IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Clause 8.4.4.20 Comment Resolutions |
| Date: 2015-05-07 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| SK Yong | Apple Inc |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides proposed comment resolutions for follow comments:

CID #,

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number (C)** | **Page(C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1588 | Joseph Levy | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 18 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | There is no need to reference where the procedure that uses this element is described. | Delete the sentence: "The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.1." |
| 1517 | Richard Roy | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 18 | E | Stephen McCann | Change: "The procedure used for this element is described" | to: "The procedure for using this element is described |

Proposed resolution: Revised

By referencing to the clause where this element is used, will help the reader to better understand the specification.

Change the sentence in 8.4.4.20 from

“The procedure used for this element is described in clause 10.25.3.2.11.1.”

to

“The use of this element is described in 10.25.3.2.11.1.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1587 | Joseph Levy | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 6 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The way the Service Information Request ANQP-element is used does not need to be described in clause 8. Therefore the description should be removed. | Replace the following two sentences: "The Service Information Request ANQP-element is sent by the non-AP STA to the AP and used to request service information. It is included in a GAS Query Request."With: "A GAS Query Request may contain a Service Information Request ANQP-element to request service information." |

**`**

Proposed resolution: Revised

Replace the following two sentences: "The Service Information Request ANQP-element is sent by the non-AP STA to the AP and used to request service information. It is included in a GAS Query Request."

With

"The Service Information Request ANQP-element contains the request for service information associated with a given service name"

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1516 | Richard Roy | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 5 | G | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Change "Service Information Request" | to "User Service Information Request" throughout the document. |

Proposed resolution: Reject

There is no justification for the change. Service information has nothing to do with user.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1439 | Yunsong Yang | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 10 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Do we really need the Service Information Query Request Length field in Figure 8-607a? Isn't it equal to the value in Length field minus the value in Service Name Length field minus 1? | Delete the field from the figure and delete the third paragraph under the figure. |

Proposed resolution: Accept

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1346 | Lei Wang | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 15 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | what's the unit of the Service information Query Request field? In bytes? | at the end of the sentence in line 15 page 13, add the following text: in unit of byte. |

Proposed resolution: Revised

The Service information Query Request length field was removed. See resolution for CID# 1439

Note: The “Service Information Query Request length” field was renamed to “Service information Query length field” prior to being removed from D1.3.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1335 | Yongho Seok | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 5 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | "The Service Information Request ANQP-element is sent by the non-AP STA to the AP and used to request service information. It is included in a GAS Query Request."In Table 10-16 - ANQP usage, the AP side usage of the Service Information Request ANQP-element is described as "T, R".Which one is correct? If "T,R" is correct, the Service Information Request ANQP-element can be also sent by the AP to the non-AP STA. | Please address this confliction. |

Proposed resolution: Counter

Update the Table 10-16 as follows

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Service Information Request  | 8.4.4.20 (Service Information Request ANQP-element)  | Q  | R  | T | —  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1278 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 14 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Can't the "service name" also contain a "service hash"? | Create some text that allows a "service name" to be a "service hash" |

Proposed resolution: Reject

There is no need to have Service Name to contain the service hash

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1277 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 17 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The "key-value query" should be able to contain a service hash as a query value | Create some text that allows a "service hash" to be a "key-value query" |

Proposed resolution: Reject

There is no need to have key-value query to include service hash since the key-value query is associated with a given service name

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1276 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 17 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | The "key-value query" needs to be defined somewhere. | Create some text to define "key-value query" |
| 1247 | Kim Chang | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 17 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | Where is the "key-value query" described? | Provide the reference or delete ", such as key-value query". |

Proposed resolution: Counter

The key-value query is service specific and there is no need to define it. The key value query is provided merely as an example. Delete the below text from the 8.4.4.20

 “such as key-value query”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1275 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 15 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | It would be more efficient to put the "Service Name" sub-field within the "Service Information Query (Request)" | Re-arrange the Service Information Request ANQP-element to merge the "Service Name" and "Service Information Query (Request)" sub-fields |

Proposed resolution:

Discussion

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page (C)** | **Line (C)** | **Type of Comment** | **Assignee** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 1273 | Stephen McCann | 8.4.4.20 | 13 | 14 | T | Stephen McCann, SK Yong | There should be a way of using the Service Information Request ANQP-element by itself, without knowing the Service Name | Provide an option, where the service name can be blank. For example to return all known services. |

Proposed resolution: Reject

The Service Information Request ANQP-element is meant to provide detailed information after early basic discovery. Enabling wildcard search in Service Information Request ANQP-element will trigger a lot of unncesasry traffic. Please note that application will look for specific service(s) rather than blindly running a wildcard search for all services and its detailed