |
| CID 6216Mark RISON | The terms PHYCS and PHYED are defined but barely used | Delete them from subclause 3.4 and replace them in the other locations with their full-fat equivalents, i.e. physical CS and physical ED (4 instances each) |
| CID 6305Mark RISON | There is a zoo of inconsistent terminology for "carrier sense", whch makes it hard to understand exactly what is meant where and how the various PHYs compare: CS, CCA, CS/CCA, energy detect, ED, PHYED, CCA-ED, CCA Mode 1-5 | First rename CCA-ED to PHYRED (regulatory ED). Then call the ED which everybody uses PHYED, and the preamble detect PHYPD. Call the combination of things which yield the PHY part of "carrier sense" PHYCS. Kill the terms CS, CCA, CS/CCA, CCA Mode, ED. Make it clear how "I'm currently transmitting" fits into "carrier sense", and whether "I've received the PPDU header so I know how long to consider the medium busy even though the energy has gone away" is considered part of PHYCS or part of MACCS/virtual CS |
| CID 6306Mark RISON | "CCA-ED" just confuses everyone, because everyone thinks it means CCA using ED, when in fact it means some wacko mode of operation in wacky regulatory domains/bands | Rename CCA-ED to something more obscure, so that people can use this term for the CCA-ED which is actually used in practice |

Discussion:

[Work in progress!]

Whereas:

1. CS (as in “CSMA/CA”) consists of the following, where any causes the medium to be considered busy (1248.9: “The CS mechanism combines the NAV state and the STA’s transmitter status with physical CS to determine the busy/idle state of the medium”):
	1. NAV
		1. The network allocation vector, set by Duration fields (1247.61: “A virtual CS mechanism shall be provided by the MAC. This mechanism is referred to as the NAV.”)
	2. Local tx in progress
		1. Delineated by PHY-TXSTART.request and PHY-TXEND.request
	3. CCA
		1. Delineated by PHY-CCA.indication (BUSY) and PHY-CCA.indication (IDLE) (1247.56: “A physical CS mechanism shall be provided by the PHY. See Clause 7 (PHY service specification) for how this information is conveyed to the MAC. The details of physical CS are provided in the individual PHY specifications.)
2. CCA consists of one or more of the following (depending on the PHY and in some cases on the CCA mode), where any causes the medium to be indicated as busy (via PHY-CCA.indication):
	1. CCA-ED is energy detect
		1. This is typically at 20 dB above the sensitivity
	2. CCA-PD is PPDU detect (which holds CCA busy for the duration indicated in the PPDU header)
		1. L-SIG TXOP protection relies on this
		2. Note PHY-RXSTART.indication and PHY-RXEND.indication are independent of this (e.g. carrier might be lost before the end of the PPDU as indicated in the PPDU header)
	3. CCA-SD is signal detect (i.e. detection of symbols generated by a particular PHY)
		1. Note some modes (e.g. “CCA mode 3” for DSSS) have an energy threshold too
		2. Note some modes (e.g. “CCA mode 4” for HR/DSSS) have a timer too
	4. CCA-RED is regulatory energy detect (only applicable to the 3G6 band in the FCC regulatory domain)
	5. CCA-SCSD is signal detect on a non-primary channel (only applicable to the VHT and TVHT PHYs)

This is illustrated graphically in the following figure (I am grateful to Guido HIERTZ for the starting design):



Here is the zoo of existing terminology, and how it maps to the terminology above:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Term | Location | Meaning |
| virtual CS mechanismvirtual carrier sense mechanismvirtual carrier sense (CS) mechanismvirtual carrier sensevirtual CSvirtual CS indicationvirtual CS condition | 25.8, 74.14, 1239.15 (obsolete – PCF), 1243.14, 1243.17, 1246.24, 1247.5, 1247.33, 1247.61, 1248.11, 1248.14, 1252.39, 1270.34, 1271.32, 1358.25, 1358.28, 1665.14, 2276.35, 2977.53 | NAV [only] |
| physical or virtual carrier sense(CS) mechanismphysical or virtual CS mechanismphysical or virtual CSPHY and virtual CS mechanismsthe virtual carrier sense mechanism orthe physical carrier sense mechanismPhysical and virtual CS functionsthe CS function provided by the PHY, the virtual CS function provided by the MAC via the NAVthe NAV and physical CS | 833.8, 1247.52, 1252.48, 1268.8, 1323.24, 1327.36, 1358.24, 1358.30, 1664.39, 1700.43, 3187.59 | CS mechanism [including “local tx”] |
| physical CS mechanismphysical carrier sense mechanismphysical CS | 1247.56, 1247.57, 1248.9, 1271.4, 1271.13, 1324.54, 2280.45 | CCA |
| carrier sense mechanismcarrier-sense mechanism [hyphen sic]“CS mechanism” [quotes sic] | 860.43, 864.52, 1378.5, 1679.57, 2280.44 | CS mechanism |
| PHYCSPHY carrier sense (PHYCS) | 56.64, 2184.52, 2184.56, 2211.28, 2211.30 | CCA-PD |
| PHYEDPHY energy detection (PHYED) | 57.1, 2184.53, 2184.56, 2211.28, 2211.30 | CCA-ED |
| PHY CS/CCACS/CCAcarrier sense/clear channel assessment (CS/CCA) | 551.36, 2185.13, 2212.7, 2264.32 (better to reword to include next sentence too, i.e. say something like “including CCA-RED, for operating classes requiring this”), 2264.39, 2264.44, 2264.45, 2264.47, 2269.10, 2271.4, 2373.13, 2374.1, 2375.4, 2375.37, 2376.53, 2445.7, 2562.2, 2563.3, 3353.22, 3355.16 | CCA |
| CS/CCA | 3351.57 (delete the item immediately above) | CCA including CCA-RED |
| code lock | 2176.8 (2x) | CCA-SD? |
| IEEE Std 802.11 DSSS correlation | 2687.60 | DSSS PPDU detection |
| CShigh rate CS | 2717.24, 2717.26 | DSSS and HR/DSSS PPDU detection |
| CS | 2722.36 | DSSS, HR/DSSS and ERP PPDU detection |
| carrier sense | 3197.37, 3197.38, 3197.61, 3197.62, 3197.63, 3197.64, 3206.59, 3206.60, 3206.61, 3206.62 | PPDU detection |
| energy detection (ED) and/or code lockED and/or code lock | 2183.61, 2209.61 | CCA-ED and/or CCA-SD? |
| energy detectenergyEnergyEnergy DetectionCCA-ED energy | 2190.18, 2220.47, 2265.4, 2554.3, 2628.56, 2687.58, 2697.23, 2717.22, 2717.26, 2722.35, 3198.11 (also lowercase “Threshold”), 3205.35 (ditto) | ED |
| energy detect | 3197.36, 3197.38, 3197.60, 3197.62, 3197.64, 3206.58, 3206.60, 3206.62 | energy detection |
| energy detect or CS | 2196.18, 2227.19 | energy or signal detection |
| CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED)CCA-ED [sometimes followed without space “Behavior” appended; this should be preserved]CCA-Energy DetectCCA-EnergyDetect | 2264.33 (+many others in this subclause), 2265.5, 2368.25 (+5 in next para), 2253.48 (+in subclause heading and many others in the subclause), 2627.59 (+in subclause heading and many others in the subclause), 2697.19, 3205.7 (also rename MIB variable + change “that” to “whether”), 3205.20 (ditto; also either delete “PHY” or prepend “OFDM”), 3205.35, 3332.13, 3336.5, 3336.8, 3339.36, 3339.38, 3339.40, 3347.11, 3347.12, 3347.15, 3351.56, 3351.63 | CCA-RED |

MIB changes also required:

dot11EDThreshold: should be stated to be in dBm with a UNITS, have a sensible range, and have a DEFVAL.

dot11TIThreshold: should be deleted (no apparent connection to anything (TI?)).

dot11OFDMEDThreshold: should be renamed to be dot11OFDMREDThreshold, be stated to be in dBm with a UNITS, have a sensible range, and have a DEFVAL of -72.

2227.5/6: “a high rate PHY signal”; 2227.22: “a valid high rate signal”; 2227.10: “a high rate PPDU” – all these include a DSSS signal, right? Note also 2227.37: “an equivalent High-Rate signal” [sic]

Proposed resolution:

[Work in progress!]

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6482Mark RISON9.3.2.11248.21 | "AirDelay is aAirPropagationTime indicated in the Coverage Class field of the Country element received from the AP of the BSS with which the STA is associated or the DO of the IBSS of which the STA is a member or from another mesh STA in the same MBSS, or if no Country element has been received from the AP of the BSS with which the STA is associated, the value of aAirPropagationTime indicated in the PLME-CHARACTERISTICS.confirm primitive." is circular, because the PLME-CHARACTERISTICS.confirm gets info from the PHY characteristics, and the PHYs say "As indicated by the coverage class (see 9.21.4 (Operation with coverage classes))." | This would probably best be fixed in 9.21.4. Perhaps "The default PHY parameters are based on aAirPropagationTime having a value of 0 us" could be changed to something like "When dot11OperatingClassesRequired is false, or the aAirPropagationTime is not available from a Country element, the aAirPropagationTime shall be taken to be 0 us" |

Discussion:

As the commenter notes, aAirPropagationTime in PLME-CHARACTERISTICS.confirm is specified in all the PHYs (except DMG and TVWS) as being dynamic, per 9.21.4, which says you look at the Country element.

Some other issues arise: aAirPropagationTime only applies if dot11OperatingClassesRequired is true, and the situation with DMG and TVWS (which have a specified aAirPropagationTime) is not clear.

Proposed changes:

Change 1248.19 as follows:

At aRxTxTurnaroundTime + AirDelay + aRxPHYDelay + 10% of aSlotTime after each MAC slot boundary as defined in 9.3.7 (DCF timing relations) and 9.22.2.4 (Obtaining an EDCA TXOP), the MAC shall issue a PHY-CCARESET.request primitive to the PHY, where AirDelay is aAirPropagationTime indicated in the Coverage Class field of the Country element received [even for DMG and TVWS?] from the AP of the BSS with which the STA is associated or from the DO of the IBSS of which the STA is a member or from another mesh STA in the same MBSS, or if no Country element containing a Coverage Class field has been received from the AP of the BSS with which a STA is associated or the DO of the IBSS of which a STA is a member or from another mesh STA in the same MBSS or dot11OperatingClassesRequired is false ~~from the AP of the BSS with which the STA is associated~~, the value of aAirPropagationTime indicated in the PLME-CHARACTERISTICS.confirm primitive.

Change 1275.49 as follows (aSlotTime equation):

aAirPropagationTime is the value indicated in the Coverage Class field of the Country element received [even for DMG and TVWS?] from the AP of the BSS with which the STA is associated or the DO of the IBSS of which the STA is a member or from another mesh STA in the same MBSS, ~~otherwise~~ or if no such Country element has been received or dot11OperatingClassesRequired is false, the value indicated in the PLME-CHARACTERISTICS.confirm primitive

Change 1320.53 as follows:

~~The default PHY parameters are based on aAirPropagationTime having a value of 0 μs, and~~ aSlotTime and other MAC timings are based on the PHY timing parameters, as specified in 9.3.2.3 (IFS) and 9.3.7 (DCF timing relations), and in particular on aAirPropagationTime. ~~When~~If dot11OperatingClassesRequired is true, it is possible to manage the MAC timings of STAs ~~that can receive Beacon frames, DMG Beacon frames, or Probe Response frames that contain the Country element (8.4.2.9 (Country element)),~~ to increase fairness in contending for the medium. Radio waves propagate at 300 m/μs in free space, and, for example, 3 μs would be the ceiling for BSS maximum one-way distance of ~450 m (~900 m round trip). The Coverage Class field of the Country element indicates ~~the~~a ~~new~~ value of aAirPropagationTime (see Table 8-76 (Coverage Class field parameters)), and the MAC can use the ~~new~~ value to calculate aSlotTime (as specified in the relevant PHY clause) and other timings. ***<paragraph break>***

~~When~~ If dot11OperatingClassesRequired is true and a Country element~~s~~ containing a ~~value for the~~ ~~c~~Coverage ~~c~~Class field has~~ve~~ been received ~~in Beacon frames, DMG Beacon frames, or Probe Response frames~~ from the AP of the BSS with which a STA is associated or from the DO of the IBSS of which a STA is a member or from another mesh STA in the same MBSS, an associated STA, or a dependent STA, or member of an IBSS, or member of an MBSS shall use MAC timings that correspond~~s~~ to the ~~new~~ value of aAirPropagationTime indicated (as specified in the relevant PHY clause).

NOTE 1—Some PHYs do not specify a dependency of aSlotTime on aAirPropagationTime.

NOTE 2—Operation over larger BSS diameters is facilitated by relaxing some PHY timing parameters, while maintaining compatibility with existing implementations in small BSS diameters.

aAirPropagationTime is 0 μs if:

* the relevant PHY clause specifies that it indicated by the coverage class, and
* at least one of the following applies:
* dot11OperatingClassesRequired is false
* no Country element containing a Coverage Class field has been received from the AP of the BSS with which a STA is associated or from the DO of the IBSS of which a STA is a member or from another mesh STA in the same MBSS

Using the Country element, an AP ~~or PCP~~, IBSS STA or MBSS STA can change ~~coverage class and~~ maximum transmit power level to enhance operation. ~~When~~If dot11OperatingClassesRequired and dot11ExtendedChannelSwitchActivated are true and the maximum transmit power level [which limit is this one referring to?] is different from the transmit power limit indicated by the operating class [OCs don’t indicate power limits; subband triplets do], the associated STA, or dependent STA, or member of an IBSS, or member of an MBSS shall operate at a transmit power at or below that indicated by the lesser of the two limits.

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6482 in <this document>, which address the comment in the manner suggested.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6496Mark RISON9.3.2.3.31250.16 | Does the SIFS 10% of aSlotTime include aAirPropagationTime too? Seems large. There is no need to allow for 10% of the aAirPropagationTime as a STA's timing accuracy is independent of the aAirPropagationTime | Change to 10% of aSlotTime - aAirPropagationTime (2x in this subclause). See also 9.3.2.1's 10% and the 10%s in 9.3.2.3.10 and 9.3.2.3.11 |

Discussion:

The error on SIFS is to allow for timing inaccuracy at the STA responding after SIFS. This inaccuracy has no dependency on the BSS diameter, since it is purely local (note that an increased aAirPropagationTime increases aSlotTime but not aSIFSTime).

Note that the DMG and TVHT situation is less significant than the non-DMG non-TVHT situation, because for DMG aAirPropagationTime is < 0.1 μs and aSlotTime is 5 μs and for TVHT aAirPropagationTime is 3 μs and aSlotTime is 20 or 24 μs, while for other PHYs aAirPropagationTime can be up to 93 μs compared with an unadulterated aSlotTime of 9 or 20 μs.

Proposed changes:

Change 1248.19 as follows:

At aRxTxTurnaroundTime + AirDelay + aRxPHYDelay + 10% ~~of~~× (aSlotTime – aAirPropagationTime) after each MAC slot boundary

Change 1250.14 as follows:

non-DMG STA shall not allow the space between frames that are defined to be separated by a SIFS, as measured on the medium, to vary from the nominal SIFS by more than ±10% ~~of~~× (aSlotTime – aAirPropagationTime)

Change 1250.17 as follows:

DMG STA shall not allow the space between frames that are defined to be separated by a SIFS time, as measured on the medium, to vary from the nominal SIFS value by more than –0% or +10% ~~of~~× (aSlotTime – aAirPropagationTime).

Change 1253.17 as follows:

DMG STA shall not allow the space between frames that are separated by MBIFS time, as measured on the medium, to vary from the nominal MBIFS value by more than –0% or +10% ~~of~~× (aSlotTime – aAirPropagationTime).

Change 1253.27 as follows:

DMG STA shall not allow the space between frames that are separated by LBIFS time, as measured on the medium, to vary from the nominal LBIFS value by more than –0% or +10% ~~of~~× (aSlotTime – aAirPropagationTime).

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6496 in <this document>, which address the comment in the manner suggested.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6308Mark RISON | 18.3.10.6 CCA requirements says: "For improved spectrum sharing, CCA-ED is required in some bands. The behavior class indicating CCA-ED is given in Table D-2 (Behavior limits sets). The operating classes requiring the corresponding CCA-ED behavior class are given in E.1 (Country information and operating classes). A STA that is operating within an operating class that requires CCA-ED shall operate with CCA-ED. Unless required by regulation, the CCA-ED shall not be required for license-exempt operation.CCA-ED shall indicate a channel busy condition when the received signal strength exceeds the CCA-ED threshold as given by dot11OFDMEDThreshold. The CCA-ED thresholds for the operating classes requiring CCA-ED are subject to the criteria in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold)."D.2.5 CCA-ED threshold says: "CCA-ED thresholds for operation in specific bands are given in E.2 (Band-specific operating requirements) where they differ from the values in PHY clauses."So the OFDM PHY refers you to D.2.5 which refers you to E.2 except where the answer is the same as in the PHY clause ... but that's where you started! | Break the infinite loop. Define the CCA-ED thresholds in one place only |

Discussion:

 10 REM PHY clauses

 20 PRINT "The CCA-ED thresholds for the operating classes requiring CCA-ED are subject to the criteria in D.2.5"

 30 GOTO 1325

1325 REM D.2.5

1330 PRINT "CCA-ED thresholds for operation in specific bands are given in E.2 where they differ from the values in PHY clauses"

1340 IF NOT (differ) THEN GOTO 10

1350 GOTO 1402

1402 REM E.2

1410 PRINT “Here are the CCA-ED thresholds.”

The solution is to delete line 1340 above.

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Delete “where they differ from the values in PHY clauses” at 3336.9.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6506Mark RISON20.3.20.5.12368.25 | This subclause starts "For the operating classes requiring CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED)" but examination of Annex E shows that the only operating classes requiring CCA-ED are in the 3G band and the maximum channel width is 20 MHz, so this subclause seems otiose at best and misleading at worst; ditto for TVHT | Delete this subclause; consider doing the same for TVHT since although 4.3.12 suggests VHT might be used in the 3G band this is not actually the case in practice |

Discussion:

This was discussed in Vancouver and the outcome was:

REVISED (GEN: 2015-05-12 00:34:20Z) - At 2368.32, add "NOTE--The CCA-ED is not required for license-exempt operation in any band." and at 2264.57, 2553.57, 2628.44 change similar statements to NOTEs.

However, there are other inconsistencies among the PHYs which (potentially) use CCA-ED (OFDM, HT, VHT, TVHT).

Proposed changes:

Change 18.3.10.6 CCA requirements as follows:

The PHY shall indicate a medium busy condition by issuing a PHY-CCA.indication primitive when the carrier sense/clear channel assessment (CS/CCA) mechanism detects a channel busy condition. ***<paragraph break>***

For the operating classes requiring CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED), the PHY shall also indicate a medium busy condition when CCA-ED detects a channel busy condition

[…]

For improved spectrum sharing, CCA-ED is required in some bands. The behavior class indicating CCA-ED is given in Table D-2 (Behavior limits sets). The operating classes requiring the corresponding CCA-ED behavior class are given in E.1 (Country information and operating classes). ~~A~~The PHY of a STA that is operating within an operating class that requires CCA-ED shall operate with CCA-ED. ***<paragraph break>***

~~Unless required by regulation, the~~ ***<smaller font>***NOTE 2—CCA-ED ~~shall not be~~ is not required for license-exempt operation in any band.

CCA-ED shall indicate a channel busy condition when the received signal strength exceeds the CCA-ED threshold as given by dot11OFDMEDThreshold. The CCA-ED thresholds for the operating classes requiring CCA-ED are subject to the criteria in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

NOTE ~~2~~3—The requirement to indicate a channel busy condition for any signal 20 dB above the minimum modulation and coding rate sensitivity (minimum modulation and coding rate sensitivity + 20 dB resulting in –62 dBm for 20 MHz channel spacing, –65 dBm for 10 MHz channel spacing, and –68 dBm for 5 MHz channel spacing) is a mandatory energy detect requirement on all Clause 18 (Orthogonal frequency division multiplexing (OFDM) PHY specification) receivers. Support for CCA-ED is an additional requirement that relates specifically to the sensitivities described in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

Change 20.3.20.5.1 CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED) as follows:

For the operating classes requiring CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED), the PHY shall also indicate a medium busy condition when CCA-ED detects a channel busy condition.

For improved spectrum sharing, CCA-ED is required in some bands. The behavior class indicating CCA-ED is given in Table D-2 (Behavior limits sets). The operating classes requiring the corresponding CCA-ED behavior class are given in E.1 (Country information and operating classes). ~~An HT~~The PHY of a STA that is operating within an operating class that requires CCA-ED shall operate with CCA-ED ~~as defined in 18.3.10.6 (CCA requirements)~~.

NOTE 1—CCA-ED is not required for license-exempt operation in any band.

CCA-ED shall indicate a channel busy condition when the received signal strength exceeds the CCA-ED threshold as given by dot11OFDMEDThreshold for the primary 20 MHz channel and dot11OFDMEDThreshold for the secondary 20 MHz channel. The CCA-ED thresholds for the operating classes requiring CCA-ED are subject to the criteria in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

NOTE 2—The requirement to indicate a channel busy condition as stated in 20.3.20.5.2, 20.3.20.5.3 and 20.3.20.5.4 is a mandatory energy detect requirement on all Clause 20 receivers. Support for CCA-ED is an additional requirement that relates specifically to the sensitivities described in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

Change 22.3.18.5.2 CCA sensitivity for operating classes requiring CCA-ED as follows:

For the operating classes requiring CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED), ~~CCA~~the PHY shall also ~~detect~~indicate a medium busy condition when CCA-ED detects a channel busy condition.

For improved spectrum sharing, CCA-ED is required in some bands. The behavior class indicating CCA-ED is given in Table D-2 (Behavior limits sets). The operating classes requiring the corresponding CCA-ED behavior class are given in ~~Annex~~ E.1. ~~A~~The PHY of a STA that is operating within an operating class that requires CCA-ED shall operate with CCA-ED. ***<paragraph break>***

~~The~~ ***<smaller font>***NOTE 1—CCA-ED is not required for license-exempt operation in any band.

CCA-ED shall indicate a channel busy condition when the received signal strength exceeds the CCA-ED threshold as given by dot11OFDMEDThreshold for the primary 20 MHz channel ~~and~~, dot11OFDMEDThreshold for the secondary 20 MHz channel, dot11OFDMEDThreshold + 3 dB for the secondary 40 MHz channel, and dot11OFDMEDThreshold + 6 dB for the secondary 80 MHz channel. The CCA-ED thresholds for the operating classes requiring CCA-ED are subject to the criteria in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

NOTE 2—The requirement to ~~issue~~indicate a ~~CCA signal~~channel busy condition as stated in 22.3.18.5.3 (CCA sensitivity for signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel) and 22.3.18.5.4 (CCA sensitivity for signals not occupying the primary 20 MHz channel) is a mandatory energy detect requirement on all Clause 22 (Very High Throughput (VHT) PHY specification) receivers. Support for CCA-ED is an additional requirement that relates specifically to the sensitivities described in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

Change 23.3.18.6.2 CCA sensitivity for operating classes requiring CCA-ED as follows:

For the operating classes requiring CCA-Energy Detect (CCA-ED), ~~CCA~~the PHY shall also ~~detect~~indicate a medium busy condition when CCA-ED detects a channel busy condition.

For improved spectrum sharing, CCA-ED is required in some bands. The behavior class indicating CCA-ED is given in Table D-2 (Behavior limits sets). The operating classes requiring the corresponding CCA-ED behavior class are given in E.1 (Country information and operating classes). ~~A~~The PHY of a STA that is operating within an operating class that requires CCA-ED shall operate with CCA-ED. ***<paragraph break>***

~~The~~ ***<smaller font>***NOTE 1—CCA-ED is not required for license-exempt operation in any band.

CCA-ED shall indicate a channel busy condition when the received signal strength exceeds the CCA-ED threshold as given by dot11OFDMEDThreshold for the primary TVHT\_W channel ~~and~~, dot11OFDMEDThreshold for the secondary TVHT\_W channel and dot11OFDMEDThreshold + 3 dB for the secondary TVHT\_2W channel [no secondary TVHT\_4W?]. The CCA-ED thresholds for the operating classes requiring CCA-ED are subject to the criteria in D.2.5 (CCA-ED threshold).

NOTE 2—The requirement to ~~issue~~indicate a ~~CCA signal~~channel busy condition as stated in 23.3.18.6.3 (CCA sensitivity for signals occupying the primary channel) and 23.3.18.6.4 (CCA sensitivity for signals not occupying the primary channel) is a mandatory energy detect requirement on all Clause 23 (Television Very High Throughput (TVHT) PHY specification) receivers. Support for CCA-ED is an additional requirement that relates specifically to the sensitivities defined in D.2.5.

Change 3332.13 as follows: “CCA shall also ~~detect~~indicate a medium busy condition when CCA-EnergyDetect detects a channel busy condition.”

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6506 in <this document>, which reject the thrust of the comment but harmonise the wording for the OFDM, HT, VHT and TVHT PHYs (which are the only PHYs subject to regulatory energy detection).

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6583Mark RISON | "All other bits are reserved, and are set to 0 on transmission and ignored on reception."; "the WEP Key ID subfield in the MPDU shall be set to 0 on transmit and ignored on receive."; "Bits 5 to 7 of the Nonce Flags field are reserved and shall be set to 0 on transmission."; "The reserved bits shall be set to 0 and shall be ignored on reception."; "If the value of Key Type (bit 3) is 0, then this bit shall be 0 on transmit and ignored on receive. "; "It shall be set to 0 on transmit and ignored on receive." | Simplifiy all of these to a statement of the form to "x is reserved", except the one which just says to set reserved bits to 0 on tx and ignore on rx, which can just be deleted.Note, however, that the statement that reserved bits are set to 0 on tx and ignored on rx is only made within the scope of clause 8, so this needs to be widened to cover other clauses |

Discussion:

OK, so we need to extend the Clause 8 convention to other MAC clauses. Leave the last one alone, as it’s in the PHY and PHY people are a bit odd (e.g. often their reserved bits are set to 1!).

Proposed changes:

Change 561.46 as follows: “Reserved fields and subfields are set to 0 upon transmission and are ignored upon reception (this includes reserved fields and subfields in the security encapsulation in protected frame bodies, nonces and EAPOL-Key frames (see Clause 11)).”

Change 872.35 as follows: “~~set to 0 on transmit and is not used at the receiver~~reserved”.

Change 937.54 as follows: “~~0 on transmission and ignored upon reception~~reserved”.

Change 943.6 as follows: “~~An AP always sets Bits 4–6 to 0. A non-AP STA ignores Bits 4–6 on reception.~~Bits 4-6 are reserved.”

Change 963.53 as follows: “~~The requesting STA sets the Query Response Length Limit to 0 on transmission and the responding STA ignores it upon reception~~In this case, the Query Response Length Limit is reserved.” [lots of missing “field”s around here!]

Change 1001.14 as follows: “~~value of the~~ AID field is ~~ignored~~reserved”.

Change 1011.37 as follows: “~~value of the~~ PCP Active subfield is ~~ignored~~reserved”.

Change 1185.28 as follows: “~~0~~reserved for all BSSIDs ~~and ignored upon reception~~”.

Change 1870.34 as follows: “field ~~value~~ is ~~ignored~~reserved”.

Change 1870.52 as follows: “~~shall be set to 0 on transmit and ignored on receive~~is reserved”.

Delete 1912.3 (“The reserved bits shall be set to 0 and shall be ignored on reception.”).

Change 1914.50 as follows: “are reserved ~~and shall be set to 0 on transmission~~”.

Change 1964.14 as follows: “~~shall be 0 on transmit and ignored on receive~~is reserved”.

Change 1966.30 as follows: “~~value~~field ~~shall be set to 0 on transmit and shall not be used at the receive~~is reserved”.

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CID 6583 in <this document>, which address the comment (including some missing instances of reserved quanta) as far as it pertains to MAC clauses.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
| CID 6375Mark RISON10.3.5.31596.24 | "and an earlier, timed out SA Query procedure with the non-AP and non-PCP STA has not allowed a new association process to be started without an additional SA Query procedure," is extremely ambiguous: does the earlier procedure allow the new process, or disallow it? In fact, it allows it! The issue is that the precedence is not clear: "(an earlier SA) (has not) (allowed association)" v. "(an earlier SA) (has) (not allowed association)" | Reword to be clear; ditto in reassoc. Text like: "and there has been no earlier, timed out SA Query procedure with the STA (which would have allowed a new reassociation process to be started, without an additional SA Query procedure)" |
| CID 6376Mark RISON10.3.51593 | There are numerous editorial and consistency issues with the description of the AP/PCP (re)assoc receipt procedures | I will propose text (not possible to give here) |
| CID 6377Mark RISON10.3.51593 | There are numerous technical issues with the description of the AP/PCP (re)assoc receipt procedures, including deletion of the PTKSA, the point of the Disassociation frame, the situation with PCPs, the distinction between SME and MLME, the behaviour if the result is not success and MFP is not in use and the reassoc is part of FT, the situation with DMG STAs | I will propose text (not possible to give here) |

Discussion:

Part of PMF is the handling of (re)association. It is necessary for an AP (or PCP, implied throughout this discussion) to be able to distinguish between a genuine (re)association request to the same AP, including the case where a STA has reset and lost its state, and a forged one. Similarly, it is necessary to distinguish between a genuine deauthentication/disassociation, including the case where an AP has reset and lost its state, and a forged one.

This is done through the SA Query procedure. The querying STA sends an encrypted frame with a unique identifier, and the queried STA, if it is still associated, sends an encrypted frame back with that identifier. If the queried STA does not respond in this way, the querying STA can, after a suitable number of attempts, conclude that the queried STA is no longer associated (e.g. it has reset).

The procedure for a genuine reassociation proceeds as follows:

1. (non-AP) STA deletes PTKSA
2. STA sends reassociation request
3. AP says “please try later” and starts SA Query procedure
4. STA does not respond (since it no longer has the PTKSA)
5. STA sends reassociation request again
6. AP accedes to the request and sends reassociation response
7. AP sends protected Disassociation frame (ignored by STA since it no longer has the PTKSA to decrypt it)
8. AP deletes PTKSA

Similarly, the procedure for a genuine association after the non-AP STA has reset proceeds as follows:

1. STA sends association request
2. AP says “please try later” and starts SA Query procedure
3. STA does not respond
4. STA sends association request again
5. AP accedes to the request and sends association response
6. AP sends protected Disassociation frame (ignored by STA since it no longer has the PTKSA to decrypt it)
7. AP deletes PTKSA

In contrast, the procedure for a forged reassociation proceeds as follows:

1. attacking STA sends reassociation request
2. AP says “please try later” and starts SA Query procedure
3. genuine STA does respond
4. AP determines the reassociation request was a forgery

There is a special case where for whatever reason the genuine STA does not respond to the SA Queries:

1. attacking STA sends reassociation request
2. AP says “please try later” and starts SA Query procedure
3. genuine STA does not respond for some reason
4. attacking STA sends reassociation request again
5. AP accedes to the request and sends reassociation response
6. AP sends protected Disassociation frame. This might be picked up by the genuine STA since it still has the PTKSA to decrypt it, though why the STA would miss all the SA Query frames but not this one, and what the genuine STA is supposed to do at this point (call the cops?) are unclear
7. genuine STA deletes PTKSA
8. AP deletes PTKSA

Unfortunately 11mc/D4.0 doesn’t quite say this (in particular the deletion of the PTKSA at the AP is missing, and the point of the Disassociation frame is unclear), and what it does say is in many places ambiguous or inconsistent (most egregiously, “an earlier SA Query procedure has not allowed a new association process to be started” has two possible and nearly opposite interpretations: “an earlier SA Query procedure has {not allowed [i.e. disallowed] {a new association process to be started}}” and “an earlier SA Query procedure has not {allowed {a new association process to be started}}”).

PCPs have not always been covered in all this, and it is not always clear that the state is maintained at both the SME and the MLME. The behaviour if the ResultCode is not SUCCESS and management frame protection is not in use and the reassociation is part of a fast BSS transition is not clearly stated.

Finally, as noted in the comments, there are a lot of editorial accuracy and consistency issues.

Proposed changes:

Change “Association request rejected temporarily; try again later” to “REFUSED\_TEMPORARILY” at 173.14, 187.20, 194.24.

Change ““Association request rejected temporarily; try again later.”” to “REFUSED\_TEMPORARILY.” (note no double quotes in the final text, but full stop yes) at 174.58, 181.53, 188.55, 195.56.

Change the indicated subclauses as follows (small changes which might be missed highlighted in turquoise), relettering steps as necessary:

**10.3.5.5 AP or PCP reassociation receipt procedures**

~~Upon receipt of an Reassociation Request frame from a non-AP STA for which the state is State 1, the AP’s MLME shall transmit an Reassociation Response frame with an appropriate status code.~~

Upon receipt of a Reassociation Request frame from a STA ~~for which the state is State 2, State 3, or State 4,~~ the AP or PCP~~’s MLME~~ shall ~~reassociate with the STA using~~use the following procedure:

1. The MLME shall issue an MLME-REASSOCIATE.indication primitive to inform the SME of the reassociation request. The SME shall issue an MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive addressed to the STA identified by the PeerSTAAddress parameter of the MLME-REASSOCIATE.indication primitive. If the reassociation is not successful, the SME shall indicate a specific reason for the failure to reassociate in the ResultCode parameter. Upon receipt of the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive, the MLME shall transmit a Reassociation Response frame.
2. [New step] If the state for the STA is 1, the SME shall refuse the reassociation request by issuing an MLME‑REASSOCIATE.response primitive with ResultCode NOT\_AUTHENTICATED. [not for DMG if the DMG STA doesn’t use 802.11 open system auth, though – does this need to be NOTEd?]
3. ~~At an~~ AP ~~having~~with dot11InterworkingServiceActivated ~~equal to~~ true only: If ~~, subsequent to receiving an~~ the MLME-REASSOCIATE.indication primitive ~~with~~has the EmergencyServices parameter set to true ~~that~~ and the RSN parameter does not include an RSNE ~~parameter~~, the SME shall ~~accept~~not reject the reassociation request ~~even if~~on the basis that dot11RSNAActivated is true and dot11PrivacyInvoked is true, thereby granting access, using unprotected frames (see 8.2.4.1.9 (Protected Frame field)), to the network for emergency services purposes.
4. Otherwise, i~~I~~n an RSNA~~,~~ the SME shall check the values received in the RSN~~E~~ parameter to see whether the values received match the ~~AP or PCP’s~~ security policy. If they do not, the SME shall refuse the reassociation ~~shall not be accepted~~ by issuing an MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive with a ResultCode indicating the security policy mismatch.
5. Otherwise, i~~I~~f the ~~AP or PCP’s~~ state for the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA is 4, the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA has a valid security association, the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA has negotiated management frame protection, ~~and~~ the reassociation is not a part of a fast BSS transition, and ~~an~~ there has been no earlier, timed out SA Query procedure with the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA ~~has not~~ (which would have allowed a new reassociation process to be started, without an additional SA Query procedure):
	1. The SME shall ~~reject~~refuse the reassociation request by ~~generat~~issuing an MLME‑REASSOCIATE.response primitive with ResultCode ~~“Association request rejected temporarily; Try again later.”~~REFUSED\_TEMPORARILY ~~The SME shall not modify any association state for the non-AP and non-PCP STA, and shall include in the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive~~ and TimeoutInterval containing a Timeout Interval element with the Timeout Interval Type field set to 3 (Association Comeback time)~~, specifying a comeback time when the AP or PCP would be ready to accept an association with this STA~~. If the SME is in an ongoing SA Query with the STA, the Timeout Interval Value field shall be set to the remaining SA Query period, otherwise it shall be set to dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout.
	2. The state for the STA shall be left unchanged.
	3. Following this, if the SME is not in an ongoing SA Query with the STA, the SME shall issue one MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive addressed to the STA every dot11AssociationSAQueryRetryTimeout TUs until an ~~matching~~ MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive for the STA and with a matching TransactionIdentifier is received or dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout TUs from the beginning of the SA Query procedure have passed. [joined to next bullet] The SME shall ~~insert the TransactionIdentifier in MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive,~~ increment ~~this~~ the TransactionIdentifier by 1 for each ~~subsequent~~ MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive, ~~and~~ rolling it over to 0 after the maximum allowed value ~~in this field~~is reached.
	4. ~~An MLME may interpret reception of a valid protected frame as an indication of a successfully completed SA Query and thereby generate an MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive.~~
	5. If ~~an~~no MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive with a~~n~~ ~~outstanding~~ ~~t~~Transaction~~i~~Identifier matching a TransactionIdentifier in an MLME-SA-QUERY.request issued in this SA Query procedure is ~~not~~ received within the dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout period, the SME shall allow ~~the~~a subsequent reassociation process with the STA to be started without starting an additional SA Query procedure, except that the SME may deny a subsequent reassociation process with the STA if an MSDU was received from the STA within this period.
6. The SME shall refuse a reassociation request from a STA that does not support all the rates in the BSSBasicRateSet parameter in the MLME-START.request primitive.
7. The SME shall refuse a reassociation request from an HT STA that does not support all the MCSs in the Basic MCS Set field of the HT Operation parameter ~~of~~in the MLME-START.request primitive.
8. The SME shall refuse a reassociation request from a VHT STA that does not support all the <VHT‑MCS, NSS> tuples indicated by the Basic VHT-MCS and NSS Set field of the VHT Operation parameter in the MLME-START.request primitive.
9. ~~The SME shall generate an MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive addressed to the non-AP and non-PCP STA. If the reassociation is not successful, the SME shall indicate a specific reason for the failure to reassociate in the ResultCode parameter as defined in 6.3.7.5.2 (Semantics of the service primitive).~~
10. If the ResultCode in the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive is SUCCESS, and the SME has an existing SA with the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA, and an SA Query procedure with that ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA has failed to receive a valid response, ~~then~~ the SME shall issue an MLME-DISASSOCIATE.request primitive addressed to the STA with ReasonCode INVALID\_AUTHENTICATION.

NOTE—This MLME-DISASSOCIATE.request generates a protected Disassociation frame ~~addressed to the STA~~. If the reassociation request was genuine, the STA has deleted the PTKSA by this point and so the protected Disassociation frame is ignored. The purpose is to inform a STA which has for some reason failed to respond to an SA Query procedure triggered by a forged reassociation request.

1. If the ResultCode in the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive is SUCCESS~~, the association identifier assigned to the STA shall be included in this primitive. If~~ and the reassociation is not part of a fast BSS transition ~~and management frame protection is not in use~~, the SME shall delete any PTKSA and temporal keys held for communication with the STA by using the MLME-DELETEKEYS.request primitive (see 11.5.18 (RSNA security association termination)). In the case of a DMG AP or PCP, the association identifier shall be in the range of 1 to 254.
2. If the MLME-REASSOCIATE.indication primitive includes an MMS parameter, the AP or PCP shall ~~generate the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive directed to the MLME of the STA identified by the PeerSTAAddress parameter of the MLME-REASSOCIATE.request primitive and~~ take the following additional action, as appropriate:
	1. If the Single AID field in the MMS parameter of the MLME-REASSOCIATE.indication primitive is equal to 1, the AP or PCP may allocate a single AID for all the STAs included in the MMS element. If the AP or PCP allocates the same AID to all STAs whose MAC address was included in the MMS element, it shall include the MMS element received from the MMS-ME coordinated STA in the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive.
	2. If the Single AID field is 0, the AP or PCP shall allocate a distinct AID for each STA specified in the MMS element.
3. ~~Upon receipt of an MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive, the MLME shall transmit a Reassociation Response frame to the STA.~~
4. ~~When~~If ~~the~~a Reassociation Response frame with a status ~~value~~code of ~~Successful~~SUCCESS is acknowledged by the STA [how does the SME find out?], the state ~~variable~~ for the STA shall be set to State 4, or to State 3 if RSNA establishment is required [how does the MLME know?] ~~on the new AP or PCP~~ and ~~the FT Protocol is not used on the new AP or PCP~~ the reassociation is not part of a fast BSS transition.
5. ~~When~~If the ResultCode ~~of the reassociation~~ in the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive is not SUCCESS and ~~if~~ management frame protection is in use the state for the STA shall be left unchanged ~~on the AP or PCP the Reassociation Request frame was sent to~~. If the ResultCode is not SUCCESS and management frame protection is not in use and the reassociation is part of a fast BSS transition, the state for the STA shall be left unchanged. ~~When~~If the ResultCode is not SUCCESS and management frame protection is not in use and the reassociation is not part of a fast BSS transition, the state for the STA ~~is~~shall be set to State 3 if it was ~~in~~ State 4.
6. If the ResultCode in the MLME-REASSOCIATE.response primitive is SUCCESS,~~If~~ RSNA establishment is required and ~~FT is not in use~~ the reassociation is not part of a fast BSS transition, the SME shall attempt a 4-way handshake. Upon a successful completion of a 4-way handshake, the SME shall enable protection by invoking MLME-SETPROTECTION.request(Rx\_Tx)~~. Upon receipt of the MLME‑SETPROTECTION.request(Rx\_Tx), the MLME shall set~~ and the state for the STA shall be set to State 4.
7. AP only: The SME shall inform the DS of any changes in the ~~association~~ state for the STA.

**10.3.5.3 AP or PCP association receipt procedures**

~~Upon receipt of an Association Request frame from a non-AP STA for which the state is State 1, the AP’s MLME shall transmit an Association Response frame with an appropriate status code.~~

Upon receipt of an Association Request frame from a ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA ~~for which the state is State 2, State 3, or State 4,~~ the AP or PCP~~’s MLME~~ shall ~~associate with the non-AP and non-PCP STA using~~use the following procedure:

1. The MLME shall issue an MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication primitive to inform the SME of the association request. The SME shall issue an MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive addressed to the STA identified by the PeerSTAAddress parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication primitive. If the association is not successful, the SME shall indicate a specific reason for the failure to associate in the ResultCode parameter. Upon receipt of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive, the MLME shall transmit an Association Response frame.
2. [New step] If the state for the STA is 1, the SME shall refuse the association request by issuing an MLME‑ASSOCIATE.response primitive with ResultCode NOT\_AUTHENTICATED. [not for DMG if the DMG STA doesn’t use 802.11 open system auth, though – does this need to be NOTEd?]
3. ~~At an~~ AP ~~having~~with dot11InterworkingServiceActivated ~~equal to~~ true only: If~~, subsequent to receiving an~~the MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication primitive ~~with~~has the EmergencyServices parameter set to true ~~that~~ and the RSN parameter does not include an RSNE, the SME shall ~~accept~~not reject the association request ~~even if~~on the basis that dot11RSNAActivated is true and dot11PrivacyInvoked is true, thereby granting access, using unprotected frames (see 8.2.4.1.9 (Protected Frame field)), to the network for emergency services purposes.
4. Upon receiving an MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication primitive, when management frame protection is not in use, the SME shall delete any PTKSA and temporal keys held for communication with the STA by using the MLME-DELETEKEYS.request primitive (see 11.5.18 (RSNA security association termination)) – CHECK, not in reassoc and appears to be duplicated in step k) below
5. Otherwise, i~~I~~n an RSNA~~,~~ the ~~AP or PCP~~SME shall check the values received in the RSN~~E~~ parameter to see whether the values received match the ~~AP or PCP’s~~ security policy. If they do not, the SME shall refuse the association ~~shall not be accepted~~by issuing an MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive with a ResultCode indicating the security policy mismatch.
6. Otherwise, i~~I~~f the ~~AP or PCP’s~~ state for the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA is 4, ~~and~~ the ~~AP or PCP~~STA has a valid security association ~~for the non-AP and non-PCP STA~~, ~~and~~the STA has negotiated management frame protection ~~with the non-AP and non-PCP STA~~, and ~~an~~ there has been no earlier, timed out SA Query procedure with the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA ~~has not~~ (which would have allowed a new association process to be started, without an additional SA Query procedure~~,~~):
	1. ~~t~~The SME shall ~~reject~~refuse the association request by ~~generat~~issuing an MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive with ResultCode ~~“Association request rejected temporarily; try again later.”~~REFUSED\_TEMPORARILY ~~The SME shall not modify any association state for the non-AP and non-PCP STA, and shall include in the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive~~and TimeoutInterval containing a Timeout Interval element with the Timeout ~~i~~Interval ~~t~~Type field set to 3 (Association Comeback time)~~, specifying a comeback time when the AP or PCP would be ready to accept an association with this STA~~. If the SME is in an ongoing SA Query with the STA, the Timeout Interval Value field shall be set to the remaining SA Query period, otherwise it shall be set to dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout.
	2. The state for the STA shall be left unchanged.
	3. Following this, if the SME is not ~~already engaging~~ in an ongoing SA Query with the STA, the SME shall issue one MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive addressed to the STA every dot11AssociationSAQueryRetryTimeout TUs until an ~~matching~~ MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive for the STA and with a matching TransactionIdentifier is received or dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout TUs from the beginning of the SA Query procedure have passed. [joined to next bullet] The SME shall ~~specify a TransactionIdentifier parameter value in the MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive, and~~ increment the ~~value~~TransactionIdentifier by 1 for each ~~subsequent~~ MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive, rolling it over the value to 0 after the maximum allowed value is reached.
	4. ~~The MLME may interpret reception of a valid protected frame as an indication of a successfully completed SA Query, and thereby generate an MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive.~~
	5. If ~~an~~no MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive with a~~n outstanding~~ ~~t~~Transaction ~~i~~Identifier matching a TransactionIdentifier in an MLME-SA-QUERY.request issued in this SA Query procedure is ~~not~~ received within the dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout period, the SME shall allow ~~the~~a subsequent association process with the STA to be started without starting an additional SA Query procedure, except that the SME may deny a subsequent association process with the STA if an MSDU was received from the STA within this period.
7. The SME shall refuse an association request from a STA that does not support all the rates in the BSSBasicRateSet parameter in the MLME-START.request primitive.
8. The SME shall refuse an association request from an HT STA that does not support all the MCSs in the Basic MCS Set field of the HT Operation parameter ~~of~~in the MLME-START.request primitive.
9. The SME shall refuse an association request from a VHT STA that does not support all the <VHT-MCS, NSS> tuples indicated by the Basic VHT-MCS and NSS Set field of the VHT Operation parameter in the MLME-START.request primitive.
10. ~~The SME shall generate an MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive addressed to the non-AP and non-PCP STA. When the association is not successful, the SME shall indicate a specific reason for the failure to associate in the ResultCode parameter as defined in 6.3.7.5.2 (Semantics of the service primitive).~~ If the ResultCode in the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive is SUCCESS, and the SME has an existing SA with the ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA, and an SA Query procedure with that ~~non-AP and non-PCP~~ STA has failed to receive a valid response, ~~then~~ the SME shall ~~send~~issue an MLME-DISASSOCIATE.request primitive addressed to the STA with ReasonCode INVALID\_AUTHENTICATION.~~46~~

***[Note to the editor: replace footnote 46 with a NOTE as follows]***

NOTE—This MLME-DISASSOCIATE.request generates a protected Disassociation frame ~~addressed to the STA~~. If the association request was genuine, the STA has deleted the PTKSA by this point and so the protected Disassociation frame is ignored. The purpose is to inform a STA which has for some reason failed to respond to an SA Query procedure triggered by a forged association request.

1. [new step break] If the ResultCode in the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive is SUCCESS, ~~the association identifier assigned to the STA shall be included in the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive, and~~ the SME shall delete any PTKSA and temporal keys held for communication with the STA by using the MLME-DELETEKEYS.request primitive (see 11.5.18 (RSNA security association termination)). In the case of a DMG AP or PCP, the association identifier shall be in the range of 1 to 254.
2. If the MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication primitive includes an MMS parameter, the AP or PCP shall ~~generate the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive directed to the MLME of the STA identified by the PeerSTAAddress parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.request primitive and~~ take the following additional action, as appropriate:
	1. If the Single AID field in the MMS parameter of the MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication primitive is equal to 1, the AP or PCP may allocate a single AID for all the STAs included in the MMS element. If the AP or PCP allocates the same AID to each STA whose MAC address was included in the MMS element, it shall include the MMS element received from the MM-SME coordinated STA in the MLME-ASSOCIATION.response primitive.
	2. If the Single AID field is 0, the AP or PCP shall allocate a distinct AID for each STA specified in the MMS element.
3. ~~Upon receipt of an MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive, the MLME shall transmit an Association Response frame) to the STA.~~
4. ~~When~~If the ResultCode ~~of~~in the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive is not SUCCESS~~,~~ ~~if~~and management frame protection is in use the state for the STA shall be left unchanged. If the ResultCode is not SUCCESS and ~~if~~ management frame protection is not in use the state for the STA shall be set to State 3 if it was ~~in~~ State 4. ***[Editor: swap this and the next step.]***

1. ~~When~~If ~~the~~an Association Response frame with a status code of ~~Successful~~SUCCESS is acknowledged by the STA [how does the SME find out?], the state for the STA shall be set to State 4, or to State 3 if RSNA establishment is required [how does the MLME know?].
2. If the ResultCode in the MLME-ASSOCIATE.response primitive is SUCCESS and~~If~~ RSNA establishment is required, the SME shall attempt a 4-way handshake. Upon a successful completion of a 4-way handshake, the SME shall enable protection by invoking MLME-SETPROTECTION.request(Rx\_Tx)~~. Upon receipt of the MLME-SETPROTECTION.request(Rx\_Tx), the MLME shall set~~ and the state for the STA shall be set to State 4.
3. AP only: The SME shall inform the DS of any changes in the ~~association~~ state for the STA.

An AP may provide neighbor report information to a STA that requests authentication or association by responding with an Authentication or (Re)Association Response frame that includes the Reason Code field set to REJECTED\_WITH\_SUGGESTED\_BSS\_TRANSITION and that includes one or more Neighbor Report elements. [what is this doing here? and why is this not in the auth or reassoc subclauses too?]

**10.14 SA Query procedures**

If dot11RSNAProtectedManagementFramesActivated is true, ~~then~~ the STA shall support the SA Query procedure.

To send an SA Query Request frame to a peer STA, the SME shall issue an MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive. A STA that supports the SA Query procedure and receives an SA Query Request frame shall respond with an SA Query Response frame ~~when~~if all of the following are true and shall not respond otherwise: the receiving STA is currently associated to the sending STA, and no pending MLME-ASSOCIATE.request or MLME‑REASSOCIATE.request primitives are outstanding for the receiving STA ~~that receives the SA Query indication~~.

NOTE—A non-AP and non-PCP STA does not respond if it is trying to reassociate with the AP or PCP that sent the SA Query Request frame (since it no longer has the PTKSA) or to another AP or PCP (it could maintain the old association and PTKSA until the reassociation is completed). There is no such restriction for an AP or PCP.

If a non-AP and non-PCP STA that has an SA with its AP or PCP for an association that negotiated management frame protection receives an unprotected Deauthentication or Disassociation frame with reason code INVALID\_CLASS2\_FRAME or INVALID\_CLASS3\_FRAME from the AP or PCP, the non-AP and non-PCP STA may use this as an indication that there may be a mismatch in the association state between itself and the AP or PCP. In such a case, the non-AP and non-PCP STA’s SME may initiate the SA Query procedure with the AP or PCP to verify the validity of the SA by issuing one MLME-SA-QUERY.request primitive every dot11AssociationSAQueryRetryTimeout TUs until a matching MLME-SA-QUERY.confirm primitive is received or dot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout TUs from the beginning of the SA Query procedure has passed. [Shouldn’t this stuff be moved to Subclause 10.3.5.7?] If the AP or PCP ~~repliesr~~esponds to the SA Query request with a valid SA Query response that has a matching transaction identifier, the non-AP STA ~~may~~should continue to use the SA. If no valid SA Query response is received, the non-AP STA’s SME may destroy the SA using the MLME-DELETEKEYS.request primitive and the non-AP STA may move into State 1 [or optionally State 2 for DMG?] with the AP.

Proposed resolution:

REVISED

Make the changes shown under “Proposed changes” for CIDs 6375, 6376, 6377 in <this document>.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Identifiers | Comment | Proposed change |
|  |  |  |

Discussion:

Proposed changes:

Proposed resolution:

Another missing space: “ignorethe”.

**References:**

802.11mc/D4.0